## **BLUE FOLDER ITEM**

Blue folder items are additional back up material to administrative reports and/or public comments received after the printing and distribution of the agenda packet for receive and file.

### CITY COUNCIL MEETING JUNE 3, 2025

L.3 PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER THE FISCAL YEAR 2025-26 PROPOSED BUDGET AND 2025-30 FIVE-YEAR CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

**CONTACT**: STEPHANIE MEYER, FINANCE DIRECTOR

• PUBLIC COMMUNICATION

| From:        | Mark Nelson (Home Gmail)   |
|--------------|--|
| То:          | CityClerk  |
| Cc:          | Anneke Blair; Jeffrey Gaul; Alan Klainbaum; Nancy Skiba; Austin Carmichael; daniella.woodnicki@redondo.org;<br>Gilbert M. Escontrias; Cindi Arrata; Candace Nafissi; John Simpson; Andrew Beeli; Jay Tsao; Steven Anderson;<br>Bhuvan Bajaj; Traffic Engineering; Andrew Winje; James Light; Paige Kaluderovic; Zein Obagi; Scott Behrendt;<br>Brad Waller; Chadwick B. Castle |
| Subject:     | Public Comment: RBCC 6/3/25 Agenda Item L3, BRR Item #03 Total Estimated Budget Cost Revision to \$617K (likely range \$370K (6-ft tall) to \$617K (10-ft tall))   |
| Date:        | Monday, June 2, 2025 5:03:16 PM  |
| Attachments: | Corrections of 500-600 Soundwall Cost Estimate.xlsx  |

CAUTION: Email is from an external source; **Stop, Look, and Think** before opening attachments or links.

# SUBJECT LINE - Public Comment: RBCC 6/3/25 Agenda Item L3, BRR Item #03 Total Estimated Budget Cost Revision to \$617K (likely range \$370K (6-ft tall) to \$617K (10-ft tall))

#### Provided as Public Comment to the Mayor, City Council, PWSC, PSC, Prospect Neighborhood

City Officials and Neighbors:

Below is a revision to the Budget Response Report Item #03 (6/3/25 Agenda Item L3) "What is the cost to construct a sound wall on the Prospect median between Beryl St and Diamond St.?"

<u>This work supports a revision to \$617K (down from \$3.13M) for BRR Item #03 using RBPW cost estimation methods with fact-based revised unit cost data and standards manual-based height specification.</u>

#### **SUMMARY**

The **Total RBPW Estimated Budget Cost of \$3,133,139.94 seemed quite high** based on my experience. As a result, I took a deep dive into the data. (FYI for the new City Attorney: I am a court and agency qualified expert witness, a co-author of the inaugural California Standard Practice Manual for energy costs and standards, and a retired executive with experience reviewing and developing engineering cost estimates for individual projects up to \$1B.)

Based on fact-based, documented revisions to the unit cost estimate drawn from CalTrans data and the height range of the wall drawn from the California Highway Design Manual, the <u>BRR</u> #03 Revised Total Estimated Budget Cost is \$617K for a 10-foot tall, 1000-foot long wall.

#### **UNIT COST ANALYSIS AND REVISION**

#### Unit Cost Estimate Revision (Revised to \$32.23 psf down from \$68.22 psf)

The unit cost used by RBPW was \$68.22 psf (+/- 1 SD interval \$4.04 to \$132.40 psf) That 1 Standard Deviation 68% certainty range nearly includes \$0 psf, which indicates that unit cost estimate is very low quality.

I reviewed the CalTrans source data and found that RBPW used a simple average of bid costs,

and included a 304 sf wall that was up to 800% more costly than walls at scale. Based on that outlier being removed, the revised cost estimate is \$32.23 psf (+/- 1 SD interval \$26.16 to \$38.40 psf). That is a much higher quality engineering cost estimator.

<u>Resulting Total Estimated Budget Cost Revision (Revised to \$1.48M down from \$3.13M)</u> RBPW uses the industry common unit cost estimation methodology. **That means the \$3.13M BRR #03 estimate is reduced to \$1.48M for the 24-foot tall x 1000-foot long wall based on** the unit cost revision ratio of 47.24%.

#### SOUNDWALL HEIGHT ANALYSIS AND REVISION

## Soundwall Size Revision (Revised to California standards of 6-feet to 14-feet from 24-feet)

It's unclear where a 24-foot wall height was sourced from, and there's ample question in my mind as to feasibility of a 24-foot tall block wall. Based on a quick AI search, the height of California Highway sound walls varies **from 6-feet to 14-feet tall** based on the California Highway Design Manual (<u>https://up.codes/s/noise-barrier-height-and-position</u>). Specifically the manual states at:

#### 1102.3 Noise Barrier Height and Position:

*Minimum Height.* Noise barriers should have a minimum height of 6 feet (measured from the top of the barrier to the top of the foundation).

*Maximum Height.* Noise barriers should not exceed 14 feet in height (measured from the pavement surface at the face of the safety-shape barrier) when located 15 feet or less from the edge of the traveled way, and should not exceed 16 feet in height above the ground line when located more than 15 feet from the traveled way.

Granted, this is a highway scale specification, but 24-feet tall is nearly 50% outside of that range. One would assume that in the City, a barrier height closer to 6-feet would be appropriate. For sake of completeness, the estimated budget cost estimate was revised using both ends of the range, and that provided a reduction to \$370K to \$863K with a mean for a 10-foot wall at \$617K.

#### **CONCLUSION**

## Based on Revision of Unit Estimated cost and Revision of Wall Size conforming to State standards:

The conservative point estimate for the BRR#03 Revision Total Estimated Budget Cost is recommended at 10-feet tall (mean value of California Highway standards), which results in a

Total Estimated Budget Cost not to exceed \$617,706.38, a reduction to 19.7% of the original \$3.13M estimate.

This estimate uses 100% of the RBPW unit cost estimation methodology with the adders for Inspection, Design, Contingency and Inflation.

This estimate removes the 304 sf outlier cost data and results in a very good quality engineering cost estimator with a tight interval.

This estimate also allows for any height selection between the minimum of 6-feet and mid-point of 10-feet tall as a conservative estimate for budgeting.

Attachment: Excel calculations spreadsheet and references

| RBPW Estimated Co  | ost  | \$3.133M   | \$3,133,139.94   |   |   |               |   |                               |  |   |  |                                |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
|--|--|--|--|---|---|---------------|---|-------------------------------|--|---|--|--------------------------------|-------------|-----------------|--------------|----------|----------------|----------------------|----------------------|
| [  |  |  |  |   |   |               |   | ORIGIN                        |  | NS DATASE   | Т  |                                |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| SOUNDWALL  | (MASON   | RY   |  |   |   |               |   |                               | S SE Skir  | n 31 Goo  | LII Divis  | 🚯 🚯                            | Asse        | Welc            | Deve         | 🚺 🚺 Redc | M Inbo         | 🔄 🔤 Full             | iClot                |
| BLOCK)   |  |  |  |   |   |               |   |                               |  |   |  | 10 10 <del>7</del> 09 - 10     |             |                 | 4.09/445249  |          |                |                      |                      |
| Length (LF)  |  |  | 1,050  |   |   |               |   | ÷ +                           |  | ) 🐾 http  | s://d8data.c   | dot.ca.gov/c                   | ontractcost | /results.php    | ritem = 5820 | 01&cs=1  |                |                      |                      |
| Height   |  |  | 24   |   |   |               |   |                               |  |   |  | 12                             | 3 3.3       |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| Square foot (S   | q ft)  |  | 25,200   |   |   |               |   |                               |  |   |  | Co                             | ontract (   | Cost Dat        | a            |          |                |                      |                      |
| Drico/Sa ft*   |  | ¢  | 68.22  | 1 710   | 144.00  |               |   | Cost Data                     | <u>Home</u> > Results  |   |  |                                |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| CM Inspection  | 1  | Ŷ  | 10%  | \$ 171 G  | 914 40  |               |   | Select                        | 8  |   | ltem No. / I   | Description                    |             |                 | Unit         | Dist     | Qty            | Unit                 | Adj                  |
| Design   |  |  | 15%  | 5 257 8   | 371 60  |               |   |                               | 582001 - SOUNI   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 06       | 304            | \$149.00             | \$119.95             |
| Contingency  |  |  | 10%  | 5 171.9   | 914.40  |               |   |                               | 582001 - SOUNE   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 06       | 304            | \$38.83              | \$31.26              |
|  |  |  | Subtotal S   | 2.320.8   | 344.40  |               |   |                               | 582001 - SOUNE   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 06       | 304            | \$100.00             | \$110.69             |
| Inflation budge  | ting facto   | r  | 35% 3  | 812,2   | 295.54  |               |   | <b>2</b>                      | 582001 - SOUNE   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 06       | 304            | \$254.00             | \$204.48             |
|  | То   | tal Estimated Bu   | dget Cost  | \$ 3,133,1  | 139.94  |               |   |                               | 582001 - SOUNI<br>582001 - SOUNI   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 06       | 304            | \$200.00             | \$161.01             |
| *2025 Caltrans Cost  | Data: https:/  | /d8data.dot.ca.gov/cont  | ractcost/results.ph  | p?item=582001&c   | <u>s=1</u>  |               |   | <b>2</b>                      | 582001 - SOUNE   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 12       | 34948          | \$28.00              | \$31.44              |
|  |  |  |  |   |   |               |   |                               | 582001 - SOUNI<br>582001 - SOUNI   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 12       | 34948          | \$20.00              | \$30.77              |
|  |  | -  | -  |   |   |               |   |                               | <u>582001</u> - SOUNI  | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 12       | 34948          | \$33.62              | \$37.75              |
| RBPW used a unit co  | ost estimate   | of   | \$ 68.22<br>\$ 64.18   | per sf  | per CalTrar   | ns            |   |                               | 582001 - SOUND<br>582001 - SOUND   | D WALL (MASONRY<br>D WALL (MASONRY  | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 12<br>06 | 34948<br>67755 | \$40.00<br>\$25.25   | \$44.92              |
|  |  |  | φ 04.10  |   |   | 15            |   |                               | 582001 - SOUNI   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 06       | 67755          | \$32.00              | \$35.93              |
|  |  |  |  |   |   |               |   |                               | 582001 - SOUNE   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 06       | 67755          | \$31.00<br>\$24.80   | \$34.8               |
| Based on the standard  | d deviation,   | RBPW is 68% confide  | ent that unit cost   |   |   |               |   |                               | 582001 - SOUNI   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 08       | 8275           | \$35.00              | \$39.30              |
|  |  | High   | \$ 132.40  | +1SD  |   |               |   |                               | 582001 - SOUNE   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 08       | 8275           | \$40.00<br>\$45.00   | \$44.92              |
|  |  | Low  | \$ 4.04  | -1SD  |   |               |   |                               | 582001 - SOUNI   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 08       | 8275           | \$31.02              | \$34.83              |
| Rased on that wide   | handwidth  | the underlying data  | was ro-ovamino   | d d   |   |               |   | upahade =1                    | check all  |   |  |                                |             |                 | 25           | 35 55    | 255            | 4.5                  |                      |
|  |  |  |  |   |   |               |   |                               | , <u></u>  | Unmodified Ad   | liusted  |                                |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| The CalTrans data inc  | cluded a 304   | sf wall, which is appr   | oximately 10-feet  | by 30-feet  |   |               |   | Average                       | Price/Unit: \$   | 68.22   | 61.58 Av   | g No. Units                    | 24049       |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| The bid costs on such  | n a small wa   | Il were up to 800% hig   | her than walls bui   | ilt at scale  |   |               |   | We                            | (of Unit Price): ±\$<br>ighted Avg.: \$  | 30.38   | 33.92 Rot  | ws Selected _<br>ws Returned _ | 20          |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| Solutions using the C  | alTrans bid  | data include: 1) use o   | f the square foot s  | ize weighted avera  | age cost  |               |   | Minimun<br>Maximun            | n Price/Unit: \$<br>n Price/Unit: \$   | 24.80   | 27.85  |                                |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| or 2) recomputation e  | xcluding the   | small, home sized, 10  | )x30 wall.   |   |   |               |   |                               |  |   |  |                                |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| Per CalTrans data th   | e Weighted   | Average (includes sm   | all wall) is   |   | 30.38   | per sf        |   | • Adjis<br>• To re<br>• To se | neo prices are <u>aquistec</u><br>move a row from the ca<br>e additional information | g to todays doilars based<br>liculations , uncheck the ch<br>h for a contract, click on th  | on the <u>Cantany Cons</u><br>eckbox next to that row<br>at contract number. | U.                             |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| Per CalTrans data, th  | e Unic Cost  | (excludes small wall)  | S  |   | 32.23   | per sf        |   | • To se                       | e a trend graph of prix  | estoran hem,click on the  | tem symber.  |                                | -           | l<br>Barton Mer |              |          | an the later   |                      |                      |
| Standard deviation of  |  |  |  |   | 6.07  |               |   |                               | <u> </u>   | <u> </u>  | 6 <mark>M</mark>   | <u> </u>                       | ×           |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
|  |  |  |  |   |   |               |   |                               |  |   |  |                                |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| Based on the standard  | d deviation,   | RBPW is 68% confide  | ent that unit cost   |   |   |               |   |                               |  |   |  |                                |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| will fall between  |  |  | <b>.</b>   |   |   |               |   |                               |  |   |  |                                |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
|  |  | High   | \$ <u>38.30</u><br>\$ <u>26.16</u>   | +1SD<br>-1SD  |   |               |   |                               |  |   |  |                                |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
|  |  |  | φ 20.10  | 100   |   |               |   |                               |  |   |  |                                |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| Removing the statis  | tical outlier  | of a 304 sf wall prov  | ides meaningful  | results.  |   |               |   | REVISE                        | D CALTRAN  | NS DATASE   | Γ  |                                |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| Conclusion: Fither t   | he Weighte   | d Average of \$30.38   | psf or the "clean  | ed up" data Unit  | Cost aver   | age of \$32   | 23 psf  |                               | S   SE Skir  | ni 📔 🛐 Goo  | LII Divis  | 🛛 🥵 All S                      | 🛛 🧱 Asse    | Welc            | 🛛 📵 Deve     | 🛛 🌀 Reda | 📔 M Inbo       | 📔 🔤 Full             | 💰 iClou              |
| are both more appro  | opriate than   | the CalTrans raw U   | nit Cost of \$68.22  | 2 psf   |   |               |   |                               |  |   |  |                                |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
|  |  |  |  |   |   |               |   |                               | ) C 6  | http  | s://d8data.c   | lot.ca.gov/c                   | ontractcost | /results.php    | ritem = 5820 | 01&cs=1  |                |                      |                      |
| Corrected Calc   | ulation o  | f the Estimated I  | Rudgot Cost  |   |   |               |   |                               |  |   |  | Co                             | ntract (    | Cost Dat        | 2            |          |                |                      |                      |
| Because the budget e   | estimate is 1  | 00% based off of the u   | nit cost. the botto  | m line can  |   |               |   |                               |  |   |  |                                |             |                 | a            |          |                |                      |                      |
| be ratio adjusted by th  | he revised c   | ost.   | ,<br>  |   |   |               |   | <u>Cost Data</u>              | <u>Home</u> > Results  |   |  |                                |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| The corrected calcula  | tion of \$32 '   | 23 nef was chosen has  | ed on consistency  | with PRDW/c   |   |               |   | Select                        |  |   | Item No. / I   | Description                    |             |                 | Unit         | Dist     | <u>Qty</u>     | Unit<br>Price        | Adj<br>Price         |
| methodology, adjustin  | ng for the ou  | tlier 304 sf wall.   |  |   |   |               |   |                               | 582001 - SOUNE   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 06       | 304            | \$149.00<br>\$29.92  | \$119.95<br>\$21.26  |
|  | Ĭ  |  |  |   |   |               |   |                               | 582001 - SOUNI   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 06       | 304            | \$100.00             | \$80.51              |
| The correction factor  | will be \$32.2   | 23/\$68.22 =   | 47.24%   |   |   |               |   |                               | 582001 - SOUNE   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 06       | 304            | \$137.50<br>\$254.00 | \$110.69<br>\$204.49 |
| The cost corrected e   | estimated b  | udget cost is:   | <u>\$1,480,095.31</u>  | for the RBPW-sp   | pecified 24   | -foot tall, 1 | 000-foot long wall  |                               | 582001 - SOUNI   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 06       | 304            | \$200.00             | \$161.01             |
|  |  |  |  |   |   |               |   |                               | 582001 - SOUNI   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 06       | 304            | \$66.00              | \$53.13              |
| Discussion of S  | nocified   | Wall Hoight  |  |   |   |               |   |                               | 582001 - SOUNI   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 12       | 34948          | \$26.00              | \$29.20              |
| It's unclear where a 2   | 4-foot wall h  | eight was sourced fror   | n. Based on a qui  | ck AI search. the   | heiaht of so  | oundwalls v   | aries   |                               | 582001 - SOUNE   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 12       | 34948          | \$27.40              | \$30.77              |
| from 6-feet to 14-feet   | t tall based   | on the California Highv  | vay Design Manua   | al.   | J   |               |   |                               | 582001 - SOUNI   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 12       | 34948          | \$40.00              | \$44.92              |
| https://up.codes/s/n   | oise-barrie  | r-height-and-position  | 1  |   |   |               |   |                               | 582001 - SOUNE   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 06       | 67755          | \$25.25              | \$28.35              |
|  |  | <u> </u>   |  |   |   |               |   |                               | 582001 - SOUNE   | D WALL (MASONRY<br>D WALL (MASONRY  | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT<br>SQFT | 06       | 67755          | \$32.00<br>\$31.00   | \$35.93<br>\$34.81   |
| Further Correct  | <u>ion of 50</u>   | 0-600 N Prospec  | t Ave Sound  | wall Estimate   | ed Cost   |               |   |                               | 582001 - SOUNI   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 06       | 67755          | \$24.80              | \$27.85              |
| Using the full range of  | f 6-feet to 14   | I-feet tall (unknown if a  | non-highway sou  | indwall should be   | 14-feet), the   | e estimated   | l budget cost   |                               | 582001 - SOUNE   | D WALL (MASONRY<br>D WALL (MASONRY  | BLOCK)<br>BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT<br>SQFT | 08       | 8275           | \$35.00<br>\$40.00   | \$39.30              |
| can be corrected by ra   | atio, as with  | the cost correction. So  | ound modeling she  | ould be conducted   | tor height  | determinati   | ons   |                               | 582001 - SOUNI   | D WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 08       | 8275           | \$45.00              | \$50.53              |
| Specified Height   | 24   | Ratio Factor   | Revised budget   | t cost estimate (L  | Jnit Cost a   | nd Wall Siz   | ze Correction)  |                               | <u>982001</u> - SOUNI  | U WALL (MASONRY   | BLOCK)   |                                |             |                 | SQFT         | 08       | 8275           | \$31.02              | \$34.83              |
| Low code   | 6  | 25%  | \$ 370,023.83  |   |   |               |   | uncheck al                    | <u>check all</u>   |   |  |                                |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| High code  | 14   | 58%  | <mark>\$ 863,388.93</mark>   |   | Mean (10-f  | root)         | \$616,706.38 19.7% of origin                              |                               | '<br>Price/Unit-⊄  | Unmodified Ad   | justed<br>36.19 Ave  | a No. Unite                    | 36835       |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| Revised budget cost e  | i<br>estimate (Ur  | nit Cost Correction)   |  | \$1,480.095.31  | (0-1001)  |               |   | Std Dev.                      | (of Unit Price): ±\$   | 6.07  | 6.82 Rot   | ws Selected                    | 13          |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| Note: Metro's Soundw   | vall10 projec  | t uses 14-foot height a  | long the 10 freewa   | ay  |   |               |   | We Minimun                    | n Price/Unit: \$   | 29.91   | 27.85  | ws neturned _                  | 20          |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| 1  |  |  |  |   |   |               |   | Maximun                       | n Price/Unit: \$   | 45.00   | 50.53  |                                |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
|  |  | }  | 1  | 1   |   | <br> 4 :      | kelv that most  | Adjus     To re               | ted prices are <mark>adjusted</mark><br>moue a row from the ca                       | d to toda/s dollars based<br>liculations, uncheck the ch  | on the <u>Caltrans Cons</u><br>ecknor peri to that row                       | traction Cost Index            |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| CONCLUSION<br>A correction was made  | le to the initi  | al unit cost estimate to   | reflect the outlier  | of a 304 sf wall in   | the costs   | It is very in |   | • To se                       | a additional latera addition   |   | Sale and Sant Br Bast Inc.   | 0.                             |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| A correction was mad<br>qualfied vendors had   | le to the initi<br>no interest i   | al unit cost estimate to<br>n such a small job, but  | o reflect the outlier<br>bid anyway out o  | of a 304 sf wall ir f courtesy. Their n   | n the costs.<br>nobilization                                  | costs alone   | e   | • To se                       | e a trend graph of price   | n for a contract, click on th<br>es for an flem , click on the  | atcontractnumber.<br>Nem number.   |                                |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| A correction was mad<br>qualfied vendors had<br>likely swamped the ha  | le to the initi<br>no interest in<br>ard costs of  | al unit cost estimate to<br>n such a small job, but<br>a 304 sf wall.  | b reflect the outlier<br>bid anyway out o  | of a 304 sf wall ir<br>f courtesy. Their n  | n the costs.<br>nobilization                                  | costs alone   | e   | • To se                       | e a treud graph of prio  | n for a contract, click on the<br>es for an flem, click on the  | atcontract number.<br>Hem number.  | <u> </u>                       | x           |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| A correction was mad<br>qualfied vendors had<br>likely swamped the ha  | le to the initi<br>no interest in<br>ard costs of<br>ed in an esti   | al unit cost estimate to<br>n such a small job, but<br>a 304 sf wall.<br>mated budget cost of 9  | bid anyway out o   | of a 304 sf wall ir<br>f courtesy. Their n<br>ot x 1000-foot wal  | n the costs.<br>nobilization                                  | costs alone   |   |                               | e a trevidg rapi of price  | n for a contract, click on the<br>es for an item, click on the<br>Solution  | atcontract number.<br>Hem number.  | <u> </u>                       | ×           |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| CONCLUSION         A correction was made         qualfied vendors had         likely swamped the had         That correction result  | le to the initi<br>no interest in<br>ard costs of<br>ed in an esti   | al unit cost estimate to<br>n such a small job, but<br>a 304 sf wall.<br>mated budget cost of \$   | b reflect the outlier<br>bid anyway out o<br>1.48M for a 24-fo   | of a 304 sf wall ir<br>f courtesy. Their n<br>oot x 1000-foot wal   | n the costs.<br>nobilization                                  | costs alone   |   |                               | e a tread grapi of prio  | n for a contract, click on the es for an item, click on the   | atcostract sumber.<br>Hem sumber.  | <u>\$</u>                      | ×           |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| CONCLUSION         A correction was made         qualfied vendors had         likely swamped the had         That correction resulte         According to the Calif  | de to the initi<br>no interest in<br>ard costs of<br>ed in an esti   | al unit cost estimate to<br>n such a small job, but<br>a 304 sf wall.<br>mated budget cost of s<br>ay Design Manual, a re  | 5 reflect the outlier<br>bid anyway out o<br>51.48M for a 24-fo<br>easonable source                                    | of a 304 sf wall in<br>f courtesy. Their n<br>oot x 1000-foot wal<br>of information for                                     | n the costs.<br>nobilization                                  | the range     | of heights from   |                               | e a tread grapi of price   | n for a contract, click on the es for an litem, click on the  | atcostractsumber.<br>Hem sumber.   | <u> </u>                       | ×           |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| CONCLUSION         A correction was made         qualfied vendors had         likely swamped the had         That correction result         According to the Calif         minimum to maximur  | de to the initi<br>no interest in<br>ard costs of<br>ed in an esti<br>fornia Highw<br>m is 6-feet to               | al unit cost estimate to<br>n such a small job, but<br>a 304 sf wall.<br>mated budget cost of s<br>ay Design Manual, a ro<br>o 14-feet.  | 5 reflect the outlier<br>bid anyway out o<br>51.48M for a 24-fo<br>easonable source                                    | of a 304 sf wall ir<br>f courtesy. Their r<br>ot x 1000-foot wal<br>of information for                                      | n the costs.<br>nobilization<br>I<br>soundwalls,              | , the range   | of heights from   |                               | e a tre ud grapi of prior  | n for a contract, click on the<br>es for an litem, click on the<br>Solution (Click on the   | atcostractsumber.<br>Item sumber.  |                                | ×           |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| CONCLUSION         A correction was made         qualfied vendors had         likely swamped the had         That correction resulte         According to the Calif         minimum to maximum         These correction                            | de to the initi<br>no interest in<br>ard costs of<br>ed in an esti<br>fornia Highw<br>m is 6-feet to               | al unit cost estimate to<br>n such a small job, but<br>a 304 sf wall.<br>mated budget cost of s<br>ay Design Manual, a ro<br>o 14-feet.  | 5 reflect the outlier<br>bid anyway out o<br>51.48M for a 24-fo<br>easonable source                                    | of a 304 sf wall ir<br>f courtesy. Their r<br>ot x 1000-foot wal<br>of information for<br>ost of \$370K 1                   | n the costs.<br>nobilization<br>I<br>soundwalls,<br>to \$863K | , the range   | of heights from 10-foot wall \$617K)                      |                               | e a tread grapi of prior   | n for a contract, click on the<br>es for an litem, click on the<br>Solution (Click on the<br>Click on the | atcostractsumber.<br>Item sumber.  |                                |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |
| CONCLUSION         A correction was made         qualfied vendors had         likely swamped the had         That correction resulted         According to the Califf         minimum to maximum         These correction         using both State | le to the initi<br>no interest in<br>ard costs of<br>ed in an esti<br>fornia Highw<br>m is 6-feet to<br>ons result | al unit cost estimate to<br>n such a small job, but<br>a 304 sf wall.<br>mated budget cost of s<br>ay Design Manual, a ro<br>o 14-feet.<br>ted in an estimat<br>soundwall heig | 5 reflect the outlier<br>bid anyway out o<br>51.48M for a 24-fo<br>easonable source<br>ced budget co<br>ht revisions a | of a 304 sf wall ir<br>f courtesy. Their n<br>oot x 1000-foot wal<br>of information for<br>ost of \$370K 1<br>and data-scru | n the costs.<br>nobilization<br>I<br>soundwalls,<br>to \$863K | , the range   | of heights from<br>10-foot wall \$617K)<br>nate revisions |                               | e a tread graph of prior   | n for a contract, click on the es for an item, click on the soft of the soft o  |  |                                |             |                 |              |          |                |                      |                      |

| From:<br>To:<br>Cc: | Darryl Boyd<br>Mark Nelson (Home Gmail)<br>CityClerk; Anneke Blair; Jeffrey Gaul; Alan Klainbaum; Nancy Skiba; Austin Carmichael;<br>daniella.woodnicki@redondo.org; Gilbert M. Escontrias; Cindi Arrata; Candace Nafissi; John Simpson; Andrew<br>Beeli; Jay Tsao; Steven Anderson; Bhuvan Bajaj; Traffic Engineering; Andrew Winje; James Light; Paige |
|---------------------|--|
| Subject:            | Re: Redondo Beach City Council Meeting 6/3/25 Agenda Item L3:BRR#03, BRR#22  |
| Date:               | Tuesday, June 3, 2025 12:44:52 PM  |

Some people who received this message don't often get email from <u>Learn why this is</u> important

CAUTION: Email is from an external source; Stop, Look, and Think before opening attachments or links.

My name is Darryl Boyd, a 32 year homeowner at Redondo Beach, CA 90277

I am a California Real Estate Broker of 31 years having owned sales, mortgage, and development companies. My family is involved in private lending and I am an expert witness in property valuation disputes involving Probate and Trust matters.

I have read the data and information that Mr. Nelson has provided and agree with his findings as it applies to the 500-600 N Prospect Ave. situation.

I look forward to addressing the City Council in person this evening.

Thank You for your consideration.

Darryl Boyd

On Tue, Jun 3, 2025 at 11:01 AM Mark Nelson (Home Gmail) < wrote:

My name is Mark Nelson and I am a property owner in the 500 block of North Prospect Ave on the frontage road. I am a state and federal court; local, state and federal agency; and arbitration qualified expert witness. My university education includes Econometrics (Economic Statistics) and Chemical Engineering. I am a retired adjunct professor of economic and business. I am also a retired Fortune 150 executive with experience in \$350M annual operating budget management and project planning, permitting, and development for projects up to \$1B.

I am attaching comments after review of the real estate economics research studies supporting the comments. It's my opinion that the studies support the conclusion of likely damages to property values on the 500-600 N Prospect frontage road as a result of the current state of disrepair.

Darryl Boyd - Broker/Owner, MRP, SFR, CPTS Specialized Court Services: Expert Witness - Probate & Trust Valuation Disputes Substitute Administration - Probate Cases DARRYL B. BOYD, BROKER

#### 811 N. Catalina Ave. Suite #2016 Redondo Beach, CA 90277

DarrylBoydBroker.com CA DRE #01178871

