



Minutes
Redondo Beach City Council
Tuesday, October 29, 2024
Closed Session - Adjourned Regular Meeting 4:30 p.m.
Open Session –Regular Meeting 6:00 p.m.

4:30 PM - CLOSED SESSION – ADJOURNED REGULAR MEETING

A. CALL MEETING TO ORDER

An Adjourned Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 4:30 p.m. by Mayor Light in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

B. ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim
(arrived at 4:32 p.m.), Obagi
Mayor Light

Officials Present: Mike Witzansky, City Manager
Melissa Villa, Analyst

C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION - NONE

D. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS

Analyst Villa reported there were no Blue Folder Items for Closed Session.

E. PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS ON CLOSED SESSION ITEMS AND NON-AGENDA ITEMS

Analyst Villa reported receiving one eComment under Item No. F.1.

There were no other public communications on Closed Session items and non-agenda items.

F. RECESS TO CLOSED – 4:33 p.m.

Councilmember Nehrenheim arrived at 4:32 p.m.

Analyst Villa read title to the items to be considered in Closed Session.

City Manager Witzansky announced that the following would be participating in Closed Session: City Manager Mike Witzansky, City Attorney Mike Webb, Assistant City Attorney

Cheryl Park, Community Development Director Marc Wiener, Public Works Director Andy Winje, Planning Manager Sean Scully, Outside Legal Counsel Ginetta Giovinco, Outside Legal Counsel Diana Veret, Human Resources Director Diane Strickfaden, and W.E.D. Director Greg Kapovich.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to recess to Closed Session at 4:34 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

F.1. CONFERENCE WITH REAL PROPERTY NEGOTIATOR - The Closed Session is authorized by the Government Code Section 54956.8.

AGENCY NEGOTIATOR:

Mike Witzansky, City Manager

Greg Kapovich, Waterfront & Economic Development Director

PROPERTY: 230 Portofino Way, Redondo Beach, CA 90277 (a portion of APN: 7503-029-903)

NEGOTIATING PARTIES: John Warner - Marine Mammal Care Center Los Angeles, a non-profit corporation

UNDER NEGOTIATION: Price and Terms

CONTACT: GREG KAPOVICH, WATERFRONT AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

F.2. CONFERENCE WITH REAL PROPERTY NEGOTIATOR - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.8

NEGOTIATOR:

Mike Witzansky, City Manager

Andy Winje, Public Works Director

Marc Wiener, Community Development Director

PROPERTY: 422 S. PCH (APN: 7508-020-026)

NEGOTIATING PARTY:

Sandcastle Pacific LLC

UNDER NEGOTIATION:

Both Price and Terms

F.3. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - ANTICIPATED POTENTIAL

LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(2).

Two potential case(s)

- F.4. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

Name of case:

**9300 Wilshire, LLC v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; City of Redondo Beach Department of Community Development; and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive
Case Number: 23STCP02189**

- F.5. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case: City of Redondo Beach, et al. v. California State Water Resources Control Board
Case Number: 20STCP03193**

- F.6. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

Name of case:

**New Commune DTLA, LLC and Leonid Pustilnikov v. City of Redondo Beach and City Council of the City of Redondo Beach
Case Number: 22TRCP00203**

- F.7. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case: New Commune DTLA, LLC v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; City of Redondo Beach Department of Community Development, et al.
Case Number: 23STCP00426**

- F.8. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

Name of case: New Commune DTLA LLC v. City of Redondo Beach; City

**Council of the City of Redondo Beach; and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive
Case Number: 23STCV10146**

- F.9. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case: In re 9300 Wilshire LLC Bankruptcy C.D. Cal.
Case Number: 2:23-bk-10918-ER**

- F.10. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case: Yes in My Back Yard, a California nonprofit corporation; SONJA TRAUSS, an individual v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; City of Redondo Beach Department of Community Development, and DOES 1 through 25 inclusive
Case Number: 23TRCP00325**

- F.11. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case: Phillip Mack v. City of Redondo Beach; and DOES 1-20, inclusive
Case No: 24TRCV03382**

- G. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION – 6:16 p.m.**

Mayor Light reconvened to Open Session at 6:16 p.m.

- H. ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk
Mike Webb, City Attorney
Mike Witzansky, City Manager
Lucie Colombo, Chief Deputy City Clerk

- I. ANNOUNCEMENT OF CLOSED SESSION ACTIONS**

City Manager Witzansky announced that under Item No. F.11, Council unanimously authorized the City Attorney to defend the City in the matter.

J. ADJOURN TO REGULAR MEETING

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and approved by voice vote, to adjourn to the regular meeting at 6:17 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

6:00 PM - OPEN SESSION – REGULAR MEETING

A. CALL TO ORDER

A Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 6:17 p.m. by Mayor Light in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

B. ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk
Mike Webb, City Attorney
Mike Witzansky, City Manager
Lucie Colombo, Chief Deputy City Clerk

C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION

Mayor Light invited Veterans and Active Military to stand and recognized them for their service.

Isabelle, 4th Grader, Jefferson Elementary School, led in the salute to the flag.

Mayor Light called for a moment of silence.

D. PRESENTATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/ANNOUNCEMENTS

Councilmember Nehrenheim discussed recent events at Riviera Village; reported attending the Domestic Violence Awareness Event; announced the upcoming Halloween Spooktacular and the First Saturday Sweep hosted by Keep the Esplanade Beautiful.

Councilmember Loewenstein spoke about his recent District 2 Community Meeting (also known as the Public Safety Town Hall); thanked RBPd Chief Hoffman and RBFD Chief Butler for speaking; mentioned the November District 2 Community Meeting would be before Thanksgiving.

Councilmember Kaluderovic spoke about attending the Cal Cities Conference, fundraising events, and participating in a Climate Resiliency and Neighborhood Center discussion; attended a Crossing Guard Appreciation event that morning; announced the District 3 online meeting will be on Saturday at 9:30 a.m.

Councilmember Obagi thanked the Fire Rescue Team that saved two paddleboarders in distress yesterday and spoke in support of Measure FP. Additionally, he announced the SBCOG has decided to not move forward with the Inglewood Transit Connector project.

Councilmember Behrendt announced a hazardous waste disposal and document shredding event on Saturday, November 2, 2024 at the Redondo Beach Performing Arts Center from 8:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m.

Councilmember Nehrenheim reported attending the Cal Cities Conference in Long Beach.

Mayor Light commended Harbor Patrol and Fire Department for the recent rescue and their proactive measures to warn people and close Yacht Club Way to prevent dangerous situations; spoke about the City receiving commendations for its homeless programs; reported the Chamber recognized City Attorney Mike Webb as Man of the Year and listed other recognitions to the team.

E. APPROVE ORDER OF AGENDA

F. AGENCY RECESS - None

G. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS

G.1 For Blue Folder Documents Approved at the City Council Meeting

City Clerk Manzano noted Blue Folder Items for H.15, J.1 and L.1.

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to receive and file Blue Folder Items.

Motion carried, 5-0.

H. CONSENT CALENDAR

H.1. APPROVE AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING FOR THE CITY COUNCIL ADJOURNED AND ADJOURNED REGULAR MEETING OF OCTOBER 29, 2024

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

H.2. APPROVE MOTION TO READ BY TITLE ONLY AND WAIVE FURTHER READING OF ALL ORDINANCES AND RESOLUTIONS LISTED ON THE AGENDA

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

H.3. APPROVE THE FOLLOWING CITY COUNCIL MINUTES: JUNE 11, 2024

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

H.4. ACCOUNTS PAYABLE DEMAND CHECK 116596 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$156,078.00

CONTACT: STEPHANIE MEYER, INTERIM FINANCE DIRECTOR

H.5. This Item was pulled for separate discussion by Mayor Light.

H.6. AUTHORIZE AN OFFSITE CHANGE ORDER TO THE PUBLIC WORKS CONTRACT WITH CSI SERVICES FOR THE INTERNATIONAL BOARDWALK SURFACE REPAIR PROJECT TO IMPLEMENT THE RIVIERA VILLAGE (SIDEWALK) IMPROVEMENTS PROJECT, JOB NO. 41310, IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$484,748, AND RETAIN THE CITY ENGINEER'S AUTHORIZATION LIMIT OF 10% FOR ANY FUTURE CHANGE ORDERS ASSOCIATED WITH THE INTERNATIONAL BOARDWALK PROJECT

CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR

H.7. APPROVE THE PURCHASE OF TEN 2025 FORD INTERCEPTORS FROM OLATHE FORD FOR USE BY THE POLICE DEPARTMENT FOR A TOTAL COST OF \$913,149

CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR

H.8. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2410-102 A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING THE SUSPENSION OF PREFERENTIAL PARKING HOURS IN THE VINCENT AND VINCENT 2 PREFERENTIAL PARKING DISTRICTS ON NOVEMBER 1, 2024

CONTACT: JOSEPH HOFFMAN, CHIEF OF POLICE

H.9. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2410-103, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA AMENDING THE OFFICIAL BOOK OF CLASS SPECIFICATIONS TO UPDATE THE JOB SPECIFICATION FOR THE POSITION OF DEPUTY HARBOR MASTER/BOAT CAPTAIN

CONTACT: PATRICK BUTLER, FIRE CHIEF

H.10. This Item was pulled by Councilmember Nehrenheim for separate discussion.

H.11. APPROVE THE PURCHASE OF RUBRIK DATA BACKUP AND RECOVERY APPLIANCES, CLOUD SERVICES, AND IMPLEMENTATION SERVICES FROM SABLE COMPUTER INC., DBA KEEP IT SIMPLE, FOR AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$191,796

CONTACT: MIKE COOK, INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY DIRECTOR

H.12. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH REVENUE & COST SPECIALISTS, LLC (RCS) TO STUDY THE CITY'S COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT AND IMPACT FEE STRUCTURE FOR AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$47,700

CONTACT: MARC WIENER, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

H.13. APPROVE HISTORIC PROPERTY PRESERVATION AGREEMENTS FOR THE PROPERTIES LOCATED AT 317 NORTH FRANCISCA AVENUE, 516 GARNET, AND 517 GARNET BEGINNING ON OCTOBER 29, 2024 FOR THE TERM OF TEN YEARS WITH AUTOMATIC RENEWAL EVERY YEAR THEREAFTER

CONTACT: MARC WIENER, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

H.14. This Item was pulled by Councilmember Kaluderovic for separate discussion.

H.15. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH PRO DOCUMENT SOLUTIONS, INC. DBA PROVOTE SOLUTIONS FOR THE MARCH 4, 2025 GENERAL MUNICIPAL ELECTION PRINT AND MAIL SERVICES IN THE AMOUNT OF \$137,755.35, FOR THE TERM BEGINNING OCTOBER 29, 2024 AND ENDING APRIL 30, 2025.

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

Councilmember Nehrenheim pulled Item No. H.10 from Consent for separate discussion.

Councilmember Kaluderovic pulled Item No. H.14 from Consent for separate discussion.

Mayor Light pulled Item No. H.5 from Consent for separate discussion.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Mark Hansen (via Zoom), King Harbor Boater, spoke in strong support of Item No. H.9 and opined it is a very well thought out proposal.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and approved by voice vote, the Consent Calendar, as amended, removing Items No.

H.5, H.10 and H.14 from Consent for separate discussions.

Motion carried, 5-0.

City Clerk Manzano read titles to Resolutions No. CC-2410-102 and CC-2410-103.

I. EXCLUDED CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS

H.5. EXCUSED ABSENCES FROM VARIOUS COMMISSION AND COMMITTEE MEETINGS

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

Mayor Light reported Staff is working towards a system where all attendees/non-attendees will be tracked; mentioned it should go online next month and looked forward to the system; pointed out one person who has missed more meetings than he has attended for the last three years and is considering approaching Council to remove that person from the commission if they cannot commit the time.

Councilmember Behrendt wanted to clarify that this pertains to commissioners who are absent but don't ask to be excused.

Mayor Light confirmed he that Councilmember Behrendt is correct.

City Manager Witzansky noted they will be asking the liaisons at the meetings to note attendance.

Mayor Light suggested not excusing Mr. Gupta for his absences.

Councilmember Loewenstein discussed excusing him if it was an emergency, as he is an Emergency Room doctor.

Councilmember Behrendt stated he would like for Mr. Gupta to have an opportunity to be excused and mentioned the possibility of retroactively excusing him even if they pass the motion.

City Clerk Manzano offered to return to Council with a recommendation after speaking with Mr. Gupta.

There were no public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to excuse all absences as listed in the Administrative Report except for Mr. Gupta's.

Motion carried, 5-0.

H.10. APPROVE THE PURCHASE OF A USED 32-FOOT SEAWAY BAYWATCH FIRE-RESCUE BOAT FOR AN AMOUNT OF \$77,000 (INCLUDING SALES TAX) FROM NEWPORT HARBOR TOURS C/O JEFF KLEID TO REPLACE FIRE BOAT #808 IN THE CITY'S FLEET INVENTORY

AUTHORIZE THE PURCHASE OF BOAT UPFITTING MATERIAL AND SERVICES FROM KING HARBOR MARINE CENTER IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$79,836

ADOPT BY 4/5TH VOTE AND TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2410-104 A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, AUTHORIZING A 2024-2025 FISCAL YEAR BUDGET MODIFICATION TO APPROPRIATE \$156,836 FROM THE VEHICLE REPLACEMENT FUND TO THE PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT 2024-2025 FISCAL YEAR OPERATING BUDGET TO FUND THE PURCHASE OF THE FIRE RESCUE BOAT

CONTACT: PATRICK BUTLER, FIRE CHIEF

Councilmember Nehrenheim expressed concerns that the subject boat is 50 years old and asked for input from RBFD Chief Butler regarding the vessel.

RBFD Chief Butler presented background information; talked about researching boat options; reported that L.A. County currently has six sister ships on their fleet; stated they did a full boat survey, engine survey and sea trial (uploaded to the file) and concluded the boat will last another twenty years; commented on the Boston Whaler and it is not designed to do the work they are needing to do; opined that older vessels are built better and felt the vessel will perform well, be immediately put into service and will save the City money. He discussed his extensive knowledge and experience building engines and managing fleets, addressed the pros and cons of gas engines versus diesel; explained the reasons why RBFD are looking at this vessel including the results of the boat surveys and the sea trial; mentioned talking to the Baywatch folks and realized RBFD is the only paramedic rescue boat in 385 square miles of Santa Monica Bay; they are required to go out and rescue people that may have started their trip in RB but need rescue efforts somewhere in Palos Verdes (as an example); stated the platform to save people's lives is better served on the Seaway.

Councilmember Nehrenheim provided a brief history of the vessel; expressed his concerns including long term maintenance costs; noted it has had a lot of work done to it and the City will be putting in a lot more; questioned the value in the City obtaining this now as there is not enough money in the budget and mentioned the police boat costs.

Discussion followed regarding maintenance and maintenance costs regarding the vessel; RBFD Chief Butler stated this is a policy decision for the Council and he is just

there to provide information.

Councilmember Nehrenheim asked that the Harbor Commission be allowed to provide input; noted the need to be careful with this purchase; commented on the fact that it is a diesel boat and meant for open seas; felt that further discussion is warranted.

Mayor Light agreed with Chief Butler's assessment of gas versus diesel; noted the boat that is being replaced is gas and commented on safety concerns with the existing boat.

Discussion followed regarding the pros of the Baywatch boat which is similar to the Seaway being considered; mentioned the rescue recently done used the Baywatch boat and not the other rescue boat since the Baywatch boat was better suited to handle the rescue.

Councilmember Nehrenheim expressed concerns with the lack of maintenance and depleting the Tidelands Fund.

City Manager Witzansky explained the funds are in the Vehicle Replacement Fund, but its origin is from the Tidelands Fund.

Chief Butler added there is a lot of interest in the Boston Whaler which could fetch a fair amount of money through a seal-bid process, which may offset some of the costs; opined it will serve the City well, it will be worth the money, and will help save lives.

Councilmember Nehrenheim stated that he is just asking for more input from the Harbor Commission; opined there are other options available that they should consider.

Councilmember Obagi thanked the Chief and team members for finding the vessel; spoke about the money expected from the sale of the Boston Whaler and addressed resulting improvements to public safety.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Behrendt, to approve Item No. H.10.

Councilmember Behrendt thanked Councilmember Nehrenheim for raising valid points.

Councilmember Loewenstein mentioned they were rushed the last time they purchased a police boat; agreed it would be helpful to have the Harbor Commission provide input and noted the City has until December 1st to decide; added that the long-term goal would be to get a grant for a new boat that would last at least 50 years; suggested looking into it.

City Clerk Manzano pointed out the Harbor Commission does not have a meeting scheduled for November since it fell on Veteran's Day

More discussion followed regarding boat options.

In reply to Councilmember Kaluderovic's question, Mayor Light expressed support for the purchase and explained his reasons.

Substitute motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to send this item to the Harbor Commission for review and return to Council pending their input.

Substitute to the substitute motion by Councilmember Behrendt, to approve Item H.10, as presented. Councilmember Behrendt withdrew the substitute to the substitute motion, as it was identical to the original motion.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Mark Hansen (via Zoom), King Harbor Boater, spoke in support of the item; strongly agreed with the Administrative Report; talked about the importance of the swim step; felt this is a unique deal for the City and recommended approval.

There were no other public comments on this item.

The substitute motion failed 2-3, by voice vote. Councilmembers Behrendt, Kaluderovic and Obagi were opposed.

City Manager Witzansky noted the need for 4/5th vote.

The motion carried 4-1, by voice vote. Councilmember Nehrenheim was opposed.

City Clerk Manzano read title to Resolution No. CC-2410-104.

H.14. APPROVE A NEW AGREEMENT WITH EVAN BROOKS ASSOCIATES, INC. FOR GRANT WRITING SERVICES FOR A TOTAL AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$60,792 AND THE TERM OCTOBER 30, 2024 THROUGH OCTOBER 29, 2027

CONTACT: LUKE SMUDE, ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER

Councilmember Kaluderovic requested prioritizing the shooting range as one of the items.

City Manager Witzansky explained that is one of the reasons Staff is recommending an update to the agreement.

There were no public comments on this item.

Discussion followed regarding this item involving appropriating money that was carried over year-over-year of the original contract amount, implementing new grant ideas and continuing to monitor grant cycles.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, Item No. H.14.

Motion carried, 5-0.

Councilmember Obagi left the chambers at 7:15 p.m.

J. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

J.1 For eComments and Emails Received from the Public

Mayor Light invited public participation on non-agenda items.

Delia A. Vechi mentioned she was there on behalf of another person who couldn't be there and herself; spoke of food trucks and specifically about one that comes every day at 4:00 p.m. on PCH; questioned if he has a permit and stated they have blatant disregard for the neighborhood and value of property; talked about prohibition of food trucks by the City and used Manhattan Beach as an example; stated MB does not allow food trucks on private property, coastal zones, residential neighborhoods, open space zones, and local commercial areas; stated this is why Redondo Beach has the lower property values of the South Bay.

Niki Negrete-Mitchell, District 3, thanked Council for the communications about invasive drones used by Metro; talked about existing pipelines; mentioned that trenching requires a larger footprint; talked about traffic on Kingsdale when buses are on the road.

Brad Waller, District 1, Keep the Esplanade Beautiful, invited the public to their next First Saturday Clean up event on November 2, 2024 at 9:00 a.m.; announced Keep the Esplanade Beautiful was named Non-profit of the Year by the Chamber of Commerce and expressed his appreciation.

Councilmember Obagi returned to the chambers at 7:21 p.m.

Laura Duke thanked Council for everything that it does; discussed Measure BC and urged residents to oppose the measure; used Kensington as an example of how they sway people to support it; questioned whether their plans make fiscal sense and whether they truly focus on benefiting all residents of the Beach Cities; referenced an article by the editorial board of the Daily Breeze that pointed out that bond critics have said this measure would increase taxes for the three beach cities for 40 years and recommend "No" for Measure BC.

Councilmember Loewenstein left the chambers at 7:25 p.m. and returned at 7:27 p.m.

Joan Irvine, District 1, announced a Women's March, supporting other groups throughout the country also marching, on Saturday from 10:00 a.m. to noon at Veterans Park; highlighted the importance of legal regulated dispensaries versus the illegal market; offered

to provide additional information.

Holly Osborne, District 5, spoke about use of drones by Metro; reported they are monitoring for fences and walls that they are perceiving as encroachments; opined they are looking to expand by taking slices of property because the ROW is not wide enough, and the hybrid ROW has a wider footprint than other options. She asked that Council consider this in its discussions and suggested getting a recommendation on a good geologist since many are studying the landslides in Palos Verdes.

Monica Suua, CFO of BCHD, corrected a statement regarding Measure BC; noted there is no developer part of the \$30 million bond and explained it involves the demolition of the building, completion of the Alcove construction, open space and connections and parking.

Bob Pinzler referenced the editorial in the Daily Breeze recommending a “No” vote on Measure BC and also recommended voting no.

Byung Cho announced that Redondo Beach Union High School will be hosting a Homecoming on Saturday and invited Council and the public.

Councilmember Loewenstein noted the game is on Friday night.

Mark Nelson (via Zoom) explained that regarding BCHD, the transaction for the lease includes PMBL LLC as a tenant so the private developer that wants to develop the assisted living facility will also develop a two-acre open space lawn and 86 surface parking spaces for the district on land that is not included in the ground lease; stated PMBL LLC (tenant) will also be responsible for demolition of the 514 building. He added that Measure BC is being used to take away those costs from the commercial developer who is looking at the 95-year lease on land; opined he doesn’t know how BCHD does not admit to subsidizing a developer. Additionally, he referenced a comment by Board Member Poster; felt it needs to be struck from the record and found lies by BCHD disturbing.

Nancy Skiba (via Zoom), District 4, spoke about a mailer sent to residents listing early voting locations, one which was at BCHD, and reported she was informed they are not set up for early voting at this time.

There were no other public comments.

K. EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

Councilmember Nehrenheim reported speaking with Councilmember Loewenstein, the public and City staff regarding Item No. L.1.

Councilmember Loewenstein reported speaking with the Mayor, Councilmember Nehrenheim, the public and City staff regarding Item No. L.1.

Councilmember Kaluderovic reported speaking with the Mayor, the public and City staff

regarding Item No. L.1.

Councilmember Obagi reported speaking with the Mayor, Councilmember Behrendt, the public and City staff regarding Item No. L.1.

Councilmember Behrendt reported speaking with the Mayor, Councilmember Obagi, Dan Elder, Ron Gaddis, the public and City staff regarding Item No. L.1.

Mayor Light reported speaking with Members of Council, Staff and members of the public regarding Item No. L.1.

L. PUBLIC HEARINGS

L.1. CONTINUED PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER LAND USE ELEMENT, ZONING ORDINANCE, AND LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM AMENDMENTS, AND CERTIFICATION OF A PROGRAM ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT (EIR) THAT SERVE TO IMPLEMENT THE CITY’S CERTIFIED 6TH CYCLE HOUSING ELEMENT

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2410-105, CERTIFYING THE FINAL PROGRAM ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT (STATE CLEARINGHOUSE NUMBER 2023050732), ADOPTING FINDINGS PURSUANT TO THE CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT, ADOPTING A STATEMENT OF OVERRIDING CONSIDERATIONS, AND ADOPTING A MITIGATION MONITORING AND REPORTING PROGRAM FOR THE REDONDO BEACH FOCUSED GENERAL PLAN UPDATE, ZONING ORDINANCE UPDATE AND LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM AMENDMENT

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2410-106, AMENDING THE GENERAL PLAN LAND USE ELEMENT TO IMPLEMENT THE CITY’S CERTIFIED 6TH CYCLE 2021-2029 HOUSING ELEMENT AND OTHER AMENDMENTS REGARDING RESIDENTIALLY DESIGNATED PROPERTIES NOT IDENTIFIED AS PROGRAM ACTIONS IN THE CITY’S HOUSING ELEMENT

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2410-107, AMENDING THE COASTAL LAND USE PLAN OF THE CITY’S LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM TO IMPLEMENT THE CITY’S CERTIFIED 6TH CYCLE 2021-2029 HOUSING ELEMENT AND OTHER AMENDMENTS REGARDING RESIDENTIALLY DESIGNATED PROPERTIES NOT IDENTIFIED AS PROGRAM ACTIONS IN THE CITY’S HOUSING ELEMENT

INTRODUCE BY TITLE ONLY ORDINANCE NO. CC-3281-24, AMENDING TITLE 10, CHAPTER 1 SUBDIVISIONS OF THE REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE FOR CONSISTENCY WITH THE GENERAL PLAN LAND

USE ELEMENT AND TO IMPLEMENT THE CITY'S CERTIFIED 6TH CYCLE 2021-2029 HOUSING ELEMENT AND OTHER AMENDMENTS REGARDING RESIDENTIALLY DESIGNATED PROPERTIES NOT IDENTIFIED AS PROGRAM ACTIONS IN THE CITY'S HOUSING ELEMENT. FOR INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING.

INTRODUCE BY TITLE ONLY ORDINANCE NO. 3282-24, AMENDING TITLE 10 PLANNING AND ZONING, CHAPTER 2 ZONING AND LAND USE OF THE REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE FOR CONSISTENCY WITH THE GENERAL PLAN LAND USE ELEMENT AND TO IMPLEMENT THE CITY'S CERTIFIED 6TH CYCLE 2021-2029 HOUSING ELEMENT AND OTHER AMENDMENTS REGARDING RESIDENTIALLY DESIGNATED PROPERTIES NOT IDENTIFIED AS PROGRAM ACTIONS IN THE CITY'S HOUSING ELEMENT. FOR INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING.

INTRODUCE BY TITLE ONLY ORDINANCE NO. 3283-24, AMENDING TITLE 10 PLANNING AND ZONING, CHAPTER 5 COASTAL LAND USE PLAN IMPLEMENTING ORDINANCE OF THE REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE FOR CONSISTENCY WITH THE GENERAL PLAN LAND USE ELEMENT AND TO IMPLEMENT THE CITY'S CERTIFIED 6TH CYCLE 2021-2029 HOUSING ELEMENT AND OTHER AMENDMENTS REGARDING RESIDENTIALLY DESIGNATED PROPERTIES NOT IDENTIFIED AS PROGRAM ACTIONS IN THE CITY'S HOUSING ELEMENT. FOR INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING.

PROCEDURES:

- 1. Open the public hearing, take testimony**
- 2. Close the public hearing**
- 3. Adopt Resolution No. CC-2410-105, certifying the Final Program EIR, adopting findings pursuant to CEQA, adopting a Statement of Overriding Considerations, and adopting a mitigation monitoring and reporting program**
- 4. Adopt Resolution No. CC-2410-106, amending the General Plan Land Use Element**
- 5. Adopt Resolution No. CC-2410-107, amending the Land Use Plan of the City's Certified Local Coastal Program**
- 6. Introduce for first reading Ordinance No. CC-3281-24, amending Title 10, Chapter 1 Subdivisions of the Redondo Beach Municipal Code**
- 7. Introduce for first reading Ordinance No. CC-3282-24, amending Title 10, Chapter 2 Zoning and Land Use of the Redondo Beach Municipal Code**
- 8. Introduce for first reading Ordinance No. CC-3283-24, amending Title 10, Chapter 5 Coastal Land Use Plan Implementing Ordinance of the Redondo Municipal Code, and**
- 9. Provide staff with direction regarding the proposed re-zoning from R-1 to C-2 on Torrance Boulevard and RH to C-2 on Pacific Coast Highway**

CONTACT: MARC WIENER, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and approved by voice vote, to reopen the public hearing.

Motion carried, 5-0.

Community Development Director Wiener introduced Planning Manager Sean Scully and the Placeworks team; narrated a PowerPoint presentation with details of the Administrative Report including: background, items for adoption tonight (amendments to existing Land Use Element and Zoning Ordinances), areas of change, residential overlay sites, zoning ordinance changes and guest parking requirements; stressed the need to implement Housing Element to meet statutory deadline of February 12, 2025; listed the resolutions and ordinances needed for adoption specifically for the Housing Element.

Councilmember Behrendt left the chambers at 7:49 p.m. and returned at 7:51 p.m.

Planning Manager Scully continued the PowerPoint presentation, addressing zoning map amendments to residential and mixed use to commercial zones not required by the Housing Element or State law; discussed options for the Artesia corridor and PCH; spoke about actions to be made tonight.

Councilmember Nehrenheim left the chambers at 7:52 p.m. and returned at 7:55 p.m.

Discussion followed regarding options for legal non-conforming properties, allowing property owners to maintain and improve their properties, other amendments to the non-conforming section, the possibility of further discussions regarding legal non-conforming, and the MU1 zone.

Jennifer Kelley (via Zoom), introduced herself as the project manager with Placeworks for the CEQA component of the project; continued with the presentation; addressed the Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR) and CEQA process.

Community Development Director Wiener stated the recommended action is to open the public hearing, take testimony, and then close the public hearing; offered to respond to questions from Council.

Councilmember Behrendt complemented City staff and the GPAC for their work on this matter.

Councilmember Obagi thanked Placeworks for their work in helping the City obtain certification for its Housing Element.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Georgette Gantner hoped that the changes proposed for PCH will help close up some of

the vacancies on PCH; spoke about the need for BCHD to update their property; talked about their plans for replacing open space, an outdoor exercise facility and an assisted living facility; mentioned it should not hinder the FAR to less than what other properties are being allowed; referenced the Legado property; addressed inconsistencies regarding the FAR in the Planning Commission's consideration and wondered if BCHD is having some spot zoning issues. Additionally, she shared her experience using BCHD services and classes; hoped Council would justifiably correct the FAR and make it consistent.

Delia A Vechi urged Council to hold the line of excessive development and protect public lands; spoke in support of the Planning Commission's recommendation of a 0.5 FAR for public lands; suggested that exceptions be allowed only for schools, police and fire facilities if there is no other option; shared her experiences having a Master's in Architecture and Planning; stated there are already 9 existing assisted care facilities in the City; asked Council to save the community and the value of the properties.

Holly Osborne, District 5, referenced the FAR in the commercial area of Artesia Boulevard; reported she heard that Council wants to double it and urged Council not to do it.

Mayor Light interjected that Council is not considering commercial zones tonight.

Jeanne Sinsheimer, District 3, commented she did not understand why one area is being given special circumstances to address the FAR; believed they should appear before the Planning Commission with specific plans for the site before increasing the FAR.

Kaileen Neuberger, member of Alcove, spoke in support of a 1.25 FAR for BCHD and all other PI properties and mentioned the important services provided by BCHD.

Alina Rashidfarokhi, member of Alcove, spoke in support of a 1.25 FAR for BCHD and all other PI properties; mentioned the important services provided by BCHD; wanted to focus on Alcove and the need for their resources and safe space it provides young people.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and approved by voice vote, to extend Alina Rashidfarokhi time by 30 seconds.

Motion carried, 5-0.

Alina Rashidfarokhi discussed the need to replace the existing building and hoped Council will help meet the community's changing needs.

Geoff Gilbert, District 2, stated he received an email that day from BCHD instructing the many recipients to safeguard and preserve their programs and services and tell the City Council to give BCHD a 1.25 FAR and to treat BCHD fairly; noted there was no mention of the commercial development that would be impacted with a low FAR; gave his insights on BCHD intentions; supported the Planning Commission's recommendations; felt that Council should heed them and commented on the approval process.

Rosann Taylor urged Council to maintain the 0.5 FAR for PI properties; referenced the email she received from BCHD titled "Save the Public Health" that implied without approving a 1.25 FAR they won't be able to provide the services; spoke about BCHD already providing services without a 1.25 FAR; noted it is not about the buildings, but about the people; mentioned the email has no mention of the development of an assisted living facility and that is why they need the change in FAR; felt they are not addressing their real intentions.

Mayor Light left the chambers.

Jane Diehl quoted from several of the City's land-use policies; spoke in support of BCHD; explained that BCHD provides services that the City does not provide and they do it without use of City funding; used covid as an example of how BCHD stepped in to help provide a testing facility; asked Council to make the FAR for one, the FAR for all; reported they will continue to look at other possibilities to develop the property.

Lara Duke spoke about learning the impacts of an increased FAR; questioned whether BCHD really wants a 1.25 FAR for all public lands and not just theirs; noted that too much density is not good for public health; noted BCHD wants an increased FAR to move ahead with a flaky deal with a private developer; mentioned, at a recent Planning Commission meeting, CEO Tom Bakaly attempted a "hot dog and ketchup" analogy with their project's compatibility with the neighborhood; opined his point was in the eye of the beholder; talked about BCHD management being dismissive of residents' concerns; hoped Council will adhere to the GPAC and Planning Commission recommendations to keep the FAR for PI properties low.

Mayor Light returned to the dais.

Sondra Segall listed actions and information provided by BCHD regarding plans for replacing their building; talked about Torrance and Manhattan Beach updating their medical facilities while Redondo Beach has let its medical facilities rot; stated reasons BCHD needs to replace its building, including its inability to survive a major earthquake; mentioned several people who argued for and against BCHD's plans all agreed that BCHD offers benefits and programs used by the community; urged Council to invest in its future.

Mary Ewell spoke in support of maintaining a FAR of 0.5 for all PI properties that are not emergency response buildings; reported that BCHD's end goal is construction of a residential care facility which holds pedestrian risks to the surrounding neighborhood and schools and their well-being; discussed medical services provided by medical doctors who rent their facilities; questioned their claim that healthcare services will be cut if they do not get a 1.25 FAR; talked about public open space being for the public; alleged BCHD has deceived and misrepresented their proposal; urged the public to vote "No" on Measure BC.

Jess Money, District 3, talked about this plan being a development delusion from Sacramento; discussed job losses and increased vacancies in commercial space; addressed the Planning Commission's consideration and recommendations versus the

City Manager's recommendation; talked about potential repercussions if this is approved; urged Council to reject it and consider dissolving BCHD and return the money to their respective cities.

Bob Pinzler spoke about going against Staff's recommendations and the possibility of having a flawed EIR which could provide the underpinning for those who wish to use Builder's Remedy; talked about BCHD's projected structural deficits and naivete such as its support of the Blue Zones Project; suggested approving Staff's recommendation of a .75 FAR; added that if BCHD presents a plan in the future, Council can deal with it then; asserted that the public should vote on this zoning change if it meets the criteria; urged Council to not go back on years of effort that have gone into preserving the City.

Tom Bakaly, CEO of BCHD, referenced a letter from their attorney included in Blue Folder Items with concerns regarding the certification of EIR on the project that BCHD has done; suggested the City can move forward with an EIR revision letter to move to the 1.25 FAR or continue the item for certification until Staff can address Council's direction that was given at the last meeting.

Mayor Light asked Tom Bakaly to clarify whether the public would be allowed access to the BCHD open space.

Tom Bakaly responded by stating the space is open to the public; stated the intention is to provide a space for the public to go and be well and take advantage of the wellness programs BCHD is offering; discussion followed clarifying it will not be fenced off and access is completely open to the public.

Councilmember Obagi directed a question to Staff asking to clarify if the actions tonight are to set the FAR for BCHD or not.

Community Development Director Marc Wiener reported Council will decide on the FAR for BCHD and the PI zones at a later date when Staff returns for Phase 2 of the project.

Councilmember Obagi then directed comments to Tom Bakaly stressing he supports the programs that BCHD offers from seniors to youth; stated what is stressing him out, amidst the November 5th election, are the letters the City is receiving from the BCHD attorneys; stated he would like to avoid any sort of adversarial relationship between the City and BCHD; referenced the final EIR from Placeworks and noted that Placeworks responded to inquiries by BCHD's letter from September 11, 2024.

Tom Bakaly stated BCHD does not believe it is responsive to their letter.

Councilmember Nehrenheim spoke about Measure RB, which affects the Charter, and asked for Mr. Bakaly's opinion.

Tom Bakaly felt it would be inappropriate for him to speak about it at that time; responded to questions from Councilmember Nehrenheim about the process; noted they felt they were

kept out of the loop with decision by Council for a .75 FAR; voiced concerns with technical components of the EIR.

Councilmember Loewenstein agreed with Councilmember Obagi regarding BCHD's threat of legal action; expressed concerns with the mass emails being distributed by BCHD claiming their programs are at risk; noted community concerns on both sides of the issue; stated his disapproval of BCHD's tactics in gaining support of the community; added that the financial terms need to be disclosed and expressed disappointment with their tactics.

More discussion followed.

Councilmember Kaluderovic mentioned Council received many emails on both sides; noted she can feel there is passion on both sides and asserted that tonight Council is discussing the EIR.

Councilmember Obagi explained that under CEQA, for any discretionary decision undertaken by Council, the City must study the project's potential environmental impacts; reported the City has a final EIR that does not analyze a 1.25 FAR at BCHD; stated Council has directed Staff to undertake that analysis but it is not ready yet; added that in no circumstance could Council approve a 1.25 FAR today.

Addressing Tom Bakaly, Councilmember Nehrenheim talked about the youth mental health services provided by BCHD and asked about the possibility of going to a Measure DD.

Tom Bakaly noted they are not required to go through a Measure DD and felt it is important to maintain flexibility to address the health needs of the future; pointed out that this is a situation where two public agencies are in disagreement but are able to still get along and felt that is a positive thing to reflect on.

Councilmember Nehrenheim stated he has no animosity and spoke it is more about the importance of process; discussion followed regarding BCHD's concerns regarding the EIR.

Jackie Ecklund, Torrance, urged Council to maintain the 0.50 FAR recommended by the Planning Commission; noted BCHD land is surrounding by residential neighborhoods; reported BCHD's plans would involve a 7-story building; expressed concerns with air pollution connected with the demolition and construction, as well as noise; discussed the location of the power generator; reiterated her support for the Planning Commission's recommendations and disagreed with the tactics in terms of threats of lawsuits. In response to Councilmember Kaluderovic's question, she confirmed she is aware of the City of Torrance's support for the Metro Green Line along the ROW.

Phil Sanchez (former Planning Commissioner), District 4, spoke about his experience in local government; addressed PI designations and other land-uses; discussed consistencies in the FAR and especially for uses that are available to everyone such as Police, Fire, Wellness and Healthcare.

Dennis McLean spoke in support of a 1.25 FAR for BCHD; noted he is a CPA; stated he studied the financial condition of BCHD; opined there is no structural deficit in BCHD; addressed their financial statements and reports; mentioned revenue sources and expected additional revenues from public/private partnerships; offered his help if needed.

Robert Caplan thanked Council for their hard work; spoke about his background and experience; discussed minimizing impacts of how things are planned for specific groups while maximizing the benefit for the larger community; mentioned research related to Blue Zones.

Wayne Craig, District 1 and Planning Commissioner, referenced examples he presented previously at another meeting on what a 1.25 FAR would look like; mentioned the Planning Commission's views and considerations and explained that is how the 0.5 FAR came about; gave scenarios of why Fire and Police are different from BCHD in terms of emergencies; explained there was nothing nefarious about the Commission's decision.

More discussion followed.

Ann Wilson spoke in support of a 0.50 FAR on PI land; noted the work of the GPAC and Planning Commission should not be swept aside for special interests; discussed the City's vision and guiding principles; addressed reasons for protecting PI land; referenced BCHD's master plan and talked about the negative impacts and precedents of increasing the FAR for the future.

Nick Biro, District 5 and former GPAC, reported the GPAC did not discuss a 0.75 FAR for BCHD; urged Council not to certify the EIR at this time and wait until the addendum on the 1.25 FAR is prepared, included, and considered.

Eugene Solomon, City Treasurer, asserted that the issue is not about the FAR, but about the business model; noted presently there is no FAR; spoke about the attempt by BCHD to partner with a private company but it did not work out; mentioned it is correlation without causation and that the public is being led to believe that the City is at fault for BCHD's failure to secure a private/public partnership by adopting a .75 FAR; discussed financial planning projections for 2024/2025, 2025/2026 and 2026/2027, Alcove funding, long-term financial strategies.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and approved by voice vote, to extend Eugene Solomon's time by 30 seconds.

Motion carried, 5-0.

Eugene Solomon asserted BCHD could not work with the private developer for other reasons than the FAR and mentioned BCHD has other public/private partnerships which provide funding and services other than the subject location; reiterated it is the business model and not the FAR that is the problem.

Councilmember Kaluderovic left the chambers and returned shortly thereafter.

Amber Guerrero (via Zoom), Venice Family Clinic, spoke in support of a 1.25 FAR for BCHD and all PI lands; discussed services provided by the organization and urged Council to continue its support of the BCHD.

Mark Nelson (via Zoom) mentioned the BCHD EIR is irrelevant and does not cover the increase to all PI lands; spoke about BCHD being litigious and mentioned they have spent \$3 million of their \$14 million budget for their Healthy Living Campus on lawyers; suggested they stop calling open space “program space” and calling it “public open space”; talked about BCHD’s statement that they have no obligation nor ability to value their community benefits; addressed their revenue sources and reported it has been a string of bad financial decisions; mentioned 33% of the revenue BCHD receives is from property tax and 50% is from renting out land and buildings that were paid for by tax payers.

City Clerk Manzano reported receiving 46 eComments in support of, 34 in opposition to and one neutral to the item.

In response to Mayor Light’s question, Community Development Director Wiener reported that 0.85 was identified as the FAR in the EIR; explained the environmental impacts are not only based on the FAR, but on the use, number of anticipated employees and associated vehicle trips and the FAR is just one aspect; added that Staff believes there is some tolerance of 0.85 to 1.0; stated Council directed Staff to evaluate potentially accommodating a 1.25 FAR, in which case it will be through an addendum or a Supplemental EIR (SEIR); clarified that because there is an addendum it must be done after EIR certification.

In reply to Councilmember Obagi’s question regarding a timeline for Staff to return with the results of the 1.25 FAR analysis, Community Development Director Wiener estimated it would be towards the end of November since most of their energy has been towards the EIR.

Councilmember Obagi asked the City Manager for his recommendation at this time.

City Manager Witzansky suggested continuing tonight’s public hearing until the November 5, 2024 Council Meeting prior to considering final certification of the EIR; reported the CEQA process does not implement the FAR policy; explained the EIR is a study and not the implementing decision and that tonight’s item considered the General Plan EIR in its totality and subsequent policy decisions associated with the implementation of the sixth cycle Housing Element. He added that it is proposed that secondary considerations would be made for other elements in the General Plan not related to the Housing Element implementation; reported Staff is considering including BCHD land uses under the Housing Element as a Phase 2 decision for Council.

More discussion followed.

Councilmember Obagi stated he does not believe in limiting the amount of taxpayer-funded and taxpayer-owned land; noted the decision on the BCHD FAR will be a decision that will occur at a later point and it will take some time; stressed that, if during this process, BCHD decides to move ahead with a lawsuit against the City the partnership with the City will suffer since BCHD will be suing the City and residents of the City of Redondo Beach and bleeding the pockets of the residents dry and causing unnecessary legal fees.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Behrendt, to continue the public hearing until the November 5, 2024 City Council meeting.

Councilmember Obagi left the chambers and returned shortly thereafter.

Councilmember Nehrenheim asked for the City Manager's opinion regarding delaying certification of the EIR.

City Manager Witzansky agreed that the District has been properly noticed of the process; acknowledged differences in opinion and felt taking an extra week to address the issue procedurally is a good decision.

Councilmember Nehrenheim asked for Assistant City Attorney Cheryl Park's opinion.

Assistant City Attorney Park stated that whether to continue the hearing or not is Council's decision.

Councilmember Nehrenheim felt the concerns have been heard and addressed and is not in favor of the motion; felt the public is going to be frustrated not moving this item forward.

Mayor Light acknowledged the comments and emails received; felt it would be prudent to wait the extra week as recommended by Staff.

Councilmember Obagi stressed to the public that Council will not be selecting an FAR for BCHD at its next meeting.

The motion carried 5-0, by voice vote.

M. ITEMS CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS AGENDAS – None

N. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION PRIOR TO ACTION - None

O. CITY MANAGER ITEMS - None

P. MAYOR AND COUNCIL ITEMS

P.1. DISCUSSION AND CONSIDERATION OF MAYOR APPOINTMENTS TO THE HOUSING AUTHORITY

Mayor Light spoke about the two applicants; corrected a typographical error in one of the applications and recommended them as Members of the Housing Authority.

There were no public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, the Mayor's appointments to the Housing Authority.

The motion carried, 5-0.

Q. MAYOR AND COUNCIL REFERRALS TO STAFF

Councilmember Nehrenheim spoke in support of a resolution supporting Small Business Week.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, to discuss at the next meeting, issuing a resolution in support of Small Business Week the Saturday after Thanksgiving.

The motion carried, 5-0.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, to add a discussion on an upcoming agenda regarding AB 1234 reporting.

Mayor Light asked for a definition of AB 1234; Councilmember Nehrenheim detailed out the meaning of AB 1234.

The motion carried, 5-0.

Councilmember Loewenstein asked for an update on the electronic signage ordinance and City Manager Witzansky reported that it is forthcoming.

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to place on the next agenda, adjournment in memory of Jack Epstein.

Motion carried 5-0.

Councilmember Kaluderovic reported receiving emails from residents requesting improvements at the Perry Park fields and noted it needs serious attention.

Councilmember Behrendt requested a BRR for a shade structure at Dale Page Park.

In response to Mayor Light's question regarding the status of establishing Rules of Conduct, City Manager Witzansky noted that it is in progress.

R. RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION – None

The Closed Session meeting was cancelled.

S. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION – None

The Closed Session meeting was cancelled.

T. ADJOURNMENT – 10:17 p.m.

There being no further business to come before the City Council, motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to adjourn the meeting at 10:17 p.m. to an Adjourned Regular meeting to be held at 4:30 p.m. (Closed Session) and a Regular meeting to held at 6:00 p.m., on Tuesday, November 5, 2024 in the Redondo Beach City Hall Council Chambers 415 N. Pacific Coast Hwy. Redondo Beach, California.

Motion carried, 5-0.

All written comments submitted via eComment are included in the record and available for public review on the City website.

Respectfully submitted:

DocuSigned by:
Eleanor Manzano
72F2AC716C214CF...

Eleanor Manzano, CMC
City Clerk



Minutes
Redondo Beach City Council
Tuesday, November 5, 2024
Closed Session - Adjourned Regular Meeting 4:30 p.m.
Open Session –Regular Meeting 6:00 p.m.

4:30 PM - CLOSED SESSION – ADJOURNED REGULAR MEETING

A. CALL MEETING TO ORDER

An Adjourned Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 4:30 p.m. by Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

B. ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Loewenstein, Nehenheim, Obagi,
Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic

Councilmembers Absent: Mayor Light

Officials Present: Mike Witzansky, City Manager
Melissa Villa, Analyst

C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION - NONE

D. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS

There were no Blue Folder Items for Closed Session.

E. PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS ON CLOSED SESSION ITEMS AND NON-AGENDA ITEMS

There were no public communications on Closed Session items and non-agenda items.

F. RECESS TO CLOSED – 4:34 p.m.

Analyst Villa read title to the items to be considered in Closed Session.

City Manager Witzansky announced that the following would be participating in Closed Session: City Manager Mike Witzansky, City Attorney Mike Webb, Assistant City Attorney Cheryl Park, Human Resources Director Diane Strickfaden, and W.E.D. Director Greg Kapovich.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, to recess to Closed Session at 4:34 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

F.1. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL AND LABOR NEGOTIATOR - The Closed Session is authorized by the Government Code Sec. 54957.6.

AGENCY NEGOTIATOR:

Mike Witzansky, City Manager

Diane Strickfaden, Director of Human Resources

EMPLOYEE ORGANIZATIONS:

Management and Confidential Bargaining Unit and Redondo Beach Firefighters' Association - Fire Management Unit

CONTACT: DIANE STRICKFADEN, DIRECTOR OF HUMAN RESOURCES

F.2. CONFERENCE WITH REAL PROPERTY NEGOTIATOR - The Closed Session is authorized by the Government Code Section 54956.8.

AGENCY NEGOTIATOR:

Mike Witzansky, City Manager

Greg Kapovich, Waterfront & Economic Development Director

PROPERTY:

230 Portofino Way, Redondo Beach, CA 90277 (a portion of APN: 7503-029-903)

NEGOTIATING PARTIES:

John Warner - Marine Mammal Care Center Los Angeles, a non-profit corporation

UNDER NEGOTIATION:

Price and Terms

F.3. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).

Name of Case:

Millicent F. Fogenay, an individual v. Robert Martin, an individual; Tyler M. Ryan, an individual; and Does 1 to 25, inclusive

Case Number: 23STCV30302

G. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION – 6:00 p.m.

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic reconvened to Open Session at 6:00 p.m.

H. ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi,
Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic

Councilmembers Absent: Mayor Light

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk
Mike Webb, City Attorney
Mike Witzansky, City Manager
Lucie Colombo, Chief Deputy City Clerk

I. ANNOUNCEMENT OF CLOSED SESSION ACTIONS

City Attorney Webb announced that under Item No. F.3, Council unanimously authorized the City Attorney to defend the City in the matter.

J. ADJOURN TO REGULAR MEETING

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to adjourn to the regular meeting at 6:01 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

6:00 PM - OPEN SESSION – REGULAR MEETING

A. CALL TO ORDER

A Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 6:01 p.m. by Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

B. ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi,
Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic

Councilmembers Absent: Mayor Light

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk
Mike Webb, City Attorney
Mike Witzansky, City Manager
Lucie Colombo, Chief Deputy City Clerk

C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic invited Veterans and Active Military to stand and be recognized them for their service.

James, 7th Grader, Adams Middle School, led in the salute to the flag.

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic called for a moment of silence.

D. PRESENTATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/ANNOUNCEMENTS

Councilmember Nehrenheim addressed the recent District 1 Community Meeting and the Riviera Village Halloween Spooktacular; announced the upcoming Veterans Day events at Veterans Park and spoke about the sale of bricks to memorialize family members who served.

Councilmember Loewenstein thanked Redondo Beach First Responders for responding to a capsized boat off Avenue C; mentioned five people were saved and one person passed; announced the District 2 Community Meeting towards the latter half of the month.

Councilmember Obagi announced the District 4 Community Meeting on Wednesday, November 20, 2024 at 6:00 p.m. at the Perry Park Senior Center; thanked the RBPD and Rbfd for their support of making their workplace a better place and spoke about the culture and dedication provided under the leadership of Chiefs Hoffman and Butler.

Councilmember Behrendt agreed with Councilmember Obagi regarding the City's Public Services Officers and thanked them for their service.

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic thanked the City's Public Services Officers for their work and support; announced that last Wednesday the City celebrated a functional zero event related to homelessness, which means the City is housing more people than are coming into the City unhoused; noted this is a significant accomplishment in the City; spoke about recent Halloween events and the 120th Homecoming Game at Redondo Union High School.

E. APPROVE ORDER OF AGENDA

City Manager Witzansky reported that under Item No. N.1 the presenter, Rebecca Elder, had a family emergency was unable to attend and asked to continue the matter until the City Council meeting of December 3, 2024.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and approved by voice vote, the order of the agenda, as amended, continuing Item No. N.1 to the City Council meeting of December 3, 2024.

Motion carried 5-0. Mayor Light was absent.

F. AGENCY RECESS – 6:12 p.m.

F.1. REGULAR MEETING OF THE COMMUNITY FINANCING AUTHORITY

CONTACT: STEPHANIE MEYER, INTERIM FINANCE DIRECTOR

RECONVENE TO REGULAR MEETING FROM AGENCY MEETING – 6:15 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi,
Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic

Councilmembers Absent: Mayor Light

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, to approve the order of the agenda for the Community Financing Authority.

Motion carried, 5-0. Mayor Light was absent.

There were no other public comments on this item.

G. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS

G.1 For Blue Folder Documents Approved at the City Council Meeting

City Clerk Manzano noted Blue Folder Items for J.1, L.2 and P.1.

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to receive and file Blue Folder Items.

Motion carried, 5-0. Mayor Light was absent.

H. CONSENT CALENDAR

H.1. APPROVE AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING FOR THE CITY COUNCIL ADJOURNED AND REGULAR MEETING OF NOVEMBER 5, 2024

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

H.2. APPROVE MOTION TO READ BY TITLE ONLY AND WAIVE FURTHER READING OF ALL ORDINANCES AND RESOLUTIONS LISTED ON THE

AGENDA

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

H.3. APPROVE THE FOLLOWING CITY COUNCIL MINUTES: NONE

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

H.4. PAYROLL DEMANDS

**CHECKS 30003-30016 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$15,191.93, PD. 10/25/24
DIRECT DEPOSIT 285854-286464 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$2,284,587.00, PD.
10/25/24**

EFT/ACH \$9,246.68, PD. 8/16/24 (PP2417)

EFT/ACH \$364,988.43, PD. 9/4/24 (PP2417)

EFT/ACH \$451,451.84, PD. 9/18/24 (PP2418)

EFT/ACH \$26,015.59, PD. 10/13/24 (PP2418)

**ACCOUNTS PAYABLE DEMANDS CHECKS 116598-116801 IN THE
AMOUNT OF \$3,115,127.72**

EFT CALPERS MEDICAL INSURANCE \$460,608.76

**DIRECT DEPOSIT 100008820-100008909 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$93,923.47,
PD.11/1/24**

REPLACEMENT DEMAND 116597

CONTACT: STEPHANIE MEYER, INTERIM FINANCE DIRECTOR

H.5. APPROVE CONTRACTS UNDER \$35,000:

**1. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH SHARP PERFORMANCE, INC. FOR
COGNITIVE PERFORMANCE COACHING SERVICES FOR AN AMOUNT NOT
TO EXCEED \$2,500 AND THE TERM NOVEMBER 5, 2024 TO NOVEMBER 5,
2025**

**2. APPROVE AN AMENDMENT TO THE AGREEMENT WITH FEHR & PEERS,
INC. TO PERFORM A SPEED STUDY ON INGLEWOOD AVE FOR AN
ADDITIONAL AMOUNT OF \$6,500 AND THE EXISTING TERM THROUGH
JUNE 30, 2027**

**3. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH FIRSTTWO, INC. FOR A SOFTWARE
APPLICATION FOR AN ANNUAL AMOUNT OF \$10,800, PLUS A 5% PRICE
INCREASE FOR EACH ADDITIONAL YEAR, AND THE TERM JULY 1, 2024
TO JUNE 30, 2025 WITH A MAXIMUM OF FIVE RENEWAL YEARS**

CONTACT: STEPHANIE MEYER, INTERIM FINANCE DIRECTOR

**H.6. APPROVE A THREE-YEAR AGREEMENT WITH VESTIS FOR PUBLIC
WORKS DEPARTMENT EMPLOYEE UNIFORM SERVICES FOR AN ANNUAL**

COST NOT TO EXCEED \$38,842 AND THE TERM NOVEMBER 6, 2024 TO NOVEMBER 5, 2027

CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR

- H.7. APPROVE A MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING (MOU) WITH THE CITIES OF HERMOSA BEACH, MANHATTAN BEACH, AND TORRANCE ESTABLISHING THE TERMS, CONDITIONS, AND COST SHARING FOR IMPLEMENTATION OF THE BEACH CITIES REGIONAL GREEN STREETS PROJECT FOR THE BEACH CITIES WATERSHED MANAGEMENT GROUP**

CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR

- H.8. APPROVE A FIVE-YEAR AGREEMENT WITH HADRONEX, INC. TO PROVIDE EQUIPMENT AND MONITORING SERVICES FOR 47 SMART SEWER MANHOLE COVERS FOR AN AVERAGE ANNUAL COST OF \$104,986, A TOTAL FIVE-YEAR COST NOT TO EXCEED \$524,931, AND THE TERM JANUARY 1, 2025 TO DECEMBER 31, 2029**

CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR

- H.9. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2411-108, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH'S AUTHORITY TO FILE APPLICATIONS FOR GRANT FUNDS FROM THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY REGIONAL PARK AND OPEN SPACE DISTRICT FOR MEASURE A FUNDING FOR PROJECTS AND PROGRAMS**

CONTACT: STEPHANIE MEYER, INTERIM FINANCE DIRECTOR

- H.10. This Item was pulled by Councilmember Nehrenheim for separate discussion.**

- H.11. APPROVE THE FIRST AMENDMENT TO THE AGREEMENT FOR LEGAL SERVICES BETWEEN THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH AND LIEBERT CASSIDY WHITMORE, A PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION**

CONTACT: MICHAEL W. WEBB, CITY ATTORNEY

Councilmember Nehrenheim pulled Item No. H.10 for separate discussion.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and approved by voice vote, the Consent Calendar, as amended, removing Item No. H.10 from Consent for separate discussions.

Motion carried, 5-0. Mayor Light was absent.

City Clerk Manzano read title to Resolution No. CC-2411-108.

I. EXCLUDED CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS

H.10. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH IWORQ SYSTEMS INC. FOR AN INTEGRATED BUILDING, PLANNING, AND ENGINEERING SOFTWARE SYSTEM THAT WILL ASSIST THE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT AND PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENTS WITH THE ISSUANCE AND MANAGEMENT OF CONSTRUCTION PERMITS FOR AN ANNUAL AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$65,000 AND A TERM OF THREE YEARS

CONTACT: MARC WIENER, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

Councilmember Nehrenheim requested Community Development Director Marc Wiener to give the public additional information regarding the project since he continually receives questions from residents on this item.

Community Development Director Wiener reported Staff is proposing transitioning from the current permitting system to a new system which will expand online permitting and have the ability to track projects throughout all departments; felt the proposed system will allow more comprehensive capability to all City functions; stated he has had experience with implementation and use of the system.

Councilmember Nehrenheim expressed his excitement for this project; stated that currently users have to go through various pages to locate things.

Community Development Director Wiener added that all the activity regarding a property will be in one location in the system and the public portal will allow the community to access information on projects that are occurring within the City; discussed a mapping feature and anticipated it will be implemented quickly (approximately 2 months).

Councilmember Nehrenheim commented on savings and the public portal; mentioned the City of Anaheim has a public portal that allows users to locate projects within a mile radius of an address.

Community Development Director Wiener mentioned the new system will have a similar feature as the City of Anaheim; addressed the overall net savings for the City; stated the cost is \$65,000 a year, which is \$7,000 less than the City is paying for the current system; mentioned the current system upgrade would have cost about \$100,000.

There were no public comments on this item.

Councilmember Obagi left the chambers.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Behrendt, and approved by voice vote, Item No. H.10, as presented.

Councilmember Obagi returned to the chambers.

Motion carried 5-0. Mayor Light was absent.

J. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

J.1 For eComments and Emails Received from the Public

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic invited public participation on non-agenda items.

Holly Osborne, District 5, referenced a submission involving pictures of stores on Artesia with different size lots; stated she did not like the idea of doubling the FAR, especially for the small lots; mentioned that District 5 did not have a grocery store for several years; provided a brief history on the land where the grocery store is located; spoke against Council artificially inflating the values of the properties; stated the community likes the grocery store and she enjoys the small “mom and pop” establishments; urged Council not to double the FAR.

Councilmember Obagi mentioned other grocery stores in North Redondo.

Joan Irvine, District 1, addressed parents’ concerns about cannabis; noted there will be only two legal and heavily regulated dispensaries in Redondo and they will sell tested and traceable products; stated she would be more concerned about alcohol and children if she were a parent; listed the dangers of alcohol versus cannabis among teens; mentioned the number of liquor stores in the Redondo area; mentioned that if parents are that concerned about dispensaries they should be concerned about bringing their children into any places that sell alcohol as well; urged Council not to deny adults safe access to cannabis.

Mary Ewell asked whether it is within Staff’s purview to construct a 3-D model of the proposed BCHD Assisted Living and Memory Care Complex that BCHD’s board is proposing; felt it can demonstrate how out of scope and non-conforming the building would be; mentioned former Mayor Bill Brand had done that with another project and opined it was very enlightening; suggested that Staff provide one at the next meeting where this item will be discussed; mentioned she had other comments but they would be directed towards Mayor Light and since he is not present decided not to continue.

Laura Duke, District 3, wanted to let Council know that she felt uncomfortable with an exchange that happened between a Torrance resident and Councilmember Kaluderovic at the last City Council Meeting; felt the interaction regarding the Metro C-Line extension

project seemed inappropriate as that was not the subject of the speaker's comment and stated the Redondo Beach and Torrance residents should be neighborly and noted the importance of expressing acceptance of each other; stated her next comments were for Mayor Light and since he is not present will wait to make those comments; referenced errors in use of the terms FAR and EIR by Mr. Bakaly and noted no one corrected him; agreed with Mary Ewell's suggestion regarding building a 3-D model for the public to view; thanked Community Director Marc Wiener and Planning Manager Sean Scully for answering her email; asked if residents can use the projector for their three minutes if needed and, in answer to her question, Councilmember Nehrenheim said yes if they email it to them prior to the meeting.

Geoff Gilbert talked about the BCHD project and how they are leading the residents to believe that without a 1.25 FAR the programs they offer will not be able to continue; talked about Mr. Bakaly's comments, during the last City Council meeting, stating the open space is for everyone but pointed out that Measure BC states the open space is for BCHD programs and does not mention general public use; stated that Mr. Bakaly also did not mention that the open space can be used to building at any time in the future; stated the open space is not protected and BCHD has lied to the public, the media and the City; discussed their project EIR and urged Council to weigh the opinions and desires of residents against the developer.

Wayne Craig, District 1, spoke about Council's support to Measures FP and RB; reminded the public there is a little over an hour yet to vote and urged voters to vote as if they are trying to save the City.

Rosann Taylor mentioned BCHD sent an email, prior to the last City Council meeting, advising residents that the City Council was making a decision to certify the EIR; opined it was confusing as it was different from what the City has been addressing, which is the FAR; asserted the EIR does not interpret local ordinances or statutes; expressed concerns with decreased home values; felt a lot of things have been overlooked and urged Council to separate the decision on the EIR from the decision on the FAR.

Brad Waller (via Zoom), District 1, spoke about Keep the Esplanade Beautiful and about their Monthly Sweeps events on the first Saturday of each month; announced an event on Saturday at the Rotary Club of Redondo Beach for their Centennial Celebration from 2:00 to 5:00 pm; additionally, addressed their need for volunteers.

Mark Nelson (via Zoom), spoke in support of comments by Rosann Taylor; addressed the BCHD EIR; noted it is irrelevant to the General Plan; addressed a FAR for PI properties.

There were no other public comments.

K. EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

Councilmember Nehrenheim reported speaking with Councilmember Obagi,

members of the public and City staff regarding Items No. L.1 and the public and Staff regarding L.2.

Councilmember Loewenstein reported speaking with City staff and the public regarding Item No. L.2.

Councilmember Obagi reported speaking with Councilmember Nehrenheim regarding Item No. L.1 and with Councilmember Behrendt, members of the public, Mr. Bakaly from BCHD and the City Manager regarding Item No. L.2.

Councilmember Behrendt reported speaking City staff regarding Item No. L.1 and regarding L.2, members of the public, City staff, Mayor Light and with Councilmember Obagi, Dan Elder and Rob Gaddis.

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic reported speaking with City staff regarding Item No. L.1 and with the public, City staff and Mayor Light, regarding Item No. L.2.

L. PUBLIC HEARINGS

L.1. PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER THE CALENDAR YEAR 2024 ANNUAL REPORT OF THE RIVIERA VILLAGE BUSINESS IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT, RE-APPOINTMENT OF THE RIVIERA VILLAGE ASSOCIATION AS THE DISTRICT'S ADVISORY BOARD AND LEVYING OF AN ASSESSMENT FOR THE DISTRICT FOR CALENDAR YEAR 2025

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY, RESOLUTION NO. CC-2411-105, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, APPOINTING AN ADVISORY BOARD IN CONNECTION WITH THE RIVIERA VILLAGE BUSINESS IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT AND DIRECTING THE PREPARATION OF A REPORT FOR CALENDAR YEAR 2025

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY, RESOLUTION NO. CC-2411-106, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING THE REPORT OF THE ADVISORY BOARD FOR 2024-2025 IN CONNECTION WITH THE RIVIERA VILLAGE BUSINESS IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY, ORDINANCE NO. 3284-24, AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, AMENDING REDONDO BEACH ORDINANCE NO. 2922-03 TO INCREASE THE ASSESSMENT AMOUNT LEVIED AGAINST BUSINESSES WITHIN THE RIVIERA VILLAGE BUSINESS IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT

APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH THE RIVIERA VILLAGE ASSOCIATION FOR SERVICE AS THE RIVIERA VILLAGE BUSINESS

IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT'S ADVISORY BOARD

CONTACT: GREG KAPOVICH, WATERFRONT & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to open the public hearing.

Motion carried 5-0. Mayor Light was absent.

W.E.D. Director Kapovich introduced the item and deferred to Riviera Village Association (RVA) President Allen Sanford for a report; requested tonight the Council reappoint the RVA to continue the oversight; proposed increasing the assessment rate from \$79,000 to \$105,000 since the rate has not been increased since 2005; stated Council is being asked to approve the report presented by Allen Sanford; he summarized what was being asked by Council tonight and turned the presentation over to Allen Sanford.

Allen Sanford presented details of the RVA's annual report and offered to respond to questions from City Council; addressed the possibility of grant funding for improved safety; presented a slide that included:

- Proposed Assessment from 2024
 - Property owners and business license holders: \$100 + \$29/employee
- 2025 Proposed Assessments (changes)
 - Business license holders: \$125 +\$34/employee
 - Property owners: \$125 +\$34/rental unit
 - Estimated gross revenues: \$105,000
 - Planned 2025 BID expenditures: 50% beautification, 40% marketing, 10% Administration
- 2024 Accomplishments
- Calendar Year 2025 Projects
 - Pavers projects
 - Strategic partnerships
 - Bollards project with Chief Hoffman
 - Media development for the Village
 - Redondo Beach Travel and Tourism (RBTT)
 - Roundabout at S Catalina Ave & Ave I
- Recommendation

RBPD Chief Hoffman expanded on efforts for improved safety and crowd control with the use of retractable bollards; reviewed attempts to obtain funding through grants; spoke about options available to implement the purchase and installation of retractable bollards.

Councilmember Nehrenheim added a brief history of the conversation regarding the

bollards; addressed security for Farmers Markets; reported plans to apply for grant funding for that; discussed upcoming projects and thanked the Association for everything they do.

Councilmember Obagi asked City Manager Witzansky to clarify his understanding that the City applied to SBCOG for Measure M funds to widen sidewalks as permanent dining decks.

City Manager Witzansky mentioned there are two phases to it; reported the City has applied and received significant grant funding to study and design expansion of the sidewalk area, the recirculation element, parking and other features; noted that it has already been funded, and the City will be receiving those monies within the next fiscal year; explained the structure will create the perimeter of the area to provide some level of traffic control such as is being done with the parkways.

Councilmember Obagi asked for slide 2B to be put up; stated he imagined there still needs to be more protection since cars can still drive up on sidewalks.

City Manager Witzansky responded and went into detail on the safety measures involved; explained it would be similar to the parklets that are actually in the roadway now.

Councilmember Obagi spoke about the funds available through Measure M; suggested not approaching it only from a security standpoint but rather a mobility standpoint in making the area more walkable and transportation friendly, in the City's application for funding.

City Manager Witzansky agreed; added there is a lot of potential for Measure M; talked about the need to design first and then apply for construction funds.

Councilmember Loewenstein asked about the pavers.

City Manager Witzansky responded and discussion followed regarding funding for pavers, locations in the Village that could benefit from pavers, making entry enhancements and when the project is scheduled to begin.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi to close the public hearing.

Councilmember Nehrenheim asked for the timeline on the parklets and on the design of them.

City Manager Witzansky addressed the timeline for the design of the parklets and noted the permanent solution will take some time.

Councilmember Nehrenheim announced there will be no free parking in Riviera Village, it is only free the last two weeks in December.

Councilmember Nehrenheim seconded the motion to close the public hearing.

Motion carried 5-0, by voice vote. Mayor Light was absent.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to adopt by title only, Resolution No. CC-2411-105, adopt by title only, Resolution No. CC-2411-106, adopt by title only, Ordinance No. 3284-24, and approve an agreement with the Riviera Village Association for service as the Riviera Village Business Improvement District's Advisory Board for 2025.

Motion carried 5-0, by voice vote. Mayor Light was absent.

City Clerk Manzano read titles to Resolutions No. CC-2411-105, CC-2411-106 and Ordinance No. 3284-24.

Councilmember Obagi left the chambers.

L.2. CONTINUED PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER LAND USE ELEMENT, ZONING ORDINANCE, AND LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM AMENDMENTS, AND CERTIFICATION OF A PROGRAM ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT (EIR) THAT SERVE TO IMPLEMENT THE CITY'S CERTIFIED 6TH CYCLE HOUSING ELEMENT

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2410-105, CERTIFYING THE FINAL PROGRAM ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT (STATE CLEARINGHOUSE NUMBER 2023050732), ADOPTING FINDINGS PURSUANT TO THE CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT, ADOPTING A STATEMENT OF OVERRIDING CONSIDERATIONS, AND ADOPTING A MITIGATION MONITORING AND REPORTING PROGRAM FOR THE REDONDO BEACH FOCUSED GENERAL PLAN UPDATE, ZONING ORDINANCE UPDATE AND LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM AMENDMENT

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2410-106, AMENDING THE GENERAL PLAN LAND USE ELEMENT TO IMPLEMENT THE CITY'S CERTIFIED 6TH CYCLE 2021-2029 HOUSING ELEMENT AND OTHER AMENDMENTS REGARDING RESIDENTIALLY DESIGNATED PROPERTIES NOT IDENTIFIED AS PROGRAM ACTIONS IN THE CITY'S HOUSING ELEMENT

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2410-107, AMENDING THE COASTAL LAND USE PLAN OF THE CITY'S LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM TO IMPLEMENT THE CITY'S CERTIFIED 6TH CYCLE 2021-

2029 HOUSING ELEMENT AND OTHER AMENDMENTS REGARDING RESIDENTIALLY DESIGNATED PROPERTIES NOT IDENTIFIED AS PROGRAM ACTIONS IN THE CITY'S HOUSING ELEMENT

INTRODUCE BY TITLE ONLY ORDINANCE NO. CC-3281-24, AMENDING TITLE 10, CHAPTER 1 SUBDIVISIONS OF THE REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE FOR CONSISTENCY WITH THE GENERAL PLAN LAND USE ELEMENT AND TO IMPLEMENT THE CITY'S CERTIFIED 6TH CYCLE 2021-2029 HOUSING ELEMENT AND OTHER AMENDMENTS REGARDING RESIDENTIALLY DESIGNATED PROPERTIES NOT IDENTIFIED AS PROGRAM ACTIONS IN THE CITY'S HOUSING ELEMENT. FOR INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING

INTRODUCE BY TITLE ONLY ORDINANCE NO. 3282-24, AMENDING TITLE 10 PLANNING AND ZONING, CHAPTER 2 ZONING AND LAND USE OF THE REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE FOR CONSISTENCY WITH THE GENERAL PLAN LAND USE ELEMENT AND TO IMPLEMENT THE CITY'S CERTIFIED 6TH CYCLE 2021-2029 HOUSING ELEMENT AND OTHER AMENDMENTS REGARDING RESIDENTIALLY DESIGNATED PROPERTIES NOT IDENTIFIED AS PROGRAM ACTIONS IN THE CITY'S HOUSING ELEMENT. FOR INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING

INTRODUCE BY TITLE ONLY ORDINANCE NO. 3283-24, AMENDING TITLE 10 PLANNING AND ZONING, CHAPTER 5 COASTAL LAND USE PLAN IMPLEMENTING ORDINANCE OF THE REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE FOR CONSISTENCY WITH THE GENERAL PLAN LAND USE ELEMENT AND TO IMPLEMENT THE CITY'S CERTIFIED 6TH CYCLE 2021-2029 HOUSING ELEMENT AND OTHER AMENDMENTS REGARDING RESIDENTIALLY DESIGNATED PROPERTIES NOT IDENTIFIED AS PROGRAM ACTIONS IN THE CITY'S HOUSING ELEMENT. FOR INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING

PROCEDURES:

- 1. Open the public hearing, take testimony**
- 2. Close the public hearing**
- 3. Adopt Resolution No. CC-2410-105, certifying the Final Program EIR, adopting findings pursuant to CEQA, adopting a Statement of Overriding Considerations, and adopting a mitigation monitoring and reporting program**
- 4. Adopt Resolution No. CC-2410-106, amending the General Plan Land Use Element**
- 5. Adopt Resolution No. CC-2410-107, amending the Land Use Plan of the City's Certified Local Coastal Program**
- 6. Introduce for first reading Ordinance No. CC-3281-24, amending Title 10, Chapter 1 Subdivisions of the Redondo Beach Municipal Code**
- 7. Introduce for first reading Ordinance No. CC-3282-24, amending Title**

10, Chapter 2 Zoning and Land Use of the Redondo Beach Municipal Code

8. Introduce for first reading Ordinance No. CC-3283-24, amending Title 10, Chapter 5 Coastal Land Use Plan Implementing Ordinance of the Redondo Municipal Code

CONTACT: MARC WIENER, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to open the public hearing.

Motion carried 4-0-1. Councilmember Obagi and Mayor Light were absent.

Councilmember Obagi returned to the chambers.

Community Development Director Wiener mentioned Council has reviewed this item at three meetings in October; noted he will keep this presentation brief in terms of the overview; stated the presentation would be a comprehensive update to the City's General Plan; stated the project has been broken up into two phases, phase one is what is being brought forward at this meeting for the actions that are necessary to implement the City's Housing Element; presented a PowerPoint which included:

- Background – City Council reviewed on Oct. 1st, 15th and 29th.
 - Only amending existing Land Use Element and Zoning Ordinances related to HE Implementation
 - Implement Housing Element to meet statutory deadline of February 12, 2025.
- Deferred Items (Phase II)
 - Defer other updates to later date:
 - Open Space and Conservation Element
 - Safety Element
 - Noise Element
 - Land Use Element
 - Public Institutional (PI) – FAR
 - Artesia Blvd. – FAR/Development/Rooftop Dining
 - Nonconforming Uses and Structures
 - Historic Preservation Policy
- Recommended Actions
 - Adopt a resolution that would certify the EIR and adopting a Statement of Overriding Considerations
 - Adopting a resolution amending the GP Land Use Element
 - Adopting a resolution amending the Land Use Plan of the City's Certified Local Coastal Program
 - Introducing ordinances for Title 10, Chapter 1, 2 and 5 of the City's Municipal Code
 - Direct Staff to return on December 3, 2024, for consideration of

subsequent environmental impact analysis regarding BCHD FAR

Councilmember Nehrenheim asked to confirm the items to be acted upon tonight; spoke about accurate findings that will help Council make decisions; mentioned impacts that cannot be mitigated that are mandated by the State.

Community Development Director Wiener clarified which ordinances are being presented for adoption tonight and reiterated items that have been deferred and will be brought back to Council in January and February.

More discussion ensued.

City Manager Witzansky reported that on December 3rd, Council will consider the analysis that was requested in October pertaining to the BCHD site; stated that implementation will be presented to Council in January and February.

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic invited public comments.

City Clerk Manzano reported receiving 12 eComments, 8 in support, 3 opposed and 1 neutral.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Councilmember Nehrenheim referenced page 45 of the final EIR regarding Public Services section relevant to the impacts to Fire, Police and Paramedic Services; read an email from Chief Hoffman regarding the number of paramedic service calls to Kensington and requested adding it to the record. He added that it is important to have all the relevant facts in the record in case the City needs to defend the EIR.

Councilmember Obagi asked what they can do to account for impacts that certain uses or conditional uses will have on City finances or public safety resources, etc.

Community Development Director Wiener mentioned that last week, Council approved an agreement for a comprehensive fee study for the department and stated that would be a vehicle to address City-wide impacts and the costs of services associated with new development.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to close the public hearing.

Motion carried 5-0. Mayor Light was absent.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to adopt by title only, Resolutions No. CC-2410-105, CC-2410-106, CC-2410-107 and introduce for first reading, Ordinances No. CC-3281-

24, CC-3282-24 and CC-3283-24 and direct Staff to return on December 3, 2024, to consider the subsequent analysis regarding a 1.25 FAR for the BCHD site.

Motion carried 5-0. Mayor Light was absent.

City Clerk Manzano read titles to Resolutions No. CC-2410-105, CC-2410-106, CC-2410-107 and Ordinances No. CC-3281-24, CC-3282-24 and CC-3283-24.

K. ITEMS CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS AGENDAS – None

L. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION PRIOR TO ACTION

L.1. This Item was continued to the City Council meeting of December 3, 2024.

M. CITY MANAGER ITEMS

City Manager Witzansky spoke about a recent incident in which the Harbor Patrol made a courageous save and recognized them for their efforts.

N. MAYOR AND COUNCIL ITEMS

N.1. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING CHARTER AMENDMENTS PERTAINING TO THE DUTIES OF THE CITY CLERK AND CITY TREASURER AND DIRECTION TO STAFF TO PREPARE BALLOT MEASURES FOR THE MARCH 4, 2025 ELECTION REFLECTING THE PROPOSED AMENDMENTS

City Clerk Manzano reviewed details of the latest recommendations for Charter amendments by the Charter Review Advisory Committee (CRAC) as it pertains to the City Clerk's office; presented slides on the recommendations, noting the bold black were the specific changes or additions.

Discussion followed regarding the requirement for a Bachelor's degree and five years' experience in public or private sector accounting or five years' experience as a City Clerk in the State of California, auditing areas of City expenditures at least once a year, needs of the City Clerk's office to conduct an audit, having Moss Adams do audits in specified areas and relying on the Charter.

City Attorney Webb reported the budget is up to Council but if the City Clerk needs certain budget or personnel to carry out the scope of her duties, she is entitled to request it.

Discussion followed regarding the City Clerk devoting his/her full time to the duties of the office to make it consistent with other provisions such as for the City Attorney, other reasons for including the provision in the Charter, prior incidents where the City Clerk has been missing in action, provisions in other sections of the Charter that will

handle that more effectively.

Councilmember Behrendt stated he is reluctant to approve the provision about the City Clerk devoting full time to the duties of the office and wondered about the source of requiring a Bachelor's degree.

City Clerk Manzano explained that the City Clerk needs to work with Department Heads and therefore should have a Bachelor's degree.

City Attorney Webb mentioned the matter will return to Council on November 19th, to address residency and other provisions and that would be the appropriate way to reconsider the matter; noted that the City Clerk cannot leave the city for thirty consecutive days without vacating their position.

Discussion followed regarding lack of enforcement and it being a left-over provision from when computers and Zoom did not exist.

Councilmember Behrendt felt that the requirement for a Bachelor's degree does not seem to be essential as a requirement in the Charter; stated he would like to give more thought to whether five years of experience as a City Clerk is an appropriate substitute; wondered about the requirements in other Charter cities for City Clerk; expressed concerns about "building a moat" around elected positions that would disqualify people from participating and reported he has confidence in voters to decide what it takes to do a particular job; asked the City Attorney if he has any particular concerns from a legal and oversight perspective.

City Attorney Webb felt it is a good compromise; reported it removes an elected position working under the direction of the City Manager; recommended, depending on what Council decides in terms of the City Treasurer, adding a line that the City Clerk provides oversight of expenditures, and the City Treasurer provides oversight of revenues.

City Manager Witzansky stated he is comfortable with the suggested modifications; reported speaking with the City Clerk regarding ensuring that the auditing function is not taxing the Finance staff to the point where they cannot perform their functions; opined the language that has been presented works and felt the City can support it financially; agreed with the separation of oversight of expenditures and revenues.

Councilmember Behrendt thanked Staff and the committee.

Councilmember Nehrenheim agreed that it is for voters to decide what the qualifications should be; opined that the minimum floor should be the legal requirements to perform the duty and asked City Clerk Manzano to list the requirements.

City Clerk Manzano listed the requirements for becoming a Certified Municipal Clerk

or Master Municipal Clerk within the State of California; expressed concerns that the minimum requirements will not be sufficient to perform accounting/auditing functions and explained that is the reason for requiring accounting experience.

City Attorney Webb explained the requirement of completing at least 15 units of accounting with a passing grade; reported on the CRAC's extensive discussion regarding the oversight role and whether a Bachelor's degree was relevant; mentioned that 5 years of experience was based on the minimum requirement for becoming a judge.

Councilmember Nehrenheim reiterated that it is for voters to decide what the qualifications should be; agreed with the 5 years of experience in private or public sector accounting or as a City Clerk; mentioned distinctions between private and public sector accounting; suggested striking "private sector accounting" and the requirement for a Bachelor's degree.

In reply to Councilmember Behrendt's question, City Clerk Manzano stated she has no issues with the existing Charter language as long as there is some kind of minimum qualification.

Councilmember Behrendt spoke in support of the existing language and in opposition to the requirement for a Bachelor's degree.

In reply to Councilmember Obagi's question, City Clerk Manzano reported she has been requiring a Bachelor's degree for her staff and that she has a Bachelor's degree.

Chief Deputy City Clerk Colombo was asked to give her feedback; she shared her experience working under various City Clerks; stated that there are opportunities to assist newer clerks and spoke about educational workshops, conferences and classes available for City Clerk professional development.

City Attorney Webb added that the City Clerk position is still civil service protected.

Discussion followed regarding the possibility of removing the requirement that the City Clerk needs to be a resident of the City to allow for more candidates; City Attorney Webb read the requirements for the City Clerk position and explained some allowances for other experience related to the City Clerk position.

Councilmember Obagi agreed with Councilmembers Behrendt and Nehrenheim regarding staying with the original Charter language relative to the qualifications of the City Clerk and maintain the residency requirement.

City Attorney Webb recommended at least one more meeting prior to taking action on this item.

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic left the chambers.

City Treasurer Solomon presented changes to the Charter that were incorporated as a result of the last meeting where Council discussed this item; noted additional information is part of Blue Folder Items; explained details of amended language relative to the City Treasurer as displayed.

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic returned to the chambers.

Councilmember Behrendt expressed concerns about the qualification requirements limiting candidates; believed that good judgement is preferable to Doctoral degree; hoped the City Treasurer had some pedigree coming in; expressed concerns about codifying that and asked residents to codify that at this time; asked the City Attorney or City Manager to give thoughts on requirements needed for City Treasurer.

City Attorney Webb talked about some of the items that need further work including the Treasurer's collection of taxes and reporting; mentioned putting in information regarding access the Treasurer needs to ensure they can do an effective and efficient job in auditing and still prepare a report to the City Manager; noted items that need clarifying language in the Charter, such as one of their duties is Tax Administrator for purposes of conducting those hearings.

City Manager Witzansky liked the phrasing in D and E, regarding, "Have access to..."; reported D is intended to provide the Treasurer with the knowledge needed to prepare and provide for cash flow for the City; suggested clarifying the intent of D and that both D and E need a little more thought.

City Treasurer Solomon stated, in terms of a maturing security that goes into cash and having to decide whether to reinvest or if the City will need it for payroll or other warrants, it is important for the City Treasurer's office to have access to other reports to review the cash flow needs of the City and help determine how to allocate and/or reinvest the funds and determine a duration for reinvesting those funds.

City Manager Witzansky proposed mirroring the language on a frequency basis in F to what is listed under the City Clerk.

Councilmember Loewenstein mentioned this is about the City's \$100 million plus portfolio; felt a requirement for a Bachelor's degree for both the City Treasurer and City Clerk is needed; opined work experience is also valuable for both positions; talked about how many people do not know what a City Treasurer does and how the job is technically specific therefore requiring specific knowledge.

City Treasurer Solomon responded to questions from Councilmember Nehrenheim regarding whether his opponent would have qualified under the proposed qualification requirements and existing guardrails provided in the City's investment policy and a government code that outlines acceptable investments.

Councilmember Nehrenheim referenced requirements for Councilmembers; expressed concerns that a Councilmember, whose only requirement is to be a resident of the City, could override the City Treasurer's recommendations with a majority vote and could completely change policy.

City Treasurer Solomon added that the next step would be to ensure the changes are in compliance with the government code.

Councilmember Nehrenheim spoke about the position morphing internally and externally through the years; felt if someone were to run on an auditing campaign they would do well; reiterated that it is up to the voters to decide.

In response to Councilmember Behrendt's questions, City Treasurer Solomon reported the present Deputy City Treasurer was there prior to him coming on board and claimed that he has extensive financial experience and credentials; spoke about the City Treasurer's team consultative process in decision making.

Councilmember Obagi agreed with Councilmember Loewenstein's statements regarding qualifications for the City Clerk and City Treasurer; noted the requirements are basic and spoke in support of the changes; asked City Treasurer Solomon what action his department takes when the City gets proceeds.

City Treasurer Solomon used an example of when a corporate bond matures; stated it gets deposited into the City's US bank account, then the Treasurer's office determines whether it can be reinvested or if it is needed for other reasons; noted the City Treasurer Department works with the Finance Department to make decisions.

More discussion followed.

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic invited public comments on this item.

Bob Pinzler (via Zoom), Former Member of the Charter Review Advisory Committee (CRAC), explained the rationale for coming up with the requirements for the City Treasurer; noted that no other City Clerk in the State has accounting responsibilities; commented on the 5 years of experience requirement and felt the City Clerk candidate should have the ability to understand the audit; stated the CRAC felt the requirements would allow future City Clerks the background to be able to handle the changes that have been occurring to the City Clerk role; suggested thinking about it not in terms of the current position, but what will occur in the future.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Discussion followed regarding continuing the item until the meeting of November 19, 2024 and reviewing the Long Beach Model BRR at that time.

Regarding the City Clerk, Councilmember Behrendt suggested keeping the Charter, as is, with the current requirements and add, “or have 5 years of experience in the State of California or have a Bachelor’s degree and 5 years of experience in a responsible position involving public or private sector accounting”, which would broaden the scope for eligibility and still meet some minimal benchmarks as is currently reflected in the City Charter.

Discussion followed regarding eliminating the requirement that “the Clerk shall devote full time to the duties of office”.

Councilmember Nehrenheim agreed with Councilmember Behrendt’s suggestions, noting there are protections in place in the Charter.

City Attorney Webb also spoke about including language to ensure a distinction between revenues and expenditures as it pertains to the City Treasurer.

Councilmember Behrendt spoke about including the City Manager in the discussions.

Motion by Councilmember Behrendt, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to continue the item to the City Council meeting of November 19th and, as it pertains to the City Clerk, keep the Charter as is with the current requirements but add “or have 5 years of experience in the State of California or have a Bachelor’s degree and 5 years of experience in a responsible position involving public or private sector accounting” and eliminating the requirement “the Clerk shall devote full time to the duties of office” and direct Staff to include language, as appropriate, to ensure a distinction between revenues and expenditures.

Motion carried 5-0. Mayor Light was absent.

In terms of the City Treasurer requirements, Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic spoke in support of a Bachelor’s degree; mentioned that it does not mean what it used to and could be persuaded otherwise.

Councilmember Behrendt agreed and asked to research whether there has been a City Treasurer in Redondo Beach, in the last 20 years, that did not have a Bachelor’s degree.

Discussion followed regarding having an Associate’s degree in a related field, the need to define “related field”, qualifications of people who work under those in elected positions and using objective language.

Councilmember Behrendt stated, in the event that Council does not reach an agreement, he would favor, for the City Treasurer item, splitting the essential changes to oversight and auditing as one ballot question and additional qualifications for the City Treasurer as another.

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic and City Treasurer Solomon agreed.

O. MAYOR AND COUNCIL REFERRALS TO STAFF

Councilmember Obagi asked whether Council should place on the ballot for March 2026 a question of whether there should be two elected positions in four years from now.

City Attorney Webb responded affirmatively and agreed to return with the information on November 19th.

R. RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION – None

The Closed Session meeting was cancelled.

S. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION – None

The Closed Session meeting was cancelled.

T. ADJOURNMENT – 8:50 p.m.

There being no further business to come before the City Council, motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, to adjourn the meeting at 8:50 p.m. to an Adjourned Regular meeting to be held at 4:30 p.m. (Closed Session) and a Regular meeting to held at 6:00 p.m., on Tuesday, November 12, 2024 in the Redondo Beach City Hall Council Chambers 415 N. Pacific Coast Hwy. Redondo Beach, California.

Motion carried, 5-0.

All written comments submitted via eComment are included in the record and available for public review on the City website.

Respectfully submitted:

DocuSigned by:
Eleanor Manzano
72F2AC716C214CF...

Eleanor Manzano, CMC
City Clerk