



Minutes
Redondo Beach City Council
Tuesday, August 6, 2024
Closed Session - Adjourned Regular Meeting 4:30 p.m.
Open Session –Regular Meeting 6:00 p.m.

4:30 PM - CLOSED SESSION – ADJOURNED REGULAR MEETING

A. CALL MEETING TO ORDER

An Adjourned Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 4:30 p.m. by Mayor Light in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

B. ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt (arrived at 4:31 p.m.), Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Mayor Light

Councilmembers Absent: Obagi

Officials Present: Mike Witzansky, City Manager
Lucie Colombo, Chief Deputy City Clerk

C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION - NONE

D. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS

Chief Deputy City Clerk Colombo announced there were no Blue Folder Items for Closed Session.

E. PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS ON CLOSED SESSION ITEMS AND NON-AGENDA ITEMS

There were no public communications on Closed Session items and non-agenda items.

F. RECESS TO CLOSED – 4:34 p.m.

Chief Deputy City Clerk Colombo read title to the items to be considered in Closed Session.

City Manager Witzansky announced that the following would be participating in Closed Session: City Manager Mike Witzansky, City Attorney Mike Webb, Assistant City Attorney Cheryl Park, Outside Legal Counsel Carolyn Valiso, Human Resources

Director Diane Strickfaden and Outside Legal Counsels Abby O'Brient and Jon Welner.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to recess to Closed Session at 4:34 p.m.

Motion carried, 4-0. Councilmember Obagi was absent.

- F.1. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege - Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

Name of case:

**John Cabeza de Vaca v. City of Redondo Beach
WCAB No: ADJ16557364**

- F.2. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

Name of case:

**Yes in My Back Yard, a California nonprofit corporation; SONJA TRAUSS, an individual v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; City of Redondo Beach Department of Community Development, and DOES 1 through 25 inclusive
Case Number: 23TRCP00325**

- F.3. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

Name of case:

**City of Redondo Beach, et al. v. California State Water Resources Control Board
Case Number: 20STCP03193**

- F.4. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

Name of case:

**New Commune DTLA, LLC and Leonid Pustilnikov v. City of Redondo Beach and City Council of the City of Redondo Beach
Case Number: 22TRCP00203**

- F.5. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

Name of case:

New Commune DTLA, LLC v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; City of Redondo Beach Department of Community Development, et al.

Case Number: 23STCP00426

- F.6. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

Name of case:

New Commune DTLA LLC v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive

Case Number: 23STCV10146

- F.7. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

Name of case:

9300 Wilshire, LLC v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; City of Redondo Beach Department of Community Development; and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive

Case Number: 23STCP02189

- F.8. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

Name of case:

In re 9300 Wilshire LLC

Bankruptcy C.D. Cal. Case Number: 2:23-bk-10918-ER

- G. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION – 6:00 p.m.**

Mayor Light reconvened to Open Session at 6:00 p.m.

- H. ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk
Mike Witzansky, City Manager
Lucie Colombo, Chief Deputy City Clerk

I. ANNOUNCEMENT OF CLOSED SESSION ACTIONS

City Manager Witzansky announced that there were no reportable actions taken by City Council under Closed Session.

J. ADJOURN TO REGULAR MEETING

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and approved by voice vote, to adjourn to the regular meeting at 6:00 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

6:00 PM - OPEN SESSION – REGULAR MEETING

A. CALL TO ORDER

A Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 6:00 p.m. by Mayor Light in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

B. ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk
Mike Witzansky, City Manager
Mike Webb, City Attorney
Lucie Colombo, Chief Deputy City Clerk

C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION

Mayor Light invited Veterans and Active Military to stand and recognized them for their service.

Caden, Fifth Grader, Alta Vista Elementary School, led in the salute to the flag.

Mayor Light called for a moment of silence.

D. PRESENTATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/ANNOUNCEMENTS

Councilmember Nehrenheim commented on the recent International Surf Festival; announced the upcoming District 1 Community Meeting at Alta Vista on Saturday at 9:30 a.m.; mentioned the compost giveaway before his meeting on Saturday at 8:00 a.m. at Wilderness Park.

Councilmember Loewenstein mentioned how impressed he is with the students in attendance and the poise of those that participate; reported attending the Medal of Valor dinner; announced there will be a townhall meeting from 10:00 a.m. to 11:30 a.m. on Saturday at the Library with Assemblymember Al Muratsuchi; stated the District 2 Community Meeting will be held on August 28th from 6:00 p.m. to 7:30 p.m. on Zoom and he will be joined by Community Development Director Marc Weiner.

Councilmember Kaluderovic announced the District 3 Community Meeting will be held in late August; noted discussions will include a community strategic plan. She said once she firms up the details, she will put it on the website and announce it.

Councilmember Obagi reported receiving messages regarding loud noise over the weekend from Inglewood close to SoFi Stadium; stated he spoke with Mayor Butts that day; stated he will come up with possible solutions regarding disturbances and make it a point to speak with Mayor Butts at the South Bay COG; announced the District 4 Community Meeting will be joined with Community Services Director Elizabeth Hause on August 29th at 6:30 p.m. at Perry Park Senior Center; stated discussions will focus on street sweeping and on the many City programs available to the community.

Mayor Light spoke about attending the Medal of Valor dinner; announced National Night Out at the Performing Arts Center on Saturday; acknowledged receiving several complaints about the loud music over the weekend and reported he will write a formal letter protesting it as well.

E. APPROVE ORDER OF AGENDA

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, the order of the agenda as presented.

Motion carried, 5-0.

F. AGENCY RECESS

F.1. COMMUNITY FINANCING AUTHORITY - REGULAR MEETING - CANCELLED

F.2. PUBLIC FINANCING AUTHORITY - REGULAR MEETING - CANCELLED

G. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS - ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS

G.1 For Blue Folder Documents Approved at the City Council Meeting

City Clerk Manzano announced Blue Folder Items for Items No. J.1, N.2 and N.3.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to receive and file Blue Folder Items.

Motion carried, 5-0.

H. CONSENT CALENDAR

H.1. APPROVE AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING FOR THE CITY COUNCIL ADJOURNED AND REGULAR MEETING OF AUGUST 6, 2024

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

H.2. APPROVE MOTION TO READ BY TITLE ONLY AND WAIVE FURTHER READING OF ALL ORDINANCES AND RESOLUTIONS LISTED ON THE AGENDA

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

H.3. APPROVE THE FOLLOWING CITY COUNCIL MINUTES: NONE

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

H.4. PAYROLL DEMANDS

**CHECKS 29848-29877 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$22,912.26, PD. 7/19/24
DIRECT DEPOSIT 281455-282092 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$2,523,186.29, PD.
7/19/24
EFT/ACH \$9,246.68, PD. 6/24/24 (PP2413)
EFT/ACH \$447,955.39, PD. 6/28/24 (PP2413)**

ACCOUNTS PAYABLE DEMANDS

**CHECKS 115159-115398 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$6,686,700.37
EFT CALPERS MEDICAL INSURANCE \$464,040.92
DIRECT DEPOSIT 100008547-100008638 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$95,526.24,
PD.8/1/24
REPLACEMENT DEMANDS 115157-115158**

CONTACT: WENDY COLLAZO, FINANCE DIRECTOR

H.5. APPROVE CONTRACTS UNDER \$35,000:

**1. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH DOUGLAS DECASTRO DBA
SIGNVERTISE FOR THE DESIGN, FABRICATION AND INSTALLATION
OF SEVENTEEN (17) ALUMINUM STRUCTURE BLADE SIGNS FOR THE
BUSINESSES ON THE INTERNATIONAL BOARDWALK IN AN AMOUNT**

NOT TO EXCEED \$34,000 FOR THE TERM AUGUST 6, 2024 TO JANUARY 17, 2025

2. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA EDISON COMPANY FOR A NEW SERVICE LINE EXTENSION FOR THE MANHATTAN BEACH BLVD AND DOW AVE TRAFFIC SIGNAL AT 2430 MANHATTAN BEACH BLVD #U IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$1,241.86 EFFECTIVE AUGUST 6, 2024 UNTIL COMPLETED

3. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH CASHEL CORPORATION DBA INTEGRATED MEDIA SYSTEMS TO REPLACE THE EXISTING PAGING SYSTEM AT THE MAIN LIBRARY IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$10,680 FOR THE TERM AUGUST 6, 2024 TO DECEMBER 1, 2024

4. APPROVE A SEVENTH AMENDMENT TO THE AGREEMENT WITH THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY (LACMTA) REVISING THE PROJECT SCHEDULE FOR THE REDONDO BEACH BICYCLE TRANSPORTATION PLAN IMPLEMENTATION PROJECT AWARDED TO THE CITY THROUGH LACMTA'S 2009 CALL FOR PROJECTS

CONTACT: WENDY COLLAZO, FINANCE DIRECTOR

H.6. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH ALL CITY MANAGEMENT SERVICES, INC. FOR CROSSING GUARD SERVICES FOR AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$132,408 AND THE TERM AUGUST 6, 2024 THROUGH AUGUST 5, 2025

CONTACT: JOE HOFFMAN, CHIEF OF POLICE

H.7. APPROVE AN AMENDMENT TO THE AGREEMENT WITH COMMLINE, INC. FOR THE PURCHASE AND INSTALLATION OF AN EMERGENCY COMMUNICATIONS DISPATCH CONSOLE STATION AT A COST OF \$36,327

CONTACT: JOE HOFFMAN, CHIEF OF POLICE

H.8. APPROVE THE CITY'S CONSENT TO RDR'S ELEVENTH SUBLEASE AMENDMENT WITH PEGGY HIRAIZUMI, DBA KOBE PEARL, FOR PROPERTY LOCATED AT 100 "D" FISHERMAN'S WHARF

CONTACT: GREG KAPOVICH, WATERFRONT & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

H.9. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH KOSMONT & ASSOCIATES, INC. FOR REAL ESTATE CONSULTING SERVICES FOR AN AMOUNT NOT TO

EXCEED \$50,000 AND THE TERM AUGUST 7, 2024 TO AUGUST 6, 2025

CONTACT: GREG KAPOVICH, WATERFRONT & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

H.10. This Item was pulled from the Consent Calendar by Councilmember Loewenstein for separate discussion.

H.11. APPROVE THE CONTRACT BETWEEN KARPEL COMPUTER SYSTEMS INC., AND THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH FOR A CASE MANAGEMENT SYSTEM.

CONTACT: MICHAEL W. WEBB, CITY ATTORNEY

H.12. This Item was pulled from the Consent Calendar by Councilmember Kaluderovic for separate discussion.

H.13. APPROVE A LESSOR ESTOPPEL CERTIFICATE AND CONSENT TO DEED OF TRUST FOR PORTOFINO HOTEL PARTNERS, L.P.

CONTACT: GREG KAPOVICH, WATERFRONT & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

H.14. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY ORDINANCE NO. 3274-24, AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH ORDERING THE SUBMISSION OF A PROPOSITION INCURRING BONDED INDEBTEDNESS TO THE QUALIFIED VOTERS OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH AT THE STATEWIDE GENERAL ELECTION TO BE HELD ON NOVEMBER 5, 2024, FOR THE PURPOSE OF FINANCING THE COSTS OF THE ACQUISITION, CONSTRUCTION, RECONSTRUCTION, REHABILITATION OR REPLACEMENT OF CERTAIN MUNICIPAL IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS CONSTITUTING PUBLIC INFRASTRUCTURE OF THE CITY. FOR SECOND READING AND ADOPTION.

CONTACT: LUKE SMUDE, ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER

Councilmember Loewenstein pulled Item No. H.10 from the Consent Calendar for separate discussion.

Councilmember Kaluderovic and Councilmember Obagi pulled Item No. H.12 from the Consent Calendar for separate discussion.

There were no public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, the Consent Calendar as amended, except for Items

No. H.10 and H.12 which were pulled for separate discussion.

Motion carried, 5-0.

City Clerk Manzano read title to Ordinance No. 3274-24.

I. EXCLUDED CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS

H.10. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2408-067, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, ADOPTING A MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING BETWEEN THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH AND THE REDONDO BEACH FIREFIGHTERS' ASSOCIATION, FROM JULY 1, 2024 THROUGH JUNE 30, 2028

CONTACT: DIANE STRICKFADEN, DIRECTOR OF HUMAN RESOURCES

Councilmember Loewenstein reported this is the last bargaining group being settled; spoke about valuing all firefighters and employees under collective bargaining and Council will provide their best effort to budget for them. He asked for a brief report from Rbfd Chief Butler regarding the new Harbor Master.

Rbfd Interim Chief Butler reported that the Harbor Master will be a trial program involving a captain-level individual as a single point of contact for Harbor related matters and with the ability to interact with yacht clubs and stakeholders regarding Harbor Patrol activities. He announced the selection of Captain Kurt Mahoney, a senior tenured Department Captain from the area who, in the interim, acts as the Deputy Fire Marshall. Additionally, he hoped that the program's success will be based on the stakeholders in the Harbor as well as internal stakeholders, which are the firefighters that work in Fire Station 3; mentioned the position will be funded out of the Fire Department's current budget; stated if they decide to move forward with the program, he will return to Council with a request for funding; noted that currently he is both Chief and Harbor Master and cannot focus on the task and noted that the program will benefit everyone.

In reply to Councilmember Loewenstein's questions, Rbfd Interim Chief Butler reported that a Captain's position costs about \$268,000 a year including benefits; noted there is currently no rotating staff; addressed the possibility of a rotation with personnel and deck hands down the road; stated the Fire Boat Captain positions will be civil service classifications, and those Captains will be assigned to those positions. He added there will be no routine cross staffing; addressed enforcement and the Harbor Master's tasks.

City Manager Witzansky reported that unit has lacked day-to-day supervision and is one of the causes for the erosion of the City's enforcement focus; talked about being able to set priorities and felt this position will help bridge the divide between Fire

Administration and the operating unit in the Harbor.

There were no public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to approve Item No. H.10, as presented.

Mayor Light thanked Council for supporting strengthening Harbor Patrol; talked about seeing immediate results, noting last week there were three rescues in the Harbor; addressed fuel spills, paddlers who were blocking the channel and kids who were jumping off rocks; spoke about the upcoming boat ramp project and was glad there will be someone representing the Harbor Patrol interests in the design of the boat ramp.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Andy Porkchop, Torrance, spoke in support of firefighters and commented on practices of the Torrance Fire Department.

There were no other public comments on this item.

The motion carried, 5-0, by voice vote.

City Clerk Manzano read title to Resolution No. CC-2408-067.

H.12. APPROVE THE GOOD NEIGHBOR PLEDGE AS DRAFTED AND AUTHORIZE SOUTH BAY CITIES COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENTS DELEGATE ZEIN OBAGI TO SIGN THE PLEDGE ON BEHALF OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH AT THE SIGNING CEREMONY.

CONTACT: MICHAEL W. WEBB, CITY ATTORNEY

Councilmember Kaluderovic referenced the Supreme Court ruling on Grants Pass; reported there have been questions as to how it will change policies in neighboring cities; stated residents fear cities will be moving their homeless population into neighboring cities; she wanted to address these concerns by highlighting elements of the Good Neighbor Pledge; mentioned that the services and shelter are the cornerstone of the efforts; stated they will not be just moving people around since that does not solve the problem; pledged that City personnel will be aware of the resources available in the City and will educate everyone in need. Additionally, she thanked SBCCOG and the City Attorney for their efforts on this matter.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, to approve the Good Neighbor Pledge as drafted and authorize SBCCOG Delegate Councilmember Zein Obagi to sign the Pledge on behalf of the City of Redondo Beach at the signing ceremony.

Councilmember Obagi offered a friendly amendment to make the City's signing of the pledge conditioned upon Manhattan Beach, Hermosa Beach, Torrance and Lawndale signing the pledge as well. His concern is that Redondo Beach signs the pledge but surrounding cities do not and the program will fail if that happens.

Councilmember Kaluderovic did not fully agree that all the neighboring cities need to pledge but that at least some of them need to in order for this to work.

Substitute motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Behrendt, and carried by voice vote, to approve the Good Neighbor Pledge and authorize SBCCOG Delegate Councilmember Zein Obagi to sign the Pledge, conditioned on Hermosa Beach, Manhattan Beach, Torrance, Lawndale and Hawthorne signing the Pledge, on behalf of the City of Redondo Beach at the signing ceremony.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Andy Porkchop, Torrance, spoke about growing homelessness and spoke in support of the pledge.

There were no other public comments.

Councilmember Kaluderovic asked the City Attorney if he has any hesitation on the condition of the cities listed; City Attorney Webb stated that it allows a veto for any one of the City's neighboring cities; noted that, whether the City signs it or not, the City will not act any differently, this is simply getting neighbors to do what Redondo Beach has been doing already; discussed a case regarding necessity being a defense to any enforcement of an anti-camping ordinance and supervisors have said that jails cannot be used for any pre- or post-trial sentences for anti-camping ordinances; felt that it is good to encourage all their neighbors to join and noted his hesitation would be if Torrance or others do not get around to signing it.

Councilmember Nehrenheim stated he has a hesitation in terms of waiting for the other cities to join; felt that Redondo Beach is doing a great job, but other cities may decline as they do not have the room, space, or budget and may "play the shell game" of moving people experiencing homelessness around. He talked about Redondo Beach continuing to do what it is doing and stated he would be more inclined to vote for the first motion than the substitute motion.

Councilmember Kaluderovic opined that the City signing the pledge will make the neighboring cities look bad by not signing it and may put them in a position to realize they are deficient.

Councilmember Obagi reiterated City Attorney Webb's statement that Redondo Beach will not change what it is currently doing regardless of whether it adopts the pledge or not; stated his goal is to induce other cities to take action in response to the Supreme

Court decision and take the good neighbor approach, specifically Manhattan Beach, Hermosa Beach, Torrance and Lawndale.

Councilmember Kaluderovic noted this as an opportunity to lead by example.

The substitute motion failed, 2-3, by voice vote. Councilmembers Kaluderovic, Loewenstein and Nehrenheim voted, "No".

Mayor Light called for the vote on the original motion.

Councilmember Behrendt commented on the importance of having the surrounding cities make a real commitment.

The motion carried, 4-1, by voice vote. Councilmember Behrendt voted, "No".

J. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

J.1 For eComments and Emails Received from the Public

Peggy Cochran, part of a group of residents near PCH and Pearl; asked for the City's help regarding the new street sweeping ordinance requiring three hours of no parking on the street during street sweeping; stated they do not have enough places to park and requested special permit parking for residents in that area.

Mayor Light confirmed this matter will return to City Council at its meeting on September 3, 2024.

Andy Porkchop agreed with the prior speaker.

City Clerk Manzano reported receiving one eComment.

There were no other public comments.

K. EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS - None

L. PUBLIC HEARINGS - None

M. ITEMS CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS AGENDAS – None

N. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION PRIOR TO ACTION

N.1. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING E-BIKE USE IN THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH

CONTACT: JOE HOFFMAN, CHIEF OF POLICE

RBPD Chief Hoffman stated he is there to give a six-month eBike update; introduced Captain Martinez from Special Operations Bureau and Lieutenant King from Special Operations Division; noted a representative from the School District will be there to answer questions regarding the permitting program that will be started during the school year and possibly a member of the public that will speak about the rewards program starting through the Outreach for eBikes. RBPD Chief Hoffman detailed out the main points of the updates with a PowerPoint presentation; items to go over included status of increased enforcement, status of community meetings, outreach and feedback, status of Assembly Bills, status of bicycle diversion programs, and status of enforcement statues; stated 135 citations have been issued and the main infractions were failure to stop at posted stop signs, absence of helmets, and riding with passengers illegally; listed the many ways they reached out to people to gain feedback regarding eBikes; found several overlapping complaints including most violators were youths or juveniles, discussed parents being accountable, and the possibility of needing a license to operate and ride one; spoke about solutions through eBike diversion; reviewed Assembly Bill 530 and noted that the Bill failed; discussed Assembly Bill 2234 and he would monitor the progress; stated it is tough to enforce some of the eBike laws.

RBPD Chief Hoffman discussed ordinances created in neighboring cities; displayed a chart with a comparison of violations and the related MC/CVC sections related to eBikes in the South Bay; stressed that enforcement is meant to correct behavior, encourage the safe operation of eBikes and prevent people from being injured; noted the enforcement of violations is not punitive in nature and that the goal is to create a safer environment for everyone; reported working closely with the School District; announced the School District has decided to implement eBike training through a local partner; summarized RBPD eBike recommendations.

In response to Mayor Light's question regarding whether bikes are allowed on sidewalks, RBPD Chief Hoffman reported bicycles are allowed to be operated on sidewalks and felt that is a discussion that is needed. Additionally, he reported there are sufficient statutes in the codes that allow the Police Department to conduct a reasonable amount of enforcement and create a safe environment; agreed that bicycles on sidewalks can be dangerous.

City Manager Witzansky reported that if the City posts the prohibition of bicycles on sidewalks in certain segments it can restrict that activity under the code.

Mayor Light suggested a middle ground of establishing some sidewalk ordinances.

Discussion followed regarding circumstances and the nature of the activity of the riders.

Councilmember Obagi spoke about injuries and fatalities of people that have come into contact with eBikes and asked whether RBPD efforts have made an impact.

RBPD Chief Hoffman reported that they have been fortunate to not have many eBike accidents reported, especially over the summer; asserted the number of complaints

received about eBikes has decreased substantially; mentioned increased uses during the school year versus the summer.

In regard to a comparison of administrative penalties with Manhattan Beach and Hermosa Beach, RBPD Chief Hoffman reported speaking with police chiefs from both agencies; noted they seem satisfied with their ordinances and enforcement; opined that their penalties are just administrative fines with little deterrence; discussed impounding eBikes and noted that each city has a slightly different experience based on the way the city is structured.

Councilmember Loewenstein mentioned he has seen the recklessness of eBikes while driving his daughter to school and in response to his questions, RBPD Chief Hoffman discussed the differences between passing an ordinance versus using the vehicle code; addressed violations and aligning enforcement to surrounding cities; discussed the need for a court to agree to a diversion program.

City Attorney Webb provided a brief history of diversion in the City; explained the process for applying for a diversion program and expanded on the need for court approval; touched on the South Bay Bicycle Coalition diversion program.

Councilmember Kaluderovic thanked RBPD for the community outreach; indicated her preference of having students and their parents go to court rather than paying a fine; felt it is important to understand the School District program and enforcement through other cities; commented she understands that there will always be reckless riders and not everything can be mitigated but noted the City could add rules.

In reply to Mayor Light's question regarding regulations relative to riding at night without lights, RBPD Chief Hoffman reported those are in the vehicle code; stated it is a section specifically for bicycles and police officers regularly enforce it. Mayor Light talked about identifying the classes of eBikes and the ability of riders to override them and stated he reached out to the City's Legislative Lobbyist to see if the City can interject something at the State level that would hit the point of sale or manufacturers.

RBPD Chief Hoffman reported that it is difficult to identify classes and easy to convert them illegally.

Councilmember Behrendt commended Chief Hoffman, Captain Martinez and Lieutenant King for the report; felt their education and programs have effectuated a welcome change over the last year and affirmed he has heard less complaints from residents regarding the issue. He spoke favorably regarding the School District's training program; thanked RBPD for their work and efforts and urged them to keep up the great work.

Councilmember Obagi requested an update in April of next year to give a status update in terms of complaints, violations, citations and accidents to ensure that Council tailors the policy according to the needs of the community.

RBPD Chief Hoffman replied favorably to the report; mentioned eBikes will continue to grow and evolve and there will continue to be a variety of approaches to try to make them safer. He added that regular reporting will keep Council and residents informed and agreed to provide an update as Council directs.

Councilmember Obagi clarified he suggested April, as there will be a new Mayor and Councilmembers and they can address the issue right away.

Councilmember Nehrenheim invited the School Board representative to the podium.

Byung Cho, Board Clerk for Redondo Beach Unified School District, commented favorably about working with the RBPD; spoke about the sticker program for eBikes; noted training at the middle school age to address the matter early on, doing continuous monitoring and working with the BCHD; added that school begins August 21, 2024 and the program rolled out this week, information was distributed to all parents via email and other methods; reported whoever attended the recent Bike Rodeo will get credit and will receive the stickers.

Councilmember Nehrenheim commented he has noticed changes for the better, especially a remarkable difference in Riviera Village, since Memorial Day; in response to his questions, RBPD Chief Hoffman discussed citations for juveniles requiring parents to attend court with the juvenile, raising fines for municipal code violations and the inability for the City to adjust fines for vehicle code violations since they are administered through the State.

Councilmember Nehrenheim spoke about eBikes being expensive; suggested the possibility of increasing fines for municipal code violations and looked toward seeing what the City can do on the administrative side. Additionally, he talked about issuing citations for not having lights, underinflated tires, etc., noting that he wants parents to understand the seriousness of the matter.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, to receive and file the PowerPoint presentation and request an update report from RBPD in April 2025.

Councilmember Nehrenheim offered a friendly amendment adding any actions regarding fines or tickets be added administratively regarding violations of the municipal code.

Councilmember Obagi interjected that the City Attorney will speak to that as the City does not have an administrative review officer procedure and it would require the development of a whole new system, including the appointment of a City employee as an Administrative Review Officer. City Attorney Webb concurred with Councilmember Obagi.

Councilmember Behrendt seconded the motion.

Discussion followed regarding continuing the Bike Rodeo and enforcement details.

Councilmember Obagi made a clarifying comment that his motion includes the expectation for the continued work and reporting being done by the RBPD.

Juwan Asani, Business Owner, 7-Eleven on Aviation and Grant, thanked RBPD Chief Hoffman and his team for keeping Redondo Beach residents, businesses and kids safe; presented 1,000 slurpee coupons for the Police to distribute in rewarding positive behavior from young residents; thanked Councilmember Kaluderovic for her efforts and looked forward to continuing to work together.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Andy Porkchop, Torrance, talked about his experience with eBikes; discussed existing laws to regulate eBikes and did not believe kids need more rules and expressed concerns with kids missing exercise with eBikes.

Wayne Craig, District 1, agreed there has been a significant improvement; commented favorably regarding the report and felt the problems include adults as well as kids

Kyle Johnson (via Zoom), District 1, mentioned he rides his eBike to work, to run to the grocery store and for recreation; stated he is grateful that Redondo Beach has not implemented ordinances like those in Manhattan Beach and Hermosa Beach; felt that ordinances are unnecessary and have a chilling effect on getting people to ride bikes; suggested the City build more Class 4 protected bike lanes so that people will have a safe space in which to ride and listed the benefits of doing so.

Brianna Egan (via Zoom), District 1, commended the City, the RBPD, and the School District for their proactive approach to this matter; noted the education has been effective; echoed the benefits of promoting bicycles for transportation; spoke in support of building more Class 4 protected bike lanes; addressed enforcement and mentioned if the City is going to step-up enforcement of eBikes, it should also step-up enforcement of vehicles.

Liam Walsh (via Zoom), District 5, commented on his family's use of eBikes; mentioned that his family downsized their auto use due to eBikes; thanked the RBPD for its efforts; spoke about relevant City laws and infrastructure needs regarding bike use; talked about prohibiting bicycles on sidewalks which would increase pedestrian safety and building more Class 4 protected bike lanes which would increase bicyclists' safety; urged Council to eliminate pedestrian/bike and vehicle conflict points and spoke about vehicle code exceptions.

Grace Peng (via Zoom), District 5, spoke about her eBike as her primary source of transportation; noted that if more people used eBikes instead of cars it would alleviate parking issues; talked about motorists breaking the law; encouraged people to try riding eBikes as a means of transportation just as they do cars; wanted car drivers to be more aware of eBikes on the road to avoid hitting them.

City Clerk Manzano reported receiving three eComments regarding this item.

There were no other public comments.

Councilmember Nehrenheim talked about following the lead of Manhattan Beach and Hermosa Beach in regards to laws and fees for specific violations; asked RBPD Chief Hoffman if the City could enforce similar fines. In reply to the question, RBPD Chief Hoffman stated they have the sidewalk ordinance but it needs to be posted and Council needs to decide what sidewalks they want these to be posted at and action can be taken. When asked how Manhattan Beach came up with the amounts for the fines, RBPD Chief Hoffman stated their Council came up with those amounts.

Mayor Light called for the vote.

The motion carried 5-0, by voice vote.

N.2. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION PERTAINING RESOLUTIONS, TO CALL A SPECIAL ELECTION, BY CONSOLIDATING WITH LA COUNTY STATEWIDE GENERAL ELECTION TO BE HELD ON TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 5, 2024, TO PLACE BALLOT MEASURES; TO APPROVE THE ISSUANCE OF GENERAL OBLIGATION BONDS TO FINANCE MUNICIPAL IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS CONSTITUTING PUBLIC INFRASTRUCTURE AND CHARTER AMENDMENTS FOR ARTICLE XXVII MAJOR CHANGES IN ALLOWABLE LAND USE AND ARTICLE XVI REDONDO BEACH UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT.

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2408-064, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, CALLING AND GIVING NOTICE OF HOLDING A SPECIAL MUNICIPAL ELECTION TO BE HELD ON TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 5, 2024, ORDERING THE SUBMISSION OF A MEASURE TO THE QUALIFIED VOTERS OF THE CITY, PLACING A MEASURE TO APPROVE THE ISSUANCE OF GENERAL OBLIGATION BONDS TO FINANCE MUNICIPAL IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS CONSTITUTING PUBLIC INFRASTRUCTURE OF THE CITY ON THE NOVEMBER 5, 2024 BALLOT, REQUESTING CONSOLIDATION WITH THE STATEWIDE GENERAL ELECTION, AND SETTING PROCEDURAL DETAILS; AND

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2407-062, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, CALLING AND GIVING NOTICE OF HOLDING A SPECIAL MUNICIPAL ELECTION TO BE HELD ON TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 5, 2024, CONSOLIDATED WITH THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY STATEWIDE ELECTION, AND ORDERING THE SUBMISSION TO THE QUALIFIED VOTERS OF THE CITY OF A MEASURE RELATING TO CHARTER

AMENDMENT ARTICLE XXVII MAJOR CHANGES IN ALLOWABLE LAND USE SECTIONS 27.2, 27.4(b), AND 27.6(h) AND (i), AND SETTING PROCEDURAL DETAILS; AND

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2408-065, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, CALLING AND GIVING NOTICE OF HOLDING A SPECIAL MUNICIPAL ELECTION TO BE HELD ON TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 5, 2024, CONSOLIDATED WITH THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY STATEWIDE ELECTION, AND ORDERING THE SUBMISSION TO THE QUALIFIED VOTERS OF THE CITY OF A MEASURE RELATING TO CHARTER AMENDMENT ARTICLE XVI REDONDO BEACH UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT SECTION 16.1, AND SETTING PROCEDURAL DETAILS; AND

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2407-061, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, REQUESTING THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS OF THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES TO CONSOLIDATE A SPECIAL MUNICIPAL ELECTION TO BE HELD ON NOVEMBER 5, 2024, WITH THE STATEWIDE GENERAL ELECTION TO BE HELD ON THE DATE PURSUANT TO SECTION 10403 OF THE CALIFORNIA ELECTIONS CODE FOR PROPOSED MEASURES.

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

Mayor Light announced this item has four sections; stated Council will discuss each and provide motions, after which the public will be invited to comment.

City Attorney Webb stated Council may allow the public to speak once per item and then can take separate votes on each.

City Clerk Manzano introduced the item; noted it involves three ballots to be placed on the November 5th election and narrated a PowerPoint presentation regarding the proposed measures and highlighted changes.

Discussion followed regarding the assessed value total aggregate amount that would be used to pay off the debt service associated with the issuance of the bonds.

City Clerk Manzano continued with the PowerPoint presentation and addressed arguments for, arguments against, and rebuttals.

In reply to Councilmember Obagi's question regarding Exhibits A and B, City Clerk Manzano reported they are attached to the resolution.

Councilmember Obagi favored a designation of PS (Public Safety), FD (Fire Department) or PD (Police Department).

Councilmember Loewenstein suggested a designation of PS, FP or PF.

City Manager Witzansky suggested Measure S for Safety.

In terms of authorizing authors, Councilmember Loewenstein volunteered and asked Councilmember Kaluderovic and Mayor Light to work with him.

Mayor Light and Councilmember Kaluderovic agreed.

Discussion followed regarding the ballot language.

City Manager Witzansky reported the original draft was prepared by the City's outside consultant and legal bond counsel and discussed use of slashes versus commas.

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, to approve the item as written; designate Mayor Light, Councilmembers Kaluderovic and Loewenstein to write the argument and the designation would be PS, FP or PF and adopt by title only, Resolution No. CC-2408-064.

City Clerk Manzano narrated a PowerPoint presentation with details of the proposed Charter amendments to Article 27 and stated that it has been approved by the City Attorney. She confirmed that Council suggested using the designations, DD, RB or LC.

City Attorney Webb reviewed the proposed amendment and talked about not including amendments that are not made in connection with the required Housing Element; addressed using the term "required amendments"; noted it is the City Council's decision and felt the initial version was harder for voters to read.

Councilmember Behrendt offered non-substantive potential changes and City Attorney Webb explained the rationale for his proposal; noted that City Council can make any non-substantive changes it wants to and deferred to the City Clerk regarding punctuation.

City Clerk Manzano reported that commas are not counted as a word.

Councilmember Behrendt suggested edits including numbering the statements for ease of reading, changing "requirement" under the Charter and adding commas as appropriate.

City Attorney Webb agreed but noted it is a problem if the intent is to refer to the exception that it be a required amendment. He added that the Charter is the law and that is why the strikethroughs are included in what the voters get.

Councilmember Obagi felt it will make the preceding bond measure look confusing.

Councilmember Behrendt acknowledged that is a good point.

City Attorney Webb reported there are specific requirements which is why the City uses bond counsel.

Council continued offering grammatical edits to the Charter amendment.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, to adopt by title only Resolution No. CC-2407-062, with the ballot language as shown on the PowerPoint slide on the screen, designating Mayor Light, and Councilmembers Nehrenheim and Obagi, as the authors of the proponent statement and designate the letters DD, RB or LC.

City Clerk Manzano narrated PowerPoint slides with information related to a proposed Charter amendment and one to the Redondo Beach Unified School District pertaining to Section 16.1 Board Members related to removing language “without compensation except necessary expenses when acting as a designated representative of the Board of Education as provided in the Education Code of State of California”.

Byung Cho, Board Clerk for the Redondo Beach Unified School District, confirmed that the school board is satisfied with the proposed wording in terms of who will author the proponent statements; he stated they have a list of names which includes the Board President and community members.

Discussion followed regarding designating School Board Members as determined by the School Board and designating Raymur Flinn as the author.

Councilmember Loewenstein suggested SD (School District), SB (School Board), or BE (Board of Education).

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, to adopt by title only Resolution No. CC-2407-065, with the ballot question as shown on the PowerPoint slide on the screen, designating School Board President, Raymur Flinn, as the author of the proponent statement and designate the letters SD, SB or BE.

City Clerk Manzano reported that arguments cannot exceed 300 words; noted that edits can be made as long as they are made before August 16, 2024 by 5:00 p.m. and stated she will submit the necessary forms to the authors so they can begin writing the arguments and get five people to support their statements; indicated she will ask the City Attorney to work on the impartial analyses; explained an addition to the Election Code involving other support that begins in 2025 and information for which is included in Blue Folder Items for this item. She added that each author will get a packet with the resolutions, county information, forms and specifications; City Clerk Manzano listed the resolutions to be adopted as amended.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to adopt Resolution No. CC-2407-061.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Andy Porkchop, Torrance, spoke about the bond measures; spoke about competing bond measures and wished the City good luck with it.

There were no other public comments on this item.

The motions carried 5-0, by voice vote.

City Clerk Manzano read titles to Resolutions No. CC-2407-061, CC-2407-062, CC-2407-064 and CC-2407-065.

RECESS/RECONVENE

Motion by Councilmember Behrendt, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and carried by voice vote, to recess at 8:37 p.m.

The motion carried 4-1-0. Councilmember Nehrenheim voted, "No".

Mayor Light reconvened the meeting at 8:46 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light

N.3. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION TO PROVIDE DIRECTION TO STAFF RELATING TO OPTIONS RELATING TO INSTANT RUNOFF METHODS, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO CONSIDERING CALLING ELECTION TO CONSIDER PLACING A MEASURE FOR A CHARTER AMENDMENT ARTICLE 18, ELECTIONS, SECTION 18.4, MAJORITY VOTE; INSTANT RUNOFF ELECTION, AND TO DISCUSS DRAFT ORDINANCE AMENDING THE CITY'S MUNICIPAL CODE RELATED TO INSTANT RUNOFF MODEL AND/OR PROVIDE STAFF DIRECTION.

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2408-068, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, CALLING AND GIVING NOTICE OF HOLDING A SPECIAL MUNICIPAL ELECTION TO BE HELD ON TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 5, 2024, TO CONSOLIDATE WITH THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY STATEWIDE ELECTION, AND ORDERING THE SUBMISSION TO THE QUALIFIED VOTERS OF THE CITY OF A MEASURE RELATING TO CHARTER AMENDMENT ARTICLE XVIII ELECTIONS SECTION 18.4, MAJORITY VOTE: INSTANT RUNOFF ELECTION, AND SETTING PROCEDURAL DETAILS.

**CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK
MICHAEL WEBB, CITY ATTORNEY**

City Attorney Webb talked about the options available for Council to consider; noted that at this time, Council only needs to decide whether to proceed with a Charter amendment or not; displayed a short video; reported Council was tasked with preparing an ordinance two years ago and Council decided to go with ranked choice voting (RCV); discussed how Council discovered that RCV is not what they perceived it to be and several mentioned he/she may have voted differently and displayed another short video.

City Clerk Manzano reported that a representative of the equipment company is on Zoom as is Rosemary from the RCV Resource Center.

Councilmember Obagi asked whether the Charter permits the City to conduct a STAR voting election.

City Attorney Webb stated there is no answer to that; reported Council would have to decide whether STAR voting is an instant runoff system; talked about the Charter referring to adopting the election procedure in the California Elections Code, in turn, it requires that the equipment be certified by the Secretary of State (he does not believe any machine is certified to do STAR voting) and a provision which is a pilot program with 10 or so criteria; indicated he cannot answer the question at this point and noted it is not up for discussion at this time but would be in two weeks and may require another ordinance allowing the City to do it by hand.

Councilmember Obagi reported that another choice could be that Council could provide direction to put a Charter amendment on the ballot in March to clarify what Council intended in the first instance, which is anything other than a delayed runoff and that currently the City wants an instant runoff voting system.

City Attorney Webb talked about whether the STAR voting system is an instant runoff system; discussed certifying machines and picking a pilot program; stated that as a Charter City, Redondo Beach could face legal challenges that the City is not following the State elections majority preference voting system. He added that previous Council direction in January was clear in terms of returning with an ordinance for RCV and noted focus is on the Charter amendment; stated Council could delay it and in the meantime, as other systems are developed that are not instant runoff systems, Council could propose Charter language that would be applicable. Council has to decide whether to do a Charter amendment tonight and has to pass an ordinance for an instant runoff voting system in two weeks. He reiterated that the Charter amendment has to be today, and the ordinance does not; talked about a provision that speeds up the voting process and mentioned the language is confusing.

City Clerk Manzano reported speaking with the consultant who sent her a guide about RCV; stated it indicates that California can be a single elimination or batch elimination.

City Attorney Webb added that if there are a lot of candidates that do not get many votes, the lower candidates can be eliminated in one round.

City Clerk Manzano narrated a PowerPoint presentation regarding Charter amendment options relative to instant runoff voting.

City Attorney Webb discussed details of the various options available for Council's consideration and reported people want certainty in casting their votes.

City Clerk Manzano listed recommendations.

Councilmember Obagi provided a brief background of the item; talked about the percentage of voters voting in runoff elections resulting in people getting elected by a minority in a small plurality; noted the voters supported the Charter amendment by 77% and that was the clearest expression in a direct democracy of what they wanted, which is to avoid our costly runoff elections. Additionally, he discussed voter fatigue and stated he will do anything to avoid runoff elections in Redondo Beach; stated he would prefer to defer this discussion until after the City's first experience with RCV to see how it goes. Additionally, he reported speaking with the City Clerk who confirmed that her office will be able to count every RCV ballot and will be able to provide audits; addressed comments by RCV advocates and the public; wondered about people attesting to the success of RCV in other cities as well as minorities being elected. He shared Slide 2B with listing quotes from numerous municipalities regarding the success of RCV; stated he has no reluctance to heed the vote of the people in choosing RCV; suggested seeing how it goes and moving forward from there; questioned communicating an "oops" at the same time Council is asking for \$93.5 million for public safety infrastructure.

Mayor Light asserted that when there is a runoff election a majority of people choose to vote in that election and stated it is not a plurality, but the majority of people who go out and take the time to run in that runoff election. He expressed concern that people who voted can get excluded in the rounds and can end up without a majority; discussed the Condorcet method of voting and felt it is confusing and premature to put it in front of the voters; voiced against doing this at the last minute. Additionally, he reported that he voted for an instant runoff system and would not have voted for RCV had he had the information that he now does; felt the City is funneled into one single choice because of the certification unless the City can get a pilot program; discussed failures in other elections and felt it is not ready for implementation.

Councilmember Nehrenheim agreed with Mayor Light's comments; talked about studies showing disenfranchisement of people of color and women in RCV; displayed Slide 1A showing a discussion in December 2022 and then Councilmember Emdee's comments about RCV and instant runoff systems allowing for flexibility of the choices of voting systems; reported the eventual language was "and instant runoff system"; spoke about the City of San Francisco's definition and noted one of the issues with RCV is that an election night tally cannot be done.

City Clerk Manzano explained the process the clerk's office goes through to verify votes. She explained how they organize, do a random drawing for the 1% tally, then hand count each box; she went on to explain the procedure her office goes through; she explained it takes a long time. She answered questions regarding errors and how her office catches mistakes; addressed precincts and districts and provided details of the counting and reporting process.

Councilmember Nehrenheim reported the City of Oakland was unable to catch a voting error and the incorrect candidate took office.

City Clerk Manzano talked about needing to go to the second ranking and was unsure what occurred in Oakland.

Councilmember Nehrenheim talked about the different tabulations; opined Council needs a backstop moving forward; noted Council is just now working out the ordinance and stated he would like to test the system that is currently in place to fully understand it; talked about comments he received from San Francisco voters about RCV, including it is confusing and not fully understood. He stated he would rather see issues of concern taken care of and delay the item and ensure the process is made completely transparent, auditable by a third party, clear, and concise.

Councilmember Loewenstein pointed out that 77% of people voted for RCV.

Councilmember Nehrenheim corrected Councilmember Loewenstein noting that they voted for an instant runoff system, not specifically RCV.

Councilmember Loewenstein wondered if Council will tell residents they were wrong; talked about RCV being around for 100 years in other countries and 20 years in the U.S.; opined it is not complicated to vote and rank who you like; reported the League of Women Voters supports RCV; stated California has approved RCV as the only form of instant runoff and felt this encourages a broad spectrum of people to run for office and not have to raise tons and tons of money. He expressed concern that if this does not pass, and the City moves forward with a Charter amendment, instead of seven months the City will only have three months to educate the public; felt that Council will be undermining the faith of people that their votes count; talked about voting irregularities in every election and saw no reason to rush this; discussed not handcuffing future Councils and stated he is nervous about overturning something that almost 80% of people voted for.

Mayor Light stated Council would not be overturning what the voters wanted if Council places this on the ballot and that it is up to them, not the Council; reported that what he read, as a voter, was "an instant runoff system".

Discussion followed between Mayor Light and Councilmember Loewenstein about RCV and voters choosing an instant runoff system versus specifically RCV and placing the

question to voters as to whether they specifically want RCV.

Mayor Light stated that voters were not informed that they were being roped into the one system and added that they were not informed they were choosing RCV.

Rosemary Blizzard (via Zoom), RCV Resources Center, discussed exit polling of voters after they have participated in RCV and overwhelmingly there is a 75% to 80%+ satisfaction rate and reported she has not seen any form of mass dissatisfaction with the process over the last several years. In response to Councilmember Loewenstein's questions, she commented on potential pitfalls being overblown and reported she has not observed a "gaming of the system". Additionally, she responded to questions from Council regarding efforts to repeal RCV.

Mayor Light commented on attempts at gaming the system and felt there is no way this process can solve the Condorcet voting problem.

Councilmember Obagi suggested not arguing with someone who does not have a vote.

Councilmember Nehrenheim noted the Mayor has veto power.

City Attorney Webb confirmed the Mayor cannot veto a Charter amendment onto the ballot and reported he could veto any ordinance that would put it on the ballot.

Councilmember Obagi commented on the voter education required for this next election; felt this is not likely to pass and will decimate the confidence people have in the City Council; noted the City is asking for the largest investments of people's lifetimes in the City at this time.

Mayor Light stated Council is under the obligation to put the best voting system in place.

Discussion followed regarding whether voters understood what they were voting for two years ago.

Councilmember Nehrenheim noted Council simply votes to put things onto the ballot and whether they pass or not is up to the voters; reported the State of Alaska has included a ballot measure to repeal RCV; felt Council needs to make a rational decision about the clarity of a voting system and stated he would rather get this right and do it correctly.

Mayor Light invited the consultant to address Council.

Sara Wolk (via Zoom), Executive Director, Equal Vote Coalition, reported she used to be an advocate for RCV but changed positions when she realized many of the points used to persuade the public are over sold or factually false; talked about STAR voting not being certified yet but, if Council chose to move forward, it could be certified through an established certification process; discussed establishing STAR voting as a pilot program; addressed options for certification and felt the pilot program could be

implemented by March but may take longer; suggested Council should pass an ordinance stating that a new voting method will go into effect not more than one year after the time that a process is in place to tally the elections. She discussed weaknesses in RCV; opined the main weakness is how pervasively it has been oversold and the fact that most rankings are not being counted; addressed voter disenfranchisement issue and a reason why STAR voting is a more accurate method; reasoned that centralized tabulation is the real problem and danger; claimed California is out of compliance with auditing laws around RCV and believed RCV cannot be implemented legally in Redondo Beach as it is physically impossible to comply with California law as written. In summary, she recommended that Council proceed with an ordinance and not do a charter amendment; suggested that the ordinance state a new voting method will go into effect after a new system is in place adding that it can reaffirm Council's commitment to the goals of the voter.

Mayor Light noted voters chose an instant runoff system and the City does not have an alternative for this next election.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Tony Hale, Redondo Beach resident spoke about his advocacy for instant runoff, RCV last year; referenced comments by the Equal Vote Coalition discrediting RCV; opined they are a fringe group proposing a system that has never been used in any public election and are not experts in election systems; stated the City should not allow this group to derail the will of the voters. He reported that RCV is supported by 65 academic experts including 10 Nobel Prize laureates; listed others high profile individuals that support RCV; suggested the City take advantage of the expert knowledge available to help implement what the voters have asked for and start the education process; spoke about the resources available for education; noted there is no reason to delay and urged Council to reject the proposed Charter amendments and move forward to meet the will of the Redondo Beach voters.

Arend Castelein, Los Angeles resident, Production Lead for Equal Vote Coalition, stated all three Charter amendment options are in direct opposition to the ballot measure that voters supported last year; believed it will create confusion and undermine voters' trust in the Council; asked that Council begin implementation of STAR voting instead of drafting a Charter amendment; he described and defined the STAR voting method and urged Council to use STAR instead of RCV.

Eugene Solomon shared comments as someone who was present through discussions of the topic by the Charter Review Advisory Committee (CRAC); spoke about those discussions and comments received from various political action committees; discussed plurality in terms of whether or not to include the School Board in the instant runoff methodology; noted it was determined that the plurality was acting in that capacity; noted that, when it was presented to Council, the concept was addressed as an instant runoff but the methodology was not.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and carried by voice vote, to allow Eugene Solomon three minutes to provide his personal views on the topic.

The motion carried 5-0.

Eugene Solomon expressed concerns about comments regarding how this will make Council “look” to the electorate or that Council will yo-yo back and forth; opined it is more important to get something right than being embarrassed about how Council will “look” to the voters; asserted that voters voted for a concept, not a methodology; talked about the ordinance not being “fully cooked” and suggested a pause to develop the best possible instant runoff system for the voters.

Kyle Johnson (via Zoom), District 1, spoke in support of RCV; discussed the voters’ choice for an instant runoff system; noted California has certified RCV as an instant runoff system and urged Council to give people what they voted for.

Tom Sharon (via Zoom), California RCV Coalition, spoke in support of RCV and implementing the system that the voters chose; read the argument in favor of RCV that was provided in the ballot measure; asserted that RCV works and has been proven in dozens of elections.

Diane Silver (via Zoom), spoke about the disrespectful claims presented by Sara Wolk against RCV; pointed out that RCV has had far more positive outcomes than the two negative claims pointed out; felt this is an effort to undermine the will of the voters by discrediting RCV; encouraged Council to hold a study session to research those claims and better understand RCV;

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and carried by voice vote, to allow Diane Silver an additional 30 seconds to comment.

The motion carried 5-0.

Diane Silver (via Zoom), addressed the idea of majority winners and reported the rate of participation in instant runoffs, round by round, is higher for RCV than it is for delayed runoffs or STAR voting.

Marcela Miranda-Caballero (via Zoom), Executive Director, California RCV Coalition, spoke about disingenuous comments regarding RCV by other electoral reformers; addressed a brief history of RCV and its benefits; noted the recommendations of the CRAC and asserted that the voters’ wishes must be fulfilled.

Eileen Reavey (via Zoom), Santa Monica resident, Deputy Director, Rank the Vote, talked about voters being in favor of RCV over STAR voting; listed concerns with the STAR voting system and reasons why; claimed RCV has a proven track record across the world for over 100 years and hoped the will of the voters is respected.

Steve Chessin (via Zoom), President, Californians for Electoral Reform, spoke about misleading and out of context information presented; pointed out that voters understood what they were voting for and read from the impartial analysis; claimed that STAR voting can violate majority rule; addressed the potential for “gaming the system”; spoke about the many successful elections in the U.S. that were run by RCV and urged Council to follow the will of the voters.

Mike Feinstein (via Zoom), Former Santa Monica Mayor and City Councilmember, spoke about being a student of electoral systems in the U.S., Australia, and Ireland; urged Council to stay the course with what Redondo Beach voters approved; discouraged placing any Charter amendment on the November ballot that would change that commitment for policy and political reasons and listed reasons why Council should not.

Colter Cederlof (via Zoom), Riverside, Volunteer with California STAR Voting Chapter, spoke in support of a STAR voting ordinance while maintaining the current Charter; asserted that STAR voting is an instant runoff voting method; expressed his commitment to help with voter education for STAR voting as he currently offers an online Zoom tutorial to educate voters about STAR voting.

Colin Lord (via Zoom), San Diego, California STAR Voting Chapter, spoke in support of moving forward with the STAR voting system and listed its benefits over RCV.

City Clerk Manzano reported receiving 11 eComments all of which oppose a Charter amendment.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Councilmember Obagi wanted to address Mr. Solomon’s comments and stated that he does believe Council’s credibility is currently on the line for this November’s election; stated he does not believe in creating policy out of fear; noted that with the public’s positive statements regarding RCV, he is willing to see it through along with confidence in the City Clerk that she will ensure all the votes are counted accurately, and then decide from there rather than “shooting from the hip” at the last minute.

Councilmember Nehrenheim reported he added his name to the list of proponents before he understood the magnitude and expressed concerns with the depth of money that is supporting one side versus the other; noted that when Council first discussed this it was supposed to be simple; felt that it is far more complicated than they realized and feels the City is not quite ready at present; reiterated Council should put forward a backstop as a delay and start moving forward and refine any system that the City wants to put in place. Additionally, he talked about ensuring that any system the City implements is certified and has been tested along with the City having the right ordinances in place.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, to propose a Charter amendment, choosing Option No. 1.

The motion died for lack of a second.

Discussion ensued between Councilmember Nehrenheim and City Attorney Webb regarding previous discussions regarding election cycles and timing and language needed to pass an ordinance.

City Attorney Webb stated it would be tough to list all the things because of other conversations about this; affirmed Redondo Beach is a Charter City, and the City could set thresholds but would invite lawsuits; stated that the City could reverse the Charter or produce a specific date.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, to propose Charter amendment Option No. 1, to be placed on the November election for 2029.

The motion died for lack of a second.

In response to questions from Councilmember Behrendt, City Clerk Manzano reported that the RCV system is already certified by the Secretary of State and is the only instant runoff system certified in California; stated she has never run an election using RCV but noted there is plenty of support to complete one and expressed full confidence in the system.

Councilmember Behrendt stated he is open to considering other instant runoff systems; stated his central issue with STAR voting is that it may not be consistent with Charter Section 18.4, as amended, and specially in the automatic round where there is no subsequent round of voting as required by the Charter and he cannot support that. He referenced approval of instant runoff voting in 2023 by the voters; stated he has not heard anything that justifies postponing, let alone changing the Charter, on that issue and asserted he is not inclined to vote to put a Charter amendment on the ballot for those reasons.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi to receive and file the report and direct staff to return with a report to the August 20, 2024 meeting and return with a discussion on potential Charter changes to permit other forms of instant runoff systems in one year.

City Attorney Webb reported that Council is not necessarily trapped into RCV for the future because the ordinance can be amended; noted Council will have to remember to do that since he will not longer be with the City.

Amended motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Behrendt, and carried by voice vote, to receive and file the report.

The amended motion carried 5-0.

O. CITY MANAGER ITEMS

City Manager Witzansky announced the launch of the City's online application portal; referenced the no parking signs on Lot 13 and reported the City cleared its appeal period with the Coastal Commission, signs will be installed next week, and enforcement will begin quickly.

Discussion followed regarding the Strategic Planning meeting.

P. MAYOR AND COUNCIL ITEMS - None

Q. MAYOR AND COUNCIL REFERRALS TO STAFF

Councilmember Nehrenheim thanked Public Works for installing the lights on Topaz and the City Clerk's office for going above and beyond in providing the election information.

Councilmember Loewenstein mentioned putting LED lights on stop signs at the Esplanade at Topaz and at Sapphire.

R. RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION – None

The Closed Session meeting was cancelled.

S. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION – None

The Closed Session meeting was cancelled.

T. ADJOURNMENT – 11:08 p.m.

There being no further business to come before the City Council, motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to adjourn the meeting at 11:08 p.m. to an Adjourned Regular meeting to be held at 4:30 p.m. (Closed Session) and a Regular meeting to be held at 6:00 p.m. (Open Session) on Tuesday, August 13, 2024 in the Redondo Beach City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

Motion carried, 5-0.

All written comments submitted via eComment are included in the record and available for public review on the City website.

Respectfully submitted:

Eleanor Manzano, CMC
City Clerk