



Minutes
Redondo Beach City Council
Tuesday, September 3, 2024
Closed Session - Adjourned Regular Meeting 4:30 p.m.
Open Session –Regular Meeting 6:00 p.m.

4:30 PM - CLOSED SESSION – ADJOURNED REGULAR MEETING

A. CALL MEETING TO ORDER

An Adjourned Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 4:30 p.m. by Mayor Light in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

B. ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehenheim, Mayor Light

Councilmembers Absent: Obagi

Officials Present: Mike Witzansky, City Manager
Melissa Villa, Analyst

C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION - NONE

D. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS

There were no Blue Folder Items for Closed Session.

E. PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS ON CLOSED SESSION ITEMS AND NON-AGENDA ITEMS

There were no public communications on Closed Session items and non-agenda items.

F. RECESS TO CLOSED – 4:32 p.m.

Analyst Villa read title to the items to be considered in Closed Session.

City Manager Witzansky announced that the following would be participating in Closed Session: City Manager Mike Witzansky, City Attorney Mike Webb, Assistant City Attorney Cheryl Park, Human Resources Director Diane Strickfaden, Outside Legal Counsel Aaron Prosin, Public Works Director Andy Winje and Outside Legal Counsel Mane Khachatryan.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and approved by voice vote, to recess to Closed Session at 4:32 p.m.

Motion carried, 4-0. Councilmember Obagi was absent.

F.1. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege - Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).

Name of case:

**John Bruce v. City of Redondo Beach
WCAB No: ADJ12141327; ADJ12141328**

F.2. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).

Name of case:

**City of Redondo Beach v. Mike Madani, Trustee of the Madani Family Trust Under Declaration of Trust Dated May 6, 2022, et al.
Case Number: 21STCV11444**

G. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION – 6:00 p.m.

Mayor Light reconvened to Open Session at 6:00 p.m.

H. ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk
Mike Webb, City Attorney
Mike Witzansky, City Manager
Lucie Colombo, Chief Deputy City Clerk

I. ANNOUNCEMENT OF CLOSED SESSION ACTIONS

City Manager Witzansky announced that Human Resources Analyst Nicolette Petz joined in Closed Session for Item No. F.1.

Councilmember Obagi announced that he was present for the entire Closed Session.

J. ADJOURN TO REGULAR MEETING

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and

approved by voice vote, to adjourn to the regular meeting at 6:00 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

6:00 PM - OPEN SESSION – REGULAR MEETING

A. CALL TO ORDER

A Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 6:00 p.m. by Mayor Light in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

B. ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk
Mike Webb, City Attorney
Mike Witzansky, City Manager
Lucie Colombo, Chief Deputy City Clerk

C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION

Mayor Light invited Veterans and Active Military to stand and recognized them for their service.

Ryder, 4th Grader, Valley Christian Academy, led in the salute to the flag.

Mayor Light called for a moment of silence.

D. PRESENTATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/ANNOUNCEMENTS

Councilmember Nehrenheim commended MSO's Brian Sabosky and Pedro Malo for noticing fraudulent QR codes on parking meters; mentioned the building of a dedicated bicycle lane on Knob Hill; talked about improvements at Alta Vista; spoke about the work on the Waterfront, including the installation of pavers at the International Boardwalk; thanked Public Works for their efforts.

Councilmember Loewenstein thanked Public Works for the installation of pavers at the International Boardwalk; announced the District 2 Community Meeting will be held on Wednesday, September 25th on Zoom from 6:00 p.m. to 7:30 p.m.; noted W.E.D. Director Greg Kapovich will be the special guest at the meeting; they will talk about the bonds for November; mentioned previous meeting and Marc Wiener, Community Development Director, joining it and listening to information regarding the measures for the FP obligation bond for rebuilding Police and Fire stations.

Councilmember Kaluderovic spoke about the recent District 3 Community Meeting last week and stated she will post the next September meeting soon.

Councilmember Obagi thanked Interim Community Services Director Hause for attending the recent District 4 Community Meeting; addressed the upcoming bond measure supporting the City's Public Safety infrastructure needs; noted forces outside the City are opposing it; thanked Council and the Mayor for helping to combat it and get the opposition withdrawn.

Mayor Light announced his first community meeting September 4, 2024, from 5:00 p.m. to 7:00 p.m. in the Community Room of the North Library and urged residents to attend.

E. APPROVE ORDER OF AGENDA

Councilmember Obagi requested moving Item No. P.3 ahead of Item No. P.1.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Behrendt, and approved by voice vote, the order of the agenda, as amended, moving Item No. P.3 prior to Item No. P.1.

Motion carried, 5-0.

F. AGENCY RECESS

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to recess at 6:13 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

F.1. REGULAR MEETING OF THE REDONDO BEACH HOUSING AUTHORITY

CONTACT: ELIZABETH HAUSE, INTERIM COMMUNITY SERVICES DIRECTOR

F.2. REGULAR MEETING OF THE COMMUNITY FINANCING AUTHORITY

CONTACT: STEPHANIE MEYER, INTERIM FINANCE DIRECTOR

F.3. PUBLIC FINANCING AUTHORITY - REGULAR MEETING – CANCELLED

RECONVENE TO REGULAR MEETING FROM AGENCY MEETINGS – 6:33 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light

G. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS

G.1 For Blue Folder Documents Approved at the City Council Meeting

City Clerk Manzano announced Blue Folder Items for Items No. H.15, J.1, N.1 and P.1.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, to receive and file Blue Folder Items.

Motion carried, 5-0.

H. CONSENT CALENDAR

H.1. APPROVE AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING FOR THE CITY COUNCIL ADJOURNED AND REGULAR MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 3, 2024

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

H.2. APPROVE MOTION TO READ BY TITLE ONLY AND WAIVE FURTHER READING OF ALL ORDINANCES AND RESOLUTIONS LISTED ON THE AGENDA

H.3. APPROVE THE FOLLOWING CITY COUNCIL MINUTES: MAY 21, 2024.

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

H.4. PAYROLL DEMANDS CHECKS 29920-29943 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$16,264.91, PD. 8/30/24 DIRECT DEPOSIT 283352-283988 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$2,425,012.51, PD. 8/30/24 EFT/ACH \$9,246.68, PD. 8/2/24 (PP2416) EFT/ACH \$30,874.52, PD. 8/26/24 (CA State Economic Development Department)

ACCOUNTS PAYABLE DEMANDS CHECKS 115683-115920 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$3,897,289.59 EFT CALPERS MEDICAL INSURANCE \$464,040.92 DIRECT DEPOSIT 100008639-100008729 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$94,298.36, PD.8/30/24

REPLACEMENT DEMANDS 115681-115682

CONTACT: STEPHANIE MEYER, INTERIM FINANCE DIRECTOR

H.5. APPROVE CONTRACTS UNDER \$35,000:

1. APPROVE A LICENSE AGREEMENT WITH SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA EDISON COMPANY (SCE) PERMITTING THE CITY TO PLACE SIGNAGE ON SCE-OWNED STREET LIGHT POLES AT NO COST TO THE CITY UNTIL TERMINATED

2. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH ROCKWEST TECHNOLOGY GROUP, INC., DBA MULTICARD, FOR ID CARD SOFTWARE MAINTENANCE IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$3,200 FOR THE TERM AUGUST 1, 2024 TO JULY 31, 2025

3. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH LEADING RESOURCES, INC. FOR STRATEGIC PLANNING FACILITATION SERVICES IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$15,000 FOR THE TERM SEPTEMBER 3, 2024 TO JANUARY 31, 2025

4. APPROVE A MASTER SOFTWARE AND SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH PARAMOUNT TECHNOLOGIES, INC., AKA PAIRSOFT INC., FOR WEBIPLEX DOCUPEAK AND E-SUBPEONA SOFTWARE PLATFORMS IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$29,449 FOR THE TERM SEPTEMBER 3, 2024 TO SEPTEMBER 2, 2027

5. APPROVE AN AMENDMENT TO THE AGREEMENT WITH LOCALITY MEDIA, INC., DBA FIRST DUE, FOR ADDITIONAL RECORDS MANAGEMENT SYSTEM SERVICES IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$26,592.25 FOR THE TERM AUGUST 16, 2024 TO AUGUST 15, 2025 AND RETROACTIVE TO JANUARY 1, 2024

CONTACT: STEPHANIE MEYER, INTERIM FINANCE DIRECTOR

H.6. This Item was pulled from Consent for separate discussion by Councilmember Obagi.

H.7. This Item was pulled from Consent for separate discussion by Councilmember Behrendt.

H.8. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2409-070, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA AMENDING THE SALARY RANGE FOR THE POSITION OF WATERFRONT & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT MANAGER

CONTACT: GREG KAPOVICH, WATERFRONT & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

H.9. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2409-071, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH,

CALIFORNIA, LEASING CERTAIN PROPERTY TO JARIET TECHNOLOGIES, INC., A DELAWARE CORPORATION APPROVE AN AMENDMENT TO THE LEASE WITH JARIET TECHNOLOGIES, INC. FOR A MONTHLY MINIMUM RENT OF \$25,183 AND THE TERM SEPTEMBER 3, 2024 THROUGH NOVEMBER 2, 2029

CONTACT: GREG KAPOVICH, WATERFRONT & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

H.10. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2409-072, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, LEASING CERTAIN PROPERTY TO PIERO QUINCI, DMD, MS INC., A CALIFORNIA CORPORATION APPROVE AN AMENDMENT TO THE LEASE WITH PIERO QUINCI, DMD, MS INC. FOR A MONTHLY MINIMUM RENT OF \$5,520 AND THE TERM SEPTEMBER 3, 2024 THROUGH SEPTEMBER 2, 2029

CONTACT: GREG KAPOVICH, WATERFRONT & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

H.11. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2407-073, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, LEASING CERTAIN PROPERTY TO ROSENWALD CAPITAL MANAGEMENT, INC., A NEW YORK CORPORATION APPROVE AN AMENDMENT TO THE LEASE WITH ROSENWALD CAPITAL MANAGEMENT, INC. FOR A MONTHLY MINIMUM RENT OF \$3,487 AND A MONTH-TO-MONTH TERM STARTING SEPTEMBER 3, 2024

CONTACT: GREG KAPOVICH, WATERFRONT & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

H.12. APPROVE ADDENDUM NO.1 TO TRANSFER AGREEMENT NO. 2022RPSSMB02 BETWEEN THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH AND THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY FLOOD CONTROL DISTRICT FOR THE FULTON PLAYFIELD MULTI-BENEFIT INFILTRATION PROJECT, JOB NO. 60280 AWARDED THROUGH THE REGIONAL SAFE CLEAN WATER PROGRAM AND AUTHORIZE THE MAYOR TO EXECUTE THE DOCUMENT

CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR

H.13. APPROVE THE SAFE, CLEAN WATER MUNICIPAL TRANSFER AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY FLOOD CONTROL DISTRICT AND THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH; AND ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2409-077, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA,

AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR, THE CITY MANAGER, OR THE CITY MANAGER'S DESIGNEE TO EXECUTE THE TRANSFER AGREEMENT WITH THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY FLOOD CONTROL DISTRICT FOR THE SAFE, CLEAN WATER PROGRAM'S MUNICIPAL PROGRAM

CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR

H.14. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2409-074, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA AMENDING THE OFFICIAL BOOK OF CLASS SPECIFICATIONS TO INCLUDE A NEW POSITION OF PRINCIPAL TRANSPORTATION ENGINEER

CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR

H.15. APPROVE CONSTRUCTION CHANGE ORDER NO. 1 FOR THE BICYCLE TRANSPORTATION PLAN IMPLEMENTATION PROJECT, JOB NO. 40510, TO SLURRY SEAL SEGMENTS OF BERYL STREET AND CATALINA AVENUE USING AVAILABLE FUNDING IN THE CITYWIDE SLURRY SEAL PROJECT, JOB NO. 41140, BUDGET WHILE RETAINING THE CITY ENGINEER'S AUTHORIZATION LIMIT FOR FUTURE CHANGE ORDERS OF 10% OF THE ORIGINAL CONTRACT AMOUNT

CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR

H.16. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH HF&H CONSULTANTS, LLC FOR SOLID WASTE CONSULTING SERVICES RELATED TO A PROPOSED SECOND AMENDMENT TO THE CITY'S SOLID WASTE HANDLING SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH ARAKELIAN ENTERPRISES, INC., DBA ATHENS SERVICES, FOR AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$40,000

CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR

H.17. APPROVE THE PURCHASE OF LAPTOP AND RUGGEDIZED TABLET COMPUTERS FROM DELL MARKETING L.P. FOR AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$75,448

CONTACT: MIKE COOK, INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY DIRECTOR

H.18. APPROVE AN AMENDMENT TO THE AGREEMENT WITH MELAD AND ASSOCIATES, INC. FOR BUILDING PLAN CHECK REVIEW AND PERMIT TECH SERVICES TO INCREASE THE AMOUNT BY \$104,000 FOR A NEW CONTRACT NOT TO EXCEED TOTAL OF \$161,000

CONTACT: MARC WIENER COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

H.19. RECEIVE AND FILE THE REDONDO BEACH POLICE DEPARTMENT ANNUAL MILITARY EQUIPMENT REPORT, IN COMPLIANCE WITH TITLE 3, CHAPTER 16 OF THE REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE AND ASSEMBLY BILL 481

CONTACT: JOE HOFFMAN, CHIEF OF POLICE

H.20. This Item was pulled from Consent for separate discussion by Councilmember Nehrenheim.

H.21. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2409-075, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA AMENDING THE PART-TIME EMPLOYMENT POLICY AND PAY PLAN FOR PART-TIME EMPLOYEES

CONTACT: DIANE STRICKFADEN, DIRECTOR OF HUMAN RESOURCES

H.22. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2409-076, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, AMENDING THE OFFICIAL BOOK OF CLASS SPECIFICATIONS TO ADD THE POSITION OF LIBRARY MANAGER

CONTACT: DANA VINKE, LIBRARY DIRECTOR

H.23. This Item was pulled from Consent for separate discussion by Councilmember Loewenstein.

H.24. This Item was pulled from Consent for separate discussion by Councilmember Nehrenheim.

Councilmember Nehrenheim pulled Items No. H.20 and H.24 from the Consent Calendar for separate consideration.

Councilmember Loewenstein pulled Item No. H.23 from the Consent Calendar for separate consideration.

Councilmember Obagi pulled Item No. H.6 from the Consent Calendar for separate consideration.

Councilmember Behrendt pulled Item No. H.7 from the Consent Calendar for separate consideration.

There were no public comments on the Consent Calendar.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to approve the Consent Calendar except Items No. H.6, H.7,

H.20, H.23 and H.24.

Motion carried, 5-0.

City Clerk Manzano read title to Resolutions No. CC-2409-070, CC-2409-071, CC-2409-072, CC-2409-073, CC-2409-077, CC-2409-074, CC-2409-075 and CC-2409-076.

I. EXCLUDED CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS

H.6 APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH ARTIST ANDREW C. JENKINS FOR INSTALLATION OF THE PUBLIC ARTWORK "SKATE WAVES" TO BE LOCATED AT THE WATERFRONT SKATE PARK AT 500 FISHERMAN'S WHARF IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$47,986 FOR THE TERM SEPTEMBER 3, 2024 TO MARCH 31, 2025

CONTACT: ELIZABETH HAUSE, INTERIM COMMUNITY SERVICES DIRECTOR

Councilmember Obagi mentioned this is a monumental achievement; noted it has been one of his priorities to bring more art to the City and shared a slide illustrating the project that will be placed at the Pier skate park area.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Andy Porkchop, Torrance, spoke about his love of murals and his support of the project and suggested saving money by letting people spray paint it for free.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Discussion followed regarding the timeline for completion.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and carried by voice vote, to approve Item No. H.6.

The motion carried 5-0.

H.7. APPROVE A ONE YEAR AGREEMENT WITH MNS ENGINEERS, INC. FOR COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT CONSULTING SERVICES IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$60,802 USING HUD ENTITLEMENT FUNDS FOR THE TERM SEPTEMBER 4, 2024 TO SEPTEMBER 3, 2025

CONTACT: ELIZABETH HAUSE, INTERIM COMMUNITY SERVICES DIRECTOR

Councilmember Behrendt stated he will abstain from voting on this item.

There were no public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and carried by voice vote, to approve Item No. H.7.

The motion carried 4-0-1. Councilmember Behrendt abstained.

H.20. INTRODUCE BY TITLE ONLY ORDINANCE NO. 3276-24, AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, AMENDING SECTION 2-3.904 OF ARTICLE 9, TITLE 2 OF THE REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE, UPDATING THE SALARY AND BENEFITS OF THE CITY ATTORNEY FOR INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING

CONTACT: DIANE STRICKFADEN, DIRECTOR OF HUMAN RESOURCES

Councilmember Nehrenheim opined this is an opportunity to reset the pay for the City Attorney position; reported voters will elect the person who they feel is qualified to be City Attorney; felt Redondo Beach should follow San Diego's example and set the pay equal to that of a California Superior Court Judge; commented that it takes the politics out of it and makes it even and consistent with other cities; addressed costs per thousand residents.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, to approve the base pay at \$238,000 per year and a 3% subsequent increase per year, thereafter, in line with the City of San Diego.

The motion died for lack of a second.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Rolf Strutzenberg mentioned Council needs to ask itself whether it is condoning or rewarding any illegal or criminal activity of the elected City Attorney; reported the City Charter is clear in terms of the duties and responsibilities of the elected City Attorney; noted any activity outside of those is a violation of the Charter and a criminal act and that another violation of the Charter occurs when the duties are not done by the City Attorney. He asserted the City Attorney is not immune from the City Charter and is bound by it and felt that Council should look at it before proceeding.

Leslie Campeggi suggested taking another approach such as using a salary that is more commensurate with like cities but implementing a bonus plan; talked about the position being an elected one but felt there is not enough transparency in terms of what the City Attorney's does, as much of it is confidential; discussed the great things being done in terms of homelessness and recommended applying a bonus. She added that this is an opportunity for Council to look at performance-based compensation.

Andy Porkchop, Torrance, commented favorably about having the City Attorney position

as elected; spoke about growing CalPERS obligations and urged Council to think about growing pension costs when raising salaries.

City Clerk Manzano reported receiving three eComments, two opposed and one neutral.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, Item No. H.20, Introducing by title only Ordinance No. 3276-24, an ordinance of the City Council of the City of Redondo Beach, California, amending Section 2-3.904 of Article 9, Title 2 of the Redondo Beach Municipal Code, updating the salary and benefits of the City Attorney for introduction and first reading.

The motion carried 4-1. Councilmember Nehrenheim was opposed.

Councilmember Nehrenheim referenced an email he received about a salary survey from a resident; explained this matter now has to be set by ordinance.

City Clerk Manzano read title to Ordinance No. 3276-24.

H.23. AUTHORIZE THE MAYOR TO SIGN A LETTER IN OPPOSITION TO SENATE BILL 450, WHICH WOULD LIMIT THE ABILITY OF LOCAL GOVERNMENTS TO APPLY OBJECTIVE STANDARDS TO PROPOSED SENATE BILL 9 PROJECTS

CONTACT: LUKE SMUDE, ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER

Councilmember Loewenstein corrected a typographical error in the letter.

Mayor Light stated that in his discussions with Senator Ben Allen and his Staff, this has already been approved and the only person that would have an impact is Governor Newsom.

Councilmember Loewenstein felt it should go to Senator Atkins as she should know how dangerous it is.

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, to address the letter to Governor Newsom, cc Senator Toni Atkins and correct the typographical error.

Councilmember Behrendt agreed with the proposed changes and offered an amendment that, in the future, Council consider moving its position on these bills from oppose to support if amended to be consistent with ensuring cities do their fair share with respect to housing. Specifically, the amendment would be that this bill, SB 450 and others like it, should apply to cities that have a residential population density of less than 10,000 people per square mile, cities that are the most in need of and capable of providing increased housing. He added that doing so may bring a different

perspective, allowing the City to get “a seat at the table” and focus on that singular issue.

Mayor Light agreed that it adds an incentive to get over the threshold so that it does not apply.

Amended motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, to address the letter to Governor Newsom, cc Senator Toni Atkins, correct the typographical error and that in the future, Council consider moving its position on these bills from oppose to support if amended, to be consistent with ensuring cities do their fair share with respect to housing and specifically, the amendment would be that this bill, SB 450 and others like it, should apply to cities that have a residential population density of less than 10,000 people per square mile, cities that are the most in need of and capable of providing increased housing.

Councilmember Nehrenheim suggested omitting “oppose” and stating that the City would be “open to supporting it, if it were amended to include the following items”.

Discussion followed regarding the bill already passing the floor.

Councilmember Kaluderovic felt the City “missed the boat” on this and agreed with sending a message that the City would be open to this, in the future, but with certain conditions.

Councilmember Nehrenheim spoke about SB 450 and how it was suspended for several years and was just pushed through last week; mentioned how this negatively impacts them.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Holly Osborne, District 5, thanked the City and the City Attorney for their efforts on successfully fighting SB 9 to not apply to Charter cities; talked about SB 40 being a last-minute, sneaky bill to nullify the victory; reported sending a letter asking Assemblymember Muratsuchi to oppose it (which he did) and to Senator Allen to oppose it (which he did not) and discussed the importance of the work of Our Neighborhood Voices.

Andy Porkchop, Torrance, suggested, when Council deliberates, that it displays the appropriate slide; spoke about a Torrance councilmember and discussed the need for more housing.

There were no other public comments on this item.

The amended motion carried 5-0.

H.24. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY ORDINANCE NO. 3275-24, AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, REPEAL TITLE 2, CHAPTER 2, ARTICLE 2, SECTION 2-2.202 (NOTICES OF RUNOFF ELECTIONS) AND ADDING ARTICLE 4 TO MUNICIPAL CODE TITLE 2, CHAPTER 2, TO PROVIDE FOR INSTANT RUNOFF VOTING RELATED TO RANKED CHOICE VOTING. FOR SECOND READING AND ADOPTION.

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

Councilmember Nehrenheim displayed Slide 1A and wondered if an unofficial election night report is mandated.

City Clerk Manzano clarified that, on election night, she would run a report on the ballots received and count the first ranking/round.

Councilmember Nehrenheim quoted from a Voluntary Voting Systems Guide regarding the Congressional Act Help America Vote Act of 2002; expressed concerns about variances in jurisdiction of rules and the need to have all the ballots in at once in order to count them; asserted he would rather have one count when all the ballots are ready to go.

City Clerk Manzano reiterated, that on election day, her office would count the first ranking only and no one is eliminated; reported that approximately two weeks later, when all ballots are added they run it through the machine; noted the system knows which ballots were counted on election day and which were received for the final tabulation. The instant runoff data is provided at that time and reports are generated.

Councilmember Nehrenheim spoke about the point of the audit and City Clerk Manzano explained there are two precincts per district; reported on the final day, there will be two boxes of ballots from election day and two from the final day, subsequently staff does its rank by choosing a box and then do their 1% (usually more than 1%) for the audit. She added that hand-counted ballots are compared to the reports.

In response to Mayor Light's question, City Clerk Manzano confirmed that her office reviews all of the rounds manually, but for only one box based on each district that has a contest and does the tally for each race. She added that it is a process that will take longer to complete than previously and confirmed that ballots are kept in the vault.

Councilmember Nehrenheim questioned the need for a preliminary run and felt that it does not provide any useful information.

City Clerk Manzano added it depends on the amount of ballots received.

Councilmember Nehrenheim advocated for doing one run after all the ballots are received and suggested changing the ordinance accordingly.

City Attorney Webb reported that since it is a substantive change, it will delay adoption of the ordinance and Council will have to reintroduce it tonight and adopt it at a subsequent meeting. He explained the likelihood of increased confusion and concerns about residents getting no information on election night; claimed that language referenced by Councilmember Nehrenheim does not conflict existing practice, it only specifies the rounds have to be tabulated when all of the ballots have been received. He reported the definition he added was designed to make it clear that initial election night round of counting was unofficial and not a required report; stated it would be up to the election official to release the unofficial election night count.

Councilmember Nehrenheim suggested leaving it in but noted he does not feel comfortable issuing a report on election night.

Councilmember Behrendt mentioned he discussed a non-substantive scrivener's matter with the City Clerk in regards to Section 2-2.46 and suggested ensuring that defined terms are capitalized.

City Attorney Webb noted it would be up to Council; mentioned he liked Councilmember Behrendt's way better; reported he varied from other ordinances in listing the definitions alphabetically.

Councilmember Behrendt talked about skipped rankings; stated that if Council wants to revisit it, there is a way to determine the intention of the voter who does not put a name in the first round but does in the second round by including in language such as, that in the event a ranking is skipped, the vote will be given to the next ranked candidate.

Councilmember Obagi observed the proposal is a vast departure from what Councilmember Behrendt advocated previously and wondered what changed his mind.

Councilmember Behrendt recalled there was concern regarding not knowing a voter's intent and reiterated his proposal for correcting that by providing the language in the instructions.

Councilmember Obagi interjected that assumes voters read the instructions; expressed concerns over voters not understanding how their choice will be ranked. He noted that no other city does it that way; reported that Ranked Choice Voting (RCV) folks are concerned this election will "blow up in the City's face" if there are more than two candidates or if something goes wrong and ballots are disqualified for skipped rankings; stated he went over the rules at a recent community meeting and felt people seemed to understand "no skipped rankings" and starting at one; noted

this is an experimental program and does not feel strongly either way.

Councilmember Loewenstein reported he was also concerned; read that up to 3% of ballots can have skipped votes; talked about a ballot having continuous skips and questioned the intention; noted he can see both sides but reiterated his concern that the City may be throwing out a lot of votes and could potentially expose the City to challenges.

Discussion followed regarding overvotes and Councilmember Loewenstein mentioned having had this discussion at length, “ad nauseum” being the best way to put it.

In response to Councilmember Obagi’s hypothetical case when a voter skips every other ranking, City Clerk Manzano reported that the software will either skip or not skip and it would look for the next ranking and consider it the second ranking.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Tony Hale reported the concerns RCV organizations nationwide have, is that throwing out votes is very different than throwing out a vote if you cannot determine the will of the voter; stated if a voter double votes, the will of the voter cannot be determined; if a clear choice is marked, that vote should be honored and not discarded; mentioned the software has options for handling skipped votes.

Regarding the software’s capabilities, Mayor Light noted that the technicians previously misled Council in terms of tie votes.

Tony Hale reported RCV organizations have looked at this, specifically because of the decisions of Redondo Beach, and have serious concerns about it and have raised the level of concern about this issue with all their organizations to make sure that other municipalities do not do this. Additionally, he talked about opening the City to increased litigation where voters could win based on the standards put forward by the Secretary of State; mentioned the bigger loss is lost credibility with the voters; clarified that the 1% check is done against the final count and not the election night count.

Councilmember Loewenstein presumed that 3% of the ballots would be thrown out and wondered if that would impact other races.

City Clerk Manzano explained it would be just for those contests that are RCV.

Councilmember Loewenstein talked about needing to clearly distinguish between “ballot” and “contest” in the ordinance as currently it seems that the entire ballot is thrown out.

Discussion followed regarding having the rules in place prior to the March election.

City Attorney Webb reported the City Clerk had indicated she wanted the ordinance done by August 20th so that she would have time before the opening of the nominations period.

City Clerk Manzano reaffirmed her need for an ordinance declaring the City will move ahead with RCV so she can move ahead with vendors and establishing systems.

In reply to Councilmember Obagi's request, City Attorney Webb detailed and reviewed the changes made to the ordinance as requested by Council at its last meeting.

Councilmember Obagi indicated he would not mind leaving the instructions as they currently are as they would guide the voter to vote as clearly as possible.

City Attorney Webb mentioned that Council could give direction to reinstate the version with 2-2.406 and 2-2.407 and decide whether or not Council wants to return to the tiebreaking system used in one other city that seems fairer than drawing a lot.

Councilmember Behrendt suggested language that, "In the event that you do skip a ranking, your vote will be given to your next ranked continuing candidate".

Councilmember Nehrenheim commented on going down the path of interpretation.

Councilmember Obagi noted the City has the "comforting guide rail" of the Secretary of State and the election code.

Councilmember Behrendt displayed Slide 3B showing proposed changes to 2-2.403.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, to go back to what was initially proposed, subject to adding the red line proposed by Councilmember Behrendt, to the initial instructions.

Regarding overvotes, City Attorney Webb stated the idea behind it is there is no way to decide which candidate a voter prefers; distinguished between overvotes and skipped votes; reported this is the norm for cities that have adopted RCV; noted this was at the recommendation of the Charter Review Advisory Committee (CRAC); added that the more deviation Council makes, the more unintentional error may be inserted into the process; pointed out that Council can see how it goes since it is an ordinance and make additional changes as it deems necessary.

Amended motion by Councilmember Obagi, to go back to what was initially proposed, subject to adding the red line proposed by Councilmember Behrendt, to the initial instruction and add the sentence regarding, "In the event of a skipped ranking, the vote will be given to the next ranked candidate", capitalize each defined term, both where they are defined and where they are used further in the ordinance

and correct the extra space in 2-2.407 and insert, “ballot” after “exhausted”.

Discussion followed regarding challenges in trying to determine a voter’s intent.

Councilmember Nehrenheim expressed concerns that by making the proposed changes, Council may very well be changing other things in the ordinance that Council is not looking at; suggested keeping the ordinance the way it is and make appropriate changes afterwards.

City Attorney Webb stated the motion goes back to the norm and what other agencies are doing; talked about overvotes and undervotes per election contest.

Councilmember Loewenstein agreed with moving ahead.

Councilmember Obagi displayed Slide 3B and suggested changing “ballot”, under 2-2.401, to “contests”; mentioned providing direction to the City Attorney to work with the City Clerk.

City Attorney Webb interjected that this is Council’s ordinance and Council has had multiple definitions.

Councilmember Obagi pointed out that Council has had two meetings to discuss this ordinance.

City Attorney Webb stated Council has had two-years’ warning; talked about the research that has been done prior to putting this on the ballot, and mentioned it is hard to produce a collective that all Councilmembers want.

Councilmember Obagi stated Councilmember Behrendt suggested to leave it as is.

Councilmember Behrendt seconded the motion.

David Engle, District 5, spoke in opposition of the ordinance; felt these changes will result in fewer people voting; suggested testing the system before implementing it.

Holly Osborne suggested testing it using 100 people from the Senior Center, 100 of the nerdiest students from Redondo Union High School over 18, 100 people from football and sports teams to see if they can follow directions.

Wayne Craig expressed concerns regarding the statement that, “The City is doing the best it can with an experimental program” and mentioned that if the City cannot clearly articulate what it is doing, it is not ready to be implemented.

Andy Porkchop, Torrance, urged Council to listen to the City’s elected lawyer; talked about good existing laws regarding elections; opined this is a waste of money and an attempt to “rig” election rules.

Tom Charron (via Zoom), California RCV Coalition, claimed that RCV is not an experimental system; reported there are over 50 cities in the nation using RCV; acknowledged that it is relatively new and voters need to be educated; expressed concerns that the skipped ranking decision made at the last meeting will disenfranchise voters; noted all other cities using RCV specify that when a ranking is skipped, the vote advances to the next ranked continuing candidate and asserted it is also recommended by the Secretary of State Guidelines and is the best policy for honoring the intent of the voter and ensuring that no voter is disenfranchised.

Marcella Miranda-Caballero (via Zoom), California RCV Coalition, spoke about skipped ranking; expressed concerns with voters being disenfranchised if the City proceeds with its present position regarding skipped rankings; noted that even Charter cities cannot toss out ballots in which the intent of the voter is clearly displayed.

Steven Hill (via Zoom) noted RCV is not experimental and that it is being used all over the world; felt that what is experimental is Council changing some of the rules that have been used before it; talked about undervotes and overvotes not being able to show the intent of the voter and being able to do so with skipped ranking with reasonable assumptions. He added that an exhausted ballot means there are no more continuing candidates; noted that skipped ranking is the only one whereby the intent of the voter can be determined and State law states that the vote must be counted.

Steve Chessin (via Zoom), President, Californians for Electoral Reform, mentioned Council's original policy language, regarding skipped ranking would be in violation of California State Law; quoted sections of the Election Code regarding determining the intent of the voter and hoped Council will approve the amendments that ballots will not be invalidated when there are skipped rankings.

Nancy Skiba (via Zoom), District 4, opined this is a terrible idea; felt it will result in increased confusions and less people voting; talked about it being shameful that the information was not provided to voters before the election.

Leslie Campeggi talked about people who do not reside in the City choosing to comment and provide disinformation; referenced a speaker who claimed this is a proven voting method yet only 50 cities out of 109,000 cities in the U.S. have chosen RCV; felt that Council advocated for a system it thought it was getting at the time; that it was not as complicated, convoluted or with so many different methods that can be chosen to take action on this type of voting. She opined the City is not yet ready for prime time on this issue; suggested taking the time to do a test pilot with different demographics and socioeconomic areas within the City to find out if people can understand the instructions.

Austin Carmichael, District 5, agreed with the previous speaker in terms of the

statistics; expressed concerns that RCV proponents are not addressing implementation; stated he is not a fan, especially as this issue is not yet being articulated clearly.

Clarissa Robinson (via Zoom), District 3, expressed concerns that RCV may create confusion for residents; noted it is a significant change and many voters may not feel comfortable with it right away; suggested implementing a test pilot prior to full implementation to identify any challenges; stated with the City's historically low voter turnout it is crucial that confidence is built in this new process; urged Council to listen to residents and not to over paid advocates during this transition and engage with the community.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Mayor Light noted this was put on the ballot and residents of Redondo Beach voted on it; stated that tonight what Council is wrestling with is implementation and approval of a method of RCV; spoke about the number of people outside of the City and paid consultants demeaning Council for their decision; disagreed that a skipped ranking can be interpreted but not an overvote in certain circumstances; noted it is a logical fallacy and an insult to the integrity and the intellect of Council.

City Attorney Webb offered to work with the City Clerk on language changing the definition for exhausted ballots, overvotes and skipped or undervote rankings to make it clear it is for a given election contest.

Councilmembers Obagi and Behrendt agreed to the suggested addition.

Amended motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Behrendt, and approved by voice vote, to go back to what was initially proposed, subject to adding the red line proposed by Councilmember Behrendt, to the initial instruction and add the sentence regarding, "In the event of a skipped ranking, the vote will be given to the next ranked candidate", capitalize each defined term, both where they are defined and where they are used further in the ordinance, and correct the extra space in 2-2.407 and insert, "ballot" after "exhausted" and direct the City Attorney to work with the City Clerk on language changing the definition for exhausted ballots, overvotes and skipped or undervote rankings, to make it clear it is for a given election contest.

The amended motion carried 5-0.

City Clerk Manzano read title to Ordinance No. 3275-24. She added that the ordinance will return to City Council, for second reading and adoption, September 17, 2024, as City Council made substantive changes.

J. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

J.1 For eComments and Emails Received from the Public

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Niki Negrete-Mitchell, District 3, thanked RBPD for their vacation patrol; opined there should be a limit on the number of topics one public member can speak on during a meeting; spoke about the number of seniors living on the ROW; gave examples on the negative impacts to their health from continuous construction; opined their quality of life is negatively impacted from noise and construction on the ROW; stated the importance of addressing the urgency of this issue in more depth.

Mark Stratton, District 1, voiced his concerns regarding crimes located at Moonstone Park; mentioned recent incidents where eBikes were stolen from the high school and ended up at Moonstone; reported being assured to having vetting and monitoring on site and that it has failed miserably. He requested the City Attorney comment on what is being done to prevent it; suggested registering serial numbers and identifying them accordingly; wondered what the City will do to protect the neighborhood around Moonstone Park.

Holly Osborne, District 5, said Council hastily amended an opposition letter without thinking about the consequences and without notifying the public in advance; asserted that cities have the right to do their own zoning regardless of density; referenced SB 450; discussed density being misleading at times and opposed including density in the SB 450 opposition letter. She urged Council not to make any more last-minute changes.

Andy Porkchop, Torrance, talked about having the freedom to attend public meetings and speak; mentioned Torrance has already reduced the allowed time to speak to one minute; stated that Redondo Beach can send all the homeless to Torrance because the City of Torrance has said they will take care of them and Mr. Porkchop says that is the message he is bringing to Council tonight; claimed people are upset because he speaks at Council meetings.

Saul Williams, via Zoom, felt Council should not let mentally challenged people comment; mentioned Andros Turda is Andy Porkchop's real name; alleged he enjoys committing disorderly conduct and filming children during PE and urged Council to stop encouraging him.

Maxina Franzoni, Inglewood, reported her car was towed and asked for help from RBPD to release her vehicle and explained she has fallen on hard times.

RBPD Chief Hoffman advised her to speak with Sergeant Martin, who was present in the meeting, to provide advice and guidance.

There were no other public comments and Mayor Light closed this portion of the

meeting.

K. EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS - None

L. PUBLIC HEARINGS - None

M. ITEMS CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS AGENDAS – None

N. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION PRIOR TO ACTION

N.1. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE CITY'S ENFORCEMENT OF PARKING RESTRICTIONS DURING STREET SWEEPING HOURS INTRODUCED BY TITLE ONLY ORDINANCE NO. 3277-24 AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, AMENDING TITLE 3, CHAPTER 7, SECTION 3-7.1308 OF THE REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE PERTAINING TO PARKING RESTRICTIONS DURING VARIOUS HOURS FOR STREET SWEEPING, FOR INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING

CONTACT: JOE HOFFMAN, CHIEF OF POLICE

RBPD Chief Hoffman introduced Captain Martinez from the Special Operations Bureau, representatives of Public Works, various city Staff and Athens Street Sweeping Services in order to present a PowerPoint regarding street sweeping and enforcement of parking restrictions during street sweeping; gave some background on the topic; explained Athens is currently contracted to do the street sweeping; displayed the street sweeping schedule and map; highlighted the RBMC 3-7.1308, which is the code that they will be providing the amendment for consideration tonight; stated the amount of citations they have issued year to date.

Discussion followed regarding spikes in the number of citations in July 2024, consistent citation data year over year, increases in complaints, enforcement challenges and observations from a recent ride-along; spoke about time gaps because the sweeper does not need to stop but the enforcement will need to in order to write the citations; stated that they are as efficient as possible with the technology given; spoke about a pilot program they are hoping to roll out soon; continued with the presentation including details of the proposed ordinance amendment

Councilmember Nehrenheim talked about developing a heat map and having two Enforcement Officers giving out citations.

RBPD Chief Hoffman reported that the City has only so many MSOs and commented that they also double up in animal control; stated the complaints come from specific areas but violations are City-wide.

Discussion followed regarding the status of the two part-time MSO positions funded by

Council.

RBPD Chief Hoffman reported those positions have not been filled yet.

Councilmember Loewenstein spoke about the possibility of part-time MSOs patrolling the pier on weekends and street sweeping during the week.

RBPD Chief Hoffman stated that suggestion will not increase enforcement and may slightly accelerate the time frame when the sweeper and enforcement vehicle pass but will mean added costs to the City; added that existing MSOs handling street sweeping are full-time positions; asserted that the Department is spread thin.

Councilmember Nehrenheim asked about the ability to reverse course and starting at the back end, working forwards.

RBPD stated that would be a question for Public Works or Athens; reported routes are set by Public Works and Athens. The Police Department keeps its commitment to follow the sweeper and issue citations as needed.

Andrea Delap, Administrative Analyst, stated if the route is reversed, the sweeper would be going against traffic.

Public Works Director Winje reported that the routes are set up to be continuous; added that it may be possible to start at the middle and go around but he would need to explore that more; reported receiving many complaints about the street sweepers going too fast.

Councilmember Nehrenheim suggested varying the hours for those at the beginning of the route while maintaining the three-hour window.

Analyst Delap reported that Public Works and Athens have tested the times and that it takes a given amount of time to cover the route; noted the need to give drivers a buffer for contingencies and stated it is difficult to determine the exact time of service. She explained there are two drivers who have to learn a detailed matrix of routes and changing the routes would be challenging.

Discussion followed regarding citing vehicles that are impeding the sweeper and opportunities for improving communication between sweepers and enforcement officers.

Councilmember Nehrenheim asserted that neighborhoods with larger densities will have more issues than single family neighborhoods; stated he looked forward to increased technology.

Councilmember Obagi thanked RBPD for addressing residents' street sweeping concerns; shared Slide 3B showing the results of an informal poll regarding street sweeping in District 4; talked about increased demands for street sweeping enforcement and complaints about the speed of street sweeping vehicles; urged staff to keep up the

good work.

Councilmember Kaluderovic commended RBPD for being responsive to residents' needs.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

David Engle, District 5, talked about the need to identify a problem before taking care of it; addressed the efficiency of street sweepers but noted they get bogged down near apartments.

Peggy Cochran, South Redondo, stated she has always enjoyed the courtesy the City has extended in allowing residents to park after street sweepers have driven by; noted that if she moves her car, it will usually take 8 hours before she can park on her street again; suggested the City consider issuing parking passes for residents of an area; stated there are no spaces for her to park.

Wayne Craig, District 1, talked about following parking signs; felt it is not a hard thing to figure out and that the City seems to be creating a solution for a problem that does not exist; discussed a problem with drainage on his street; suggested the City is creating a new "Ranked Choice Parking" system and wondered if it is worth the time.

Andy Porkchop, Torrance, stated he is here to help; commented on the importance of clean streets; reported that in Torrance street sweepers have radios.

City Clerk Manzano reported receiving one eComment in support of this item.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Behrendt, and carried by voice vote, to introduce by title only, Ordinance No. 3277-24, as amended in the Blue Folder, and receive and file the report.

Mayor Light thanked Council and RBPD for responding quickly to the public.

The motion carried 5-0.

City Clerk Manzano read title to Ordinance No. 3277-24.

O. CITY MANAGER ITEMS

City Manager Witzansky discussed the paving project at the International Boardwalk and announced the upcoming Strategic Planning Session next Tuesday at 3:00 p.m. in the Main Library meeting room.

Mayor Light moved to Item No. P.3.

P. MAYOR AND COUNCIL ITEMS

P.1. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING A CHARTER AMENDMENT PERTAINING TO THE DUTIES OF THE CITY TREASURER AND DIRECTION TO STAFF TO PREPARE A BALLOT MEASURE FOR THE MARCH 4, 2025 ELECTION REFLECTING THE PROPOSED AMENDMENT

City Treasurer Solomon shared a PowerPoint presentation with a recap of the item; reviewed edits to the Charter language and listed Council actions requested.

Councilmember Loewenstein voiced support for the amendment; spoke about qualifications and suggested adding the requirement for a Bachelor's or Master's degree; questioned whether CFA or CFP should be a requirement and felt 4 or more years of experience could substitute for a degree.

Councilmember Nehrenheim agreed with getting the City into compliance with current practices and fixing the Charter; expressed concerns with the requirements suggested by the Charter Review Advisory Committee (CRAC); felt it is up to voters to decide the qualifications, as over time, they may need to solve a specific problem; stated he does not believe the City should be changing or adding any requirements. Additionally, he noted there are no requirements to become a Councilmember; talked about guardrails provided by the State for the investment policies and reiterated it is up to the voters to decide the City Treasurer's qualifications.

Councilmember Kaluderovic agreed with the proposed changes to the Charter amendments; mentioned making the language clearer about the qualifications being one "or" two and stating "Charter Financial Analyst (CFA)", not "Advisor" as the title.

Councilmember Behrendt agreed with Councilmember Nehrenheim in terms of letting the voters decide each candidate's qualifications; noted it is good to have degrees and experience but that, at the end of the day, it comes down to judgement. Additionally, he spoke about the Deputy City Treasurer who has layers of requirements to ensure things are done right; mentioned the City Treasurer may not have the ability to hire and fire that person.

Councilmember Loewenstein commented that an accounting background is one of the requirements for City Clerk but questioned how much accounting that position requires; noted there are several requirements for the Harbor Commission; discussed the need to deal with large investments and felt it is necessary to ensure candidates are people with an accounting background or have experience in governmental accounting and financial markets.

Mayor Light reported City Treasurer Solomon is doing a great job and noted he doesn't have a degree; suggested Council should not pick qualifications that would prohibit the

right people to fill those positions.

Councilmember Behrendt asked City Attorney Webb to comment on the matter and City Attorney Webb talked about the CRAC's discussions and about the City Treasurer providing more of a true check-and-balance and cautioned about removing them. He suggested that Council take some time to get the thoughts of the City Treasurer; talked about concerns with the Moss Adams approach and urged Council to review which words it would like to maintain to ensure that the City Treasurer has the authority to serve as a true check-and-balance. He discussed changing "collection" to "audit" relative to taxes and license fees; noted this is bringing past actions of past Councils in line with the Charter language and explained ways of doing that; addressed including some type of timing in the Charter, noting that future City Treasurers may have difficulty meeting the required timing; felt that if something needs to be done, Council should include it in the Charter.

City Treasurer Solomon pointed out that Council needs to be careful adding services to the City Treasurer's office since the position primarily operates as a part-time role and can hold a job outside of the office; voiced other concerns that the Council should consider before adding additional features to that office; discussed staffing concerns when adding features; addressed the Deputy City Treasurer's job description and responsibilities and reported the City Treasurer is able to appoint additional Deputies but Council controls the purse strings and that is where there could be conflict.

Councilmember Behrendt agreed with changing "review, monitor and examine" to "audit" and establishing a frequency for the audit.

City Treasurer Solomon interjected that establishing a frequency for the audit would be more appropriate for Item (f), because of the taxes and fees being a major revenue source for the City.

Councilmember Obagi questioned whether to prescribe the frequency in the Charter; felt it could be addressed by ordinance or left up to the City Treasurer as he/she is elected; added that if he/she is not doing the job, there could include some accountability.

City Attorney Webb explained it would be difficult to do it by ordinance.

Councilmember Obagi shared Slide 3B; talked about considering disbursements for Item (c); suggested equal auditing power relative to disbursements that are made to the extent Council wants a check over the Finance Department.

City Treasurer Solomon deferred oversight to the City Clerk with regard to warrants that are paid and City Clerk Manzano agreed. City Treasurer Solomon confirmed there is an audit feature (check-and-balance) with regards to disbursements and reported the City Treasurer's Office is involved more in revenues than disbursements.

Discussion followed regarding the City Clerk's and City Treasurer's roles.

City Attorney Webb suggested having the City Treasurer and City Clerk discuss the matter together since the discussion has moved into monitoring and he believes they need to define that in terms of what oversight falls within which office to compare and contrast and determine any changes in language.

In reply to Councilmember Obagi's question, Councilmember Loewenstein agreed to include "or Doctoral" degree to the qualifications, delete the various certification designations and other edits as displayed in Slide 3B.

Discussion followed regarding required qualifications for the City Treasurer's position; determining if having experience in investment policies, governmental accounting and financial markets is necessary; wondered whether City Treasurer Solomon would qualify given those requirements and avoiding leaving things up to interpretation.

City Treasurer Solomon reported it was the recommendation of the CRAC that the two amendments (the redline to the existing Charter amendment and the consideration of adding qualifications) be two separate Charter amendments and will be two separate decisions for the voters; stated that if Council elects to change the redline for the duties there will be some action directed so that those duties are delegated formally to either the Financial Services Department, the City Manager's Office or elsewhere.

City Attorney Webb was unsure to agree; stated the City Manager, as the Chief Executive Officer, would have those responsibilities if they are not otherwise assigned.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to receive and file the report, direct Staff to return in November with a proposed Charter amendment for the duties to the redline 11.1 and a separate discussion to have the qualifications aligned with qualifications for the City Clerk's position.

Councilmember Kaluderovic suggested a friendly amendment to include "no later than November 5th" and Councilmembers Nehrenheim Loewenstein accepted the friendly amendment.

Amended motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to receive and file the report, direct Staff to return, no later than November 5th, with a proposed Charter amendment for the duties to the redline 11.1 and a separate discussion to have the qualifications aligned with qualifications for the City Clerk's position.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Rolf Strutzenberg mentioned that, as a Charter change, the proposed is massive and opined it guts the authority and the rights of the City Treasurer; noted that the CRAC made it clear that for years the City was in violation of its own Charter; stated he supports that the change needs to happen; asserted this cannot go on the March election; quoted

from Election Code 1415 and stated Council cannot change the rights of this position on a March election. He claimed that Council cannot put this on a March election otherwise it is subjecting the City to legal action.

Andy Porkchop, Torrance, talked about the importance of the City Treasurer; spoke against reducing his duties and about qualifications and the importance of checks and balances.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Councilmember Nehrenheim agreed with Rolf Strutzenberg; noted the need to have this item come back to Council to address and define the qualifications and duties.

The motion carried 5-0, by voice vote.

P.2. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE DESIGNATION OF THE LA KINGS 5K FUNDRAISING RUN AS A CITY SIGNATURE EVENT AND WHETHER TO PROVIDE A CITY SUBSIDY IN FISCAL YEAR 2024-25

Interim Community Services Director Hause presented details of the Administrative Report.

Councilmember Nehrenheim talked about the decreased number of runs in the City since he has been on Council due to increased costs; discussed trying to get more private security and less Police involvement; discussed The Village Runner events and the Summerfest which had no issues; expressed concerns that this particular event has had issues every year and spoke about Riviera Village business owners being tired of not being heard. He added that he loves community events but wants to ensure that impacts are minimized and the events are held to a high level; asserted that he does not support this being a signature event or giving the Kings a stipend or any kind of free services.

In reply to Mayor Light's questions regarding whether there is a budget for this, City Manager Witzansky reported that it would require a 4/5ths budget modification resolution and would stress the departments that participate.

Councilmember Loewenstein felt the Kings do a phenomenal job in supporting community activities; listed some of their contributions and donations to the community; opined that they should not have a higher subsidy than the Super Bowl 10k, which is \$10,000; mentioned the event is a long-established Redondo tradition; announced he will not be in attendance at the September 17th Council meeting for a 4/5ths vote.

Councilmember Kaluderovic alleged that Councilmember Nehrenheim's issues were with the event itself; suggested they could address each issue one-by-one; noted the Kings have deep roots in the City and that many members live in Redondo Beach; stated they have contributed to many City projects and the community; talked about discussions

with a member about an all-abilities playground; addressed the importance of the relationship and partnership with the City as they have a big reach that benefits Redondo Beach.

Councilmember Loewenstein agreed.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic to recognize the Kings 5K as a signature event with a subsidy of \$7,000 this year.

Councilmember Loewenstein stated he will second the motion, but adding conditions addressing the concerns of Councilmember Nehrenheim.

Discussion followed regarding what the issues are and how to resolve them.

City Manager Witzansky reported that Staff intends to address those conditions as part of the signature event process; noted that Councilmember Nehrenheim provided a complete list of concerns and Staff is tackling them as part of the coordination regardless of Council's decision on this matter.

Mayor Light asked about the criteria for signature events so that Council can be objective for the future; Councilmember Loewenstein stated it is case-by-case and agreed about the importance of maintaining a good relationship.

Councilmember Nehrenheim spoke about emails he receives listing concerns with the event; reported he values the relationship and reiterated the need for setting high standards; listed other worthy events and their subsidies and asserted these are not "issues" but significant problems that keep reoccurring or new problems that occur. Additionally, he spoke about dealing with this issue year-over-year; noted that relationships are two-way streets and discussed the need to ensure that residents and businesses of Riviera Village have a say. He asked that if Council is to approve a subsidy, it waits until after the event to ensure the event space has been cleaned up by 11:00 a.m. and nothing is left behind by 9:00 a.m. the next day.

Mayor Light opined that Councilmember Nehrenheim is asking for a friendly amendment.

Councilmember Nehrenheim felt it should come back to Council to verify that was done.

Councilmember Loewenstein stated he respects the request but wondered about getting a 4/5ths vote in his absence.

Councilmember Nehrenheim responded it would need to be a unanimous vote and affirmed he would request that as a friendly amendment.

City Manager Witzansky reported staff would return with a resolution in October and as long as it is prepared before issuing the invoice, Council could act on it at that time.

Councilmember Kaluderovic asked for clarification of the friendly amendment.

Councilmember Nehrenheim reiterated his request to ensure that the event space has been cleaned up by 11:00 a.m. and nothing is left behind by 9:00 a.m. the next day.

In response to Councilmember Kaluderovic's question, Interim Community Services Director Hause reported their permit calls for the street to be reopened by noon.

Councilmember Nehrenheim talked about prior events and noted that they receive a subsidy even though they did not comply with the permit; agreed to change the request that the event space be cleaned up by noon but that no trace of the event be left behind by 9:00 a.m. the next day.

Councilmember Kaluderovic accepted the amendment as long as it is keeping with what the permit is requiring.

Councilmember Loewenstein did as well.

Amended motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to recognize the Kings 5K as a signature event with a subsidy of \$7,000 this year and ensure that the event space is cleaned up by noon and nothing is left behind by 9:00 a.m. the next day and is in keeping with the requirements of the permit.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Andy Porkchop, Torrance, talked about the L.A. Kings fundraising event; questioned who they are fundraising for; felt if they have money, the City does not need to subsidize them for this event.

There were no other public comments on this item.

In reply to Councilmember Obagi's question regarding the impact on Riviera Village businesses from the event, Councilmember Nehrenheim reported they usually experience a 20% decrease in revenue due to the L.A. Kings 5K event.

The amended motion carried 5-0, by voice vote.

Mayor Light moved to Item No. P.4 as Item P.3 was heard before P.1 per Approval of the Agenda.

P.3. DISCUSSION AND CONSIDERATION OF MAYOR APPOINTMENTS TO VARIOUS BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS

Mayor Light referenced the list of appointments; talked about the assessment and interview process; thanked Council for its input and asked for Council's consideration of his appointments to the various Boards and Commissions.

Councilmember Nehrenheim noted these were hard decisions to make; commended Mayor Light for his efforts and thanked residents who applied and went through the process.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and carried by voice vote, to approve the Mayor's list of appointed Board Members and Commissioners, as presented.

Councilmember Behrendt expressed disappointment that District 5 was completely excluded from the Harbor Commission; spoke about a lack of geographic and district diversity and refusal to appoint a well-qualified candidate from District 5; noted that Stephen Anderson is a very good candidate and expressed his interest. He asked that Mayor Light reconsider and appoint Stephen Anderson to the Harbor Commission.

Councilmember Obagi shared Slide 3B; commented about the Mayor's list of appointments, specifically in terms of the Harbor Commission; opined the Harbor Commission is becoming a commission of the Mayor's friends and is not representative of the City's diversity; spoke about the need to have a representative of District 5 on the Harbor Commission. Additionally, he noted three of the six current Harbor Commissioners are members of the King Harbor Yacht Club; noted if Lee Caller is appointed that will be four and there will be no quorum when the Commission considers the Yacht Club's lease.

Mayor Light interjected that the Harbor Commission does not approve leases.

Councilmember Obagi continued advocating for representation of District 5 on the Harbor Commission; claimed that Stephen Anderson does care whether he serves on the Harbor or the Public Works Commission; talked about the need for Council to ensure inclusive representation in Board and Commissions. He added that he will not support the motion and asked that Council support inclusion of a District 5 resident on the Harbor Commission and will support Lee Caller for the next Harbor Commission position that opens up.

Councilmember Loewenstein stated he has never met Stephen Anderson and the Harbor is in his district; felt that if a person felt strongly about serving on the Harbor Commission, they would talk to the Councilmember who represents the Harbor; spoke positively about Lee Caller but also understood the desire to have someone represent District 5.

Mayor Light reported that before he became Mayor, six Commissions were not represented by all districts; wanted to everyone to know that he is not attempting to stack the Harbor Commission with his "buddies"; noted he reached out to all Councilmembers and thanked them for their input; stated that three Councilmembers recommended Lee Caller and that he does not appreciate this issue being politicized; stated he put lots of effort in trying to balance the commissions.

Councilmember Kaluderovic commented on the process and agreed this was a hard decision to make.

Councilmember Behrendt commented that he heard tonight that Lee Caller is willing to serve on the Public Works and Sustainability Commission.

Mayor Light noted that Councilmembers get to either accept or not accept the Mayor's appointments but does not get to make appointments.

Substitute motion by Councilmember Behrendt to approve the Mayor's Board and Commission appointments with the exception of the at-large appointment to the Harbor Commission.

Councilmember Obagi spoke favorably on Former Mayor Brand appointing people with diverse backgrounds to commission positions; mentioned he placed people on commissions that had no prior experience on certain subject matters to give the boards different perspectives and views on subject matters; hoped the Mayor would reconsider and appoint Stephen Anderson or anybody else from District 5 to the Harbor Commission.

Mayor Light felt Councilmember Obagi mischaracterized Former Mayor Brand's decision process.

Councilmember Obagi seconded the substitute motion.

Councilmember Nehrenheim spoke about being on Council since 2017; reported he has always supported the Mayor's appointments even if he did not agree with all of them; noted that last year there was not a single member from District 1 on the Historical Commission; asserted that the Mayor's choice is not about fighting for a district, but about seeing the overall scope for the City; opined that Council needs to trust the Mayor's judgement and understand it is not about a district, but where the City needs to go in the future. He commended the Mayor's choices and talked about the importance of the overall vision and understanding how to move things forward.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Rolf Strutzenberg opined Councilmembers Obagi and Behrendt have a problem with the ordinance itself; stated the Planning Commission requires one member from each district to be on the commission; described how the Harbor Commission's requirement is different and set up as qualification-based; noted the Harbor Commission should be comprised of people that are knowledgeable and qualified to deal with things that happen in the Harbor; suggested that if Council wants changes it should change the ordinance to include it but not the rules, especially this late in the game.

Lee Coller wanted to clarify he lives in a small strip of District 3 in South Redondo, not North Redondo as previously mentioned in the meeting.

Andy Porkchop, Torrance, talked about Council arguing; opined it is not professional; commented people should be appointed based on qualifications and not nepotism or districts in which they live.

Austin Carmichael, District 5, thanked Council for a window into the discussion; stated he is glad his name made the list; noted that much of the discussion tonight has been heated and suggested that everyone consider how to conduct themselves in front of various commissions especially the Youth Commission; opined the need to be good examples for them; reminded Council that these meetings are on video and can be watched over and over; talked about being appointed by two Mayors, one of whom did not know him and one that is sitting in front of him; noted his appreciation for being allowed to serve.

Mark Hansen (via Zoom), King Harbor boater, recommended the appointment of Lee Caller to the Harbor Commission; understood wanting equal representation of all districts and suggested rounding out the district issue in future appointments.

Nancy Skiba (via Zoom), District 4, hoped that choices will be made based on qualifications and desire; believed the Mayor's choices should be honored and respected.

Leslie Campeggi, Redondo Beach, pointed out that Lee Caller is in attendance and the other person in question is not.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Councilmember Kaluderovic asked the City Attorney whether there is a conflict appointing members of the King Harbor Yacht Club; City Attorney Webb noted he is hesitant in responding but stated he has not had to address the matter in 20 years; confirmed that the Harbor Commission advises but does not act on leases.

Councilmember Behrendt stated that Stephen Anderson is passionate about the Harbor and Waterfront; spoke about his qualifications and agreed with leaving it up to Council.

Councilmember Obagi shared slide 3B regarding Stephen Anderson's application and the Mayor's comments regarding Matt Kilroy's position being open in October; reported Matt Kilroy vacated his seat but his position should have been vacated after 60 days of missing meetings.

The substitute motion failed 2-3, by voice vote. Councilmembers Kaluderovic, Loewenstein and Nehrenheim were opposed.

The original motion carried 3-2, by voice vote. Councilmembers Behrendt and Obagi were opposed.

Mayor Light returned to Item No. P.1.

P.4. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING YOUTH APPOINTMENTS TO THE 2024-25 YOUTH COMMISSION

City Manager Witzansky reported that Community Services interviewed and vetted twelve candidates.

Mayor Light thanked Councilmember Kaluderovic and Staff for working on this item; agreed with the selections; supported the recommendations as written and asked for Council's approval.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, the recommended appointments to the 2024-2025 Youth Commission, as written.

There was no public comment on this item.

The motion carried 5-0, by voice vote.

Q. MAYOR AND COUNCIL REFERRALS TO STAFF

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim to, prior to January 31, 2025 or when ballots go out, for the City of Redondo to have a full-blown test to implement RCV and place a Council discussion on the agenda to review the results of the test.

Councilmember Obagi asked what would happen if the test fails.

Councilmember Nehrenheim stated Council would need to set up guard rails and understand the results.

The motion died for lack of a second.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to agendize a discussion on commission attendance requirements.

Councilmember Nehrenheim suggested a friendly amendment to include a discussion on improving communications to commission members, Staff and Council.

Mayor Light voiced his support.

Councilmember Kaluderovic noted that is already included in the plan.

The motion carried 5-0, by voice vote.

Councilmember Obagi noted the upcoming Strategic Plan Council meeting.

Mayor Light commented on his selections to Commissions noting the number of members who were appointed from each district and stated he tried to be fair.

R. RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION – None

The Closed Session meeting was cancelled.

S. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION – None

The Closed Session meeting was cancelled.

T. ADJOURNMENT – 11:45 p.m.

There being no further business to come before the City Council, motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, to adjourn the meeting at 11:45 p.m. to a Regular meeting to be held at 3:00 p.m. (Strategic Planning Session) on Tuesday, September 10, 2024 in the Redondo Beach Main Library Meeting Room (2nd Floor), 303 N. Pacific Coast Hwy. Redondo Beach, California.

Motion carried, 5-0.

All written comments submitted via eComment are included in the record and available for public review on the City website.

Respectfully submitted:

Eleanor Manzano, CMC
City Clerk