



## **4:30 PM - CLOSED SESSION – ADJOURNED REGULAR MEETING**

### **A. CALL TO ORDER**

An Adjourned Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 4:30 p.m. by Mayor Light in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

### **B. ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Mayor Light

Councilmembers Absent: Obagi

Officials Present: Mike Witzansky, City Manager  
Melissa Villa, Analyst

### **C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG - NONE**

### **D. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS**

Analyst Villa announced there were no Blue Folder Items for Closed Session.

### **E. PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS ON CLOSED SESSION ITEMS AND NON-AGENDA ITEMS**

Analyst Villa reported receiving two eComments for Closed Session Item No. F.6.

### **F. RECESS TO CLOSED – 4:35 p.m.**

Analyst Villa read title to the items to be considered in Closed Session.

City Manager Witzansky announced that the following would be participating in Closed Session: City Manager Mike Witzansky, City Attorney Mike Webb, Assistant City Attorney Cheryl Park, Human Resources Director Diane Strickfaden, Outside Labor Negotiator Laura Kalty and Interim Fire Chief Patrick Butler, Deputy Community Services Director Kelly Orta, Assistant to the City Manager Elizabeth Hause, Deputy City Attorney Aleena Hashmi, Outside Counsel Jon Welner and Abby O'Brient, Carolyn Beliso and Outside Legal Counsel Beverly Palmer.

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote to recess to Closed Session at 4:35 p.m.

Motion carried, 4-0-1. Councilmember Obagi was absent.

**F.1. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL AND LABOR NEGOTIATOR - The Closed Session is authorized by the Government Code Sec. 54957.6.**

**AGENCY NEGOTIATOR:**

**Mike Witzansky, City Manager**

**Diane Strickfaden, Director of Human Resources**

**EMPLOYEE ORGANIZATIONS:**

**Redondo Beach Firefighters Association**

**F.2. CONFERENCE WITH REAL PROPERTY NEGOTIATOR - The Closed Session is authorized by the Government Code Section 54956.8.**

**AGENCY NEGOTIATOR:**

**Mike Witzansky, City Manager**

**Cameron Harding, Community Services Director**

**PROPERTY:**

**309 Esplanade, Redondo Beach, CA 90277**

**NEGOTIATING PARTIES:**

**Made by Meg - Meg Walker**

**UNDER NEGOTIATION:**

**Both Price and Terms**

**CONTACT: CAMERON HARDING, COMMUNITY SERVICES DIRECTOR**

**F.3. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**Kelly Nicole Deckers v. City of Redondo Beach, et al.**

**Case Number: 24STCV06168**

**F.4. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**City of Redondo Beach, et al. v. California State Water Resources Control Board**

**Case Number: 20STCP03193**

- F.5. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**New Commune DTLA, LLC and Leonid Pustilnikov v. City of Redondo Beach and City Council of the City of Redondo Beach**

**Case Number: 22TRCP00203**

- F.6. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**New Commune DTLA, LLC v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; City of Redondo Beach Department of Community Development, et al.**

**Case Number: 23STCP00426**

- F.7. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**New Commune DTLA LLC v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive  
Case Number: 23STCV10146**

- F.8. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**9300 Wilshire, LLC v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; City of Redondo Beach Department of Community Development; and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive  
Case Number: 23STCP02189**

- F.9. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**  
**In re 9300 Wilshire LLC**  
**Bankruptcy C.D. Cal. Case Number: 2:23-bk-10918-ER**

- F.10. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**  
**Yes in My Back Yard, a California nonprofit corporation; SONJA TRAUSS, an individual v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; City of Redondo Beach Department of Community Development, and DOES 1 through 25 inclusive**  
**Case Number: 23TRCP00325**

- F.11. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege - Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**  
**Jason Sapien v. City of Redondo Beach**  
**WCAB No: ADJ15676680**

- F.12. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION. The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**  
**AIDS Healthcare Foundation and City of Redondo Beach v. Rob Bonta, in his official capacity as California Attorney General; State of California; and DOES 1 to 100**  
**Los Angeles County Superior Case Number: 21STCP03149**  
**Second Appellate District Court Case Number: B321875**

**G. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION – 6:26 p.m.**

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to reconvene to Open Session from Closed Session at 6:26 p.m.

Motion carried, 4-0-1. Councilmember Behrendt was absent.

Councilmember Behrendt joined the meeting immediately following reconvening.

**H. ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light



Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, CMC, City Clerk  
Mike Webb, City Attorney  
Mike Witzansky, City Manager  
Lucie Colombo, Chief Deputy City Clerk

**I. ANNOUNCEMENT OF CLOSED SESSION ACTIONS**

City Manager Witzansky reported that under Closed Session Agenda Item No. F.3, the City Council unanimously authorized the City Attorney to defend the City in the case.

**J. ADJOURN TO REGULAR MEETING**

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, to adjourn to the regular meeting at 6:27 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

**6:00 PM - OPEN SESSION - REGULAR MEETING**

**A. CALL TO ORDER**

A Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 6:27 p.m. by Mayor Light in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

**B. ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk  
Mike Webb, City Attorney  
Mike Witzansky, City Manager  
Lucie Colombo, Chief Deputy City Clerk

**C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION**

Mayor Light invited Veterans to stand and recognized them for their service.

Sydney, 6th Grade Student, Perras Middle School, led the salute to the flag.

Mayor Light called for a moment of silence.

**D. PRESENTATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/ANNOUNCEMENTS**

**D.1. PRESENTATION BY CONGRESSMAN TED LIEU'S OFFICE OF PRESIDENT BIDEN'S CONDOLENCE LETTER TO THE LATE MAYOR BILL BRAND'S FAMILY**

Mayor Light announced this item is being postponed to the next City Council meeting.

**D.2. MAYOR'S COMMENDATION TO THE AYSO REGION 17 GIRLS U12 TEAM FOR EARNING 2024 WESTERN STATES SILVER MEDALS**

Mayor Light presented each Member of the AYSO Region 17 Girls U12 Team with a commendation for earning the 2024 Western States Silver Medals.

Councilmember Nehrenheim spoke about the recent District 1 community meeting and the upcoming District 1 community meeting; addressed Late Mayor Brand's paddle out event on May 11, 2024; announced an online community meeting on April 22, 2024, 6:30 p.m. and acknowledged National Dispatchers Week and the great work of City Dispatchers.

Councilmember Loewenstein announced the upcoming District 2 community meeting on April 25, 2024 at 6:00 p.m.

Councilmember Kaluderovic announced the District 3 community meeting on April 27, 2024 at 9:00 a.m. and noted the location is still pending.

Councilmember Obagi thanked City Dispatchers for their great work; announced the District 4 community meeting on May 16, 2024 at 6:30 p.m.; addressed upcoming important meetings with L.A. County Metro regarding the C-Line extension and encouraged residents to attend and get involved.

Councilmember Behrendt announced the District 5 community meeting on May 1, 2024, at 6:00 p.m. at the Redondo Beach Performing Arts Center.

Mayor Light announced upcoming Earth Day events this weekend, including at Wilderness Park, and the State of the City event on May 9, 2024.

**E. APPROVE ORDER OF AGENDA**

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, to approve the order of the agenda, as presented.

Motion carried, 5-0.

**F. AGENCY RECESS – None**

**G. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS**

**G.1 For Blue Folder Documents Approved at the City Council Meeting**

City Clerk Manzano reported Blue Folder Items include materials for Agenda Items H.17, J.1, N.1, and H.8.

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote to receive and file Blue Folder Items.

Motion carried, 5-0.

## **H. CONSENT CALENDAR**

### **H.1. APPROVE AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING FOR THE CITY COUNCIL ADJOURNED AND REGULAR MEETING OF APRIL 16, 2024**

**CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK**

### **H.2. APPROVE MOTION TO READ BY TITLE ONLY AND WAIVE FURTHER READING OF ALL ORDINANCES AND RESOLUTIONS LISTED ON THE AGENDA**

**CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK**

### **H.3. APPROVE THE FOLLOWING CITY COUNCIL MINUTES: NONE**

**CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK**

### **H.4. PAYROLL DEMANDS**

**CHECKS 29678-29696 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$28,862.05, PD. 4/12/24  
DIRECT DEPOSIT 277146-277753 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$2,252,373.49, PD. 4/12/24**

**EFT/ACH \$9,321.68, PD. 2/16/24 (PP2404)**

**EFT/ACH \$9,246.68, PD. 3/1/24 (PP2405)**

**EFT/ACH \$441,325.90, PD. 3/11/24 (PP2404)**

**EFT/ACH \$445,734.33, PD. 3/25/24 (PP2405)**

### **ACCOUNTS PAYABLE DEMANDS**

**CHECKS 113599-113785 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$1,291,037.39**

**REPLACEMENT DEMAND 113598 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$1,693.64**

**CONTACT: WENDY COLLAZO, FINANCE DIRECTOR**

### **H.5. APPROVE CONTRACTS UNDER \$35,000:**

**1. APPROVE A SERVICE POLICY AND AGREEMENTS WITH THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF TECHNOLOGY AND AT&T CORPORATION FOR DISCOUNTED RATES ON LEGACY CALNET TELECOMMUNICATIONS SERVICES FOR MULT-YEAR TERMS**

**2. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH PEGASUS STUDIOS, INC. FOR VIDEO RECORDING AND BROADCASTING SERVICES FOR THE UPCOMING MAY, JUNE, JULY, AND AUGUST CITY COUNCIL AND COMMISSION MEETINGS FOR AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$33,600 AND AN OVERALL AGREEMENT TERM OF APRIL 16, 2024 TO APRIL 15, 2025**

**CONTACT: WENDY COLLAZO, FINANCE DIRECTOR**

- H.6. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2404-024, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING THE FILING OF AN APPLICATION FOR SPECIFIED GRANT FUNDS FROM THE BUDGET ACT OF 2023, SEC. 93, 3790-101-001,(1),(d) OF WHICH \$5,000,000 SHALL BE MADE AVAILABLE FOR THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH FOR THE ACQUISITION OF LAND FOR FUTURE PARK DEVELOPMENT**

**CONTACT: GREG KAPOVICH, WATERFRONT & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR**

- H.7. APPROVE THE FIFTH AMENDMENT TO THE AMENDED AND RESTATED AGREEMENT FOR SPECIAL EVENT SERVICES AND REVOCABLE LICENSE WITH SANFORD VENTURES, INC. FOR THE USE OF REAL PROPERTY FOR THE BEACHLIFE FESTIVAL AMENDING THE OPERATING HOURS, FACILITY USE FEE, NUMBER OF PUBLIC PARKING SPACES USED BY FESTIVAL OPERATORS, AND THE REIMBURSEMENT OF MUNICIPAL EXPENSES ASSOCIATED WITH THE FESTIVAL FOR ONE EVENT TO OCCUR DURING THE TERM APRIL 16, 2024 THROUGH JULY 31, 2024**

**CONTACT: GREG KAPOVICH, WATERFRONT & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR**

- H.8. APPROVE THE PURCHASE OF ONE FORD MAVERICK XL HYBRID TRUCK FROM COLLEY FORD FOR USE BY THE BUILDING AND SAFETY DIVISION FOR AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$36,053.02 AND AUTHORIZE THE MAYOR TO EXECUTE ALL RELATED PROCUREMENT DOCUMENTS**

**CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR**

- H.9. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH ECOKAI ENVIRONMENTAL, INC. FOR WATER QUALITY MONITORING AND TESTING SERVICES AT SEASIDE LAGOON FOR AN ANNUAL AMOUNT OF \$50,000, A FIVE-YEAR TOTAL AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$250,000, AND A TERM THAT EXPIRES ON APRIL 16, 2029**

**CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR**

- H.10. APPROVE THE SECOND AMENDMENT TO THE ON-CALL ELECTRICAL ENGINEERING CONSULTING SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH LUCCI AND ASSOCIATES TO INCREASE THE NOT TO EXCEED AMOUNT BY \$100,000, FOR A NEW TOTAL NOT TO EXCEED AMOUNT OF \$300,000, AND TO EXTEND THE TERM TO MAY 5, 2026**

**CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR**

- H.11. DECLARE AN OUT OF SERVICE POLICE PATROL VEHICLE (UNIT #658) AS**

**SURPLUS PROPERTY AND APPROVE THE DONATION OF THE VEHICLE TO THE REDONDO BEACH FIREFIGHTER'S ASSOCIATION FOR USE IN AN UPCOMING BURN INSTITUTE CHARITY EVENT**

**APPROVE THE EQUIPMENT DONATION AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH AND THE REDONDO BEACH FIREFIGHTER'S ASSOCIATION**

**ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2404-025, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, AUTHORIZING THE DONATION OF A POLICE VEHICLE TO THE REDONDO BEACH FIREFIGHTER'S ASSOCIATION**

**CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR**

- H.12. APPROVE A SECOND AMENDMENT TO THE AGREEMENT WITH PAYBYPHONE TECHNOLOGIES, INC. FOR THEIR MOBILE PARKING PAYMENT APPLICATION SERVICE TO INCREASE THE PER TRANSACTION CONVENIENCE FEE TO THE FOLLOWING AMOUNTS: \$0.30 EFFECTIVE APRIL 16, 2024, \$0.32 EFFECTIVE APRIL 16, 2025, AND \$0.45 EFFECTIVE APRIL 16, 2026, AND TO ESTABLISH A SMS TRANSACTION FEE OF \$0.20 PER TEXT MESSAGE EFFECTIVE APRIL 16, 2024 FOR USE OF THE OPT-IN TEXT MESSAGE REMINDER FEATURE, WITH NO CHANGE TO THE EXISTING AGREEMENT TERM WHICH ENDS OCTOBER 18, 2026**

**CONTACT: JOE HOFFMAN, CHIEF OF POLICE**

- H.13. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2404-026, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, AMENDING THE OFFICIAL BOOK OF CLASS SPECIFICATIONS FOR THE POSITION OF PLANNING MANAGER**

**CONTACT: DIANE STRICKFADEN, DIRECTOR OF HUMAN RESOURCES**

- H.14. APPROVE A SERVICE POLICY AND AGREEMENT WITH T-MOBILE TO CERTIFY THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH'S AUTHORIZATION TO PARTICIPATE IN THE T-MOBILE CONNECTING HEROES SERVICE PROGRAM FOR A MULTI-YEAR TERM AND TO APPROVE AN INITIAL PURCHASE OF WIRELESS MOBILE DEVICES NOT TO EXCEED \$48,237.84**

**CONTACT: MIKE COOK, INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY DIRECTOR**

- H.15. This Item was pulled by Councilmember Obagi for separate consideration.**

- H.16. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH AND PACIFIC MARITIME GROUP, INC. REGARDING PACIFIC MARITIME GROUP'S ASSUMPTION OF LIABILITY FOR ANY FAILURE TO PROVIDE BARGE SERVICES NECESSARY FOR THE EXECUTION OF THE FIREWORKS DISPLAY AS STIPULATED IN THE AGREEMENT WITH**

**GARDEN STATE FIREWORKS APPROVE A REVISED AGREEMENT WITH GARDEN STATE FIREWORKS FOR PRODUCTION OF THE CITY'S 2024 FOURTH OF JULY FIREWORKS DISPLAY**

**CONTACT:** LUKE SMUDE, ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER

**H.17. This Item was pulled by Councilmember Behrendt for separate consideration.**

Councilmember Obagi pulled Agenda Item No. H.15 from the Consent Calendar for separate consideration.

Councilmember Behrendt pulled Agenda Item No. H.17 from the Consent Calendar for separate consideration.

There were no public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, the Consent Calendar except for Consent Calendar Item Nos. H.15 and H.17.

Motion carried, 5-0.

City Clerk Manzano read titles to Resolutions No. CC-2404-024, CC-2404-025 and CC-2404-026.

**I. EXCLUDED CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS**

**H.15. RECEIVE AND FILE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH LOGO REDESIGN COMPETITION ENTRIES**

**CONTACT:** ELIZABETH HAUSE, ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER

Councilmember Obagi spoke about the Redondo Beach logo redesign competition; commended Assistant to the City Manager Hause for opening the competition, soliciting submissions from the community and compiling the information for Council's review and presented some of the submissions.

City Clerk Manzano reported receiving three eComments regarding the item.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and approved by voice vote, Item No. H.15, to receive and file the City of Redondo Beach Logo Redesign Competition Entries.

Motion carried, 5-0.

**H.17. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2404-028, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA EXPRESSING THE CITY'S SUPPORT OF ASSEMBLY BILL (AB) 2230 (BENNETT) WHICH**

**SEEKS TO APPLY RESIDENTIAL HOUSING TO CALIFORNIA'S PRINCIPAL ANTITRUST LAW AND CLARIFY THAT CITY ATTORNEYS MAY PROSECUTE ANTI-COMPETITIVE BEHAVIOR**

**APPROVE THE ATTACHED LETTER OF SUPPORT FOR SIGNATURE BY THE MAYOR AND CITY ATTORNEY**

**CONTACT:** MICHAEL W. WEBB, CITY ATTORNEY  
LUKE SMUDE, ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER

Councilmember Behrendt announced he will be voting, "No"; reported that based on his research and discussions with L.A. City Attorney Hydee Feldstein Soto and Kevin James, he believed AB 2230 will do the opposite of increasing housing in California and will become an impediment to new affordable housing in California and asserted it is in need of substantial amendments.

Councilmember Nehrenheim invited fellow Councilmembers and the public to listen to "Our Neighborhood Voices" this Thursday, which will educate the public on this issue, which will remove local control. He added that the coastal zone is being attacked, impacting the ability to keep the coastal zone open for all; thanked the City Attorney for writing the letter and hoped the bill passes.

Councilmember Loewenstein spoke about big foreign corporations buying property, nationwide so that average people do not have the ability to compete in the real estate market and discussed the importance of supporting affordable housing in the City and believed this is one way of doing so.

There were no public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and approved by roll call vote, Item No. H.17, to adopt by title only Resolution No. CC-2404-028, A Resolution of the City of Redondo Beach, California expressing the City's support of Assembly Bill (AB) 2230 (BENNETT) which seeks to apply residential housing to California's Principal Antitrust Law and clarify that City Attorneys may prosecute anti-competitive behavior and approve the attached letter of support for signature by the Mayor and City Attorney.

The motion carried with the following roll call vote:

AYES: Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi  
NOES: Behrendt  
ABSENT: None  
ABSTAIN: None

Motion carried, 4-1.

City Clerk Manzano read title to Resolution No. CC-2404-028.

**J. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS**



## **J.1 For eComments and Emails Received from the Public**

Suzanne Beaudelaire, President, Redondo Beach Women's Club, spoke about their work in the community and invited the public to participate in their upcoming fundraiser.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and approved by voice vote, to receive and file a flier submitted by Suzanne Beaudelaire.

Motion carried, 5-0.

Liza Caso reported visiting her neighbors to obtain feedback regarding installing pickleball at Alta Vista Park; noted residents expressed concerns that they were not notified of the project and submitted a petition of 32 neighbors who are vehemently opposed to the project.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and approved by voice vote, to receive and file a petition submitted by Liza Caso.

Motion carried, 5-0.

Bob Brown spoke in opposition to the proposed installation of pickleball at Alta Vista Park; addressed the recommended distance of courts to residences; discussed the proximity of his home to the courts; expressed concerns regarding the excess noise; suggested the City conduct studies to measure the negative impacts on the neighborhood around Alta Vista and urged City Council to oppose the plan.

Ryan Hall objected the proposal to install pickleball courts at Alta Vista Park; talked about noise levels creating adverse conditions for residents and urged Council to get an informed vote on the matter.

Alicia Wenke opposed the installation of pickleball courts at Alta Vista Park; spoke about her home's proximity and negative impacts to parking, traffic, noise and lights and wondered about the negative impacts to the students at Vista Elementary School.

Ron Maroko, District 3, referenced a Resolution establishing the Ito Family Open Space at the corner of Ripley and Flagler and how it provides a unique learning opportunity for students and residents to learn about the Ito Family and early Redondo Beach history; noted that a related CIP was not included in the budget last year; reported that the Public Arts Commission approved a conceptual plan that was also approved by the Historical Commission and the Recreation and Parks Commission; referenced BRR 47, that included a cost estimate of \$400,000 to \$800,000 for the project and another \$50,000 to \$75,000 to prepare plans and specifications; talked about submitting a public records request seeking information about the project and the response that there were no responsive records identified, no records to show who prepared the estimates, no records showing the different components of the project and hoped that City Council will take steps to get this important project moving forward, approve the design work plan specifications and approve the funding for at least three historical markers, in the park, so they can be installed before the beginning of the next school year.



Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to extend Ron Maroko's time for commenting, by 30 seconds.

Motion carried, 5-0.

Ron Maroko listed supporting documents for submission to Council.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to receive and file documents submitted by Ron Maroko.

Motion carried, 5-0.

Joan Irvine, District 1, submitted documents

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and approved by voice vote, to receive and file documents submitted by Joan Irvine.

Motion carried, 5-0.

Joan Irvine, District 1, discussed cannabis education; announced a workshop hosted by the Cancer Support Group, with Elizabeth Mack who will be talking about cancer, CBD and cannabis and that she will be a guest on her radio show at healthlife.net.

Councilmember Obagi left the Chambers at 7:17 p.m., and returned at 7:20 p.m.

Vicky Oetzell reported that Councilmember Nehrenheim stated he had no financial interest in the Los Angeles County Fire Department; noted he has worked for them for 28 years, in various positions; opined this is a conflict of interest issue; referenced Government Code 18700.1; announced she has requested copies for Councilmember Nehrenheim's earnings and copies of paystubs from the City Attorney's Office, and suggested Councilmember Nehrenheim should recuse himself from any discussion and voting regarding the RBFD and the LACFD.

Brad Waller, Vice President, Keep the Esplanade Beautiful, thanked USC Alumni for taking part in a special cleanup as part of the USC Day of Service and the Beach Cities Health District for joining in the last regular cleanup.

Eugene Solomon, City Treasurer, talked about City revenue sources; noted Redondo Beach is business-friendly; spoke about making retail space more dynamic and exploring revenue-producing ideas and challenged Council to think of revenue-producing ideas to present to City Council.

Robin Eisenberg acknowledged people who commented against the installation of pickleball courts near their homes and urged them to attend the upcoming Metro C-Line extension meeting in solidarity with residents living near the ROW.

Pat Healey, District 1, spoke about the removal of Chris Voisey from the General Plan Advisory Committee because of a civil matter; discussed suspension of

Councilmember Obagi from the practice of law for three years, a civil matter; referenced a post questioning whether Councilmember Obagi should be forced to resign and suggested the City issue a letter requesting Councilmember Obagi's resignation adding that the City cannot have double standards.

There were no other public comments and Mayor Light closed this portion of the meeting.

#### **K. EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

Councilmember Loewenstein reported speaking with City staff and the public, in the past, regarding Item No. L.1.

Councilmember Kaluderovic reported speaking with City staff and the public regarding Item No. L.1.

Councilmember Obagi reported discussing this matter with his wife.

Councilmember Behrendt reported speaking with Mayor Light and the public regarding this matter.

Mayor Light reported speaking with Councilmembers, City staff, and the public.

#### **L. PUBLIC HEARINGS**

##### **L.1. A PUBLIC HEARING FOR CONSIDERATION OF A CATEGORICAL EXEMPTION UNDER THE CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT (CEQA) AND A COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT TO PROHIBIT PARKING ON THE SOUTH SIDE OF HERONDO STREET BETWEEN PACIFIC COAST HIGHWAY AND NORTH FRANCISCA AVENUE FROM THE HOURS OF 2:00 A.M. TO 6:00 A.M.**

##### **RECOMMENDATION:**

- 1. Open the public hearing, take testimony, and deliberate;**
- 2. Close the public hearing; and**
- 3. Adopt a resolution by title only subject to the findings contained therein:**

**ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2404-027, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, ADOPTING A CATEGORICAL EXEMPTION FROM THE CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT (CEQA) AND APPROVING A COASTAL DEVELOPMENT PERMIT TO PROHIBIT PARKING ON THE SOUTH SIDE OF HERONDO STREET BETWEEN PACIFIC COAST HIGHWAY AND NORTH FRANCISCA AVENUE FROM THE HOURS OF 2:00 A.M. TO 6:00 A.M.**

**CONTACT: JOE HOFFMAN, CHIEF OF POLICE**

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and approved by voice vote, to open the public hearing.

Motion carried, 5-0.

City Manager Witzansky introduced Acting Community Development Director Scully and RBPB Senior Management Analyst Carillo and deferred to them for a report.

RBPB Senior Management Analyst Carillo narrated a PowerPoint presentation with details of the project.

In response to Mayor Light's question regarding including Lot 13, Acting Community Development Director Scully reported it is under the jurisdiction of the Harbor Commission as the initial body that would act on that Coastal Development Permit.

Councilmember Loewenstein reported he and Councilmember Nehrenheim have fought for no meters in that area but stated that people have abused it by parking overnight and beyond; noted that is not the intention of having no meters there, but rather to encourage people to visit the coastal zones and spoke in support of the item.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Robert Moore, District 3, suggested changing the hours to 1:00 a.m. to 5:00 a.m. to accommodate surfers.

Andy Porkchop, Torrance, shared that he used to live in his car; spoke in opposition to the item and in support of creating safe parking places.

Charles Hammond, District 4, agreed with the previous speaker and suggested changing the hours to 1:00 a.m. to 5:00 a.m.

Acting Community Development Director Scully confirmed that the hours of 2:00 a.m. to 6:00 a.m. are for consistency as those are the same hours on the other side of Herondo Street.

Kyle Johnson, District 1, via Zoom, spoke about helping people who face hard times to recover and felt this action would go against the good work the City has been doing to help the unhoused and it would penalize people who are already suffering.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Councilmember Obagi commented on the availability of parking in Lot 13; realized all parking there will be changed from 2:00 a.m. to 6:00 a.m. and stated it makes sense to change the time unless it will ruin things for enforcement.

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to close the public hearing.

Motion carried, 5-0.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and approved by voice vote, to adopt by title only Resolution No. CC-2404-027, A Resolution

of the City Council of the City of Redondo Beach, California, adopting a categorical exemption from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and approving a Coastal Development permit to prohibit parking on the south side of Herondo Street between Pacific Coast Highway and North Francisca Avenue from the hours of 2:00 a.m. to 6:00 a.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

City Clerk Manzano read title to Resolution No. CC-2404-027.

**M. ITEMS CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS AGENDAS – None**

**N. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION PRIOR TO ACTION**

**N.1. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE COMPARATIVE DEPLOYMENT AND ORGANIZATIONAL ANALYSIS PREPARED BY CITYGATE ASSOCIATES, LLC. OF THE REDONDO BEACH FIRE DEPARTMENT AS COMPARED TO THE CONSOLIDATED FIRE DISTRICT OF LOS ANGELES COUNTY**

**DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON THE ORGANIZATIONAL ANALYSIS OF THE REDONDO BEACH FIRE DEPARTMENT AND MASTER PLAN**

**DIRECTION ON NEXT STEPS (IF ANY) REGARDING THE REPORTS AND FIRE DEPARTMENT OPERATIONS**

**CONTACT:** PATRICK BUTLER, INTERIM FIRE CHIEF & HARBOR MASTER

RBFD Interim Chief Butler introduced Stuart Gary with Citygate Associates and deferred to him for a report.

Stuart Gary, Public Safety Principal, Citygate Associates, spoke about his career in the Fire Department, teaching and consulting; discussed the format of the report and narrated a PowerPoint presentation of an organizational analysis of the Redondo Beach Fire Department, deployment recommendations and master plan and a comparative deployment and organizational analysis of the Redondo Beach Fire Department as compared to the Consolidated Fire District of L.A. County.

Discussion followed regarding moving the crew and equipment from Station 2 to Station 3 (in the middle of the two simultaneous high density areas and allowing it to pick up as many calls south as north) in lieu of a far north station, picking up simultaneous calls in fewer travel minutes, reinforcing marine capabilities and the possibility of testing the theory through a pilot program of 90 to 180 days.

Consultant Gary spoke about an overlap of services and management of all things marine by various City departments; suggested taking a step back and looking at the Fire Patrol boat and staffing as well as marina management in the different basins and

consider what a Harbor Department might look like. He addressed key findings in their review of Fire Headquarters; discussed ownership of stations and catastrophic repairs falling to the city of ownership; reported minor repairs are the contractors' responsibility as part of the annual operating costs; spoke about fire engines and transferring fleet assets to the new entity and listed headquarters programs recommendations.

Additionally, Consultant Gary listed key findings in their review of contracting fire services; spoke about the capabilities of the Consolidated Fire District of L.A. County; stressed that it is all but inevitable, that cities contract into subregional or regional fire protection; noted he cannot predict future pay, benefit and safety regulation changes in the industry and talked about projections and local control. He addressed staffing and shared staffing and options for Council to consider in determining next steps and spoke about overlap of services along the coastline.

Consultant Gary responded to Council questions regarding removing an engine from Station 2 to the middle of the population cluster for faster response to where the majority of incidents occur; reiterated that Hermosa Beach was not part of the analysis for this section of the report; stated that reciprocity with Hermosa Beach is part of future unknown steps and commented on City Council having choices to have further community conversations about.

Consultant Gary addressed deployment differences in the various proposals, cost comparisons, City leave-behind cost obligations, unfunded pension obligations related to the Fire Department budget, cost comparisons without pension obligations, key contracting findings and concluding observations.

Discussion followed regarding accounting of recommendations to add administrative staff, impacts to the City's Communications Center, consideration of a Fire Master Plan to include elements of the implementation plan in the City budget and providing broad policy direction.

Councilmember Loewenstein talked about the excellent quality of service provided by the Consolidated Fire District of L.A. County and RBFD; discussed the need to repair or replace the City's existing fire stations and addressed the possibility of CalPERS requiring other assessments. Additionally, spoke about wanting to talk to cities that have moved to County fire services.

Consultant Gary stated he cannot think of a city that has left the County system and reported the collective has stuck together for a long time and is generally, happy with the professionalism and the level of services of the Consolidated Fire District of L.A. County.

Councilmember Loewenstein noted that is a difficult thing to do; spoke about the need for pay raises and about the County's bargaining power, the North Redondo station, making sure all areas in Redondo Beach are well serviced, including other stations that potentially might service the City and considering the rate of inflation and mentioned \$305,000 of anticipated expenses that were not in the study.

Relative to retrospective compensation analysis, Consultant Gary stated that because

of the Great Recession and Covid, in doing a survey, the City's Finance team has to try to model each respondent to the survey's ability to pay and feed their public safety costs over ten years, has to be part of the equation.

Councilmember Loewenstein spoke about public safety being the City's top priority, about ensuring that Redondo Beach gets the best service possible and doing it, most efficiently.

Councilmember Obagi noted the excellent work of the RBFD without clerical assistance and asked about the benefits of spending for it.

Consultant Gary stated it will eventually control the rate of increase on sworn people; discussed training record compliance as required by law and believed hiring a clerical assistant and analyst will better serve the City.

Councilmember Obagi stated that while Citygate was contracted to explain the fire quote, it was a follow up to Chief Kauffman's previous assessment and in response to his questions, City Manager Witzansky reported that the City has already hired an analyst; noted the biggest focus has been on training and expanding the training program; added that an Emergency Coordinator position has been added, although not yet filled and indicated staff will evaluate Citygate recommendations as part of the upcoming budget cycle.

Consultant Gary suggested tabling the clerical FTE for a fiscal year and driving the new headquarters team for efficiency and effectiveness and reconsider the position.

Councilmember Obagi commented favorably on the report and on the responsiveness of the RBFD; spoke in support of the RBFD and announced their participation in the 32nd Annual Safety and Fire Expo. Additionally, he did not see a financial appeal in going to the County and relinquishing control; talked about continuing this discussion in three or four weeks as the RBFD Fire Fighters just received the report and have not had the time to discuss it and commented on noticing for this item.

Councilmember Kaluderovic noted that noticing was the same as when Late Mayor Brand was replaced; noted the lack of Federal and State regulations directing the level of fire service staffing, response times or outcomes and asked about the kind of influence the City would have over those topics if it were to move to County services.

Consultant Gary reported there will be performance terms in the contract and if the two parties agree, they become enforceable as part of the contract and contract negotiations.

Councilmember Kaluderovic spoke about maintaining local control and in reply to her question, Consultant Gary spoke about impacts on response times by the City's Dispatch transferring calls to County services noting they meet the State's ring time performance criteria and discussed the opinion of the Chief Harbor Master that Baywatch would not be able to enforce City codes in the Harbor.

RBFD Interim Chief Butler addressed City code enforcement in the Harbor and the need for approval by the L.A. County Supervisors of a code change relative to the County's



supervision of the Harbor; spoke about recruitment and retention and a desire to work in Redondo Beach; discussed auto-pulse equipment and having that equipment on the apparatus and talked about mutual aid regions and systems.

Councilmember Kaluderovic invited Fire Association President Campos to the podium, and he explained the final report was published Friday and was sent to Members, today; asked for additional time for Members to review it and spoke about intangibles that are under negotiations.

Fire Association President Campos stated that labor negotiations should be separate but noted they intertwine with the City's consideration of keeping RBFD or contracting with the Consolidated Fire District of L.A. County.

In reply to Councilmember Nehrenheim's questions, Consultant Gary reported getting City staff input and feedback throughout the process; addressed documents produced throughout the process and confirmed reviewing a previous assessment produced by RBPB Chief Kauffman.

Councilmember Nehrenheim presented a history of the topic; discussed what the assessment did not cover; reported speaking with neighboring cities and felt the option of a South Bay Fire District will never happen; discussed relying on Manhattan Beach and Hermosa Beach; commented on success requirements and trends for charging for paramedic calls. He talked about getting the City's ambulance rights, back; referenced the creation of a civilian Harbor Patrol and spoke about moving the engine from Station 3 to Station 2 or the Harbor.

Consultant Gary talked about the most active area in the City in terms of calls for service.

Councilmember Nehrenheim spoke about Manhattan Beach Fire Services responding to several calls per week to Redondo Beach; thanked the MBFD for their service and felt the report did not address Area G and the amount of equipment borrowed from other cities.

Consultant Gary explained that they looked at the City's fleet and new orders and the past was not taken into account because the City has adequate equipment on order and subsequently, on reserve once the new orders are filled, so the City has rehabilitated and rebooted the fleet replacement cycle and a forensic audit was not necessary.

Discussion followed regarding staffing, having conversations with Public Works and RBPB regarding customer service turnaround time on the fire fleet and including modeling of the Cities of Palos Verdes and Hermosa Beach Fire Stations.

Consultant Gary listed factors that come into play when a master plan is codependent on mutual automatic aid for primary, daily customer service including reciprocity, drive time and the unit hour utilization.

Councilmember Nehrenheim spoke about needing the data on Manhattan Beach including how much they are in Redondo Beach, maintenance requests, overtime requirements and the current budget and asked about a situation where communications

and phone lines are down, and the City is on its own.

Consultant Gary felt the RBPd and RBFD Chiefs would better respond to the question; noted that every Communications Center has backup plans when communications and phone lines are down.

Councilmember Nehrenheim apologized to employees; spoke about making needed improvements; addressed costs related to Fire Stations; provided a brief history of Station 1 and Station 2; talked about the money needed to build a new Fire Station and asked about possible funding sources.

Consultant Gary discussed typical financing vehicles including setting aside capital replacement money (an infrastructure financing plan), short-term debt bonding and long-term general obligation bonds.

Mayor Light interjected noting this is about operations and not facilities and financing.

Councilmember Nehrenheim spoke about sending this to the Budget and Finance Commission to work on the bonding or financing structure moving forward and spoke in support of the RBFD.

Councilmember Obagi spoke about the City deploying its financial abilities; talked about projects in the City needing attention; took issue with people who compare any decision to the replacement of Late Mayor Brand and agreed to allow more time for Fire Fighters to review the report, ask questions and provide input.

Mayor Light expressed concerns regarding moving an engine to Station 3; noted that most of the response of that unit would not be in the Tidelands; reported concerns about sharing Harbor Patrol for non-Harbor duties; stated Harbor Patrol duties are fundamentally different than what Fire Fighters do including patrolling and preempting hazardous situations versus waiting for calls for service.

Mayor Light invited public comments on this item.

Michael Grady spoke about his experience with rescue; asserted that the RBFD is the best; noted that the system is not broken but needs improvements; talked about City Fire Fighters caring about the community and urged City Council to leave the RBFD intact.

Mariam Butler spoke in support of the RBFD; discussed takeaways from the study and urged City Council to leave the RBFD intact.

Jim Mueller spoke about the number of vacant buildings adding to fire hazards in the City; spoke in support of the RBFD; suggested that Consolidated Fire District of L.A. County “sweeten the deal” by upgrading the firehouses and equipment and offsetting the total pension and health benefits for Fire Fighters and urged City Council to be mindful of potential conflicts of interest when they are dealing with a small entity versus a large one from which they get other contracts.



Brad Waller spoke about Council having a straight-forward choice, to maintain the current Fire Department, based on the findings in the Citygate report; shared his experience touring Station 1; talked about the importance of maintaining local control over public safety services and urged City Council to do so.

Diane Lewis, District 4, reported that she and her neighbors are seriously opposed to losing control of the RBFD and moving to Consolidated Fire District of L.A. County services and spoke about the added costs and potential fewer services.

Pamela Sund spoke in opposition to contracting with the Consolidated Fire District of L.A. County for services; talked about wanting the RBFD to be nimble, responsive and with minimal bureaucracy and urged City Council not to pursue a contract with Consolidated Fire District of L.A. County and to follow some of the recommendations in the Citygate report.

Lisa Nash, District 3, spoke in support of the RBFD; noted there is no financial benefit for the City to go with the County and felt that contracting with the County adds another unnecessary layer that will negatively impact the City.

Sondra Segall, District 4, spoke in support of the RBFD and in opposition to contracting with the County for fire services; noted that RBFD has a Class 1 rating that Consolidated Fire District of L.A. County does not have and asserted the City Council serves residents who have repeatedly communicated that they do not want RBFD services outsourced.

Commissioner Carmichael, Member of the Public Safety Commission, asked that City Council not make a decision based on what was or on what happens in other cities that are incomparable.

Former Fire Chief Pat Aust spoke in support of keeping RBFD; felt City Council is on the right track and commented favorably on the report.

Rita Lloyd spoke in support of maintaining local control and keeping the RBFD.

Janette Kurth McKennie, District 4, spoke in support of RBFD and RBPD; stated she is open to the recommendations regarding Fire Station 2 and Rig 64; expressed concerns regarding increased costs by moving to Consolidated Fire District of L.A. County and urged Council to support local control and RBFD.

Wayne Craig, District 1, spoke about City Council searching for answers regarding the possibility of moving to Consolidated Fire District of L.A. County; provided a history of the item; talked about the age of existing Fire Stations; noted they are in bad shape and City Council needs to produce a way to fund their repair and suggested review of the matter by the Budget and Finance Commission and the Public Safety Commission.

Robert Moore, District 3, spoke in support of maintaining local control and keeping the RBFD.

Andy Porkchop, Torrance, spoke about CalPERS and unfunded pension liabilities; urged the City to look at cheaper options and talked about someone calling the Police on him

because of his camera.

Kent Iverson, District 4, spoke about the capital expense required to upgrade RBFD and RBPB infrastructure; suggested issuing bonds and addressed the need for capital expenditure for facilities.

John Bucci, District 1, via Zoom, expressed concerns regarding moving to the Consolidated Fire District of L.A. County; noted increased costs and urged City Council to keep RBFD status quo.

City Clerk Manzano reported receiving 83 eComments, 82 opposed to moving to Consolidated Fire District of L.A. County and one, neutral.

There were no additional public comments at this time.

Councilmember Nehrenheim felt it vital to send the report to the Harbor Commission, Public Safety Commission, Public Works Commission, and the Budget and Finance Commission to review the impacts that are in the report, the recommendations and the fixes, to receive input from the Fire Union, return to the City Council with a Budget Response Report (BRR) as appropriate for the upcoming budget in June.

Councilmember Loewenstein wanted to add to Councilmember Nehrenheim's motion based on discussions with City Manager Witzansky and that is that he found it interesting that the City's Fire Department and Mr. Gary, have been extensively questioned but Los Angeles County Fire Department has not been present to be able to ask difficult questions of them, similar to discussions in the past with Athens. He would like to bring L.A. County Fire Department back.

City Manager Witzansky reported they were invited multiple times but refused to attend, did not send a representative and were not interested in attending tonight's meeting.

Councilmember Loewenstein made his additions and seconded Councilmember Nehrenheim's motion.

Councilmember Obagi spoke about bifurcating the decision to go to Consolidated Fire District of L.A. County and the decision regarding the improvements and changes needed in the RBFD.

Substitute motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to continue the discussion on whether to join the Consolidated L.A. County Fire District to the City Council meeting of May 7, 2024, to send this report to all the Commissions and the Fire Association for the recommendations of what to do inside the Fire Department, and to receive staff opinion on whether the City should test Fire Station 3, adding an engine model by moving it from Fire Station 2, and also whether the City should undertake any further analysis by Citygate of Harbor Patrol and receiving an audit from them of the City's Harbor Patrol and what changes can be made to improve service or recovery on service.

Mayor Light asked what was driving May 7th and Councilmember Kaluderovic asked about making a decision at tonight's meeting.

Councilmember Obagi responded that it would comply with the City's Firefighters to provide additional time to review documents because they received it today, and it would allow him time to provide to his constituents for their review.

The Mayor expressed concern about the suggested May 7th date given the upcoming items and suggested that the City Manager determine the date.

Councilmember Kaluderovic spoke about the time spent on discussing the matter; referenced Citygate recommendations and suggested putting this issue to bed.

Discussion followed regarding letting the City Manager decide when the date for returning to City Council with the information.

City Manager Witzansky talked about this involving two distinct work efforts including a comparative analysis, which can be addressed at the meeting of May 7, 2024 and reported that further efforts will require more time. He added that a BRR will be provided on public safety facility costs and bond options.

Substitute motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to continue the discussion on whether to join the Consolidated L.A. County Fire District to the City Council meeting of May 7, 2024, to allow for the Fire Association's input and to direct staff to forward the Citygate report to the Harbor Commission, Public Safety Commission, Public Works Commission, the Budget and Finance Commission, with no deadline on this, and to receive staff's recommendation on the test to move an engine from Fire Station 2 to Fire Station 3, as well as whether the City should undertake further Citygate analysis of Harbor Patrol.

Councilmember Loewenstein asked Councilmember Obagi to consider asking L.A. County Fire Department to attend a meeting on a night separate from Citygate.

Councilmember Obagi agreed to add to his motion, to invite L.A. County Fire Department to attend the May 7th meeting.

Councilmember Loewenstein seconded Councilmember Obagi's amended substitute motion.

Councilmember Kaluderovic commented that she agreed that this matter was to be bifurcated and agreed with Councilmember Obagi's second part of the motion, but not with the first part of the motion which included the May 7th deadline because there has been extensive discussion and 82 comments in opposition of this.

The substitute to the substitute motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic is to direct staff to receive and file the Citygate report, thank Consolidated L.A. County Fire District for their time and efforts and she wished they were in attendance, close this item to keep

the local RBFD in the City, and then to include Councilmember Obagi's second part of his motion to send the Citygate report to the Harbor Commission, Public Safety Commission, Public Works Commission, and Budget and Finance Commission with no deadline on this, and to receives staff's recommendation on the test to move an engine from Fire Station 2 to Fire Station 3, as well as whether the City should undertake further Citygate analysis of Harbor Patrol.

Additional discussion ensued among the City Council.

In response to Councilmember Behrendt, Fire Association President Campos came forward to address the City Council. He stated the need for additional time to review the report; acknowledged the support received but wondered if the City will provide the economic support that Fire Fighters need, \$4 million, which are currently in negotiations with the City.

City Manager Witzansky talked about having an understanding of the 1% COLA for Fire Fighters and noted the need to tread carefully, as the contract is still under negotiations.

City Attorney Webb commented on proper ways to negotiate; stated that the wording of the motion depends on how specific it is or providing options and referenced rules under Government Code Section 1091.5 relative to conflicts of interest.

Discussion followed regarding the timing of the Citygate study, adjustments to salaries, and budget analysis.

Councilmember Behrendt offered a friendly amendment to the second part of Councilmember Kaluderovic's motion. His modification was to return to the City Council, without reference to the Commissions to not obliging the City Council to send it to them, but rather for next steps if any regarding additional studies of the organizational analysis of the City's Fire Department, which would include additional discussion and possible direction on further analysis of the organizational aspects of the report. Councilmember Behrendt did not second Councilmember Kaluderovic's motion.

The substitute to the substitute motion made by Councilmember Kaluderovic dies for lack of a second.

Councilmember Behrendt offered a friendly amendment to the motion to direct staff to return, without reference to committees for directions on next steps regarding the additional studies concerning the organizational analysis of the Fire Department.

The Substitute to the substitute motion made by Councilmember Behrendt dies for lack of a second.

Substitute to the substitute motion made by Councilmember Behrendt was to continue a discussion and possible action regarding the comparative deployment and organizational analysis prepared by Citygate Associates, LLC, of the Redondo Beach Fire Department as compared to the consolidated Fire District of the Los Angeles County be presented to the City Council at the meeting of May 7, 2024, and continue to a meeting in July, discussion and possible action on the organizational analysis of the

Redondo Beach Fire Department and Master Plan and direction on next steps (if any) regarding the reports and Fire Department operations.

The substitute to the substitute motion made by Councilmember Behrendt died for lack of a second.

Councilmember Nehrenheim offered a friendly amendment to the substitute motion made by Councilmember Obagi, that staff provide an updated budget document that shows expenditures of the overtime and current budget of the Fire Department expenditures and provide a report on mutual aid statistics on the times the City has called on partners in the South Bay area for mutual aid.

In reply to Councilmember Obagi's question regarding whether the Department will be under or over budget this year, City Manager Witzansky reported staff is projecting the Department will be under budget at year end.

Councilmember Obagi did not want to make the changes presented by Councilmember Nehrenheim.

Councilmember Loewenstein stated that May 7th, would not work as he will be remote due to his daughter's graduation, therefore he withdrew his second to Councilmember Obagi's substitute motion.

Councilmember Obagi's substitute motion died for lack of a second.

Councilmember Nehrenheim restated his original amended motion.

Amended motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and failed by roll call vote, to direct staff to forward the Citygate report to the Harbor Commission, Public Safety Commission, Public Works Commission, and the Budget and Finance Commission to discuss and consider the recommendations, get input from the Fire Association and return to City Council with BRRs, as appropriate for the budget discussions on June 4, 2024, and to invite Consolidated Fire District of L.A. County to attend that meeting.

The amended original motion failed 2-3 with the following roll call vote:

AYES: Loewenstein, Nehrenheim  
NOES: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Obagi  
ABSENT: None  
ABSTAIN: None

Councilmember Nehrenheim introduced a new motion by restating Councilmember Obagi's previous motion with a new date of May 21, 2024.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and carried by roll call vote, to continue the discussion on whether to join the Consolidated L.A. County Fire District to the City Council meeting of May 21, 2024, to allow for the Fire Association's input and to direct staff to forward the Citygate report to the

Harbor Commission, Public Safety Commission, Public Works Commission, the Budget and Finance Commission, with no deadline on this, and to receives staff's recommendation on the test to move an engine from Fire Station 2 to Fire Station 3, as well as whether the City should undertake further Citygate analysis of Harbor Patrol, and to invite L.A. County Fire Department to attend said meeting separate from Citygate. The motion carried, 3-2 with the following roll call vote:

AYES: Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi  
NOES: Behrendt, Kaluderovic  
ABSENT: None  
ABSTAIN: None

Councilmember Kaluderovic briefly left at 11:06 p.m.

## **RECESS/RECONVENE**

Motion by Councilmember Behrendt, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, to recess at 11:06 p.m.

Motion carried, 4-0-1. Councilmember Kaluderovic was absent.

Mayor Light reconvened the meeting at 11:16 p.m.

## **ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light

## **N.2. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON THE MOST RECENT TRIENNIAL CITYWIDE PAVEMENT MANAGEMENT SURVEY FOR BOTH STREETS AND ALLEYWAYS AND THE RECOMMENDED WORK PLAN FOR THE RESIDENTIAL STREET REHABILITATION AND CITYWIDE SLURRY SEAL CAPITAL PROJECT PROGRAMS**

**CONTACT:** ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR

Acting City Engineer Lauren Sablan narrated a PowerPoint presentation with details of the most recent triennial citywide Pavement Management Survey for streets and alleyways and the recommended work plan for the residential street rehabilitation and citywide slurry seal capital project programs.

Discussion followed regarding related budget actions necessary, increasing backlog, impacts of inflation and delays, clarification of scenarios, executing projects that are funded as soon as possible to avoid inflation and impacts of electric vehicles on streets.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, to receive and file the report and accept recommendations of the work plan for the residential street rehabilitation and citywide slurry seal capital



project programs.

There were no public comments on this item.

Motion carried, 5-0.

**O. CITY MANAGER ITEM**

City Manager Witzansky thanked Interim Community Development Director Sean Scully for acting in that capacity for the last six months and announced the new Community Development Director Marc Wiener will be starting next Monday.

**P. MAYOR AND COUNCIL ITEMS - None**

**Q. MAYOR AND COUNCIL REFERRALS TO STAFF**

In response to Councilmember Nehrenheim's question, City Manager Witzansky addressed the status of VRBO short-term rentals and offered to discuss related pros and cons and values in the BRR and noted it is an evolving issue. Councilmember Nehrenheim asked for a BRR regarding raising revenues in the City and another for historical markers and creating a walk throughout the City.

City Manager Witzansky reported there have been approximately 65 BRRs requested throughout this fiscal year.

Councilmember Kaluderovic asked for a brief discussion regarding celebrating June Pride Month and City Manager Witzansky reported it will be on an upcoming agenda.

Councilmember Kaluderovic requested BRRs to upgrade signals, ramps and modernize the poles and crosswalks at Beryl and Maria, ramps and additional improvements for the fourth crosswalk at the intersection of Inglewood and 182nd and the illuminated no-left turn signal on the southeast corner.

Councilmember Obagi referred a discussion on a letter in support of SB 867 (Drought, Flood, and Water Resilience, Wildfire and Forest Resilience, Coastal Resilience, Extreme Heat Mitigation, Biodiversity and Nature-Based Climate Solutions, Climate Smart Agriculture, Park Creation and Outdoor Access, and Clean Energy Bond Act of 2024), directed to the Assembly Natural Resources Committee and noted it could be a source of funds for seawall reconstruction.

Councilmember Behrendt spoke about the things that need to be done and suggested this item could be postponed to a later date and discussed in conjunction with other bills Council would consider in taking a position.

City Manager Witzansky noted that in the past, City Council has adopted a policy paper that identifies positions and if there is a bill of interest, staff can draft a letter, administratively, corresponding to the adopted policy principles.

Councilmember Behrendt commented on the need to focus on other matters, now.

Councilmember Obagi stated the bill will be voted on in July, 2024 and noted the need to move forward.

Councilmember Nehrenheim agreed.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to place on an upcoming agenda, a discussion on a letter in support of SB 867 (Drought, Flood, and Water Resilience, Wildfire and Forest Resilience, Coastal Resilience, Extreme Heat Mitigation, Biodiversity and Nature-Based Climate Solutions, Climate Smart Agriculture, Park Creation and Outdoor Access, and Clean Energy Bond Act of 2024), directed to the Assembly Natural Resources Committee and noted it could be a source of funds for seawall reconstruction.

There was brief discussion regarding clarification on whether such item should be brought back as a Consent Calendar or Discussion item and the concern regarding supporting and opposing bills.

Motion carried, 3-2. Councilmembers Behrendt and Kaluderovic were opposed.

Mayor Light suggested that Councilmember Behrendt work with the City Manager to develop a policy statement identifying City Council's positions.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to direct Councilmember Behrendt to work with the City Manager to develop a policy statement to identify City Council policy positions and present to the City Council with a recommendation for July or later.

Motion carried, 5-0.

**R. RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION - None**

**S. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION - None**

**T. ADJOURNMENT – 11:47 p.m.**

There being no further business to come before the City Council, motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and was approved by voice vote, to adjourn the meeting at 11:47 p.m., April 16, 2024, to an Adjourned Regular meeting to be held at 4:30 p.m. (Closed Session) and a Regular meeting to be held at 6:00 p.m. (Open Session) on Tuesday, April 23, 2024, in the Redondo Beach City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

Motion carried, 5-0.



All written comments submitted via eComment are included in the record and available for public review on the City website.

Respectfully submitted:

DocuSigned by:  
*Eleanor Manzano*  
72F2AC716C214CF...

---

Eleanor Manzano, CMC  
City Clerk