



Minutes
Redondo Beach City Council
Tuesday, May 20, 2025
Closed Session – Adjourned Regular Meeting 4:30 p.m.
Open Session – Regular Meeting 6:00 p.m.

4:30 PM - CLOSED SESSION – ADJOURNED REGULAR MEETING

A. CALL MEETING TO ORDER

An Adjourned Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 4:30 p.m. by Mayor Light in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

B. ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Waller, Castle, Kaluderovic, Obagi, Behrendt, Mayor Light

Councilmembers Absent: None

Officials Present: Mike Witzansky, City Manager
Joy Ford, City Attorney
Melissa Villa, Analyst

C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION - None

D. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS - None

E. PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS ON CLOSED SESSION ITEMS AND NON-AGENDA ITEMS

Analyst Villa reported no eComments and no one on Zoom.

F. RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION – 4:32 p.m.

F.1. CONFERENCE WITH REAL PROPERTY NEGOTIATOR - The Closed Session is authorized by the Government Code Section 54956.8.

AGENCY NEGOTIATOR:

Mike Witzansky, City Manager

Elizabeth Hause, Community Services Director

PROPERTY:

309 Esplanade, Redondo Beach, CA 90277

**NEGOTIATING PARTIES:
Made by Meg - Meg Walker**

**UNDER NEGOTIATION:
Both Price and Terms**

Analyst Villa read title to the item to be considered in Closed Session.

City Manager Witzansky announced that the following would be participating in Closed Session: City Manager Mike Witzansky, City Attorney Joy Ford, Assistant City Attorney Cheryl Park, Senior Deputy City Attorney Cristine Shin, Community Services Director Elizabeth Hause and Deputy Community Services Director Kelly Orta.

Motion by Councilmember Waller, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to recess to Closed Session at 4:32 p.m.

Motion carried 5-0 by voice vote.

G. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION

Mayor Light reconvened to Open Session at 6:02 p.m.

H. ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Waller, Castle, Kaluderovic, Obagi, Behrendt, Mayor Light

Councilmembers Absent: None

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk
Mike Witzansky, City Manager
Joy Ford, City Attorney
Laura Diaz, Deputy Records Mgmt. Coordinator/Sr.
Deputy City Clerk

I. ANNOUNCEMENT OF CLOSED SESSION ACTIONS

City Manager Witzansky stated there were no announcements that evening.

J. ADJOURN TO REGULAR MEETING

Motion by Councilmember Castle, seconded by Councilmember Waller, to adjourn to the regular meeting at 6:02 p.m.

Motion carried 5-0 by voice vote.

6:00 PM – OPEN SESSION – REGULAR MEETING

A. CALL TO ORDER

A Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 6:02 p.m. by Mayor Light in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

B. ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Waller, Castle, Kaluderovic, Obagi, Behrendt, Mayor Light

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk
Mike Witzansky, City Manager
Joy Ford, City Attorney
Laura Diaz, Deputy Records Mgmt. Coordinator/Sr. Deputy City Clerk

C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION

Mayor Light invited Veterans and Active Military to stand and be recognized for their service.

Hunter, 5th grader at Alta Vista Elementary School, led in the salute to the flag.

D. PRESENTATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/ANNOUNCEMENTS/AB 1234 TRAVEL EXPENSE REPORTS

D.1. MAYOR'S PROCLAMATION OF MAY 17-23, 2025 AS NATIONAL SAFE BOATING WEEK

Mayor Light announced the proclamation of May 17th through the 23rd as National Safe Boating Week; invited Commander Stephen Chick, Beach Cities Flotilla 12-05 Coast Guard Auxiliary, and Rick Horner, Public Affairs Staff Officer for Division 12 in Santa Monica, to join him at the podium; stated the City is proud to partner with the National Safe Boating Council, the US Coast Guard Auxiliary, and many others in recognizing National Safe Boating Week; stated that the week serves as an important reminder to the Redondo Beach community and visitors about the value of staying safe while enjoying recreational boating; explained that the Coast Guard Auxiliary is the uniformed volunteer civilian branch of the US Coast Guard and stated its primary mission is to promote recreational boating safety; stated both the Flotilla 12-05 and Division 12 are actively involved in offering boating and safety courses, free vessel safety checks, and community

outreach programs in collaboration with local marines and businesses in Redondo Beach.

Stephen Chick stated on behalf of Flotilla 12-05 Coast Guard Auxiliary and Division 12 Santa Monica Bay, they are honored, humbled, and greatly appreciative for Redondo Beach presenting these proclamations; gave more information and statistics on their mission to promote safe boating; mentioned alcohol use is the main known contributing factor in fatal boating accidents and detailed out other causes of accidents and deaths involved in boating; congratulated Captain Kurt Mahoney with his newest assignment as Harbor Master for King Harbor.

Rick Horner thanked the Mayor and Council for the honor.

Mayor Light presented the Proclamations to both Stephen Chick and Rick Horner.

D.2. MAYOR'S PROCLAMATION OF MAY 18-24, 2025 AS NATIONAL PUBLIC WORKS WEEK

Mayor Light asked Public Works Director Andy Winje to join him up at the podium; announced that Redondo Beach along with other communities across the country are recognizing National Public Works Week; stated the 2025 theme is "People, Purpose, and Presence", which highlights the core values that inspire Public Works professionals; noted that, even though it is behind the scenes, Public Works is always present; spoke more about their efforts in maintaining the City; stated tonight the City is thanking and celebrating the City's Public Works professionals in the part they play in the City's well-being.

Public Works Director Winje invited Deputy Director Mike Klein and City Engineer Lauren Sablan to join him and the Mayor at the podium; spoke about their importance to the department and stated he wanted to share this moment with them; gave some more details about the Public Works Department, including that it employs 25% of the City's full-time employees, manages over 100 projects and the City's capital improvement program worth about \$30 million in appropriations over the next year; spoke about how proud he is to work for the City.

Mayor Light presented the Proclamation on behalf of the residents, City Council, and as Mayor.

Councilmember Waller wanted to remind people that there will be a Memorial Day Ceremony at the Redondo Beach Veterans Memorial to honor past, present, and future veterans; announced the City's ceremony will be at 1:00 p.m. on Monday, May 26th at Veterans' Park followed by a BBQ at the Elks.

Councilmember Castle announced that on the 29th they will have a joint Community Meeting of District 2 and District 3 at the Library, on the second floor, starting at 5:30 p.m.

Councilmember Kaluderovic gave a shout out to the Redondo Beach PTA for putting on

a water safety event; mentioned that Captain Mahoney, LA County lifeguards, and the Coast Guard attended; stated it was an amazing event.

Councilmember Obagi reported he attended the RBF Gala with his wife; noted how much the Educational Foundation does for the City's School District; announced his Community Meeting will be Thursday, June 5th at the Perry Park Senior Center at 6:00 p.m.

Councilmember Behrendt wanted to remind everyone that the District 5 Community Meeting would be on Wednesday, May 28th at 6:00 p.m. at the Redondo Beach Performing Arts Center with Joy Ford as the special guest.

Mayor Light reported he attended a Cal Recycle hearing last week to appeal the closure of Dominguez Park; stated Director Winje, Director Hause and himself drove all the way to the hearing, waited, and the third member of the appeal hearing never showed up, so unfortunately, it must be rescheduled.

E. APPROVE ORDER OF AGENDA

City Manager Witzansky asked if staff could pull the contract listed under Item H.5; stated he would like to bring it back as a Consent Calendar item next month.

Motion by Councilmember Waller, seconded by Councilmember Castle, to approve the order of the agenda as modified.

The motion carried 5-0 by voice vote.

F. AGENCY RECESS - None

G. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS

G.1. For Blue Folder Documents Approved at the City Council Meeting

City Clerk Manzano reported Blue Folder Items for Items No. H.8, H.11, J.1, N.1, and N.2.

Motion by Councilmember Waller, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to receive and file Blue Folder Items.

Motion carried 5-0 by voice vote.

H. CONSENT CALENDAR

H.1. APPROVE AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING FOR THE CITY COUNCIL ADJOURNED AND REGULAR MEETING OF MAY 20, 2025

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

- H.2. APPROVE MOTION TO READ BY TITLE ONLY AND WAIVE FURTHER READING OF ALL ORDINANCES AND RESOLUTIONS LISTED ON THE AGENDA**

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

- H.3. APPROVE THE FOLLOWING CITY COUNCIL MINUTES: A. MAY 6, 2025 ADJOURNED AND REGULAR MEETING**

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

- H.4. PAYROLL DEMANDS**

CHECKS 30213-30233 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$25,159.90, PD. 5/9/25

DIRECT DEPOSIT 294634-295249 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$2,526,801.84, PD. 5/9/25

EFT/ACH \$9,310.73, PD. 5/9/25 (PP2510)

EFT/ACH \$466,153.43, PD. 5/19/25 (PP2509)

ACCOUNTS PAYABLE DEMANDS

CHECKS 119397-119694 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$3,307,595.84

REPLACEMENT DEMAND 119396

CONTACT: STEPHANIE MEYER, FINANCE DIRECTOR

- H.5. Pulled by City Manager Mike Witzansky.**

- H.6. EXCUSED ABSENCES FROM VARIOUS COMMISSION AND COMMITTEE MEETINGS**

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

- H.7. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH POWERPHONE, INC., DBA TOTAL RESPONSE, FOR THE PURCHASE AND IMPLEMENTATION OF EMERGENCY MEDICAL DISPATCH SOFTWARE FOR AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$98,923 AND THE TERM MAY 20, 2025 THROUGH JUNE 30, 2027, USING FUNDS PROVIDED BY THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNOR'S OFFICE OF EMERGENCY SERVICES**

CONTACT: JOE HOFFMAN, CHIEF OF POLICE

- H.8. APPROVE A MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING WITH THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY FOR THE USE OF PROPOSITION C 40% DISCRETIONARY - ZERO EMISSION TRANSIT CAPITAL PROGRAM - FUNDS BY THE BEACH CITIES TRANSIT SYSTEM FOR THE TERM OCTOBER 1, 2024 THROUGH JUNE 30, 2028**

CONTACT: ELIZABETH HAUSE, COMMUNITY SERVICES DIRECTOR

H.9. APPROVE A LESSOR AGREEMENT, SERVING AS AN ESTOPPEL FOR SUNRISE-HARBOR LTD., FOR THE REFINANCING OF THE REDONDO BEACH HOTEL

CONTACT: GREG KAPOVICH, WATERFRONT AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

H.10. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH FINLEY'S TREE & LANDCARE TO INSTALL IRRIGATION AND NEW LANDSCAPE MATERIALS IN THE CIVIC CENTER COURTYARD FOR A COST NOT TO EXCEED \$185,035

CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR

H.11. APPROVE THE SECOND AMENDMENT TO THE AGREEMENT WITH THE CITY OF HERMOSA BEACH TO INCREASE THE MONTHLY FEE TO THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH BY 10% EACH YEAR FOR THE NEXT FOUR YEARS AND THEN BY 5% EACH YEAR THEREAFTER FOR CITY PROSECUTION SERVICES

CONTACT: JOY A. FORD, CITY ATTORNEY

H.12. APPROVE THE AMENDMENT TO THE AGREEMENT WITH KARPEL COMPUTER SYSTEMS INC. DOING BUSINESS AS KARPEL SOLUTIONS FOR THE ADDITION OF AN EXTERNAL AGENCY PORTAL FOR AN ADDITIONAL AMOUNT OF \$9,000

CONTACT: JOY A. FORD, CITY ATTORNEY

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Waller, to approve the Consent Calendar items except H.5.

Mayor Light invited public comment.

City Clerk Manzano reported there was no one on Zoom and no eComments.

Motion carried 5-0 by voice vote.

I. EXCLUDED CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS - None

J. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

J.1. For eComments and Emails Received from the Public

Ray Lawson, Western States Regional Council of Carpenters, Local 562, wanted to remind City Council, Mayor and the City Manager about wage theft, or the subcontractor

disclosure ordinance; stated they have worked with other cities and have come to agreements with the city managers and city councils of those cities; explained what the subcontractor disclosure ordinance does; noted there is a lot of building going on in Redondo Beach and asked if there is any type of tracking or accountability for workers being paid in cash or on workers being misclassified; noted that often times no one knows what the workers are being paid, whether they are being taxed, and if the cities are missing out on the benefits; reported that wage theft runs rampant in California and contractors will bring in out-of-state or immigrant workers and take advantage of them; stated that his organization is trying to protect the work and workers and maintain a livable wage; spoke about wanting to have the discussion with the City of Redondo Beach and introduce the ordinance so contractors would have to report whether they have violated the law and committed wage theft and tax fraud; asked for transparency and stated he has information to email to Council and staff.

Jim Mueller spoke about the AACAP and its purpose of creating improvements along Artesia; noted the AACAP is four and a half years old (which does not reflect a sense of urgency), needs voter approval (asked when that would be happening), and stated much of the AACAP will require money that will depend on the City's general fund and the Galleria's impact fees and opined those would not be available to use; mentioned that three art projects are moving forward and paid for by John Parsons, along the Aviation and Artesia corridor; spoke about one of the beneficial changes recommended by AACAP is establishing a business improvement district on Artesia, and mentioned that a small group of citizens tried to explore that but the City has offered no support; stated that the area is filled with people wanting to buy goods and services and asked why the City doesn't think of more simple ideas to make it happen; stated the NRBBA sponsors an event called Dine-around and spoke of its success and recommended a public market in the green space; mentioned Rick McQuillin's development of a social media app that would connect residents with businesses on Artesia and asked why the City does not help him make it happen; recommended the City set smaller goals and move forward now with action.

Pedro Huerta, Western States Regional Council of Carpenters, mentioned his local covers from Huntington Beach to the airport; wanted to make sure the Council was aware of their organization; explained that they are trying to prevent wage theft from happening and trying to protect workers from lack of good wages and benefits; mentioned there are cases where workers and their families are living at the job sites; reported they offer state approved apprenticeship programs and stated that is how he started.

German Harman stated he is also with the union and a part of the South Bay Carpenters; wanted to share that he went through the apprenticeship program and it changed his life; spoke about the mentor program and how they want to impact other people's lives; stated that they all came there to support their cause and extend their help to the City.

City Clerk Manzano reported no eComments or anyone on Zoom.

K. EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS - None

L. PUBLIC HEARINGS - None

M. ITEMS CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS AGENDAS - None

N. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION PRIOR TO ACTION

N.1. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE DIRECTION ON THE PROPOSED SECOND AMENDMENT TO THE CITY'S SOLID WASTE HANDLING SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH ATHENS SERVICES TO MODIFY RATE STRUCTURES, CERTAIN SOLID WASTE PROGRAMS, AND OTHER TERMS OF THE AGREEMENT

CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR

City Manager Witzansky introduced the item; stated they are not seeking any specific action, they are seeking direction on the proposed amendment to the City's solid waste handling services; noted that Athens Services is the largest vendor agreement for the City year over year for the past 15 years (since 2011); stated they are an outstanding hauler for the City and have been very responsive to service demands; reported the industry is changing and are required to bring this forward; turned the floor over to Public Works Director Andy Winje.

Public Works Director Winje explained how complicated and highly regulated the waste industry has become; narrated a PowerPoint presentation which included:

- Athens Services – Solid Waste Handling Services Agreement Proposed Second Amendment – last amendment was in 2019
- Current Agreement
 - o Annual contract value: \$15.6 million – includes \$5.25 million City pass through
 - o Contract duration - timeline
 - July 1, 2011 – City Agreement w/ Athens
 - July 1, 2019 – First Amendment to Agreement
 - June 30, 2028 – End of Term
 - June 30, 2030 – 24-month potential extension
 - o Current rates are competitive
 - o Showed a list of rates for the surrounding cities
 - o Redondo Beach FY 24-25 – Residential: \$29.78 / Commercial: \$253.44
 - o Included Services & Community Benefits – showed a list of all the benefits beyond pick up.
- Industry Changes & State Mandates
 - o Secondary market impacts
 - o SERRF closure/diversion reduction

- Three-stream requirement

Councilmember Behrendt asked if there was a prospect of additional facilities certified by the state coming online that would provide the sorting in the next five or so years.

Public Works Director Winje reported that the state is not providing any and they would rely on the industry to provide it; mentioned Athens representatives are in the audience and also a consultant for the contract, HF&H; hoped Athens could shed some light on it later in the evening; continued on with the presentation.

- Key Proposed Amendments
 - Noted a few are listed on the presentation but a full list has been provided to Council in the staff report
 - Rate structure adjustment
 - Optional scout service – small vehicle that pulls the dumpsters out of spaces
 - SB 1383 program changes
 - Exclusive Roll-Off service
 - Term Extension
 - CY 2025 – Execute Second Amendment
 - June 30, 2035 – Term Second Amendment
 - June 30, 2040 – First Optional Extension
 - June 20, 2045 – Second Optional Extension
- Prop 218 Requirements
 - Required for changes to rate methodology
 - Required for MFR and Commercial accounts in this case
 - Mail in Ballot
 - Majority Protest Hearing for adoption by Council
 - New rates allowed only upon adoption
 - Estimate 3 months to complete Prop 218 process
 - Requires proposed new rate schedule to begin Prop 218
- Recommendation
 - Discuss and provide direction on:
 - Proposed amendment topics
 - Additional information to be requested
 - Process and next steps

Sharon Shapiro Fox, Vice President of Government Affairs for Athens Services, stated she is joined by her colleague, John Bierly, area President for Athens; noted that Athens is a local and family owned business; gave weekly service numbers and spoke of Athens knowing the Redondo Beach community better than any other City provider; noted that the additional services that Athens provides to the City are unprecedented and hoped that the City recognizes those benefits and pointed out that they are big cost savings to the City; listed external and unfunded mandates that have changed the industry; reported in 2024, SERRF (South East Resource Recovery Facility), the only remaining

transformation facility in the greater Los Angeles and Southern California region, was closed and the difficulty in complying with the new 2025 diversion requirements due to the closure; reported that SP 1383 is why it was important for them to go to a three-stream collection.

Sharon Shapiro-Fox wanted to answer Councilmember Behrendt's question regarding the prospect of additional facilities certified by the state coming online that would provide the sorting in the next five or so years; explained everyone in the industry is going to the three-stream model; noted the challenge is the Cal Recycle is requiring three quarters consecutive for certification and that is difficult to achieve so they used the three-stream model as the solution.

Councilmember Behrendt asked what percentage increase Athens is proposing.

Sharon Shapiro-Fox stated they have proposed some bundled service rates; mentioned they have a proposed rate sheet, and they can share that as they get further along.

John Bierly joined Ms. Shapiro-Fox at the podium; stated they are not proposing an increase for all residents just for multi-family (greater than five units) and commercial customers; stated they are proposing a commercial rate and everything else would be based off of usage; stated their goal is to "right-size" the customers.

More discussion followed. Councilmember Behrendt re-clarified the question and asked what Athens is proposing to increase their rates on a net basis.

John Bierly responded that it is tough to answer since it varies from customer to customer.

Councilmember Behrendt stated he didn't get an answer to his question but they can move on.

Councilmember Obagi asked for clarification on the Scout Service and "right-size" concept.

John Bierly explained the Scout Service as a smaller vehicle that pulls the commercial bins/dumpsters out for the larger trash vehicles to pick them up and dump; then explained the "right-size" concept means a team goes out and meets with every customer and does a trash assessment; explained by doing the "right-size" method they can offset the customers' recycling cost by reducing the trash cost.

More discussion followed regarding rates and what is provided in the rates and how the new mandates have forced them to increase costs; Athens explained they were trying to impact the customers that are directly affected (multi-family and commercial) and not those that are not directly affected (single family/less than 5 units residential) by the new mandates; Athens explained that residential units up to 4 units normally use the bins but the 5 units or more and commercial units use the larger containers (dumpsters).

Councilmember Obagi asked why the City doesn't just add an amendment to their current agreement to include the new service to 5 units and greater that was not previously being offered.

Sharon Shapiro-Fox answered the challenge is, in order to run the recycling program to that third stream, Athens needs to add capital and as part of SB 1383 there is some extensive ongoing requirements; adding the cost to amortize that program over the remaining term of the existing agreement would be very significant; stated Athens was asked to look for an option to run the recycling program enhancement and distribute that cost between commercial and multifamily; noted another option would have been to increase cost about 13.5% for all commercial businesses and all multifamily customers.

Councilmember Castle stated, in terms of compliance and the closing of the facility and the City's percentage split in the stream, it looks like the entire cost of that is going to be borne by 788 customers, including bin fees and increases in their rates from residential to commercial.

John Bierly stated that current residents are already using the three-stream and will not be impacted; reported that the commercial and multifamily (greater than 5) accounts will be impacted.

More discussion followed.

Councilmember Waller mentioned the Prop 218 ballots and asked if it is the 788 customers or is it 788 plus the commercial customers.

Public Works Director Winje stated it would be the latter because the commercial bundling is new and that is a new change in the rate methodology; mentioned that the 788 customers are about 12,000 households.

Councilmember Waller asked what the estimated cost is to send, collect, and count all the ballots.

Andrea Delap, Senior Analyst, stated, as Director Winje said earlier, the City went through the Prop 218 process last year but it was for the whole community; noted that they have a very good estimate from last year and the endeavor cost the City \$39,000.

Sharon Shapiro-Fox mentioned if Council looked at the staff report it does note a \$20,000 financial impact cost and stated Athens would cover that cost; added that their purpose tonight was to get some direction from Council with respect to moving forward and becoming compliant with SP 1383 and to do so at the minimal rate impact to the rate payer; reiterated that the significant impacts to the industry were unfunded, external regulation and their hope is to work with the City for the protection of the City and the rate-payers.

Mayor Light asked what capital investment they are amortizing.

John Bierly stated it is based on a couple of things: 1) they will need to purchase additional vehicles to handle the recycling since they do need to separate that commodity and to take it to the processing facility, and 2) they have bins, carts, etc. that need to be amortized as well.

Sharon Shapiro-Fox went over numbers from both commercial and residential bins in 2024, stating Athens collected over 52,036 tons (to give Council an idea of the volume of material they are moving); noted their goal is to divert as much away from landfill as possible; noted the other component to going to a three-stream is that the quality and content of what they receive as part of a source separated program is higher and more superior than a mixed-waste processing facility.

More discussion followed on how they amortize the cost and the locked in term of the agreement being a benefit.

Councilmember Obagi asked if the agreement extends the rates that the City currently has or if there is an escalator built in.

John Bierly stated currently as part of the plan there is an escalator every year, a weighted average of multiple items.

City Manager Witzansky added that it is a combination of pre-negotiated indices; stated that assuming the City uses a similar structure that they have today they would know how the adjustment formula would work going forward; noted they need to see the exact proposed rate structure under this format; stated there is an inverse relationship between term and the initial cost for the rate change; spoke of needing direction from Council; asked if the City is comfortable exploring the seven-year term extension up against their current three years or does Council want to see an alternative of that; clarified that tonight the construct is to direct this rate change to the customers who are experiencing the service change and stated the alternative is to amortize the rate change to all residents and absorb, collectively, with more moderate change to all households; stated this is a Council policy decision.

Councilmember Obagi noted that Athens has been a tremendous partner for the City; asked for slide 2B on the screen and stated he sent out an email to his constituents and neighbors asking for their impression of Athens; reported he received a 97% satisfaction rate from those who responded, with 44% being highly satisfied and 52.9% being satisfied; spoke of being comfortable moving forward with Athens without looking at competitors but noted that there are a lot of items that Athens flagged in the contract that they want to change; stated he has a lot of questions and submitted it as a Blue Folder item; asked to hear from HF&H and wanted to know what the scope of their retention was and also why the City has no work product from them.

Senior Analyst Delap interjected to introduce the HF&H consultants and stated Lindsay Lagos, Project Manager, and Haley Kunert, Senior Project Manager, were online;

reported that when HF&H were brought on about 12 months ago, they were asked to look at a very different draft proposal and explained what they were asked to do for the City; added that HF&H were not asked to look at rate structures or the additional terms presented tonight but would be happy to assist if Council so directed.

Haley Kunert explained that HF&H are a solid waste and recycling consulting firm and only work with municipal agencies; stated they support jurisdictions with processes like the one they are going through with Athens; explained further that they can do rate analysis, rate impact, and support cities with complying with state regulations and any other contract management and monitoring of those contracts.

Councilmember Obagi thanked Haley Kunert for her explanation; focused back on his questions regarding the changes in the contract with Athens; referred to the liquidated damages provisions and spoke of Redondo Beach being windy and trash flying around and the need for it to be picked up; spoke of HF&H working with Athens on the amended agreement and giving the City advice whether the terms of the agreement are in line with industry standards.

City Manager Witzansky pointed out that HF&H are waiting on information and the City is on the precipice of receiving the proposed rate structure from Athens which is all needed to move forward.

Mayor Light agreed that there are a lot of terms in the new agreement that they have not discussed tonight; explained what the Council needs to have a better understanding and comparison to move forward.

Councilmember Kaluderovic agreed with the Mayor's assessment and felt that the information given wasn't "apples to apples" and asked for better comparisons the next time this item is discussed; asked if the HF&H contract needed to be extended or a new one drawn up.

City Manager Witzansky stated that the contract will need to be extended but they have money in the Solid Waste fund that will cover it; mentioned it will be a minor amendment to the contract and should be easy but will depend on what the City is asking them to compare.

Councilmember Kaluderovic referred to the three-stream method and asked what happens to the City's current trash cans and do they need to be changed.

Haley Kunert responded by stating the City does not need to change the public sector cans or the ones in the public space.

Councilmember Kaluderovic asked if that included City Hall and the School Districts.

Sharon Shapiro-Fox reported that Athens has already started to work with City Hall and the School Districts in moving to a three-stream.

Councilmember Kaluderovic shared some thoughts regarding the multi-unit commercial and residential buildings being more work than most and hoped to discuss this more at another time.

Councilmember Behrendt agreed with all the comments and questions from Council; stated since it is the largest contract the City has with anyone that it will require more attention; stated that they will need straight answers from Athens so they can make the decisions needed; asked what specific work product and direction HF&H would need from the City.

Discussion followed on what HF&H requires and what they will be able to do.

Lindsay Lagos felt everything the City is asking for is in HF&H's wheelhouse to provide; noted that what the City is asking for in this instance is contingent upon getting the information and data they need and discussing the timeframe the City is expecting or that Athens is requesting from HF&H.

Discussion followed on the timeframe, compliance, and the need to be quick.

Mayor Light asked Sharon Shapiro-Fox when they need the results from Prop 218.

Both Sharon Shapiro-Fox and City Manager Witzansky explained to the Council what needs to happen but ultimately it needs to be a Fall roll out, which means they need the results in July or August.

Councilmember Behrendt felt they still do not have enough data or information to make a decision on the agreement.

Councilmember Waller mentioned his residents are very supportive of Athens and appreciated the level of service Athens provides; stated he would like to see a longer term agreement if given the choice and explained why.

Councilmember Obagi asked HF&H what their thoughts are on applying cost increases to only those affected or to the overall community.

Haley Kunert responded by saying that is up to the City's decision and preference.

More discussion ensued.

Councilmember Obagi reported that sometimes it takes 10 or more meetings in Closed Session for Council to make a decision; suggested that Athens get them the data they need asap to have the discussions and make a decision.

Mayor Light suggested that Council use Councilmember Obagi's list as a starting point for discussion items for the agreement.

City Manager Witzansky mentioned there is another option and that would be, to share any input with City staff directly so they have an opportunity to work it into their calculus.

Mayor Light invited public comment.

Mara Santos, CEO for the Redondo Beach Chamber of Commerce, spoke in support of Athens services for post amendment; explained why she felt that way including how involved Athens is in the community.

City Clerk Manzano reported no one on Zoom and no eComments.

N.2. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPROVAL OF THE CITY'S COYOTE MANAGEMENT AND RESPONSE PLAN

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2505-030, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING THE COYOTE MANAGEMENT AND RESPONSE PLAN AND MAKING A DETERMINATION FOR EXEMPTION UNDER CEQA

PURSUANT TO THE PLAN, DIRECT STAFF TO PROCURE ON-CALL (AS NEEDED) TRAPPING SERVICES

CONTACT: JANE CHUNG, ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER

City Manager Witzansky thanked Jane Chung for all her work in getting this plan together.

Mayor Light gave some background on the item and why he requested it.

Jane Chung, Assistant to the City Manager, provided a PowerPoint presentation which included:

- Background
 - o 2024: approximately 120 coyote sightings reported
 - o 2025 YTD: 35 coyote sightings reported
 - o No city has effectively eliminated or reduced coyote populations
 - o Certain coyote-human response actions are legally prohibited
 - o CA Dept of Fish & Wildlife rarely allows relocation due to risks
 - o Captured coyotes must be released on site or euthanized within 24 hours
 - o Coyotes have a nature fear of humans
 - o LA County reports fewer than 10 coyote attacks per year
 - o Only two recorded fatal coyote attacks in the US and Canada
- Plan Overview – stated Manhattan Beach, Palos Verde Estates and Torrance have developed response plans to address coyote activity
 - o Balance wildlife preservation with public safety
 - o Four-pronged approach:

- Ensure safe community spaces
 - Enhance deterrence efforts
 - Foster public education
 - Actively monitor coyote activity
- Coyote Management and Response Matrix
 - Tiered response framework
 - Response based on encounter type
 - Goal to minimize interactions and ensure public safety
 - Internal planning
 - Staff developed an internal response workflow map
- CEQA Exemption
 - Adoption of the Coyote Management and Response Plan is exempt from CEQA
 - Exemption under Sections 15061(b)(3) and 15308 of the CEQA Guideline
- On-Call Trapping Services
 - City consults with the CA Dept of Fish & Wildlife for necessary trapping
 - It is recommended City engage a certified on-call trapper
 - Estimated cost: \$1,500 per coyote
- Recommendations
 - Staff recommends Council adopt Resolution No. CC 2505-030
 - Direct staff to procure on-call (as needed) trapping services

City Manager Witzansky thanked Marc Wiener for assisting in identifying Michael Baker and providing a cost effective review of this plan; noted without the City clearing CEQA, they would not have the ability to formally trap coyotes, if necessary; stated the CEQA adoption is critical and mentioned the on-call trapping services is important for the City to have to respond and react.

Councilmember Waller felt the education part of the presentation was the most important detail; asked if there is a matrix that can show the number of sightings.

City Manager Witzansky reported that the City does have a tool to take reported sightings and put them into their CAD database and it will map the incidents so they can monitor.

Chief Hoffman explained in more detail the ability to track reported sightings in their CAD system; stated on the Police webpage they have created a coyote portal and explained the color-coding system.

Councilmember Waller asked the City Attorney about the liabilities and risks to having the plan.

City Attorney Ford stated there are always risks but this plan helps the City take action

and protects the community.

Mayor Light noted that without the CEQA analysis they could not have a response plan and this gives the City the basic tools to react; mentioned an Instagram post the Police department produced that gave really good information on coyote sightings.

Chief Hoffman stated one of their MSOs, Marco Garcia, produced the video and he is part of the animal control unit.

Councilmember Obagi thanked staff for putting this plan together.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Waller, to adopt by title only Resolution No. CC 2505-030 and to direct staff to procure on-call, as needed, trapping services.

Councilmember Obagi offered a friendly amendment making a determination for exemption under CEQA.

Councilmember Kaluderovic accepted the friendly amendment.

Mayor Light invited public comment.

City Clerk Manzano reported no eComments and no hands raised on Zoom.

Motion carried 5-0 by voice vote.

City Clerk Manzano read to adopt by title only Resolution No. CC 2505-030.

Motion by Councilmember Behrendt, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to take a five minute recess.

Motion carried 5-0 by voice vote. Recess at 7:55 p.m.

Meeting resumed at 8:02 p.m.

Roll Call

Councilmembers Present: Waller, Castle, Kaluderovic, Obagi, Behrendt, Mayor Light

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk
Mike Witzansky, City Manager
Stephanie Meyer, Finance Director

N.3. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE CITY MANAGER'S PROPOSED FISCAL YEAR 2025-2026 BUDGET AND FIVE-YEAR CAPITAL

IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

RECEIVE AND FILE THE PROPOSED BUDGET AND FIVE-YEAR CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM DOCUMENTS AND SET JUNE 3, 2025 AS THE DATE TO CONDUCT A PUBLIC HEARING ON THE FISCAL YEAR 2025-26 BUDGET AND 2025-2030 CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

CONTACT: STEPHANIE MEYER, FINANCE DIRECTOR

City Manager Witzansky stated he will be presenting the proposed annual FY 2025-26 Budget and 5-Year CIP; noted that although they feature a 5-year CIP, only the first year appropriations are actually adopted and approved by Council as part of the budget;; thanked Stephanie Meyer and Erin Smith along with all the department heads for assisting with the Budget; stated they are using a new format and used Open.gov as a platform and will continue to change the document to make it better; presented a PowerPoint which included:

- Budget Overview
 - o Budget Themes
 - Employee compensation costs
 - New technology programs and online services
 - Training, health, and wellness
 - Critical public safety and public works programs
 - Measure FP implementation
 - CalPERS Unfunded Accrued Liability

Councilmember Behrendt asked if there is anything Council can do to influence the UAL number (which City Manager Witzansky reported is roughly at \$3.4 million per year) and bring it lower for the City.

City Manager Witzansky mentioned, at some point, the City might want to look at refinancing that figure; noted that if the discount rate and the municipal bond rate is 2% or greater there may be value in the City fixing that cost.

- Uncertain economic future – mentioned the tariffs as an example.
- o General Fund Summaries – provided a slide with Proposed FY 2025-26 Budget; explained the summary.
 - General Fund balance before Decision Packages \$1,427,079
 - Total estimated year-end fund balance after recommendations \$42,906
 - General Fund Revenues – provided a slide with columns for: Revenue Type, Proposed FY 2025-26 and Increase/Decrease over Midyear FY

Councilmember Behrendt asked what the City could do to help the hotels and gain more

revenue from TOT.

City Manager Witzansky stated more advertising or marketing of the City, keeping the City clean and attractive so more people want to come to Redondo Beach; mentioned that the City has already assisted by creating the Tourism Improvement District (TID) and that once Legado comes online in the fall the City will see significant revenue growth from that site.

Councilmember Obagi interjected that Rebecca Elder asked for an increase to some sort of a fee that the tourism district was charging to the hotels.

City Manager Witzansky reported currently the TID is allowed to assess a 1% surcharge for the purposes of marketing and is generating roughly \$700K to \$800K per year to use towards marketing; spoke about the correlation with that surcharge and the TOT rates and it is something they can discuss and explore further; continued with his presentation.

- General Fund Expenditures – provided a slide with columns for: Personnel, Maintenance & Operations, Internal Services, Capital Outlay and Transfers Out.
- Subtotal Expenditures: \$108,322,823
- Total Expenditures & Transfers Out: \$123,449,820
- Decision Packages & Other Items
 - Additional Payments & Sources of Funds
 - Decision Packages

Discussion followed regarding the reserves, UAL and PERS.

- Capital Projects Summary
 - FY 2025-26 – New and Carryover – Total = \$93.9 million / Total # of projects = 104
 - FY 2024-25 – Amount spent \$18.3 million / Projects completed = 22 / Designed & Awarded = 17
- Budget Calendar – All advertised
 - May 20th – Budget & CIP Introduction
 - June 3rd – Operations Focus
 - June 10th – CIP Focus
 - June 12^h – Budget & Finance Commission
 - June 17th – Budget & CIP Adoption
- Recommendations
 - 1) Receive and file the budget presentation
 - 2) Provide direction on the preparation of additional BRRs (45 currently) – suggested no more BRRs after the June 3rd meeting.
 - 52 Decision Packages, 35 related to the GF
 - 7 Categories historically for Decision Packages but this year

they did not deploy the Commissions/Citizens category since it seemed to be consistent with criteria already received.

Mayor Light appreciated all the work they put into the budget proposal; noticed there is not too much in the discretionary fund and wondered how they would get to all the BRRs; asked with Measure FP if that frees up any funds the City would have used on maintenance of the facilities.

City Manager Witzansky said it is reflected in the recommendations and those funds will be used towards the shooting range.

Councilmember Behrendt thanked City staff; asked about the City's investment portfolio which has roughly \$100 million and asked what their return is and where is that captured in the budget.

City Manager Witzansky deferred that question to Finance Director Stephanie Meyer.

Finance Director Meyer stated it is about \$1 million in the General Fund for FY 2024-25 and projected a bit less for the next FY because of the uncertainty of the market; noted that the information can be found in the General Fund categories under the "Use of Money and Property" category and explained what is under that category.

More discussion followed and noted they may need to wait for the City Treasurer to be present.

Councilmember Castle mentioned the Budget & Finance Commission had worked on CalPERS' liability and CalPERS' assets and asked if it was possible to get the table from that presentation.

City Manager Witzansky stated they can create a BRR for that.

Councilmember Obagi thanked City staff for what they have already accomplished; voiced a concern he had, referenced page 12 of the Budget, regarding how the City could increase the revenue side and noted it does not include discussion of increasing the TOT; referenced BRR 50 of last year's budget that spoke of discussion of raising TOT and can not recall that they did that; felt they are missing out on that this year.

City Manager Witzansky stated that he did not want to be redundant by mentioning that concept again but stated those are always initiatives Council can pursue.

Councilmember Obagi mentioned the inability to work with the School District in sharing some costs.

More discussion ensued.

Councilmember Obagi spoke about the option to put meters on Herondo; asked for slide

2B to be put up on the screen which featured a video on the metered area and the free parking areas; stated that the free parking is normally full but no one parks at the meters and felt that if they metered the free parking area it would bring revenue to the City.

Discussion followed regarding the area on Herondo that was mentioned by Councilmember Obagi.

Councilmember Behrendt mentioned they should get input from the District 2 Councilmember since it affects their district.

More discussion followed and City Manager Witzansky mentioned they could easily bring back the BRR on that item.

Mayor Light invited public comment.

Laura MacMorran, Redondo Beach resident, referenced the Legado area and mentioned it has 700 linear feet of frontage; stated it has zero street trees and offers 40 linear feet of the most pathetic parkway landscaping ever planted; noted that between PCH and Torrance a person can enjoy a pleasant walk with trees, landscape and buffering between residences and vehicles; stated that the renderings for the Legado project featured lovely landscape and beautiful trees; asked that Council make this problem right; spoke of Redondo having two futures: 1) shrink its tree canopy or 2) use public dollars to fund tree plantings; asked them to reject both those futures and instead use the tax dollars wisely going forward; asked that immediate action be taken to fix the frontage on PV and PCH.

City Manager Witzansky stated that the sentiment is shared, and it is a temporary condition; reported that the parkway trees will be installed and stated Caltrans asked the developer to hold off on their installation because of their project which would have required relocation of the trees.

More discussion followed regarding tree installations.

Mara Santos, acting President for the Redondo Beach Chamber of Commerce, stated she is there on behalf of the RB Chamber of Commerce leadership and Board of Directors asking for Council's consideration for additional fee waivers for the Super Bowl 10K; mentioned in the past the Super Bowl 10K was part of a signature event for the City and it no longer is but the fees have continued to increase for them and they are asking for additional fee waivers to combat the additional fees.

Eugene Solomon (via Zoom), Redondo Beach City Treasurer, wanted to answer Councilmember Behrendt's questions; reported that the return on investment portfolio is about \$1.5 million and of that 60% goes to the General Fund and 40% goes into a pool of funds; stated the City strictly follows the policy guidelines of their investment policy mentioning liquidity and safety are the most important and then yield; reported their benchmark and rate of return is affected greatly by investments that were made several years ago and mentioned some of the long-term duration risk are affecting their overall

portfolio returns; noted that when opportunities present themselves to look at yield they will do so.

City Clerk Manzano reported no one online and no one on Zoom.

Mayor Light asked if anyone wanted to present any BRRs.

Councilmember Waller asked for a BRR on light pole banner hardware replacement in the Riviera Village.

Motion by Councilmember Waller, seconded by Councilmember Castle, to receive and file the City Manager's proposed Fiscal Year 2025-2026 Budget and Five-year Capital Improvement Program.

Motion carried 5-0 by voice vote.

O. CITY MANAGER ITEMS - None

P. MAYOR AND COUNCIL ITEMS – None

Q. MAYOR AND COUNCIL REFERRALS TO STAFF

Mayor Light mentioned reviewing the military reserves pay, policy and process and wanted to confirm that the City Manager did not need a referral for that.

City Manager Witzansky stated he thinks consistency is needed between the City's MOUs and ordinance; stated he spoke to City Attorney Ford about it and they will reconcile it; spoke of inconsistencies in the old code language versus what they are doing as a matter of course and practice in MOUs in compliance with state and federal law.

Motion by Councilmember Waller, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to discuss with staff regarding the Riviera Village parking requirements for new businesses.

Councilmember Castle asked Councilmember Waller for clarification on the referral.

Councilmember Waller said his understanding is that the parking requirements were relaxed significantly for specific types of businesses and it affects the mix of businesses in the Village; mentioned originally it was used to encourage restaurants but the Riviera Village Association is concerned that the mix is not as expected and would like to go back to how it was before or find a solution that helps bring back the right mix of businesses.

More discussion followed regarding how Covid changed the requirements and now need to restore some balance.

Councilmember Behrendt asked Councilmember Waller if he has discussed this with the Mayor, City Manager or anyone else on Council.

Councilmember Waller stated he spoke to the Mayor and the City Manager.

More discussion followed as to the feasibility of this referral.

Motion carried 5-0 by voice vote.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Behrendt, to have a discussion on whether to implement the Paramedic Assessment Fee that was discussed at the last budget.

City Manager Witzansky clarified the item in more detail; stated it requires a contract and they can certainly have a discussion regarding the contract.

More discussion ensued.

Motion carried 5-0 by voice vote.

Councilmember Behrendt mentioned the fireworks show and stated the traffic was terrible and asked if there is a way for City staff to work with other cities to alleviate the traffic flow from that event.

City Manager Witzansky mentioned that he is working with Hermosa Beach already on the issue.

R. RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION

R.1. CONFERENCE WITH REAL PROPERTY NEGOTIATOR - The Closed Session is authorized by the Government Code Section 54956.8.

AGENCY NEGOTIATOR:

Mike Witzansky, City Manager

Elizabeth Hause, Community Services Director

PROPERTY:

309 Esplanade, Redondo Beach, CA 90277

NEGOTIATING PARTIES:

Made by Meg - Meg Walker

UNDER NEGOTIATION:

Both Price and Terms

S. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION - None

T. ADJOURNMENT – 9:09 p.m.

There being no further business to come before the City Council, motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Waller, to adjourn the meeting at 9:09 p.m. to an Adjourned Regular meeting to be held at 4:30 p.m. (Closed Session) and a Regular meeting to be held at 6:00 p.m. (Open Session) on Tuesday, June 3, 2025, in the Redondo Beach City Hall Council Chamber, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

The motion carried 5-0 by voice vote.

All written comments submitted via eComment are included in the record and available for public review on the City website.

Respectfully submitted:

Eleanor Manzano, CMC
City Clerk