



Administrative Report

J.1., File # PA24-1809

Meeting Date: 11/13/2024

TO: PUBLIC AMENITIES COMMISSION

FROM: STEVEN GIANG, SENIOR PLANNER

TITLE

A PUBLIC HEARING CONSIDERING AN EXEMPTION DECLARATION AND CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS FOR THE REHABILITATION OF FIVE RESIDENTIAL STRUCTURES LOCATED WITHIN A DESIGNATED HISTORIC DISTRICT, PURSUANT TO CHAPTER 4, TITLE 10 OF THE REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE

APPLICANT: DAVID KAPLAN, KAPLAN CHEN KAPLAN

ADDRESS: **216 - 218 N. CATALINA AVENUE**

APPLICATION NO: COA-2024-04/COA-2024-05

RECOMMENDATION:

1. Open public hearing and administer oath;
2. Take testimony from staff, applicant, and interested parties;
3. Close public hearing and deliberate; and
4. Adopt a resolution by title only approving the request subject to the findings and conditions contained therein:

A RESOLUTION OF THE PUBLIC AMENITIES COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA APPROVING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE REHABILITATION OF THREE RESIDENTIAL STRUCTURES IN A DESIGNATED HISTORIC DISTRICT, AND ADOPTING AN EXEMPTION DECLARATION FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 216 NORTH CATALINA AVENUE PURSUANT TO THE REQUIREMENTS OF CHAPTER 4, TITLE 10 OF THE REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE

A RESOLUTION OF THE PUBLIC AMENITIES COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA APPROVING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE REHABILITATION OF TWO RESIDENTIAL STRUCTURES IN A DESIGNATED HISTORIC DISTRICT, AND ADOPTING AN EXEMPTION DECLARATION FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 218 NORTH CATALINA AVENUE PURSUANT TO THE REQUIREMENTS OF CHAPTER 4, TITLE 10 OF THE REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The applicant is requesting that the Public Amenities Commission approve Certificate of Appropriateness applications for the rehabilitation of five residential structures within a designated historic district located at 216 to 218 North Catalina Avenue. The proposed project includes the rehabilitation of the exterior materials of each of the buildings, the replacement of non-original windows, upgrades to the roof structures, and the installation of new mechanical equipment.

BACKGROUND

Description of the Properties

The designated historic district includes five detached structures on two legal lots. The property is located on the east side of North Catalina Avenue, between Diamond and Carnelian Streets. The property is zoned R-3A, low-density multi-family residential.

The property at 216 N. Catalina Avenue includes a Craftsman two-story apartment building at the front of the site, and two detached one-story cottages located at the rear (east) of the site. The property at 218 N. Catalina Avenue includes a one-story Queen Anne style duplex at the front of the site and a two-story apartment building at the rear (east) of the site.

The Preservation Commission designated the North Catalina Historic District on September 6, 1995. The properties were identified as including pre-1895 structures and part of the early development of the City. The properties are located within the original downtown corridor and were within walking distance of the original wharves. Please note that the two-story apartment building located at the rear of the 218 property was built around 1959 and is not historically designated.

216 N. Catalina Avenue

The two-story Craftsman apartment building has four units ranging in size from approximately 900 to 1,100 square feet. The project proposes interior remodeling which would not affect the exterior features of the building. Floor plans were provided in the architectural drawings for reference (see attached Architectural Drawings). The scope of the work for this building includes repainting the stucco, cleaning and painting the horizontal siding, refurbishing the exterior stairs and railings, and painting the existing chimneys. The North Elevation shown on Sheet A204 identifies four non-original windows (noted as "D") that are proposed to be replaced with historically accurate wood openings. The openings would also have wood trim to match the other existing openings. The South Elevation

on Sheet A205 identifies three non-original openings that are proposed to be replaced with historically accurate wood openings. Again, the openings would have wood trim to match the other existing openings. The Site Plan on Sheet A004, shows the proposed rooftop mechanical equipment. The equipment is proposed to be screened with wood slat fencing with a wood cap. The woodwork is to be similar to and painted in the same color as the existing front porch siding.

The two detached rear cottages are approximately 500 to 600 square feet in size. Per the application materials provided (see attached Application), the cottages were built at the front of the property first and then moved to the rear of the site around 1913 to make space for the two-story apartment. The scope of work includes replacing deteriorated wood siding as needed, painting the siding, refurbishing existing windows, refurbishing the exterior stairs/railings, replacing the roof at the south cottage with brown shingles, and installing new mechanical equipment in front of each cottage. Due to reduced existing setbacks around the cottages, the placement of equipment in front of the cottages was the most practical proposal. Both of the mechanical equipment installations are proposed to be screened from view.

218 N. Catalina Avenue

The one-story Queen Anne style duplex at the front of the property is approximately 1,200 square feet in size and was most likely constructed as a single-family residence. Per the application materials provided (see attached Application), the rear addition appears on the Sanborn map around 1904. The original home exhibits steep, symmetrical gable roof elements while the rear addition includes a low, unsymmetrical gable. The scope of work includes redesigning that rear gable roof element, painting the stucco, cleaning and painting the eaves and gutter, prepping and painting the front porch woodwork, replacing non-original openings, and creating new openings for Building Code-required bedroom egress.

The West Elevation shown on Sheet A204, identifies one non-original opening to be replaced (noted as "D" in the attached Architectural Drawings). The North Elevation on Sheet A204, identifies two non-original openings to be replaced. The East Elevation on Sheet A205, identifies two non-original openings to be replaced. The South Elevation on Sheet A205, identifies two non-original openings to be replaced plus two new custom wood windows (noted as "F") for bedroom egress. All windows are proposed to be historically accurate wood with wood trim to match the existing openings.

The redesigned rear gable element is shown on the North, East, and South Elevations. The existing plate is approximately 6 feet in height and the proposed plate is a standard 8 feet in height. This creates a roof ridge increase of approximately 4 feet, however, the roof would still be less than 15 feet in height and be below the front existing gable. Furthermore, the new gable would be symmetrical which is more compatible with the original building.

The non-original two-story apartment building at the back of the property would also have new paint

and refurbished windows. The building currently has four units ranging in size from 580 to 820 square feet. The applicant proposes that the existing garage be converted to an ADU with new openings. Because this structure is not historic, it is not held to the same historical standards as the designated buildings.

New mechanical equipment is proposed at both buildings. The mechanical equipment at the front Queen Anne building would be located within the existing fenced courtyard. The mechanical equipment for the rear apartment building would be located in front of the building, but be screened from view.

Certificate of Appropriateness

To review the proposed changes, the Commission must consider the adopted Design Guidelines for historic structures. The City standards rely on and include the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (SISR). These broad guidelines were published by the National Park Service and designed for the purpose of preservation. The ten (10) standards are included as part of the Mills Act contract. Staff has identified the standards that most closely relate to the proposed project and has noted below how the project meets each standard:

#1 A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

This district was originally constructed as residential and each of the buildings are still utilized as residential structures.

#2 The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

The character-defining features of this Craftsman home (216), the rear cottages (216), and the Queen Anny style duplex (218) would be retained. These features include the front porch elements, the wood windows/trim/openings, the brick chimneys, the horizontal siding, and the gable roof elements. All deteriorated materials would be like-for-like wood replacements. Inappropriate alterations such as the louvered windows (216 and 218) and the low, unsymmetrical roof (218) would be replaced.

#5 Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

No distinctive features would be removed from the historic district.

#6 Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Most of the existing features are to be retained and refurbished. Any deteriorated wood materials, primarily siding, would be replaced like-for-like.

#9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy the historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

The redesigned gable element on the rear of the Queen Anne style structure (218) would still be below the front existing gable and would exhibit a symmetrical gable more compatible with the original building. The gable would have a different roof pitch than the original street-facing, steep gable.

The Preservation Ordinance

In addition to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the Preservation Ordinance, pursuant to Section 10-4.403(d)(1), states that the Commission shall issue a Certificate of Appropriateness only when it determines that the project meets the following:

1. Conforms to the prescriptive standards adopted by the Commission.
2. Will not detrimentally alter, destroy or adversely affect any exterior improvement or exterior architectural feature.
3. Will retain the essential elements that make the resource significant.

The prescriptive standards are the Secretary of Interior's Standards and the project meets the applicable key elements as stated in the section above. The proposed alterations would not interfere with the existing character-defining features of the historic district.

The Zoning and Development Standards

The development standards for the R-3A Zone are outlined in Municipal Code Section 10-5.515. No new square footage is proposed at any of the existing structures; thus, the existing setbacks remain unchanged. There are no proposed changes to the number of stories or the amount of outdoor living space. The proposed building height for the redesigned one-story gable element at the rear of the Queen Anne style structure (218) would be less than 15 feet in height, which is well below the allowable 30 feet for the zone.

Please note that these properties are considered legal, nonconforming. The structures were legal when built, but are nonconforming per the current development standards for the zone. For example, a new development in the R-3A Zone would be required to meet the 5-foot side yard setback, each unit would be required to have 350 square feet of outdoor living space, and each unit would be required to have two parking spaces. Per Municipal Code Section 10-5.2004, nonconforming structures may be altered so long as the alterations do “not increase the degree of nonconformity of the structure as a whole...” This is very common with historic properties as their construction predates the current development standards.

Summary and Conclusion

As described in this report, the key character-defining features of the historic buildings would be carefully retained and refurbished. Any deteriorated exterior materials would be replaced like-for-like in materials and design. Inappropriate alterations such as the louvered windows, would be replaced with wood windows and wood trim. New alterations, such as the egress windows, the gable roof element, and the mechanical equipment installations would all be designed to be compatible to the existing designated buildings. For these reasons, the rehabilitation project meets the Secretary of Interior’s Standards and proposed work is appropriate for the historic district. The property owner that designated the historic district in 1995 did not pursue a Mills Act contract with the City. Following Public Amenities Commission review, the current owner intends to process for a Mills Act contract for each site. For reference, the Mills Act report for each address is attached.

ATTACHMENTS

Draft Resolution (COA-2024-04)
Draft Resolution (COA-2024-05)
CEQA Exemption Declaration (COA-2024-04/COA-2024-05)
Application for Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2024-04)
Application for Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2024-05)
KCK Mills Act Report (COA-2024-04)
KCK Mills Act Report (COA-2024-05)
Architectural Drawings (COA-2024-04)
Architectural Drawings (COA-2024-05)