



Minutes
Redondo Beach City Council
Tuesday, November 5, 2024
Closed Session - Adjourned Regular Meeting 4:30 p.m.
Open Session –Regular Meeting 6:00 p.m.

4:30 PM - CLOSED SESSION – ADJOURNED REGULAR MEETING

A. CALL MEETING TO ORDER

An Adjourned Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 4:30 p.m. by Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

B. ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi,
Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic

Councilmembers Absent: Mayor Light

Officials Present: Mike Witzansky, City Manager
Melissa Villa, Analyst

C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION - NONE

D. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS

There were no Blue Folder Items for Closed Session.

E. PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS ON CLOSED SESSION ITEMS AND NON-AGENDA ITEMS

There were no public communications on Closed Session items and non-agenda items.

F. RECESS TO CLOSED – 4:34 p.m.

Analyst Villa read title to the items to be considered in Closed Session.

City Manager Witzansky announced that the following would be participating in Closed Session: City Manager Mike Witzansky, City Attorney Mike Webb, Assistant City Attorney Cheryl Park, Human Resources Director Diane Strickfaden, and W.E.D. Director Greg Kapovich.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, to recess to Closed Session at 4:34 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

F.1. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL AND LABOR NEGOTIATOR - The Closed Session is authorized by the Government Code Sec. 54957.6.

AGENCY NEGOTIATOR:

Mike Witzansky, City Manager

Diane Strickfaden, Director of Human Resources

EMPLOYEE ORGANIZATIONS:

Management and Confidential Bargaining Unit and Redondo Beach Firefighters' Association - Fire Management Unit

CONTACT: DIANE STRICKFADEN, DIRECTOR OF HUMAN RESOURCES

F.2. CONFERENCE WITH REAL PROPERTY NEGOTIATOR - The Closed Session is authorized by the Government Code Section 54956.8.

AGENCY NEGOTIATOR:

Mike Witzansky, City Manager

Greg Kapovich, Waterfront & Economic Development Director

PROPERTY:

230 Portofino Way, Redondo Beach, CA 90277 (a portion of APN: 7503-029-903)

NEGOTIATING PARTIES:

John Warner - Marine Mammal Care Center Los Angeles, a non-profit corporation

UNDER NEGOTIATION:

Price and Terms

F.3. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).

Name of Case:

**Millicent F. Fogenay, an individual v. Robert Martin, an individual; Tyler M. Ryan, an individual; and Does 1 to 25, inclusive
Case Number: 23STCV30302**

G. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION – 6:00 p.m.

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic reconvened to Open Session at 6:00 p.m.

H. ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi,
Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic

Councilmembers Absent: Mayor Light

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk
Mike Webb, City Attorney
Mike Witzansky, City Manager
Lucie Colombo, Chief Deputy City Clerk

I. ANNOUNCEMENT OF CLOSED SESSION ACTIONS

City Attorney Webb announced that under Item No. F.3, Council unanimously authorized the City Attorney to defend the City in the matter.

J. ADJOURN TO REGULAR MEETING

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to adjourn to the regular meeting at 6:01 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

6:00 PM - OPEN SESSION – REGULAR MEETING

A. CALL TO ORDER

A Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 6:01 p.m. by Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

B. ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi,
Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic

Councilmembers Absent: Mayor Light

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk
Mike Webb, City Attorney
Mike Witzansky, City Manager
Lucie Colombo, Chief Deputy City Clerk

C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic invited Veterans and Active Military to stand and be recognized them for their service.

James, 7th Grader, Adams Middle School, led in the salute to the flag.

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic called for a moment of silence.

D. PRESENTATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/ANNOUNCEMENTS

Councilmember Nehrenheim addressed the recent District 1 Community Meeting and the Riviera Village Halloween Spooktacular; announced the upcoming Veterans Day events at Veterans Park and spoke about the sale of bricks to memorialize family members who served.

Councilmember Loewenstein thanked Redondo Beach First Responders for responding to a capsized boat off Avenue C; mentioned five people were saved and one person passed; announced the District 2 Community Meeting towards the latter half of the month.

Councilmember Obagi announced the District 4 Community Meeting on Wednesday, November 20, 2024 at 6:00 p.m. at the Perry Park Senior Center; thanked the RBPB and RBFD for their support of making their workplace a better place and spoke about the culture and dedication provided under the leadership of Chiefs Hoffman and Butler.

Councilmember Behrendt agreed with Councilmember Obagi regarding the City's Public Services Officers and thanked them for their service.

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic thanked the City's Public Services Officers for their work and support; announced that last Wednesday the City celebrated a functional zero event related to homelessness, which means the City is housing more people than are coming into the City unhoused; noted this is a significant accomplishment in the City; spoke about recent Halloween events and the 120th Homecoming Game at Redondo Union High School.

E. APPROVE ORDER OF AGENDA

City Manager Witzansky reported that under Item No. N.1 the presenter, Rebecca Elder, had a family emergency was unable to attend and asked to continue the matter until the City Council meeting of December 3, 2024.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and approved by voice vote, the order of the agenda, as amended, continuing Item No. N.1 to the City Council meeting of December 3, 2024.

Motion carried 5-0. Mayor Light was absent.

F. AGENCY RECESS – 6:12 p.m.

F.1. REGULAR MEETING OF THE COMMUNITY FINANCING AUTHORITY

CONTACT: STEPHANIE MEYER, INTERIM FINANCE DIRECTOR

RECONVENE TO REGULAR MEETING FROM AGENCY MEETING – 6:15 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi,
Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic

Councilmembers Absent: Mayor Light

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, to approve the order of the agenda for the Community Financing Authority.

Motion carried, 5-0. Mayor Light was absent.

There were no other public comments on this item.

G. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS

G.1 For Blue Folder Documents Approved at the City Council Meeting

City Clerk Manzano noted Blue Folder Items for J.1, L.2 and P.1.

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to receive and file Blue Folder Items.

Motion carried, 5-0. Mayor Light was absent.

H. CONSENT CALENDAR

H.1. APPROVE AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING FOR THE CITY COUNCIL ADJOURNED AND REGULAR MEETING OF NOVEMBER 5, 2024

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

H.2. APPROVE MOTION TO READ BY TITLE ONLY AND WAIVE FURTHER READING OF ALL ORDINANCES AND RESOLUTIONS LISTED ON THE

AGENDA

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

H.3. APPROVE THE FOLLOWING CITY COUNCIL MINUTES: NONE

CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

H.4. PAYROLL DEMANDS

**CHECKS 30003-30016 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$15,191.93, PD. 10/25/24
DIRECT DEPOSIT 285854-286464 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$2,284,587.00, PD.
10/25/24**

EFT/ACH \$9,246.68, PD. 8/16/24 (PP2417)

EFT/ACH \$364,988.43, PD. 9/4/24 (PP2417)

EFT/ACH \$451,451.84, PD. 9/18/24 (PP2418)

EFT/ACH \$26,015.59, PD. 10/13/24 (PP2418)

**ACCOUNTS PAYABLE DEMANDS CHECKS 116598-116801 IN THE
AMOUNT OF \$3,115,127.72**

EFT CALPERS MEDICAL INSURANCE \$460,608.76

**DIRECT DEPOSIT 100008820-100008909 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$93,923.47,
PD.11/1/24**

REPLACEMENT DEMAND 116597

CONTACT: STEPHANIE MEYER, INTERIM FINANCE DIRECTOR

H.5. APPROVE CONTRACTS UNDER \$35,000:

**1. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH SHARP PERFORMANCE, INC. FOR
COGNITIVE PERFORMANCE COACHING SERVICES FOR AN AMOUNT NOT
TO EXCEED \$2,500 AND THE TERM NOVEMBER 5, 2024 TO NOVEMBER 5,
2025**

**2. APPROVE AN AMENDMENT TO THE AGREEMENT WITH FEHR & PEERS,
INC. TO PERFORM A SPEED STUDY ON INGLEWOOD AVE FOR AN
ADDITIONAL AMOUNT OF \$6,500 AND THE EXISTING TERM THROUGH
JUNE 30, 2027**

**3. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH FIRSTTWO, INC. FOR A SOFTWARE
APPLICATION FOR AN ANNUAL AMOUNT OF \$10,800, PLUS A 5% PRICE
INCREASE FOR EACH ADDITIONAL YEAR, AND THE TERM JULY 1, 2024
TO JUNE 30, 2025 WITH A MAXIMUM OF FIVE RENEWAL YEARS**

CONTACT: STEPHANIE MEYER, INTERIM FINANCE DIRECTOR

**H.6. APPROVE A THREE-YEAR AGREEMENT WITH VESTIS FOR PUBLIC
WORKS DEPARTMENT EMPLOYEE UNIFORM SERVICES FOR AN ANNUAL**

COST NOT TO EXCEED \$38,842 AND THE TERM NOVEMBER 6, 2024 TO NOVEMBER 5, 2027

CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR

- H.7. APPROVE A MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING (MOU) WITH THE CITIES OF HERMOSA BEACH, MANHATTAN BEACH, AND TORRANCE ESTABLISHING THE TERMS, CONDITIONS, AND COST SHARING FOR IMPLEMENTATION OF THE BEACH CITIES REGIONAL GREEN STREETS PROJECT FOR THE BEACH CITIES WATERSHED MANAGEMENT GROUP**

CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR

- H.8. APPROVE A FIVE-YEAR AGREEMENT WITH HADRONEX, INC. TO PROVIDE EQUIPMENT AND MONITORING SERVICES FOR 47 SMART SEWER MANHOLE COVERS FOR AN AVERAGE ANNUAL COST OF \$104,986, A TOTAL FIVE-YEAR COST NOT TO EXCEED \$524,931, AND THE TERM JANUARY 1, 2025 TO DECEMBER 31, 2029**

CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR

- H.9. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2411-108, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH'S AUTHORITY TO FILE APPLICATIONS FOR GRANT FUNDS FROM THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY REGIONAL PARK AND OPEN SPACE DISTRICT FOR MEASURE A FUNDING FOR PROJECTS AND PROGRAMS**

CONTACT: STEPHANIE MEYER, INTERIM FINANCE DIRECTOR

- H.10. This Item was pulled by Councilmember Nehrenheim for separate discussion.**

- H.11. APPROVE THE FIRST AMENDMENT TO THE AGREEMENT FOR LEGAL SERVICES BETWEEN THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH AND LIEBERT CASSIDY WHITMORE, A PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION**

CONTACT: MICHAEL W. WEBB, CITY ATTORNEY

Councilmember Nehrenheim pulled Item No. H.10 for separate discussion.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and approved by voice vote, the Consent Calendar, as amended, removing Item No. H.10 from Consent for separate discussions.

Motion carried, 5-0. Mayor Light was absent.

City Clerk Manzano read title to Resolution No. CC-2411-108.

I. EXCLUDED CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS

H.10. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH IWORQ SYSTEMS INC. FOR AN INTEGRATED BUILDING, PLANNING, AND ENGINEERING SOFTWARE SYSTEM THAT WILL ASSIST THE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT AND PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENTS WITH THE ISSUANCE AND MANAGEMENT OF CONSTRUCTION PERMITS FOR AN ANNUAL AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$65,000 AND A TERM OF THREE YEARS

CONTACT: MARC WIENER, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

Councilmember Nehrenheim requested Community Development Director Marc Wiener to give the public additional information regarding the project since he continually receives questions from residents on this item.

Community Development Director Wiener reported Staff is proposing transitioning from the current permitting system to a new system which will expand online permitting and have the ability to track projects throughout all departments; felt the proposed system will allow more comprehensive capability to all City functions; stated he has had experience with implementation and use of the system.

Councilmember Nehrenheim expressed his excitement for this project; stated that currently users have to go through various pages to locate things.

Community Development Director Wiener added that all the activity regarding a property will be in one location in the system and the public portal will allow the community to access information on projects that are occurring within the City; discussed a mapping feature and anticipated it will be implemented quickly (approximately 2 months).

Councilmember Nehrenheim commented on savings and the public portal; mentioned the City of Anaheim has a public portal that allows users to locate projects within a mile radius of an address.

Community Development Director Wiener mentioned the new system will have a similar feature as the City of Anaheim; addressed the overall net savings for the City; stated the cost is \$65,000 a year, which is \$7,000 less than the City is paying for the current system; mentioned the current system upgrade would have cost about \$100,000.

There were no public comments on this item.

Councilmember Obagi left the chambers.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Behrendt, and approved by voice vote, Item No. H.10, as presented.

Councilmember Obagi returned to the chambers.

Motion carried 5-0. Mayor Light was absent.

J. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

J.1 For eComments and Emails Received from the Public

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic invited public participation on non-agenda items.

Holly Osborne, District 5, referenced a submission involving pictures of stores on Artesia with different size lots; stated she did not like the idea of doubling the FAR, especially for the small lots; mentioned that District 5 did not have a grocery store for several years; provided a brief history on the land where the grocery store is located; spoke against Council artificially inflating the values of the properties; stated the community likes the grocery store and she enjoys the small “mom and pop” establishments; urged Council not to double the FAR.

Councilmember Obagi mentioned other grocery stores in North Redondo.

Joan Irvine, District 1, addressed parents’ concerns about cannabis; noted there will be only two legal and heavily regulated dispensaries in Redondo and they will sell tested and traceable products; stated she would be more concerned about alcohol and children if she were a parent; listed the dangers of alcohol versus cannabis among teens; mentioned the number of liquor stores in the Redondo area; mentioned that if parents are that concerned about dispensaries they should be concerned about bringing their children into any places that sell alcohol as well; urged Council not to deny adults safe access to cannabis.

Mary Ewell asked whether it is within Staff’s purview to construct a 3-D model of the proposed BCHD Assisted Living and Memory Care Complex that BCHD’s board is proposing; felt it can demonstrate how out of scope and non-conforming the building would be; mentioned former Mayor Bill Brand had done that with another project and opined it was very enlightening; suggested that Staff provide one at the next meeting where this item will be discussed; mentioned she had other comments but they would be directed towards Mayor Light and since he is not present decided not to continue.

Laura Duke, District 3, wanted to let Council know that she felt uncomfortable with an exchange that happened between a Torrance resident and Councilmember Kaluderovic at the last City Council Meeting; felt the interaction regarding the Metro C-Line extension

project seemed inappropriate as that was not the subject of the speaker's comment and stated the Redondo Beach and Torrance residents should be neighborly and noted the importance of expressing acceptance of each other; stated her next comments were for Mayor Light and since he is not present will wait to make those comments; referenced errors in use of the terms FAR and EIR by Mr. Bakaly and noted no one corrected him; agreed with Mary Ewell's suggestion regarding building a 3-D model for the public to view; thanked Community Director Marc Wiener and Planning Manager Sean Scully for answering her email; asked if residents can use the projector for their three minutes if needed and, in answer to her question, Councilmember Nehrenheim said yes if they email it to them prior to the meeting.

Geoff Gilbert talked about the BCHD project and how they are leading the residents to believe that without a 1.25 FAR the programs they offer will not be able to continue; talked about Mr. Bakaly's comments, during the last City Council meeting, stating the open space is for everyone but pointed out that Measure BC states the open space is for BCHD programs and does not mention general public use; stated that Mr. Bakaly also did not mention that the open space can be used to building at any time in the future; stated the open space is not protected and BCHD has lied to the public, the media and the City; discussed their project EIR and urged Council to weigh the opinions and desires of residents against the developer.

Wayne Craig, District 1, spoke about Council's support to Measures FP and RB; reminded the public there is a little over an hour yet to vote and urged voters to vote as if they are trying to save the City.

Rosann Taylor mentioned BCHD sent an email, prior to the last City Council meeting, advising residents that the City Council was making a decision to certify the EIR; opined it was confusing as it was different from what the City has been addressing, which is the FAR; asserted the EIR does not interpret local ordinances or statutes; expressed concerns with decreased home values; felt a lot of things have been overlooked and urged Council to separate the decision on the EIR from the decision on the FAR.

Brad Waller (via Zoom), District 1, spoke about Keep the Esplanade Beautiful and about their Monthly Sweeps events on the first Saturday of each month; announced an event on Saturday at the Rotary Club of Redondo Beach for their Centennial Celebration from 2:00 to 5:00 pm; additionally, addressed their need for volunteers.

Mark Nelson (via Zoom), spoke in support of comments by Rosann Taylor; addressed the BCHD EIR; noted it is irrelevant to the General Plan; addressed a FAR for PI properties.

There were no other public comments.

K. EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

Councilmember Nehrenheim reported speaking with Councilmember Obagi,

members of the public and City staff regarding Items No. L.1 and the public and Staff regarding L.2.

Councilmember Loewenstein reported speaking with City staff and the public regarding Item No. L.2.

Councilmember Obagi reported speaking with Councilmember Nehrenheim regarding Item No. L.1 and with Councilmember Behrendt, members of the public, Mr. Bakaly from BCHD and the City Manager regarding Item No. L.2.

Councilmember Behrendt reported speaking City staff regarding Item No. L.1 and regarding L.2, members of the public, City staff, Mayor Light and with Councilmember Obagi, Dan Elder and Rob Gaddis.

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic reported speaking with City staff regarding Item No. L.1 and with the public, City staff and Mayor Light, regarding Item No. L.2.

L. PUBLIC HEARINGS

L.1. PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER THE CALENDAR YEAR 2024 ANNUAL REPORT OF THE RIVIERA VILLAGE BUSINESS IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT, RE-APPOINTMENT OF THE RIVIERA VILLAGE ASSOCIATION AS THE DISTRICT'S ADVISORY BOARD AND LEVYING OF AN ASSESSMENT FOR THE DISTRICT FOR CALENDAR YEAR 2025

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY, RESOLUTION NO. CC-2411-105, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, APPOINTING AN ADVISORY BOARD IN CONNECTION WITH THE RIVIERA VILLAGE BUSINESS IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT AND DIRECTING THE PREPARATION OF A REPORT FOR CALENDAR YEAR 2025

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY, RESOLUTION NO. CC-2411-106, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING THE REPORT OF THE ADVISORY BOARD FOR 2024-2025 IN CONNECTION WITH THE RIVIERA VILLAGE BUSINESS IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY, ORDINANCE NO. 3284-24, AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, AMENDING REDONDO BEACH ORDINANCE NO. 2922-03 TO INCREASE THE ASSESSMENT AMOUNT LEVIED AGAINST BUSINESSES WITHIN THE RIVIERA VILLAGE BUSINESS IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT

APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH THE RIVIERA VILLAGE ASSOCIATION FOR SERVICE AS THE RIVIERA VILLAGE BUSINESS

IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT'S ADVISORY BOARD

CONTACT: GREG KAPOVICH, WATERFRONT & ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to open the public hearing.

Motion carried 5-0. Mayor Light was absent.

W.E.D. Director Kapovich introduced the item and deferred to Riviera Village Association (RVA) President Allen Sanford for a report; requested tonight the Council reappoint the RVA to continue the oversight; proposed increasing the assessment rate from \$79,000 to \$105,000 since the rate has not been increased since 2005; stated Council is being asked to approve the report presented by Allen Sanford; he summarized what was being asked by Council tonight and turned the presentation over to Allen Sanford.

Allen Sanford presented details of the RVA's annual report and offered to respond to questions from City Council; addressed the possibility of grant funding for improved safety; presented a slide that included:

- Proposed Assessment from 2024
 - Property owners and business license holders: \$100 + \$29/employee
- 2025 Proposed Assessments (changes)
 - Business license holders: \$125 +\$34/employee
 - Property owners: \$125 +\$34/rental unit
 - Estimated gross revenues: \$105,000
 - Planned 2025 BID expenditures: 50% beautification, 40% marketing, 10% Administration
- 2024 Accomplishments
- Calendar Year 2025 Projects
 - Pavers projects
 - Strategic partnerships
 - Bollards project with Chief Hoffman
 - Media development for the Village
 - Redondo Beach Travel and Tourism (RBTT)
 - Roundabout at S Catalina Ave & Ave I
- Recommendation

RBPD Chief Hoffman expanded on efforts for improved safety and crowd control with the use of retractable bollards; reviewed attempts to obtain funding through grants; spoke about options available to implement the purchase and installation of retractable bollards.

Councilmember Nehrenheim added a brief history of the conversation regarding the

bollards; addressed security for Farmers Markets; reported plans to apply for grant funding for that; discussed upcoming projects and thanked the Association for everything they do.

Councilmember Obagi asked City Manager Witzansky to clarify his understanding that the City applied to SBCOG for Measure M funds to widen sidewalks as permanent dining decks.

City Manager Witzansky mentioned there are two phases to it; reported the City has applied and received significant grant funding to study and design expansion of the sidewalk area, the recirculation element, parking and other features; noted that it has already been funded, and the City will be receiving those monies within the next fiscal year; explained the structure will create the perimeter of the area to provide some level of traffic control such as is being done with the parkways.

Councilmember Obagi asked for slide 2B to be put up; stated he imagined there still needs to be more protection since cars can still drive up on sidewalks.

City Manager Witzansky responded and went into detail on the safety measures involved; explained it would be similar to the parklets that are actually in the roadway now.

Councilmember Obagi spoke about the funds available through Measure M; suggested not approaching it only from a security standpoint but rather a mobility standpoint in making the area more walkable and transportation friendly, in the City's application for funding.

City Manager Witzansky agreed; added there is a lot of potential for Measure M; talked about the need to design first and then apply for construction funds.

Councilmember Loewenstein asked about the pavers.

City Manager Witzansky responded and discussion followed regarding funding for pavers, locations in the Village that could benefit from pavers, making entry enhancements and when the project is scheduled to begin.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi to close the public hearing.

Councilmember Nehrenheim asked for the timeline on the parklets and on the design of them.

City Manager Witzansky addressed the timeline for the design of the parklets and noted the permanent solution will take some time.

Councilmember Nehrenheim announced there will be no free parking in Riviera Village, it is only free the last two weeks in December.

Councilmember Nehrenheim seconded the motion to close the public hearing.

Motion carried 5-0, by voice vote. Mayor Light was absent.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to adopt by title only, Resolution No. CC-2411-105, adopt by title only, Resolution No. CC-2411-106, adopt by title only, Ordinance No. 3284-24, and approve an agreement with the Riviera Village Association for service as the Riviera Village Business Improvement District's Advisory Board for 2025.

Motion carried 5-0, by voice vote. Mayor Light was absent.

City Clerk Manzano read titles to Resolutions No. CC-2411-105, CC-2411-106 and Ordinance No. 3284-24.

Councilmember Obagi left the chambers.

L.2. CONTINUED PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER LAND USE ELEMENT, ZONING ORDINANCE, AND LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM AMENDMENTS, AND CERTIFICATION OF A PROGRAM ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT (EIR) THAT SERVE TO IMPLEMENT THE CITY'S CERTIFIED 6TH CYCLE HOUSING ELEMENT

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2410-105, CERTIFYING THE FINAL PROGRAM ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT (STATE CLEARINGHOUSE NUMBER 2023050732), ADOPTING FINDINGS PURSUANT TO THE CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ACT, ADOPTING A STATEMENT OF OVERRIDING CONSIDERATIONS, AND ADOPTING A MITIGATION MONITORING AND REPORTING PROGRAM FOR THE REDONDO BEACH FOCUSED GENERAL PLAN UPDATE, ZONING ORDINANCE UPDATE AND LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM AMENDMENT

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2410-106, AMENDING THE GENERAL PLAN LAND USE ELEMENT TO IMPLEMENT THE CITY'S CERTIFIED 6TH CYCLE 2021-2029 HOUSING ELEMENT AND OTHER AMENDMENTS REGARDING RESIDENTIALLY DESIGNATED PROPERTIES NOT IDENTIFIED AS PROGRAM ACTIONS IN THE CITY'S HOUSING ELEMENT

ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2410-107, AMENDING THE COASTAL LAND USE PLAN OF THE CITY'S LOCAL COASTAL PROGRAM TO IMPLEMENT THE CITY'S CERTIFIED 6TH CYCLE 2021-

**2029 HOUSING ELEMENT AND OTHER AMENDMENTS REGARDING
RESIDENTIALLY DESIGNATED PROPERTIES NOT IDENTIFIED AS
PROGRAM ACTIONS IN THE CITY'S HOUSING ELEMENT**

**INTRODUCE BY TITLE ONLY ORDINANCE NO. CC-3281-24, AMENDING
TITLE 10, CHAPTER 1 SUBDIVISIONS OF THE REDONDO BEACH
MUNICIPAL CODE FOR CONSISTENCY WITH THE GENERAL PLAN
LAND USE ELEMENT AND TO IMPLEMENT THE CITY'S CERTIFIED 6TH
CYCLE 2021-2029 HOUSING ELEMENT AND OTHER AMENDMENTS
REGARDING RESIDENTIALLY DESIGNATED PROPERTIES NOT
IDENTIFIED AS PROGRAM ACTIONS IN THE CITY'S HOUSING
ELEMENT. FOR INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING**

**INTRODUCE BY TITLE ONLY ORDINANCE NO. 3282-24, AMENDING
TITLE 10 PLANNING AND ZONING, CHAPTER 2 ZONING AND LAND USE
OF THE REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE FOR CONSISTENCY
WITH THE GENERAL PLAN LAND USE ELEMENT AND TO IMPLEMENT
THE CITY'S CERTIFIED 6TH CYCLE 2021-2029 HOUSING ELEMENT AND
OTHER AMENDMENTS REGARDING RESIDENTIALLY DESIGNATED
PROPERTIES NOT IDENTIFIED AS PROGRAM ACTIONS IN THE CITY'S
HOUSING ELEMENT. FOR INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING**

**INTRODUCE BY TITLE ONLY ORDINANCE NO. 3283-24, AMENDING
TITLE 10 PLANNING AND ZONING, CHAPTER 5 COASTAL LAND USE
PLAN IMPLEMENTING ORDINANCE OF THE REDONDO BEACH
MUNICIPAL CODE FOR CONSISTENCY WITH THE GENERAL PLAN
LAND USE ELEMENT AND TO IMPLEMENT THE CITY'S CERTIFIED 6TH
CYCLE 2021-2029 HOUSING ELEMENT AND OTHER AMENDMENTS
REGARDING RESIDENTIALLY DESIGNATED PROPERTIES NOT
IDENTIFIED AS PROGRAM ACTIONS IN THE CITY'S HOUSING
ELEMENT. FOR INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING**

PROCEDURES:

- 1. Open the public hearing, take testimony**
- 2. Close the public hearing**
- 3. Adopt Resolution No. CC-2410-105, certifying the Final Program EIR,
adopting findings pursuant to CEQA, adopting a Statement of Overriding
Considerations, and adopting a mitigation monitoring and reporting
program**
- 4. Adopt Resolution No. CC-2410-106, amending the General Plan Land
Use Element**
- 5. Adopt Resolution No. CC-2410-107, amending the Land Use Plan of
the City's Certified Local Coastal Program**
- 6. Introduce for first reading Ordinance No. CC-3281-24, amending Title
10, Chapter 1 Subdivisions of the Redondo Beach Municipal Code**
- 7. Introduce for first reading Ordinance No. CC-3282-24, amending Title**

10, Chapter 2 Zoning and Land Use of the Redondo Beach Municipal Code

8. Introduce for first reading Ordinance No. CC-3283-24, amending Title 10, Chapter 5 Coastal Land Use Plan Implementing Ordinance of the Redondo Municipal Code

CONTACT: MARC WIENER, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to open the public hearing.

Motion carried 4-0-1. Councilmember Obagi and Mayor Light were absent.

Councilmember Obagi returned to the chambers.

Community Development Director Wiener mentioned Council has reviewed this item at three meetings in October; noted he will keep this presentation brief in terms of the overview; stated the presentation would be a comprehensive update to the City's General Plan; stated the project has been broken up into two phases, phase one is what is being brought forward at this meeting for the actions that are necessary to implement the City's Housing Element; presented a PowerPoint which included:

- Background – City Council reviewed on Oct. 1st, 15th and 29th.
 - Only amending existing Land Use Element and Zoning Ordinances related to HE Implementation
 - Implement Housing Element to meet statutory deadline of February 12, 2025.
- Deferred Items (Phase II)
 - Defer other updates to later date:
 - Open Space and Conservation Element
 - Safety Element
 - Noise Element
 - Land Use Element
 - Public Institutional (PI) – FAR
 - Artesia Blvd. – FAR/Development/Rooftop Dining
 - Nonconforming Uses and Structures
 - Historic Preservation Policy
- Recommended Actions
 - Adopt a resolution that would certify the EIR and adopting a Statement of Overriding Considerations
 - Adopting a resolution amending the GP Land Use Element
 - Adopting a resolution amending the Land Use Plan of the City's Certified Local Coastal Program
 - Introducing ordinances for Title 10, Chapter 1, 2 and 5 of the City's Municipal Code
 - Direct Staff to return on December 3, 2024, for consideration of

subsequent environmental impact analysis regarding BCHD FAR

Councilmember Nehrenheim asked to confirm the items to be acted upon tonight; spoke about accurate findings that will help Council make decisions; mentioned impacts that cannot be mitigated that are mandated by the State.

Community Development Director Wiener clarified which ordinances are being presented for adoption tonight and reiterated items that have been deferred and will be brought back to Council in January and February.

More discussion ensued.

City Manager Witzansky reported that on December 3rd, Council will consider the analysis that was requested in October pertaining to the BCHD site; stated that implementation will be presented to Council in January and February.

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic invited public comments.

City Clerk Manzano reported receiving 12 eComments, 8 in support, 3 opposed and 1 neutral.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Councilmember Nehrenheim referenced page 45 of the final EIR regarding Public Services section relevant to the impacts to Fire, Police and Paramedic Services; read an email from Chief Hoffman regarding the number of paramedic service calls to Kensington and requested adding it to the record. He added that it is important to have all the relevant facts in the record in case the City needs to defend the EIR.

Councilmember Obagi asked what they can do to account for impacts that certain uses or conditional uses will have on City finances or public safety resources, etc.

Community Development Director Wiener mentioned that last week, Council approved an agreement for a comprehensive fee study for the department and stated that would be a vehicle to address City-wide impacts and the costs of services associated with new development.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to close the public hearing.

Motion carried 5-0. Mayor Light was absent.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to adopt by title only, Resolutions No. CC-2410-105, CC-2410-106, CC-2410-107 and introduce for first reading, Ordinances No. CC-3281-

24, CC-3282-24 and CC-3283-24 and direct Staff to return on December 3, 2024, to consider the subsequent analysis regarding a 1.25 FAR for the BCHD site.

Motion carried 5-0. Mayor Light was absent.

City Clerk Manzano read titles to Resolutions No. CC-2410-105, CC-2410-106, CC-2410-107 and Ordinances No. CC-3281-24, CC-3282-24 and CC-3283-24.

K. ITEMS CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS AGENDAS – None

L. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION PRIOR TO ACTION

L.1. This Item was continued to the City Council meeting of December 3, 2024.

M. CITY MANAGER ITEMS

City Manager Witzansky spoke about a recent incident in which the Harbor Patrol made a courageous save and recognized them for their efforts.

N. MAYOR AND COUNCIL ITEMS

N.1. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING CHARTER AMENDMENTS PERTAINING TO THE DUTIES OF THE CITY CLERK AND CITY TREASURER AND DIRECTION TO STAFF TO PREPARE BALLOT MEASURES FOR THE MARCH 4, 2025 ELECTION REFLECTING THE PROPOSED AMENDMENTS

City Clerk Manzano reviewed details of the latest recommendations for Charter amendments by the Charter Review Advisory Committee (CRAC) as it pertains to the City Clerk's office; presented slides on the recommendations, noting the bold black were the specific changes or additions.

Discussion followed regarding the requirement for a Bachelor's degree and five years' experience in public or private sector accounting or five years' experience as a City Clerk in the State of California, auditing areas of City expenditures at least once a year, needs of the City Clerk's office to conduct an audit, having Moss Adams do audits in specified areas and relying on the Charter.

City Attorney Webb reported the budget is up to Council but if the City Clerk needs certain budget or personnel to carry out the scope of her duties, she is entitled to request it.

Discussion followed regarding the City Clerk devoting his/her full time to the duties of the office to make it consistent with other provisions such as for the City Attorney, other reasons for including the provision in the Charter, prior incidents where the City Clerk has been missing in action, provisions in other sections of the Charter that will

handle that more effectively.

Councilmember Behrendt stated he is reluctant to approve the provision about the City Clerk devoting full time to the duties of the office and wondered about the source of requiring a Bachelor's degree.

City Clerk Manzano explained that the City Clerk needs to work with Department Heads and therefore should have a Bachelor's degree.

City Attorney Webb mentioned the matter will return to Council on November 19th, to address residency and other provisions and that would be the appropriate way to reconsider the matter; noted that the City Clerk cannot leave the city for thirty consecutive days without vacating their position.

Discussion followed regarding lack of enforcement and it being a left-over provision from when computers and Zoom did not exist.

Councilmember Behrendt felt that the requirement for a Bachelor's degree does not seem to be essential as a requirement in the Charter; stated he would like to give more thought to whether five years of experience as a City Clerk is an appropriate substitute; wondered about the requirements in other Charter cities for City Clerk; expressed concerns about "building a moat" around elected positions that would disqualify people from participating and reported he has confidence in voters to decide what it takes to do a particular job; asked the City Attorney if he has any particular concerns from a legal and oversight perspective.

City Attorney Webb felt it is a good compromise; reported it removes an elected position working under the direction of the City Manager; recommended, depending on what Council decides in terms of the City Treasurer, adding a line that the City Clerk provides oversight of expenditures, and the City Treasurer provides oversight of revenues.

City Manager Witzansky stated he is comfortable with the suggested modifications; reported speaking with the City Clerk regarding ensuring that the auditing function is not taxing the Finance staff to the point where they cannot perform their functions; opined the language that has been presented works and felt the City can support it financially; agreed with the separation of oversight of expenditures and revenues.

Councilmember Behrendt thanked Staff and the committee.

Councilmember Nehrenheim agreed that it is for voters to decide what the qualifications should be; opined that the minimum floor should be the legal requirements to perform the duty and asked City Clerk Manzano to list the requirements.

City Clerk Manzano listed the requirements for becoming a Certified Municipal Clerk

or Master Municipal Clerk within the State of California; expressed concerns that the minimum requirements will not be sufficient to perform accounting/auditing functions and explained that is the reason for requiring accounting experience.

City Attorney Webb explained the requirement of completing at least 15 units of accounting with a passing grade; reported on the CRAC's extensive discussion regarding the oversight role and whether a Bachelor's degree was relevant; mentioned that 5 years of experience was based on the minimum requirement for becoming a judge.

Councilmember Nehrenheim reiterated that it is for voters to decide what the qualifications should be; agreed with the 5 years of experience in private or public sector accounting or as a City Clerk; mentioned distinctions between private and public sector accounting; suggested striking "private sector accounting" and the requirement for a Bachelor's degree.

In reply to Councilmember Behrendt's question, City Clerk Manzano stated she has no issues with the existing Charter language as long as there is some kind of minimum qualification.

Councilmember Behrendt spoke in support of the existing language and in opposition to the requirement for a Bachelor's degree.

In reply to Councilmember Obagi's question, City Clerk Manzano reported she has been requiring a Bachelor's degree for her staff and that she has a Bachelor's degree.

Chief Deputy City Clerk Colombo was asked to give her feedback; she shared her experience working under various City Clerks; stated that there are opportunities to assist newer clerks and spoke about educational workshops, conferences and classes available for City Clerk professional development.

City Attorney Webb added that the City Clerk position is still civil service protected.

Discussion followed regarding the possibility of removing the requirement that the City Clerk needs to be a resident of the City to allow for more candidates; City Attorney Webb read the requirements for the City Clerk position and explained some allowances for other experience related to the City Clerk position.

Councilmember Obagi agreed with Councilmembers Behrendt and Nehrenheim regarding staying with the original Charter language relative to the qualifications of the City Clerk and maintain the residency requirement.

City Attorney Webb recommended at least one more meeting prior to taking action on this item.

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic left the chambers.

City Treasurer Solomon presented changes to the Charter that were incorporated as a result of the last meeting where Council discussed this item; noted additional information is part of Blue Folder Items; explained details of amended language relative to the City Treasurer as displayed.

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic returned to the chambers.

Councilmember Behrendt expressed concerns about the qualification requirements limiting candidates; believed that good judgement is preferable to Doctoral degree; hoped the City Treasurer had some pedigree coming in; expressed concerns about codifying that and asked residents to codify that at this time; asked the City Attorney or City Manager to give thoughts on requirements needed for City Treasurer.

City Attorney Webb talked about some of the items that need further work including the Treasurer's collection of taxes and reporting; mentioned putting in information regarding access the Treasurer needs to ensure they can do an effective and efficient job in auditing and still prepare a report to the City Manager; noted items that need clarifying language in the Charter, such as one of their duties is Tax Administrator for purposes of conducting those hearings.

City Manager Witzansky liked the phrasing in D and E, regarding, "Have access to..."; reported D is intended to provide the Treasurer with the knowledge needed to prepare and provide for cash flow for the City; suggested clarifying the intent of D and that both D and E need a little more thought.

City Treasurer Solomon stated, in terms of a maturing security that goes into cash and having to decide whether to reinvest or if the City will need it for payroll or other warrants, it is important for the City Treasurer's office to have access to other reports to review the cash flow needs of the City and help determine how to allocate and/or reinvest the funds and determine a duration for reinvesting those funds.

City Manager Witzansky proposed mirroring the language on a frequency basis in F to what is listed under the City Clerk.

Councilmember Loewenstein mentioned this is about the City's \$100 million plus portfolio; felt a requirement for a Bachelor's degree for both the City Treasurer and City Clerk is needed; opined work experience is also valuable for both positions; talked about how many people do not know what a City Treasurer does and how the job is technically specific therefore requiring specific knowledge.

City Treasurer Solomon responded to questions from Councilmember Nehrenheim regarding whether his opponent would have qualified under the proposed qualification requirements and existing guardrails provided in the City's investment policy and a government code that outlines acceptable investments.

Councilmember Nehrenheim referenced requirements for Councilmembers; expressed concerns that a Councilmember, whose only requirement is to be a resident of the City, could override the City Treasurer's recommendations with a majority vote and could completely change policy.

City Treasurer Solomon added that the next step would be to ensure the changes are in compliance with the government code.

Councilmember Nehrenheim spoke about the position morphing internally and externally through the years; felt if someone were to run on an auditing campaign they would do well; reiterated that it is up to the voters to decide.

In response to Councilmember Behrendt's questions, City Treasurer Solomon reported the present Deputy City Treasurer was there prior to him coming on board and claimed that he has extensive financial experience and credentials; spoke about the City Treasurer's team consultative process in decision making.

Councilmember Obagi agreed with Councilmember Loewenstein's statements regarding qualifications for the City Clerk and City Treasurer; noted the requirements are basic and spoke in support of the changes; asked City Treasurer Solomon what action his department takes when the City gets proceeds.

City Treasurer Solomon used an example of when a corporate bond matures; stated it gets deposited into the City's US bank account, then the Treasurer's office determines whether it can be reinvested or if it is needed for other reasons; noted the City Treasurer Department works with the Finance Department to make decisions.

More discussion followed.

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic invited public comments on this item.

Bob Pinzler (via Zoom), Former Member of the Charter Review Advisory Committee (CRAC), explained the rationale for coming up with the requirements for the City Treasurer; noted that no other City Clerk in the State has accounting responsibilities; commented on the 5 years of experience requirement and felt the City Clerk candidate should have the ability to understand the audit; stated the CRAC felt the requirements would allow future City Clerks the background to be able to handle the changes that have been occurring to the City Clerk role; suggested thinking about it not in terms of the current position, but what will occur in the future.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Discussion followed regarding continuing the item until the meeting of November 19, 2024 and reviewing the Long Beach Model BRR at that time.

Regarding the City Clerk, Councilmember Behrendt suggested keeping the Charter, as is, with the current requirements and add, “or have 5 years of experience in the State of California or have a Bachelor’s degree and 5 years of experience in a responsible position involving public or private sector accounting”, which would broaden the scope for eligibility and still meet some minimal benchmarks as is currently reflected in the City Charter.

Discussion followed regarding eliminating the requirement that “the Clerk shall devote full time to the duties of office”.

Councilmember Nehrenheim agreed with Councilmember Behrendt’s suggestions, noting there are protections in place in the Charter.

City Attorney Webb also spoke about including language to ensure a distinction between revenues and expenditures as it pertains to the City Treasurer.

Councilmember Behrendt spoke about including the City Manager in the discussions.

Motion by Councilmember Behrendt, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to continue the item to the City Council meeting of November 19th and, as it pertains to the City Clerk, keep the Charter as is with the current requirements but add “or have 5 years of experience in the State of California or have a Bachelor’s degree and 5 years of experience in a responsible position involving public or private sector accounting” and eliminating the requirement “the Clerk shall devote full time to the duties of office” and direct Staff to include language, as appropriate, to ensure a distinction between revenues and expenditures.

Motion carried 5-0. Mayor Light was absent.

In terms of the City Treasurer requirements, Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic spoke in support of a Bachelor’s degree; mentioned that it does not mean what it used to and could be persuaded otherwise.

Councilmember Behrendt agreed and asked to research whether there has been a City Treasurer in Redondo Beach, in the last 20 years, that did not have a Bachelor’s degree.

Discussion followed regarding having an Associate’s degree in a related field, the need to define “related field”, qualifications of people who work under those in elected positions and using objective language.

Councilmember Behrendt stated, in the event that Council does not reach an agreement, he would favor, for the City Treasurer item, splitting the essential changes to oversight and auditing as one ballot question and additional qualifications for the City Treasurer as another.

Mayor Pro Tem Kaluderovic and City Treasurer Solomon agreed.

O. MAYOR AND COUNCIL REFERRALS TO STAFF

Councilmember Obagi asked whether Council should place on the ballot for March 2026 a question of whether there should be two elected positions in four years from now.

City Attorney Webb responded affirmatively and agreed to return with the information on November 19th.

R. RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION – None

The Closed Session meeting was cancelled.

S. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION – None

The Closed Session meeting was cancelled.

T. ADJOURNMENT – 8:50 p.m.

There being no further business to come before the City Council, motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, to adjourn the meeting at 8:50 p.m. to an Adjourned Regular meeting to be held at 4:30 p.m. (Closed Session) and a Regular meeting to be held at 6:00 p.m., on Tuesday, November 12, 2024 in the Redondo Beach City Hall Council Chambers 415 N. Pacific Coast Hwy. Redondo Beach, California.

Motion carried, 5-0.

All written comments submitted via eComment are included in the record and available for public review on the City website.

Respectfully submitted:

DocuSigned by:
Eleanor Manzano
72F2AC716C214CF...

Eleanor Manzano, CMC
City Clerk