



Minutes  
Redondo Beach City Council  
Tuesday, July 9, 2024  
Closed Session - Adjourned Regular Meeting 4:30 p.m.  
Open Session –Regular Meeting 6:00 p.m.

## **4:30 PM - CLOSED SESSION – ADJOURNED REGULAR MEETING**

### **A. CALL TO ORDER**

An Adjourned Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 4:30 p.m. by Mayor Light in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

### **B. ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Mayor Light

Councilmembers Absent: Obagi

Officials Present: Mike Witzansky, City Manager  
Melissa Villa, Analyst

### **C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION - NONE**

### **D. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS**

Analyst Villa announced there were no Blue Folder Items for Closed Session.

### **E. PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS ON CLOSED SESSION ITEMS AND NON-AGENDA ITEMS**

There were no public communications on Closed Session items and non-agenda items.

### **F. RECESS TO CLOSED – 4:33 p.m.**

Analyst Villa read title to the items to be considered in Closed Session.

City Manager Witzansky announced the following would be participating in Closed Session: City Manager Mike Witzansky, City Attorney Mike Webb, Assistant City Attorney Cheryl Park, Outside Legal Counsel Alexander Frank.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and

approved by voice vote to recess to Closed Session at 4:33 p.m.

Motion carried, 4-0-1.

- F.1. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Sec. 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**Bruce Allan Haroldson v. City of Redondo Beach, et al.**

**Case Number: 19STCV46879**

- F.2. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**In re 9300 Wilshire LLC**

**Bankruptcy C.D. Cal. Case Number: 2:23-bk-10918-ER**

- F.3. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**9300 Wilshire, LLC v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; City of Redondo Beach Department of Community Development; and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive**

**Case Number: 23STCP02189**

- F.4. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**New Commune DTLA LLC v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive**

**Case Number: 23STCV10146**

- F.5. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**New Commune DTLA, LLC v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; City of Redondo Beach Department of**

**Community Development, et al.  
Case Number: 23STCP00426**

- F.6. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**New Commune DTLA, LLC and Leonid Pustilnikov v. City of Redondo Beach and City Council of the City of Redondo Beach  
Case Number: 22TRCP00203**

- F.7. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**City of Redondo Beach, et al. v. California State Water Resources Control Board  
Case Number: 20STCP03193**

- F.8. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**Yes in My Back Yard, a California nonprofit corporation; SONJA TRAUSS, an individual v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; City of Redondo Beach Department of Community Development, and DOES 1 through 25 inclusive  
Case Number: 23TRCP00325**

- G. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION – 6:00 p.m.**

Mayor Light reconvened to Open Session at 6:00 p.m.

- H. ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk  
Mike Witzansky, City Manager  
Melissa Villa, Analyst

- I. ANNOUNCEMENT OF CLOSED SESSION ACTIONS**

City Manager Witzansky announced there were no reportable actions taken during Closed Session.

**J. ADJOURN TO REGULAR MEETING**

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to adjourn to the regular meeting at 6:00 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

**6:00 PM - OPEN SESSION - REGULAR MEETING**

**A. CALL TO ORDER**

A Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 6:00 p.m. by Mayor Light in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

**B. ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, CMC, City Clerk  
Mike Witzansky, City Manager  
Melissa Villa, Analyst

**C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION**

Mayor Light invited Veterans to stand and recognized them for their service.

Maddox, first grader, Washington Elementary School, led in the salute to the flag.

Mayor Light called for a moment of silence.

**D. PRESENTATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/ANNOUNCEMENTS**

**D.1. MAYOR'S COMMENDATION TO THE SPRING 2024 REDONDO BEACH LITTLE LEAGUE MAJORS CHAMPIONS, THE DODGERS**

Mayor Light presented the Mayor's Commendation to the Spring 2024 Redondo Beach Little League Majors Champions the Dodgers.

David Klewan thanked the City for its support throughout the years and spoke about the team's accomplishments.

## **D.2. MAYOR'S COMMENDATION TO LT. WAYNE WINDMAN FOR RECEIVING THE PEACE OFFICER STANDARDS AND TRAINING EXCELLENCE IN TRAINING LIFETIME ACHIEVEMENT AWARD**

Mayor Light called RBPB Chief Hoffman and RBPB Lieutenant Wayne Windman to the podium and presented the Mayor's Commendation to Lt. Windman for receiving the Peace Officer Standards and Training Excellence in Training Lifetime Achievement Award.

RBPB Chief Hoffman spoke about Lt. Windman's achievements and dedication to training and congratulated him for his service.

Councilmember Nehrenheim announced the upcoming Greek Festival hosted by the Greek Orthodox Church; discussed the Riviera Summer Festival and the fireworks show in the Harbor; reported he will attend the Independent Cities Association Seminar this weekend; reported the District 1 Community Meeting will be held on July 20th at Alta Vista where the City Manager will be a special guest; announced District 1 online Community Meeting will be on July 22nd at 6:30 p.m.

Councilmember Loewenstein commented favorably about the Fireworks Show on July 4th; expressed concerns about the effects of fireworks on animals; announced the L.A. County Police Canine Association Annual Show on July 27, 2024 at 1:00 p.m. at the Sea Hawk Bowl; thanked Interim Community Services Director Hause for being a guest at the recent District 2 Community Meeting and reported there will be no District 2 Community Meeting in July.

Councilmember Kaluderovic reported the District 3 Community Meeting will be on July 13th at 9:00 a.m. at Franklin Park; announced Shakespeare by the Sea at 7:00 p.m. on July 13th at Dominguez Park and another Shakespeare by the Sea at 7:00 p.m. on July 14<sup>th</sup> at Veterans Park.

Councilmember Obagi reported the COG Steering Committee discussed a Good Neighbor Pledge related to the City's response to homelessness after the Johnson vs Grants Pass Supreme Court ruling; and thanked RBPB and RBFB for working through the July 4th weekend and keeping the City safe.

Councilmember Behrendt reported attending the City of Inglewood State of the City event.

Mayor Light reported starting the Independence Day 5K event in Riviera Village; thanked City staff for their response to a recent coyote incident; noted that we have an endangered species on our waterfront that is recovering thanks to volunteers from the community, they are the El Segundo Blue Butterflies; he stated nature walks are being conducted by the South Bay Parkland Conservancy on July 13th and July 20th.

**E. APPROVE ORDER OF AGENDA**

City Manager Witzansky pulled Agenda Item H.11 from the agenda and reported it will be presented to City Council at a later date.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and approved by voice vote, the order of the agenda, as amended pulling Item No. H.11.

Motion carried, 5-0.

**F. AGENCY RECESS – 6:14 p.m.**

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and approved by voice vote, to recess to the Regular Meeting of the Community Financing Authority at 6:14 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

**F.1. REGULAR MEETING OF THE COMMUNITY FINANCING AUTHORITY**

**CONTACT:** WENDY COLLAZO, FINANCE DIRECTOR

**RECONVENE TO REGULAR MEETING FROM AGENCY MEETING – 6:20 p.m.**

**ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light

**G. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS**

**G.1 For Blue Folder Documents Approved at the City Council Meeting**

City Clerk Manzano announced Blue Folder Items for Items No. H.12, J.1, and N.1.

**H. CONSENT CALENDAR**

**H.1. APPROVE AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING FOR THE CITY COUNCIL  
ADJOURNED AND REGULAR MEETING OF JULY 9, 2024**

**CONTACT:** ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

**H.2. APPROVE MOTION TO READ BY TITLE ONLY AND WAIVE FURTHER  
READING OF ALL ORDINANCES AND RESOLUTIONS LISTED ON THE  
AGENDA**

**CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK**

**H.3. APPROVE THE FOLLOWING CITY COUNCIL MINUTES:  
A. MAY 7, 2024 ADJOURNED AND REGULAR MEETING**

**CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK**

**H.4. PAYROLL DEMANDS**

**CHECKS 29799-29825 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$22,415.14, PD. 6/21/24  
DIRECT DEPOSIT 280205-280841 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$2,375,127.35, PD.  
6/21/24**

**EFT/ACH \$9,246.68, PD. 5/10/24 (PP2410)**

**EFT/ACH \$9,246.68, PD. 5/24/24 (PP2411)**

**EFT/ACH \$439,080.31, PD. 6/5/24 (PP2411)**

**ACCOUNTS PAYABLE DEMANDS**

**CHECKS 114733-114965 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$3,739,154.51**

**EFT CALPERS MEDICAL INSURANCE \$470,324.15**

**DIRECT DEPOSIT 100008454-100008546 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$96,106.99,  
PD.7/1/24**

**REPLACEMENT DEMANDS 114731-114732**

**CONTACT: WENDY COLLAZO, FINANCE DIRECTOR**

**H.5. APPROVE CONTRACTS UNDER \$35,000:**

**1. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA EDISON  
COMPANY FOR A NEW METER AND SERVICE FOR THE MANHATTAN  
BEACH BLVD MEDIAN IRRIGATION SYSTEM AT 2506 MANHATTAN  
BEACH BLVD #U IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$1,306.32 EFFECTIVE  
JULY 9, 2024 UNTIL COMPLETED**

**2. This Item was pulled from the Consent Calendar for separate  
discussion by Councilmember Behrendt.**

**3. APPROVE A FOURTH AMENDMENT TO THE FUNDING AGREEMENT  
#92000000F5301 WITH LOS ANGELES COUNTY METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY (LACMTA) RECEIVED ON JUNE 17,  
2024 FOR THE GRANT AVENUE SIGNAL IMPROVEMENTS PROJECT,  
JOB NO. 41090 TO EXTEND THE LAPSING DATE OF THE PROJECT  
TERM TO FEBRUARY 29, 2024 AT NO ADDITIONAL COST TO THE CITY**

**CONTACT: WENDY COLLAZO, FINANCE DIRECTOR**

**H.6. This Item was pulled from the Consent Calendar for separate discussion  
by Councilmember Behrendt.**

H.7. This Item was pulled from the Consent Calendar for separate discussion by Councilmember Obagi.

H.8. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH SOUTH BAY CENTER SPE, LLC FOR CONTINUED OVERTIME DEPLOYMENT OF CITY POLICE OFFICERS AT THE SOUTH BAY GALLERIA FOR A REIMBURSEMENT AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$90,000 PER YEAR, AND A CITY COMMITMENT TO CONTRIBUTE \$30,000 OF UNREIMBURSED POLICE SERVICES ANNUALLY, FOR THE TERM JULY 1, 2024 THROUGH JUNE 30, 2026

CONTACT: JOE HOFFMAN, CHIEF OF POLICE

H.9. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2407-055, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING THE SUSPENSION OF PREFERENTIAL PARKING HOURS IN THE VINCENT AND VINCENT 2 PREFERENTIAL PARKING DISTRICTS ON JULY 27, 2024 FROM 11:00 AM TO 7:00 PM

CONTACT: JOE HOFFMAN, CHIEF OF POLICE

H.10. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH PEREGRINE TECHNOLOGIES, INC. FOR PLATFORM INTEGRATION SOFTWARE FOR AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$96,500 ANNUALLY FOR THE TERM JULY 9, 2024 TO JULY 8, 2025, WITH AN OPTION TO RENEW FOR TWO ADDITIONAL ONE-YEAR TERMS

CONTACT: JOE HOFFMAN, CHIEF OF POLICE

H.11. This Item was pulled from the Agenda by City Manager Witzansky and will be presented to City Council at a later date.

H.12. This Item was pulled from the Consent Calendar for separate discussion by Councilmember Obagi.

H.13. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2407-056, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, AMENDING THE OFFICIAL BOOK OF CLASS SPECIFICATIONS TO UPDATE THE POSITION OF BUILDING INSPECTOR

CONTACT: MARC WIENER, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

H.14. This Item was pulled from the Consent Calendar for separate discussion by Councilmember Loewenstein.

Councilmember Loewenstein pulled H.14 from the Consent Calendar for separate

discussion.

Councilmember Obagi pulled Items No. H.7 and H.12 from the Consent Calendar for separate discussion.

Councilmember Behrendt pulled Items No. H.5(2) and H.6 from the Consent Calendar for separate discussion.

Mayor Light invited public comments on the Consent Calendar.

Andrew Lesser, District 1, spoke about Item No. H.9; thanked RBPd Chief Hoffman for placing the item on the agenda, briefly summarized the item; discussed his participation in the Southern California Golden Retriever Rescue; announced the L.A. County Police Canine Association Annual Show on July 27, 2024 at 1:00 p.m. at the Sea Hawk Bowl.

Andy Porkchop urged Council to vote for free parking; mentioned attending a meeting and enjoyed mingling with the dogs and police officers; urged the public to attend the upcoming L.A. County Police Canine Association Annual Show.

There were no other public comments on the Consent Calendar.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic and approved by voice vote, the Consent Calendar, as presented except for H.11, which was continued to a later date, H.5(2), H.6, H.7, H.12 and H.14 which were pulled for separate discussion.

Motion carried, 5-0.

City Clerk Manzano read titles to Resolution No. CC-2407-055 and CC-2407-056.

## **I. EXCLUDED CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS**

### **H.5. APPROVE CONTRACTS UNDER \$35,000:**

**2. APPROVE A FIRST AMENDMENT TO THE PROFESSIONAL SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH MICHAEL BAKER INTERNATIONAL, INC. FOR DESIGN AND CONSTRUCTION SUPPORT SERVICES FOR THE AVIATION BLVD NORTHBOUND AT ARTESIA BLVD RIGHT TURN LANE PROJECT, JOB NO. 40780, IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$27,695 FOR THE TERM ENDING DECEMBER 31, 2025 WITH A ONE-YEAR RENEWAL OPTION**

Councilmember Behrendt announced his abstention on Item No. H.5(2).

City Clerk Manzano reported receiving one eComment in relation to this item.

There were no other public comments.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic and approved by voice vote, Item No. H.5.(2).

Motion carried, 4-0-1. Councilmember Behrendt abstained.

## **H.6. EXCUSED ABSENCES FROM VARIOUS COMMISSION AND COMMITTEE MEETINGS**

**CONTACT:** ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK

Councilmember Behrendt mentioned notes from the City Clerk referencing policy and wondered whether City Council would like to discuss this policy sometime in the future.

Councilmember Nehrenheim reported he has looked at the excused absences issue for a long time; mentioned the inconsistencies with attendance rosters and absences being recorded; stated the ordinance requires requests for excused absences need to be done prior to the meeting date; asked for clarification on attendance rosters being attached and mentioned not seeing the attendance summary report in a long time.

In response to Councilmember Nehrenheim's question, City Clerk Manzano mentioned it has been inconsistent but a new person has been added and this should bring consistency to the attendance summary report.

More discussion ensued regarding making the policy clearer.

In reply to Councilmember Kaluderovic's question, Councilmember Behrendt spoke about cases of family emergencies where absences are unexpected.

Mayor Light asked if unexcused absences are reported.

City Clerk Manzano reported that she has not had any unexcused absences in the last six months, so far.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Ron Maroko felt that unexcused absences should be reported in summary reports; reported he has been tracking commission absences for a long time; presented numerous examples, including meetings that were cancelled because of a lack of a quorum; addressed requests for excused absences; the proper process for meetings when there is a lack of quorum; talked about the need for more robust reporting to City Council and to the community.

There were no other public comments.

Councilmember Behrendt stated this seems to overlay with Item H.14 and urged the public to submit recommendations, questions, and comments in writing for City Council to review.

Councilmember Obagi addressed a question to the City Attorney; he posed if a commission meeting convenes, and there is no quorum, has a meeting really occurred. Laughter ensued.

City Attorney Webb confirmed no meeting would have actually occurred; he directed Council to review Section 2-9.107 of the Charter dealing with uniform regulations on commissions; noted the City already has the necessary tools in place; stated he did not think there is a requirement to request an excused absence beforehand and suggested a referral to Staff for a summary report to determine the scope of the problem.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi to excuse the absences from the various Commissions and Committee meetings and direct the City Clerk to return with a list of Commissioners who have been absent for 60 days or longer.

Councilmember Nehrenheim mentioned absent for two consecutive meetings.

Councilmember Kaluderovic suggested unexcused absences for the last four months; noting the Council has not been getting that information.

City Attorney Webb reported some commissions meet less frequently than monthly and suggested keeping it at 60 days or longer.

Councilmember Nehrenheim suggested listing the data from when Commissioners were sworn in (September).

Amended motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Behrendt, and approved by voice vote, to excuse the absences from the various Commissions and Committee meetings and direct the City Clerk to return with a list of Commissioners who have been absent for 60 days or longer and have unexcused absences.

The amended motion carried, 5-0.

**H.7. APPROVE PLANS AND SPECIFICATIONS FOR THE ARTESIA BOULEVARD SAFETY IMPROVEMENTS PROJECT, JOB NO. 41330, AND AUTHORIZE THE CITY CLERK TO ADVERTISE THE PROJECT FOR COMPETITIVE BIDDING**

**CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR**

Councilmember Obagi reported pulling this item to allow Public Works Director Winje to discuss the various proposed project improvements related to this item.

Public Works Director Winje provided a brief history of the project and addressed project goals, specific improvements and changes at Artesia and Rindge to improve safety including bulb-outs and bollards; stated they are at the point where they are ready to put this out for public bidding process; continued on giving more details on the project's goals.

Councilmember Obagi mentioned bulb-outs on Grant and reported receiving feedback regarding drivers struggling to make a right turn around bulb-outs; suggested slanting the corner to warn drivers so they do not hit the bollards, especially during early implementation.

Public Works Director Winje reported the purpose of the bulb-outs is to signal drivers to move their vehicle into the traffic lane and remain there until they make a right rather than going against the curb.

Discussion followed regarding safety for pedestrians, citing various scenarios that may lead to dangerous situations. Public Works Director Winje clarified the intention of the use of bollards and bulb-outs; stating they are not meant for refuge for pedestrians but to signal drivers to slow down and wait to proceed into the traffic lanes; suggestions were made on the design; more explanation was given. The Mayor voiced his concerns for pedestrian safety; concerns were addressed.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Ron Maroko commented on the intersection; mentioned the interaction between bicycles and eBikes on the subject corner should also be a concern; stated that is where the real risk is.

Andy Porkchop opined this project will only slow down traffic; opposed the project.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and approved by voice vote, to approve Item No. H.7.

The motion carried, 5-0.

**H.12. INTRODUCE BY TITLE ONLY ORDINANCE NO. 3272-24, AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, REPEALING SECTIONS 2-9.201 THROUGH 2-9.303, AND SECTIONS 2-9.1101 THROUGH 2-9.1203 OF THE REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE REGARDING THE HISTORICAL, PRESERVATION,**

**LIBRARY, AND RECREATION AND PARKS COMMISSIONS, AND ADDING SECTIONS 2-9.1501 THROUGH 2-9.1503 REGARDING THE CONSOLIDATED PUBLIC AMENITIES COMMISSION. FOR INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING.**

**CONTACT:** LUKE SMUDE, ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER

Councilmember Obagi addressed an email from Steve Colin, Chair of the Historical Commission, included in Blue Folder Items; stated the Chair harassed City staff Gary Margolis and Elizabeth Hause about decisions that City Council made to appoint Mayor Light; Councilmember Obagi clarified City staff does not make that decision and stated Council makes that decision; he lists other parts of the email that are sexist and incorrect; goes on to berate the behavior of this Commissioner. Councilmember Obagi stated he wanted to ensure this email is part of the City's history.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi to approve Item No. H.12.

Councilmember Behrendt felt this item overlaps the discussion regarding H.6 relative to issues with quorums; reported reviewing correspondence from Jennifer Hall, Chair of the Library Commission and a letter from the Recreation and Parks Commissioner; opined the letters raised some valid points; talked about the potential of the proposal improving the situation for staff and members of the public; stated he is in favor of the proposal; mentioned changes can be made if it does not work out.

Mayor Light mentioned numbers he compiled when he was putting in his recommendations for commissions; stated that in 2023, across the four commissions, 18 meetings were cancelled for various reasons; stated that the average actionable items per year resulted in three per commission per meeting; stated he thought that was a digestible amount; felt when an item is of more importance, members will get more engaged and there will be less absences and less cancellations.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Ron Maroko, District 3, voiced that consolidating may not be a good idea; recognized it is City Council and Staff's prerogative to try something and that commissioners serve at the pleasure of the Council; thanked Assistant to the City Manager Smude for his work on the matter; wished Council good luck; opined that combining commissions results in a reduction in community involvement which contradicts Council's goal.

Andy Porkchop spoke about the policy of commissions and committees in the City of Torrance and opposed limiting participation by citizens in City government.

There were no other public comments.

Councilmember Obagi restated the motion.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Behrendt and carried by voice vote, to introduce, by title only, Ordinance No. 3272-24, an ordinance of the City Council of the City of Redondo Beach, California, repealing sections 2-9.201 through 2-9.303, and sections 2-9.1101 through 2-9.1203 of the Redondo Beach Municipal Code regarding the Historical, Preservation, Library, and Recreation and Parks Commissions and adding sections 2-9.1501 through 2-9.1503 regarding the Consolidated Public Amenities Commission for Introduction and First Reading.

The motion carried 5-0.

City Clerk Manzano read title to Ordinance No. 3272-24.

**H.14. APPROVE UPDATES TO THE MASTER FEE RESOLUTIONS TO REFLECT THE FINAL 2024-25 FISCAL YEAR BUDGET ADOPTION MOTION AND TO SET JULY 10, 2024 AS THE EFFECTIVE DATE FOR THE FEES THAT DO NOT REQUIRE ORDINANCE MODIFICATION PRIOR TO IMPLEMENTATION**

**ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2406-049, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, AMENDING THE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT USER FEES, AS AMENDED**

**ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2406-050, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, AMENDING THE PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT USER FEES, AS AMENDED**

**ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2406-051, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, AMENDING THE POLICE DEPARTMENT USER FEES, AS AMENDED**

**ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2406-052, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, AMENDING THE COMMUNITY SERVICES DEPARTMENT USER FEES, AS AMENDED**

**CONTACT: WENDY COLLAZO, FINANCE DIRECTOR**

Councilmember Loewenstein highlighted items approved in the FY 2024/2025 budget including increases to fees at Alta Vista Park, Aviation Park Gym (large and small gyms), picnic shelters, maintenance fees and parking permits; stated how much this budget meeting bothered him; he was disappointed in the lack of

cooperation with Council and the lack of consideration for residents; explained that is why he voted against the majority; he stated it will be his last budget he votes on; touched on parts of the budget that bothered him but not wanting to rehash it all; urged fellow Councilmembers to consider what residents want and not what staff wants; not spend every bit of the budget then placing the burden on the backs of residents; asked Council to provide services at reasonable costs and fees to residents instead of making money off residents. He stated he will vote, "No" on this item as he feels it is the wrong thing to do; he only went with the majority because Council had to pass the budget.

Councilmember Obagi indicated his surprise and mentioned Lowenstein's budget allocated \$65,000 to replace box signs and \$72,000 to paint traffic poles, which do not enhance anyone's quality of life; talked about not funding for the Wiley Sump Preserve, raising rent for the Redondo Beach Performing Arts Center, and highlighted other items; he stated his budget focused on what was strictly necessary to deliver high-quality service to residents in terms of after-school programs, resurfacing tennis courts, appropriating money for sound insulation for pickleball and noted support for the increases.

Councilmember Kaluderovic stated that fees had to be raised in order to hire more staff to provide services for residents; mentioned she does not want to subsidize concealed weapons and added the City is raising fees because it is not creating revenue in other places.

Councilmember Loewenstein mentioned the box signs are to benefit the whole city; stated he spent only \$40,000 in District 2, other than Wilderness Park (which benefits everyone); noted he did not spend the Subdivision Public Park Trust Fund bringing it down to zero. Additionally, he stated that painting traffic poles are for the entire City.

Councilmember Nehrenheim agreed with Councilmember Loewenstein's comments in opposing this item; noted the City experienced a record-revenue year before raising the fees; referenced a quote from years back stating "California doesn't have a revenue problem, it has a spending problem" and said this Council spends too much; referenced the upcoming bond matter; felt that cancelling free parking at Riviera Village this year will be a shock to residents; reported he will join Councilmember Loewenstein in opposing this item.

Councilmember Obagi stated that Council cannot use credit cards; noted the Charter requires that the budget must be balanced; stated many of the appropriations in District 2 are one-time expenditures and investments; noted they are not recurring and felt that is why the City will have a big surplus next year.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Andy Porkchop opined the City of Torrance is in trouble because they raised taxes

and fees; mentioned a lot of people are leaving Southern California for that reason; voiced his opposition on raising taxes and fees since people will not be able to live here.

City Clerk Manzano reported receiving one comment on Zoom and one eComment in opposition to this item.

There were no other public comments.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Behrendt, and carried by voice vote, to approve updates to the Master Fee Resolutions to reflect the final 2024-25 Fiscal Year Budget Adoption motion and to set July 10, 2024 as the effective date for the fees that do not require ordinance modification prior to implementation, Adopt by Title Only Resolution No. CC-2406-049, a resolution of the City Council of the City of Redondo Beach, California, amending the Community Development Department user fees, as amended, Adopt by Title Only Resolution No. CC-2406-050, a resolution of the City Council of the City of Redondo Beach, California, amending the Public Works Department user fees, as amended, Adopt by Title Only Resolution No. CC-2406-051, a resolution of the City Council of the City of Redondo Beach, California, amending the Police Department user fees, as amended and Adopt by Title Only Resolution No. CC-2406-052, a resolution of the City Council of the City of Redondo Beach, California, amending the Community Services Department user fees as amended.

The motion carried 3-2. Councilmembers Loewenstein and Nehrenheim voted no.

City Clerk Manzano read title to Resolutions No. CC-2406-049, CC-2406-050, CC-2406-051 and CC-2406-052.

## **J. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS**

### **J.1 For eComments and Emails Received from the Public**

Joan Irvine, District 1, suggested that Council consider where the City may be if there had been timely development on the Waterfront, if the Legado project had not been delayed, no special elections, and if the City had embraced the potential of cannabis dispensaries in 2017; felt that Redondo Beach could be in a robust, economic position; talked about not being able to change the past, but having the power to move forward; asked about the status of the cannabis ordinance and applications for retail cannabis in the City; felt it is hypocritical that society accepts alcohol use in front of minors while expressing concerns about cannabis; submitted copies of a research study that found teen use of cannabis decreases when cannabis is legalized and regulated.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and carried by voice vote, to receive and file copies of an article, submitted by Joan Irvine.

The motion carried 5-0.

Joan Irvine discussed the benefits of legalization; talked about gun violence and potential impacts of cannabis in reducing gun violence and urged City Council to prioritize this issue for the benefit of the community.

Ray Hollar, Lawndale, discussed the Metro C-Line Extension Project and the May Metro Board meeting; thanked the Mayor and other city representatives for attending and speaking at that meeting; spoke in support of Niki Negrete-Mitchell regarding her urgent request for help on the Metro Line issue; encouraged more residents to get involved so that Metro can hear new voices; noted that the Green Line extension will change the South Bay forever.

Niki Negrete-Mitchell, District 3, spoke about discussions at the May Metro Board meeting; discussed a vote on an amendment presented by Metro Board Member James Butts; requested for a more detailed analysis of the LPA and the Hawthorne Boulevard option; noted the amendment was not included in the meeting minutes and Metro is acting like the amendment never happened; detailed what took place at the meeting and the outrage she and others felt; mentioned a request a formal, legal inquiry into the matter.

Holly Osborne, District 5, explained the illustrations of the ROW regarding the Metro C-Line Extension Project; voiced her frustrations regarding the design and noted it is not the LPA but rather the Metro preferred alternative.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and carried by voice vote, to extend the speaking time for Holly Osborne by 30 seconds.

The motion carried 5-0.

Holly Osborne mentioned Metro has talked about extending freight trains in front of senior housing and stated she will continue to educate Council on the design.

Bob Pinzler referenced a discussion, in last Sunday's New York Times magazine, about cannabis in the State of New York and the failures they have experienced from their implementation of cannabis policies; encouraged Councilmembers to read it to learn about the pitfalls; pointed out that no matter the issue, someone has had an experience that others can learn from.

Andy Porkchop thanked Council for the fireworks show; talked about the City of Torrance calendar of events; discussed public transportation and safety; thanked the City for allowing three minutes to speak.

City Clerk Manzano reported receiving one eComment regarding this item.

Nancy Skiba, District 4, via Zoom, thanked City Council for the fireworks show on July 4, 2024.

There were no other public comments.

**K. EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS - None**

**L. PUBLIC HEARINGS - None**

**M. ITEMS CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS AGENDAS – None**

**N. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION PRIOR TO ACTION**

**N.1. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING SELECTION OF A COLOR PALETTE FOR THE NEW CITY LOGO AND NEXT STEPS FOR LOGO IMPLEMENTATION**

**CONTACT: ELIZABETH HAUSE, INTERIM COMMUNITY SERVICES DIRECTOR**

Interim Community Services Director Hause narrated a PowerPoint presentation with details of the Administrative Report; provided more explanation on the options for colors; asked Council to select the official colors for the approved logo design.

Traffic Engineer Liu presented examples of existing street name signs; reported the City is no longer allowed to use all capital letters for street names according to a new state and federal law; explained in 2009 that law was implemented to increase legibility; detailed the implementation of new signs and presented samples of the proposed new street signs along with examples of other cities; explained the various fonts allowed and other details to consider in the decision regarding new street signs.

Interim Community Services Director Hause stated that a decision on the new street signs was not needed tonight; gave some direction on how Council should proceed in the selection process; noted Staff would work with Stellen Design to develop design guidelines.

Councilmember Obagi asked Traffic Engineer Liu to hold up two signs in the back of the Council Chambers; felt the blue signs are the most legible and clear between the green and blue signs.

In reply to Councilmember Behrendt's question about gradients, Interim Community Services Director Hause stated it would be preferable to use consistent colors and gradients across the board; explained the reasons the designer preferred gradient No. 22.

Councilmember Behrendt directed a question to the City Attorney; asked, in respect to protecting intellectual property of the City, whether only the approved gradient would be protected; City Attorney Webb stated he will get that answered by someone with expertise and will return to Council with a response.

Councilmember Loewenstein stated there is a reason highway signs are green; mentioned that darker blue is distracting to the eye and less visible at night; noted there are various reasons the Redondo Beach signs are green; suggested that people Google the reasons for more information; expressed support for green street signs. Additionally, he talked about many street signs being faded; recommended replacing those as soon as possible; suggested keeping an inventory of faded street signs and replacing those prior to changing any that aren't as damaged.

Traffic Engineer Liu reported a part-time staff member is working on making an inventory of signs that need to be replaced.

Councilmember Loewenstein mentioned it would be great if Council could settle on a design as soon as possible in order to start replacement of faded signs and lighted box signs with the new logo design.

Councilmember Nehrenheim spoke about challenges of having a gradient on the logo; addressed lack of consistency in signs in terms of the logo design, colors and the proposed color palettes. He reported results of an informal poll that he conducted resulted in a majority of respondents preferring the logo with gradient 22, with the white background, and including green in the logo to tie in with the green street signs; opined that with a green sign, there will be a cleaner transition and respects the history of the City.

More discussion ensued regarding the various gradients.

Councilmember Kaluderovic spoke in support of gradient 22 and the green background.

Councilmember Obagi agreed with using a green background for the street signs; displayed a photo of an existing green and blue street signs together; believed that using the green background would blend in more with existing old signs; stated he likes gradient 22 but questioned the use of the mustard color.

Interim Community Services Director Hause reported she can work with the artist to make the yellow a brighter shade.

Councilmember Obagi stated his support for gradient 22 and green backgrounds for City street signs.

City Manager Witzansky reported that the vast majority of street signs in the City are green; in response to Councilmember Nehrenheim's question regarding what is done with the old signs, City Manager Witzansky stated that they are recycled and rescreened.

Councilmember Nehrenheim suggested auctioning street signs and allocating the proceeds to local non-profits.

City Manager Witzansky noted that reuse helps the City alleviate some of its cost burden and noted there would be costs associated with auctioning or donating City street signs.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Bob Pinzler commented that gradient 27 resembles the “smog sunset” logo; wondered why the 2009 “new” State law regarding the prohibition of using all capital letters for street signs was not implemented sooner; agreed with using a green background for street signs.

Andy Porkchop agreed the signs should be green; talked about the City of Torrance street signs; noticed Torrance Boulevard has blue street signs; commented on saving money for tax payers.

Sue Brennan spoke in support of green signs; felt yellow and white may not blend well; indicated she would be interested in buying a street sign; agreed it would be a good fundraiser.

City Clerk Manzano reported receiving two eComments; one in support of the item and one neutral.

There were no other public comments on this item.

City Manager Witzansky reported the artist will prepare a kit to present to City Council with a final version of the proposed street sign and logo.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and carried by voice vote, to approve the use of green street signs with white and using gradient 22 (Option 1) and to direct staff to work with the artist on the color palette and to make the flat yellow color brighter.

The motion carried 5-0.

## **N.2. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE SCOPE OF WORK FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF A CITYWIDE PARKS SYSTEM ASSESSMENT**

**CONTACT:** ELIZABETH HAUSE, INTERIM COMMUNITY SERVICES DIRECTOR

Interim Community Services Director Hause introduced Deputy Community Services Director Orta; she and Deputy Community Services Director Orta presented the scope of work for the development of a Citywide Parks Master Plan. She noted that, currently, there are no funds in the budget for a Parks Master Plan; presented a PowerPoint to explain further their vision on the plan; provided reasons why the Master Plan is needed, options on how to design the plan; recommendations on specific visions for the City; looking for Council’s direction whether this is something the City would consider pursuing.

City Manager Witzansky explained it was purposeful that Staff does not include this effort as part of this year's budget; explained the Community Services Department is in transition and is focusing on outstanding projects; noted that, at some point, there will be a permanent Community Services Director and Parks Services Manager; believed within six months, Staff may have the ability to do an internal assessment, understand maintenance and other needs and return when there is more bandwidth to spend resources on those efforts; discussion ensued.

Mayor Light commented on the elimination of the lower pond at Wilderness Park and the misuse of funds to try to recreate it; opined the General Parks Master Plan is a waste of time; felt the City should utilize the resources already available instead of using money to pay for the information; felt the City is park poor and has experienced a slight reduction of park lands partially because of losing the community center at Knob Hill and because the population has steadily grown; discussed major renovations occurring at Seaside Lagoon and a Master Plan from OB that has not been implemented but had money set aside for, and now the money is gone; reported he is hesitant on supporting another Master Plan until the City executes on the projects that have already been identified and that it has committed to do. He added that Staff has enough on its plate; believes if given more time, the work could be done internally and voiced opposition to moving forward on this matter.

Councilmember Kaluderovic reported she had asked to include this matter on the Strategic Plan last year; explained she did not mean for it to be an assessment of park conditions, but rather a holistic assessment of park use; spoke about play structure costs; spoke about misuse of park space and the redundancy of the equipment provided; clarified her goal for evaluation was to determine who uses the parks and how to best serve the entire community. She agreed with Mayor Light as far as the City's workload but saw the need for such an evaluation in the future; asked to keep the topic on the Strategic Plan and supported pausing this effort for now.

Councilmember Nehrenheim referenced an Administrative Report in 2021 regarding the condition of amenities in City parks and parkettes; reported the Recreation and Parks Commission reviewed the report and made recommendations; displayed a report done by the county in 2016 that categorized parks and open spaces in Redondo Beach; noted it can be used as a guide going forward and urged the use of similar reports and studies already conducted rather than spend additional money and time. Councilmember Nehrenheim stated he will submit the reports into the record.

Councilmember Loewenstein agreed with Mayor Light; stated the City has many projects in the hopper that should be executed first and are already funded; referenced a past parks amenities assessment and asked if that report could be found.

In response to his question, City Manager Witzansky stated he was sure it could be pulled; addressed the status of the Regional Park restrooms and the Dog Park; agreed the priority now is execution rather than planning for the next round of projects.

Mayor Light acknowledged Councilmember Kaluderovic's request for an assessment of park use rather than conditions and felt it would be beneficial to find out whether the City is correctly programming parks.

City Manager Witzansky agreed that a comprehensive Parks Master Plan would be of value and that is what the proposed Master Plan was intended to do.

Mayor Light again suggested that City staff could work on the comprehensive Parks Master Plan internally.

City Manager Witzansky agreed they could but it would take time and energy; noted it would require community meetings, input and feedback; agreed with the assessment of the parks having too much play structures and are misused; reiterated they are already loaded with current projects they need to complete and it is prioritization of effort that needs to be the City's focus.

Councilmember Obagi agreed with Mayor Light and Councilmember Kaluderovic; recalled when this was brought up it was about parkettes and maintenance; noted with the amount of parkettes the City has it would be overwhelming to assess them all; suggested it would be good to get a consultation on parkettes alone in terms of a plan for maintaining or replacing them moving forward to utilize the space for what the community wants or needs.

City Manager Witzansky reported the scope of work included in developing a master plan; spoke about the need to have someone able to manage that effort; noted the lack of resources and capacity to move forward with one at this time.

Councilmember Obagi commented on the work being completed at the various parks; felt the City is taking care of the major parks; suggested directing staff, once departments are fully staffed, to return with an analysis of existing parkettes including how they are being used, maintenance requirements to continue those uses and what alternative uses could be made and provide outreach to residents.

Councilmember Kaluderovic reiterated there is value in this, but not at this time; agreed with segmenting and analyzing just the parkettes and spoke about having a holistic view of the City in terms of residents' proximity to major parks.

City Manager Witzansky asserted that when Staff returns with the strategic plan conversation, Council could decide how to move forward.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic to pause the effort at this time, and as Council revisits the strategic plan it can decide how to move forward.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Ron Maroko, District 3, suggested this could be a great project for the Youth Commission to undertake; inquired about the possibility of implementing pickleball at the parkettes.

Councilmember Kaluderovic reported getting complaints from neighbors near parkettes but agreed this would be a good project for the Youth Commission; stated many middle school students do not have places to hang out.

Mayor Light remembered when students came before Council advocating for a skate park and agreed with engaging the youth of different ages.

Andy Porkchop spoke about the importance of parks; agreed hiring a consultant for a master plan would be a waste of money and talked about making school yards available for kids.

There were no other public comments on this item.

In response to Councilmember Obagi's question about the Youth Commission, Mayor Light reported it will be active in October.

Councilmember Obagi offered a friendly amendment to direct the Youth Commission, when it is effective, to inventory all City parks, their amenities and conditions with a photo book report; providing feedback on the needs and desired uses of the parks from their perspective.

Councilmember Kaluderovic welcomed the amendment but did not agree with asking them to report on the conditions of the parks but to focus on the programming.

The amended motion was restated.

Amended motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and carried by voice vote, to pause the effort at this time and to direct the Youth Commission, when it is effective, to inventory all City parks from a programming perspective.

The amended motion carried 5-0.

## **O. CITY MANAGER ITEM**

City Manager Witzansky thanked the RBPD, RBFd and Traffic Control for the Fourth of July events and fireworks show; noted it was a team effort and recognized the hard work put into the event; mentioned they have less complaints overall from previous years; announced the launch of the City's external facing online building permit program in early August.

## **P. MAYOR AND COUNCIL ITEMS**

**P.1. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE CHARTER REVIEW ADVISORY COMMITTEE'S REPORT RECOMMENDATIONS REGARDING THE PROCESS OF "PUBLISHING" AND RESIDENCY REQUIREMENTS AS DIRECTED BY COUNCIL AND;**

**LETTER TO COUNCIL FROM THE REDONDO BEACH UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT DATED MAY 29, 2024 REGARDING A CHARTER CHANGE AMENDING SECTION 16.1, BOARD MEMBERS, REGARDING COMPENSATION**

**DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE COMMITTEE'S FUTURE WORK OR DISBANDMENT**

Bob Pinzler, Member, Charter Review Advisory Committee (CRAC), discussed a memo given to City Council regarding the two remaining items including the process of publishing and residency requirements; spoke about the CRAC looking to the future with respect to the recommended Charter changes; talked about the possibility of local newspapers disappearing in the future and requiring publishing for bids and reported the CRAC's recommendations are to eliminate the word "newspaper" and to generalize it to be following State law giving Council flexibility on this issue for 20-25 years. In terms of bids, he reported there are requirements in State law to publish notices in printed form, in newspapers; mentioned speaking with a Councilmember from Arcadia who told him they are trying to make the requirement as generic as possible so they can deal with changes without having to go through the Charter process; talked about changes in technology and the difficulty it poses due to its ability to change so quickly.

Ron Maroko, Member, CRAC, explained the Committee attempted to save costs in terms of printing (i.e., the General Plan).

Joe Dawidziak, Member, CRAC, spoke about the Committee discussing the possibility of mailing postcards to residents with a QR code to access electronic notices and documents, such as the Building Code or the General Plan; mentioned installing kiosks at specific locations for the public to access electronic information and stated the CRAC is trying to offer Council the flexibility to adapt to technology changes in the future.

Councilmember Behrendt commended the CRAC for a job well done and hoped Council can make some changes that will accomplish what the CRAC is recommending.

Mayor Light commented on having the ordinances ready to go for the initial round as things will come up quickly after the election.

City Attorney Webb referenced Section 420 and materials related to the City of Arcadia, which was the most recent amendment of a Charter City; they distinguished

between matters of municipal affairs and local affairs; stated that for municipal affairs, changes can be done by ordinance and provides the most flexibility for Council and making it clear that matters that do not pertain solely to municipal affairs have to comply with applicable law.

In response to Mayor Light's question, City Attorney Webb reported that Article 27 specifically uses the word "mail" and changing it to "publish" would not change the requirement that it be mailed; suggested City Council may want to change both.

Discussion followed regarding whether "mail" included email, and whether amending Article 27, in the same spirit as eliminating the word "publish", would allow Council to do.

Councilmember Nehrenheim confirmed publishing would be "as defined by City ordinance".

Member Maroko added that Council has the discretion to change what it wants "published"; mentioned looking at options for reducing costs of printing in newspapers; reported the CRAC ultimately decided to change "publish" to give Council the maximum flexibility for changes in the future.

Member Dawidziak spoke about whether people really read newspaper notices.

Councilmember Nehrenheim mentioned the CRAC pointed out that the current newspaper, wherein the City publishes its notices, does not get delivered to residents anymore.

Member Maroko added that, per State law, the City will need an official newspaper until the law changes.

Councilmember Nehrenheim agreed to changing the definition and adding "as per City ordinance".

City Attorney Webb displayed a slide of the City of Arcadia's Section 420; read over the section pertaining to the discussion and suggested using this as an example but not necessarily using the exact wording.

Councilmember Loewenstein agreed with verbiage "as per ordinance"; talked about Democracy and access to it via cellphones; noted the availability of computers in the Library; liked the idea of a QR code; suggested providing the option of requesting hard copies on the QR code postcard; commended the CRAC for their hard work.

In reply to Councilmember Obagi's questions regarding the City Attorney's understanding of the CRAC recommendations, City Attorney Webb understood that City Council will remove the requirement for matters of purely municipal concerns to publish in a local newspaper, bifurcate the rules for purely municipal matters and

leave them up to ordinance; for matters that are not purely municipal, Council will comply with State law.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim to accept the Charter Review Advisory Committee's recommendation to remove the requirement for matters of purely municipal concerns to publish in a local newspaper, bifurcate the rules for purely municipal matters and leave them up to ordinance; for matters that are not purely municipal Council will comply with State law.

Councilmember Obagi requested a friendly amendment to include an amendment regarding the references to "mail" in Article 27.

City Attorney Webb stated that is not on tonight's agenda and stated Staff will return for direction regarding Article 27.

Councilmember Obagi seconded by motion.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Councilmember Loewenstein left the Chambers at 9:20 p.m.

Andy Porkchop spoke about the need to follow State and Federal guidelines; suggested posting notices on school bulletin boards or mailing flyers to residents; noted that not a lot of people read them and nobody else cares.

Councilmember Loewenstein returned to the Chambers at approximately 9:23 p.m.

Councilmember Kaluderovic left the Chambers at approximately 9:23 p.m.

There were no other public comments on this item.

The motion carried 4-0-1. Councilmember Kaluderovic was absent.

Councilmember Kaluderovic returned to the Chambers at approximately 9:25 p.m.

Member Maroko discussed the CRAC's consideration of a definition of "residence"; reported he was the only member who opposed the CRAC's recommendation; stated it was decided that the standard should be where a person is registered to vote; opined "resident" and "registered to vote" seemed ambiguous but the CRAC decided to include a definition and an analysis of how it came to its decision.

Member Pinzler added that the issue was how to define a "registered voter" and the CRAC decided it is whatever the Registrar of Voters indicates; explained the existing County structure and felt that is the best way to go. Additionally, he explained by filing a police report violation of the Charter can be made public; mentioned the CRAC felt that 30 days (prior to filing) seemed to be the right amount of time for a person to be

considered a resident of the City and qualify to run for office.

Discussion followed regarding the reason for determining 30 days; the possibility of establishing a longer period; and addressing the Mayor's position.

City Attorney Webb stated that 30 days is the maximum for requiring residency; noted that holding office is a fundamental right that cannot be unduly restricted, and courts seem to frown on requiring longer.

Member Dawidziak noted that 30 days may not be beneficial to any community of interest; mentioned there may be a nefarious point of intent with no concern about longevity and indicated he voted for the CRAC's recommendation to 30 days but did not agree.

Councilmember Loewenstein agreed. City Attorney Webb reported that unfortunately, the California Supreme Court does not; noting it held that any requirement that is more than 30 days is a violation of the Equal Protection Clause.

Mayor Light wondered whether the Mayoral and other elected positions should be changed to require elected officials have to remain a resident during their term(s) in office.

City Attorney Webb stated Council has no obligation to change it; could change it for the Mayoral position but questioned the need to change the other three elected positions as it would be harder for them to change their residencies as the positions are mostly full-time jobs and neither can leave the City for longer than 30 days. He added that the Mayor position is the easiest to change; suggested, for the other three, Council may want to remove the 30 days and indicate "resident" or add "and remain a resident".

Member Pinzler stated that the CRAC's recommendation is to, for clarification purposes, add the Mayor and all Citywide offices.

Councilmember Obagi asked if the CRAC considered whether a person should have an intent to remain a resident of the City to continue to hold office.

Member Dawidziak reported the CRAC had that discussion, mainly because he prolonged it, and decided "residency" would be considered at the time a person files to run for office.

Member Pinzler spoke about complications in including "intent" and noted intent is almost impossible to prove.

Councilmember Nehrenheim reported the State definition as "domicile" rather than "residence"; stated residency can be changed only by the union of "act" and "intent"; felt the only things that need to be cleaned up are the Mayor, elected positions and

Councilmembers.

City Attorney Webb disagreed; spoke about there being volumes of AG opinions as to what constitutes residency and what does not; encouraged Council to review it; talked about moral turpitude and residency and how it is a fundamental right that a tie go to the office holder and there was initial direction to define it so it can be interpreted more clearly; reported he provided a number of different definitions of State law that defines residency, differently and stated Council can pick any of those to include in the Charter, for purposes of being elected and that “domicile” is one acceptable method.

Additionally, City Attorney Webb explained that if there is a criminal violation of the Charter, the case goes to the Police Department or another investigative agency. If it is a felony, it begins with the DA’s office, unless they reject it and refer it to the City Attorney. He addressed misdemeanor charges going straight to City Council; spoke about the processes in General Law cities and listed options available to City Council at this time.

Member Maroko reported that the intent remains with the City Council as the fact finders.

Councilmember Nehrenheim stated that for voting purposes, the State defines “residency” as a person’s domicile and read the applicable statutes; referenced the City’s Carry Concealed Weapons permit as distinguishing between “residence” and “domicile” and reiterated the items needing to be cleaned up are the Mayor, elected positions and Councilmembers.

Again, City Attorney Webb disagreed; referenced Section 6.5; asserted that State law does not trump a Charter City in setting up elections; suggested that Council could take language from that section and include it in the Charter and then “domicile” would be the definition and noted that to declare that State law determines it is legally, incorrect and it ignores the different definitions of “residents” in the State.

Councilmember Nehrenheim noted Mr. Colantuono and other attorneys had different opinions and noted this involves election law.

In reply to Councilmember Obagi’s questions regarding whether Councilmember Nehrenheim’s goal is to have a domicile requirement, Councilmember Nehrenheim declared that “domicile” is “residence” and there is an equivalency.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, to incorporate the “domicile” requirements as defined in Election Code 349 (B) in the Charter and incorporate the continued “domicile” requirement to the Mayor and other Elected Offices, as deemed appropriate.

City Attorney Webb confirmed the City will continue the residency requirement and

will define “resident” using the exact language for use in the Charter and will continue for local municipal officials.

Member Pinzler commented on consideration of “qualified elector” indicating that they were registered to vote at a particular time and stated that seemed to be a clear indication of the current USPS change-of-address process where the USPS informs the Registrar of Voters there has been a change of address.

Discussion followed regarding picking a word and using it.

Councilmember Nehrenheim mentioned the need to include the 15-question test that the State of California uses to determine “domicile” and to consider several scenarios.

Councilmember Obagi clarified that the motion is not eliminating the current eligibility requirements that include “they shall be a registered voter”.

City Attorney Webb added it does not require that “they maintain”; felt that Council may not want to rush to a motion; referenced Government Code 36.502a, 17.70, 244, 34AA2 and others, and Elections Code 10.227; noted the City does not have to follow State law when determining qualifications for being a resident; urged City Council to carefully review the materials provided by the CRAC, especially the various competing definitions. In addition, he commented on case law in the City of Ojai regarding a Councilmember who became unhoused; spoke about needing to be specific enough that all future Councilmembers and future City Attorneys advising them understand the definition clearly.

Councilmember Obagi asked whether all bases would be covered if the City were to require that a person be registered to vote in the City, remain a registered voter of Redondo Beach and maintain a residence in Redondo Beach as defined by Elections Code 349; mentioned a previous issue where the term “residence” was ambiguous.

City Attorney Webb reported there is a problem with using both domicile and residence; talked about the need to define “domicile”; being specific that “residence” and “domicile” are interchangeable using only Elections Code 349 B and advised Council to look specifically at sections that deal with residency requirements to become elected for a General Law City or remain.

Amended motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, to include that “they shall be registered to vote in Redondo Beach, maintain registration to vote in Redondo Beach and include the definition of “domicile” as a requirement that they maintain in Redondo Beach (pulled from Elections Code 349 (B)).

City Attorney Webb stated he will include language that, “resident for this purpose means...” (taken from the Elections Code).

Councilmember Behrendt confirmed the City Attorney's advice for Council to review materials provided prior to making this "weighty" decision.

Councilmember Obagi withdrew the amended motion.

Substitute motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Behrendt, to direct the City Attorney to return to City Council with an amendment to the Charter that is consistent with the motion made, including for the Mayor and elected positions, but also give Council all of the research and background materials from the CRAC and continue the discussion on another day where Council can finalize its decision.

Councilmember Nehrenheim talked about the Charter being silent on this issue and opined it goes back to State law.

Discussion followed regarding specific sections of State law and case law regarding which definitions to use.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Andy Porkchop spoke about State and Federal laws; commented on using CCW information as proof of residency; stated support for a 30-day residency requirement and commented on Council's process.

Leslie Campeggi appreciated that Council can discuss issues robustly and present arguments for and against; indicated she does not appreciate someone from another city criticizing Redondo Beach's leadership and processes.

There were no other public comments.

The substitute motion carried 5-0 by voice vote.

Mayor Light mentioned the possibility of disbanding the CRAC.

Member Pinzler stated that the CRAC has addressed all of the items requested by City Council.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Behrendt, to disband the Charter Review Advisory Committee.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Eugene Solomon mentioned there will be issues that will still come up; urged City Council to be mindful that there are still things that need to be discussed regarding the City Charter and he hoped City Council will address these issues should Council disband the CRAC, such as the issue of filling vacancies.

Bob Pinzler suggested suspending the CRAC's operations rather than disbanding it.

There were no other public comments.

Councilmember Obagi commented on the number of amendments recommended by the CRAC and Council's need to handle those; thanked the CRAC for its work and felt there is a need to bring closure to this process at this point.

Councilmember Nehrenheim requested a list of outstanding Charter issues that Council will need to address.

Substitute motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, to suspend the CRAC and direct the committee to return with a list of outstanding Charter issues.

The substitute motion died for lack of a second.

The motion carried by voice vote, 4-1. Councilmember Nehrenheim voted, "No".

Mayor Light spoke about a request from the School Board asking to remove "without compensation".

Mayor Light invited public comments.

RBUSD Board Clerk Byung Cho thanked City Council for its service and considering this item; reported the letter speaks for itself and asked City Council to approve the changes as submitted.

City Clerk Manzano talked about the possibility of a November election; noted there would be an associated cost; reported she set it up for three measures, which would cost approximately \$230,000; noted to add an additional measure would be incrementally insignificant.

RBUSD Board Clerk Cho added that the Board will have a discussion on an upcoming agenda about covering the costs of School District elections.

There were no other public comments.

Councilmember Loewenstein felt this should be on the ballot.

Councilmember Obagi reviewed a slide of suggested Charter changes regarding the School Board; commented on consulting the City Attorney on the addition of a provision that the School District shall reimburse the City for its share of expenses associated with the elections of the Board of Education or any other matter concerning the affairs of the School District and asked about bonds.

City Clerk Manzano reported that typically, when the School District has a bond, they take care of it directly with the County.

Councilmember Obagi struck the suggestion about bonds.

Additionally, Councilmember Obagi talked about the School District reimbursing the City for costs incurred relating to the School District such as Crossing Guards and SROs.

City Attorney Webb expressed concerns, particularly about not interfering with the operation of the school, but needs time to research the matter.

Councilmember Nehrenheim talked about residents responding to Charter violations by filing a Police report; understood there has been a Police report filed for a Charter violation regarding reimbursement and pay of School Board Members and asked whether that will interfere with placing the item on the November ballot.

City Attorney Webb reiterated the process for addressing Charter violations; explained that if there is a criminal violation of the Charter, the case goes to the Police Department or another investigative agency. If it is a felony, it begins with the DA's office, unless they reject it and refer it to the City Attorney.

Mayor Light asked for clarification and City Attorney Webb reported putting the item on the ballot has nothing to do with the matter currently under investigation.

Mayor Light redirected the discussion as to the specific School District request; noted it has nothing to do with reimbursing the City and felt the City should partner with the School Board and discuss the matter with them before calling for a change.

City Attorney Webb stated he would have concerns about putting it in the Charter; commented on the City's sports leagues being conducted on their fields at no charge and the City provides Security Guards and felt there are practical concerns as well as legal concerns about including it in the Charter.

Councilmember Loewenstein felt it is germane to an election to know who is paying for it and whether or not a subcommittee needs to discuss it.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to direct the City Attorney to prepare the appropriate documentation and research the question of whether language can be included in the Charter that the School Board must pay their pro rata share of the election.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Bob Pinzler spoke about the number of Charter Cities in California; reported only 29 have any mention of a School Board; talked about cities who have declared the

School District as an independent body running under the Education Code and commented about compensation included in the Charter as a rare thing to do. Talked about the broader question of “why the School District is in the Charter” and offered to send City Council the information.

In reply to Councilmember Obagi’s question, City Clerk Manzano reported the School District normally have their bond measures in November elections.

City Attorney Webb noted the Charter mandates that they be in the General Municipal Election and that is why the City pays for it.

Councilmember Obagi observed that the City could propose to the electorate to strike 16.3 elections from the Charter and that would absolve the City of its obligation to fund their elections.

Andy Porkchop talked about a previous speaker criticizing his speech; felt she was not speaking to the agenda item and Council did not shut her down.

There were no other public comments.

The motion carried 5-0, by voice vote.

#### **Q. MAYOR AND COUNCIL REFERRALS TO STAFF**

Councilmember Loewenstein requested an update on ranked-choice-voting for the March election.

Discussion followed regarding addressing it at the July 30th meeting.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and approved by voice vote, to agendize a Council discussion on whether the City wants to join the Good Neighbor Pledge for the July 30, 2024 meeting.

The motion carried 4-1. Councilmember Nehrenheim voted, “No”.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Behrendt, and approved by voice vote, to direct the City Attorney to provide information regarding whether the City can proceed with cost recovery efforts from the School Board or strike 16.3.

The motion carried, 5-0.

Mayor Light asked for a discussion about a Coyote Management Plan and City Manager Witzansky suggested it could be added to the agenda for the third meeting in August.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and carried by voice vote, to direct Staff to agendize a discussion in a meeting in August

about developing a Coyote Management Plan.

The motion carried, 5-0.

Mayor Light commented on excused absences and asked for a report from the City Clerk.

**R. RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION – None**

The Closed Session meeting was cancelled.

**S. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION – None**

The Closed Session meeting was cancelled.

**T. ADJOURNMENT – 10:38 p.m.**

There being no further business to come before the City Council, motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and was approved by voice vote, to adjourn the meeting at 10:38 p.m., to an Adjourned Regular meeting to be held at 4:30 p.m. (Closed Session) and a Regular meeting to be held at 6:00 p.m. (Open Session) on Tuesday, July 16, 2024 in the Redondo Beach City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

Motion carried, 5-0.

All written comments submitted via eComment are included in the record and available for public review on the City website.

Respectfully submitted:

DocuSigned by:

*Eleanor Manzano*

72F2AC716C214CF...

---

Eleanor Manzano, CMC  
City Clerk