



Minutes  
Redondo Beach City Council  
Tuesday, January 21, 2025  
Closed Session - Adjourned Regular Meeting 4:30 p.m.  
Open Session – Regular Meeting 6:00 p.m.

## **4:30 PM - CLOSED SESSION – ADJOURNED REGULAR MEETING**

### **A. CALL MEETING TO ORDER**

An Adjourned Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 6:00 p.m. by Mayor Light in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

### **B. ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light

Officials Present: Mike Witzansky, City Manager  
Melissa Villa, Analyst

### **C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION**

### **D. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS - None**

### **E. PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS ON CLOSED SESSION ITEMS AND NON-AGENDA ITEMS - None**

### **F. RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION**

#### **F.1. CONFERENCE WITH REAL PROPERTY NEGOTIATOR - The Closed Session is authorized by the Government Code Section 54956.8.**

#### **AGENCY NEGOTIATOR:**

**Mike Witzansky, City Manager**

**Greg Kapovich, Waterfront & Economic Development Director**

#### **PROPERTY:**

**555 North Harbor Drive, Redondo Beach, CA 90277 (a portion of APN: 7503-008-901)**

#### **NEGOTIATING PARTIES:**

**Kevin Ketchum, Port Royal Marina, LGW Investments, LLC**

#### **UNDER NEGOTIATION:**

**Lease Status, Price, and Terms**

- F.2. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION –**  
The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).

**Name of case:**

**City of Redondo Beach, et al. v. California State Water Resources Control Board**

**Case Number: 20STCP03193**

- F.3. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION -** The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).

**Name of case:**

**In re 9300 Wilshire LLC Bankruptcy C.D. Cal.**

**Case Number: 2:23-bk-10918-ER**

- F.4. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION -** The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).

**Name of case:**

**9300 Wilshire, LLC v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; City of Redondo Beach Department of Community Development; and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive**

**Case Number: 23STCP02189**

- F.5. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION -** The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).

**Name of case:**

**Yes in My Back Yard, a California nonprofit corporation; SONJA TRAUSS, an individual v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; City of Redondo Beach Department of Community Development, and DOES 1 through 25 inclusive**

**Case Number: 23TRCP00325**

- F.6. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION -** The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).

**Name of case: New Commune DTLA LLC v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive**

**Case Number: 23STCV10146**

- F.7. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case: New Commune DTLA, LLC and Leonid Pustilnikov v. City of Redondo Beach and City Council of the City of Redondo Beach  
Case Number: 22TRCP00203**

- F.8. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case: New Commune DTLA, LLC v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; City of Redondo Beach Department of Community Development, et al.  
Case Number: 23STCP00426**

- F.9. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of Case: Corteza, Warlie v. City of Redondo Beach, Quality Seafood, Inc., BC Urban, LLC and DOES 1 to 25  
Case Number: 25TRCV00066**

Analyst Villa read title to the items to be considered in Closed Session.

City Manager Witzansky announced that the following would be participating in Closed Session: City Manager Mike Witzansky, Assistant City Attorney Cheryl Park and W.E.D. Director Greg Kapovich.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and carried by voice vote, to recess to Closed Session at 4:33 p.m.

The motion carried 5-0.

**G. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION – 6:00 p.m.**

Mayor Light reconvened to Open Session at 6:00 p.m.

**H. ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk  
Mike Witzansky, City Manager  
Cheryl Park, Assistant City Attorney  
Laura Diaz, Records Mgmt Coordinator/ Deputy  
City Clerk

**I. ANNOUNCEMENT OF CLOSED SESSION ACTIONS**

City Manager Witzansky reported the case under Item F.9, Council directed the City Attorney to defend the City in the matter.

**J. ADJOURN TO REGULAR MEETING**

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and carried by voice vote, to adjourn to the regular meeting at 6:01 p.m.

The motion carried 5-0.

**6:00 PM – OPEN SESSION – REGULAR MEETING**

**A. CALL TO ORDER**

A Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 6:01 p.m. by Mayor Light in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

**B. ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk (via Zoom)  
Mike Webb, City Attorney  
Mike Witzansky, City Manager

**C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION**

Mayor Light invited Veterans and Active Military to stand and recognized them for their service.

Maddie, 5th Grader, Jefferson Elementary School, led in the salute to the flag.

Mayor Light called for a moment of silence.

**D. PRESENTATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/ANNOUNCEMENTS/AB 1234 TRAVEL**

## **EXPENSE REPORTS**

Councilmember Nehrenheim announced the online District 1 community meeting tomorrow night.

Councilmember Loewenstein announced the District 2 online community meeting will be a week from tonight, January 28th from 6:00 p.m. to 7:30 p.m.; stated he will be joined by the RB Fire and PD and announced the topic would be the fires in the Palisades and Altadena Eaton Canyon fires.

Councilmember Obagi announced a joint North Redondo community meeting on February 3rd, 6:00 p.m. at the Redondo Beach Performing Arts Center. He reported that Thursdays and Fridays are no burn days per the AQMD.

Councilmember Behrendt spoke about the upcoming joint North Redondo community meeting; stated that the RB Fire and Police will be presenting at the community meeting and the City will be honoring them; reported the Public Works meeting will continue to a later date.

Councilmember Obagi announced Public Works is continuing to hose down playgrounds in the City to address concerns about ashes.

Mayor Light stated there is a ban on leaf blowers to combat the toxic ashes in the air; commended the City's First Responders for putting their lives on the line for others.

### **E. APPROVE ORDER OF AGENDA**

Council concurred to approve the order of the agenda, as presented.

### **F. AGENCY RECESS – 6:07 p.m.**

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, to recess to a Special Meeting of the Successor Agency at 6:07 p.m.

The motion carried 5-0.

### **F.1. SPECIAL MEETING OF THE SUCCESSOR AGENCY**

**CONTACT: STEPHANIE MEYER, INTERIM FINANCE DIRECTOR**

**RECONVENE TO REGULAR MEETING FROM AGENCY MEETING – 6:14 p.m.**

### **ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim,

**G. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS**

**G.1 For Blue Folder Documents Approved at the City Council Meeting**

City Clerk Manzano reported receiving Blue Folder items for Item No. J.1 and N.1.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and approved by voice vote, to receive and file Blue Folder Items.

The motion carried 5-0.

**H. CONSENT CALENDAR**

**H.1. APPROVE AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING FOR THE CITY COUNCIL ADJOURNED AND REGULAR MEETING OF JANUARY 21, 2025**

**CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK**

**H.2. APPROVE MOTION TO READ BY TITLE ONLY AND WAIVE FURTHER READING OF ALL ORDINANCES AND RESOLUTIONS LISTED ON THE AGENDA**

**CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK**

**H.3. APPROVE THE FOLLOWING CITY COUNCIL MINUTES:  
A. SEPTEMBER 17, 2024 ADJOURNED AND REGULAR MEETING  
B. OCTOBER 1, 2024 ADJOURNED AND REGULAR MEETING**

**CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK**

**H.4. PAYROLL DEMANDS**

**CHECKS 30070-30085 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$18,310.64, PD. 1/3/25  
DIRECT DEPOSIT 288949-289560 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$2,293,507.78, PD. 1/3/25**

**CHECKS 30086-30098 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$9,144.44, PD. 1/17/25  
DIRECT DEPOSIT 289561-290183 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$2,297,071.10, PD. 1/17/25**

**EFT/ACH \$9,423.24, PD. 1/3/25 (PP2501)**

**EFT/ACH \$200.00, PD. 1/7/25**

**EFT/ACH \$8,638.32, PD. 1/11/25**

**EFT/ACH \$450,622.96, PD. 1/27/25 (PP2501)**

**ACCOUNTS PAYABLE DEMANDS CHECKS 117609-117878 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$3,109,992.80**

**CONTACT: STEPHANIE MEYER, INTERIM FINANCE DIRECTOR**

**H.5. APPROVE CONTRACTS UNDER \$35,000:**

**1. APPROVE A CONSULTING SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH SWAPE, LLC FOR ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW SERVICES IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$6,000 AND THE TERM JANUARY 21, 2025 TO DECEMBER 31, 2025**

**2. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH LEADING RESOURCES, INC. TO ASSIST WITH THE PREPARATION OF A COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT STRATEGIC PLAN IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$12,000 AND THE TERM JANUARY 21, 2025 TO MAY 31, 2025**

**CONTACT: STEPHANIE MEYER, INTERIM FINANCE DIRECTOR**

**H.6. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH PACIFIC AQUASCAPE INTERNATIONAL, INC. FOR THE REPAIR OF THE LOWER POND AT WILDERNESS PARK, JOB NO. 31010, FOR AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$420,069, WITH A TERM THROUGH JANUARY 20, 2028**

**CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR**

**H.7. APPROVE AN AMENDMENT TO THE AGREEMENT WITH COAST CONSTRUCTION GROUP FOR THE DESIGN AND CONSTRUCTION OF A SEABASS GROW-OUT FACILITY IN KING HARBOR TO INCREASE THE AMOUNT BY \$4,500 FOR A NEW NOT TO EXCEED TOTAL OF \$71,500 AND TO EXTEND THE TERM BY FOUR WEEKS TO AUGUST 1, 2025**

**CONTACT: GREG KAPOVICH, WATERFRONT AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR**

**H.8. APPROVE THE ANALYSIS OF IMPEDIMENTS TO FAIR HOUSING CHOICE REPORT FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE CITY'S FIVE-YEAR COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT CONSOLIDATED PLAN AS REQUIRED BY THE U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT**

**CONTACT: ELIZABETH HAUSE, COMMUNITY SERVICES DIRECTOR**

**H.9. APPROVE A GRANT AWARD PACKAGE AND CERTIFICATIONS AND ASSURANCES STATEMENT WITH THE U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, OFFICE OF JUSTICE PROGRAMS, BUREAU OF JUSTICE ASSISTANCE, FOR THE FY 2024 EDWARD BYRNE MEMORIAL JUSTICE ASSISTANCE GRANT (JAG) PROGRAM IN THE AMOUNT OF \$13,698 FOR THE TERM**

**OCTOBER 1, 2023 THROUGH SEPTEMBER 30, 2025**

**ADOPT BY 4/5THS VOTE AND BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2501-001 A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, AUTHORIZING A FISCAL YEAR 2024-2025 BUDGET MODIFICATION TO APPROPRIATE \$13,698 IN BUREAU OF JUSTICE ASSISTANCE FY 2024 EDWARD BYRNE MEMORIAL JUSTICE ASSISTANCE GRANT (JAG) PROGRAM FUNDS TO THE CITY'S INTERGOVERNMENTAL GRANTS FUND**

**CONTACT: JOE HOFFMAN, CHIEF OF POLICE**

**H.10. APPROVE BY 4/5THS VOTE AND BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2501-002 A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, AUTHORIZING A FISCAL YEAR 2024-2025 BUDGET MODIFICATION TO APPROPRIATE \$58,728 IN GRANT YEAR 2023 STATE HOMELAND SECURITY PROGRAM GRANT FUNDS TO THE CITY'S INTERGOVERNMENTAL GRANTS FUND**

**CONTACT: JOE HOFFMAN, CHIEF OF POLICE  
PATRICK BUTLER, FIRE CHIEF**

**H.11. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY ORDINANCE NO. 3286-25, AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, AMENDING THE REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE BY ADDING CHAPTER 28 - ELECTRIC VEHICLE CHARGING STATIONS TO TITLE 9, TO PROVIDE AN EXPEDITED, STREAMLINED PERMITTING PROCESS FOR ELECTRIC VEHICLE CHARGING STATIONS FOR SECOND READING AND ADOPTION**

**CONTACT: MARC WIENER, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR**

**H.12. APPROVE AN AMENDMENT TO THE AGREEMENT WITH MELAD AND ASSOCIATES, INC. FOR BUILDING PLAN CHECK REVIEW AND PERMIT TECH SERVICES TO INCREASE THE AMOUNT BY \$150,000 FOR A NEW CONTRACT NOT TO EXCEED TOTAL OF \$311,000**

**CONTACT: MARC WIENER, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR**

**H.13. APPROVE AN AMENDMENT TO THE AGREEMENT WITH BOWMAN INFRASTRUCTURE ENGINEERS LTD. FOR BUILDING PLAN CHECK REVIEW SERVICES TO INCREASE THE AMOUNT BY \$40,000 FOR A NEW NOT TO EXCEED TOTAL OF \$190,000**

**CONTACT: MARC WIENER COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR**

**H.14. APPROVE LEASES AND ADDENDUMS FOR FIVE SINGLE ROOM**



**OCCUPANCY UNITS LOCATED AT 126 WEST D STREET, WILMINGTON, CALIFORNIA 90744 BETWEEN THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH AND SWAMI INTERNATIONAL TO SERVE AS BRIDGE HOUSING FOR PEOPLE EXPERIENCING HOMELESSNESS FOR THE AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$62,370 FOR THE TERM FEBRUARY 1, 2025 TO JANUARY 31, 2026**

**CONTACT:** MICHAEL W. WEBB, CITY ATTORNEY

**H.15. RECEIVE AND FILE THE MONTHLY UPDATE TO THE STRATEGIC PLAN OBJECTIVES ADOPTED BY CITY COUNCIL ON OCTOBER 8, 2024**

**CONTACT:** MIKE WITZANSKY, CITY MANAGER

There were no public comments on the Consent Calendar.

Mayor Light highlighted Item No. H.6, spoke about reestablishing the seabass grow facility.

Councilmember Obagi mentioned H.14 and recognized Quality of Life Prosecutor Joy Ford for all her efforts and referenced H.15, pallet shelters and the City's emergency preparedness.

City Clerk Manzano reported receiving one eComment in opposition H.3, to the minutes.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, the Consent Calendar, as presented.

Motion carried 5-0.

City Clerk Manzano read Resolution No. CC-2501-001, CC-2501-002 and Ordinance No. 3286-25.

**I. EXCLUDED CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS - None**

**J. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS**

**J.1 For eComments and Emails Received from the Public**

Ron Maroko, spoke about today being the 26th anniversary of the City Charter, listed four reasons he believes the City Clerk should resign unless she can fix the problems: 1) Public Records Act Administration - referenced improper redaction of a document requested through a Public Records Request; felt that the statute is not being implemented correctly or consistently; mentioned speaking with the City Attorney in the matter, 2) Improper removal of public meeting recordings; referenced the September 18, 2024 Historical Commission meeting and stated the City Clerk took down the meeting due to a lack of quorum but that there was about 20 minutes of a meeting and should

have been noted who was absent and who was present; stated it is an improper use of government to take the meeting down; due to lack of time, Ron Maroko was not able to give the other two reasons.

Mayor Light stated if Ron Maroko would like to email him the other two reasons, he will address it.

Sara Martin, District 1, talked about having good governance; reported that she will attend Council meetings to educate the public on the principles of good governance and spoke about her experience in public advocacy and the City's lack of action relative to the Sailing School.

Mayor Light mentioned it is an embarrassment that the Sailing School has not moved forward and reported that Community Services is working on the matter.

Eugene Solomon, RB City Treasurer, noted that hope is not a plan; talked about revenue initiatives he proposed in the past, but noted almost nothing has been done; acknowledged the City raised parking fees and after-school programs for residents but felt that Council has not discussed any ideas for raising substantial revenue; mentioned increased costs and inflationary pressures which will be passed on to residents and urged Council to stop delaying discussing the revenue-producing initiatives contained in the Strategic Plan.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, to receive and file documents submitted by Jess Money.

The motion carried 5-0.

Jess Money, District 3, opined that the Homeless Outreach Program is illegal and criminal; questioned why the program is run by the City Attorney's office and not Community Services; talked about the City Attorney's office setting up the Homeless Coordinator as the City Attorney's successor; reported the City Attorney's office has no authority to conduct such programs; believed staff has hidden the truth about the pallet shelter program and urged Council to move the program under Community Services, where it belongs.

Robin Eisenberg commented positively on the City's Homeless Outreach Program and staff and asked everyone not to attack the most vulnerable.

Wayne Craig, District 1, talked about the upcoming election; reported talking to neighbors who indicated they did not understand anything about Ranked Choice Voting (RCV) and asked that Council start the process to educate voters.

Andy Porkchop, Torrance, asked the Council to consider not placing EV chargers next to residences or other buildings; talked about the ivy plants along the Esplanade being destroyed and felt that if it rains, the dirt will slide onto the bike path.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, to receive and file documents submitted by Joan Irvine.

The motion carried 5-0.

Joan Irvine, District 1, Candidate for Mayor, talked about a lot of information on social media being inappropriate; acknowledged free speech but felt that type of behavior is not wanted in the City and statements should be fact-based. Additionally, she shared she attended a Women's Club luncheon where conversations took place about some of the misogyny that goes on in the City; went on to reference a derogatory statement made by Steve Colin, Candidate for City Attorney, who made a statement saying "the stay-at-home mom councilwoman" when speaking about a group who work at residences to help people.

At Councilmember Obagi's request, Joan Irvine offered to email a copy of the statement.

Georgette Gantner, District 2, reported the last Redondo Beach female Mayor was Barbara Doerr who was Mayor for two terms, in 1981 and 1985.

Male speaker thanked Council for all the support they have shown him; spoke about allowing three homeless people to live in his building at no cost to them, for a period of time; spoke about working with Lila Omura; talked about the City helping out through the HUD Program; voiced his concerns regarding eBikes being ridden dangerously and surveyed them over a period of one week, noting they run through stop signs, drive down the streets going the wrong way, and hoped the Council would recognize this behavior; thanked Council for its work.

Nancy Skiba (via Zoom), District 4, Public Safety Commissioner, stated concerns that people are using the City's social media pages to spew scandalous and dangerous comments about Councilmembers, Commissioners and the City Attorney; reported they are hinting about lawsuits, that it is an embarrassment and very disturbing and hoped Council will find ways to protect the City and its leaders.

Mayor Light announced that the thirty minutes allowed for public comments has ended.

**K. EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS - None**

**L. PUBLIC HEARINGS - None**

**M. ITEMS CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS AGENDAS - None**

**N. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION PRIOR TO ACTION**

**N.1. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON THE CITY'S DRAFT CANNABIS REGULATORY ORDINANCES APPROVE THE DRAFT**

**LANGUAGE IN THE CANNABIS REGULATORY ORDINANCES AND DIRECT STAFF TO SCHEDULE A PUBLIC HEARING BEFORE THE PLANNING COMMISSION ON FEBRUARY 3, 2025 TO PROVIDE RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE CITY COUNCIL PURSUANT TO STATE LAW PRIOR TO FORMAL CONSIDERATION OF INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING OF THE ORDINANCES DIRECT STAFF TO SCHEDULE A PUBLIC HEARING AND RETURN TO THE CITY COUNCIL ON FEBRUARY 11, 2025 FOR CONSIDERATION OF INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING OF THE PROPOSED ORDINANCES**

**CONTACT:** ELIZABETH HAUSE, COMMUNITY SERVICES DIRECTOR

Community Services Director Hause presented background information and narrated a PowerPoint presentation regarding the City's Draft Cannabis Regulatory Ordinances including updates to note and next steps.

Discussion followed regarding presenting updated sections of all three ordinances to the Planning Commission for their review.

City Manager Witzansky explained it will be those sections pertaining to the Zoning Ordinance.

Community Services Director Hause listed staff recommendations and offered to respond to questions from Council.

Discussion followed regarding scheduling the Planning Commission review by February 3rd and whether there will be a quorum.

Councilmember Nehrenheim noted the City is not creating a new ordinance but rather ensuring that everything is correct and consistent.

Councilmember Obagi left the chambers.

Mayor Light commended Council, Community Services Director Hause and City staff for their work on this ordinance.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Courtney Caron spoke about the application criteria in Section 1 being vague and wondered what is required as proof of compliance; suggested providing clearer instruction so that applicants can know what is expected.

Councilmember Obagi returned to the chambers.

Courtney Caron continued identifying specific areas in the ordinance that need clarification such as a requirement for CPA certified financial statements.

Mayor Light asked Assistant City Attorney Park whether clarifications can be provided as applications are put out.

Assistant City Attorney Park offered to look into the matter further and report back.

Community Services Director Hause offered to edit the ordinance to clarify Section No. 3.1.

Georgette Gantner, District 2, wondered if the public was asked if it wanted dispensaries in Redondo Beach and mentioned that the public seems confused about the topic.

Mayor Light stated that the City is not required to put it to a vote and believed it was Councilmember Behrendt who brought up that the City has never polled the people with the direct question.

Georgette Gantner suggested that Council determine locations at a future Council meeting.

Andy Porkchop, Torrance, suggested locating cannabis retailers near fast food businesses to increase sales tax revenue; spoke about residents of Torrance buying their cannabis in Redondo Beach as cannabis cannot be purchased in Torrance.

Joan Irvine, District 1, thanked Council and staff for moving this ordinance through; talked about her support of cannabis and an informal survey she conducted noting there was general consensus that people would rather have two legal, highly regulated stores than what is existing now; discussed the dangers of the black market and her advocacy and support for child safety.

Christopher, District 4, spoke about a dispensary near his house that has impacted parking and public safety; noted that many of the vehicles in his neighborhood were broken into.

City Clerk Manzano reported receiving five eComments, all of which were opposed to the item.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and carried by voice vote, to direct staff to present this item to the Planning Commission at its special meeting on February 3, 2025, after incorporating the meeting comments of tonight (Section 3.1) and schedule the first reading of the ordinance on the City Council meeting of February 11, 2025.

Councilmember Obagi spoke about the illegal dispensary that was on Aviation and

the trauma that was inflicted on the neighborhood; noted Council made a lot of effort to ensure those past experiences are not repeated by taking its time on this ordinance.

Councilmember Kaluderovic spoke about how this has taken hundreds of hours of work to complete the infrastructure for the City to be ready to open two cannabis stores, when the time comes; spoke about the importance of completing the work and thanked Director Hause and staff.

Motion carried 4-1. Councilmember Behrendt was opposed.

**N.2. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING UPDATES TO THE REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE TO CONSIDER MODIFYING THE LAND USE REGULATIONS AND BUSINESS PERMITTING STANDARDS PERTAINING TO SMOKE SHOPS CITYWIDE AND NOTARY SERVICES IN THE RIVIERA VILLAGE DISTRICT**

**CONTACT:** MARC WIENER, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

Community Development Director Wiener narrated a PowerPoint presentation with details of the Administrative Report; gave some background on the item, highlighting City Council's Strategic Plan goal of attracting new businesses and reducing regulatory barriers, and focusing on smoke shops and notary services; reviewed and explained different types of permits.

Mayor Light commented on whether this item was noticed properly.

City Manager Witzansky reported this is a primer to understand how to approach the two uses described, understand what options are currently available and how the code applies to different designations to date. Additionally, he reported staff is seeking direction in terms of how to regulate the two business types that have been identified.

Mayor Light stated he wants to ensure that Council is focused on what is on the agenda.

Community Development Director Wiener continued with the presentation addressing smoke shops; recommended Council review requirements and regulations for smoke shops to be brought back at a later date.

Discussion followed regarding the ability to place a cap per geographical area and regulating certain aspects of tobacco retail shops rather than banning (which is illegal).

Community Development Director Wiener discussed the Riviera Village District, the recent establishment of office uses along Catalina Street and listed the

recommended actions.

Mayor Light mentioned forming a subcommittee of the Council to work with staff.

City Manager Witzansky stated that staff is seeking broad policy direction to find a way to clean up the code to prevent problems in the future and knowing whether there are specific things Council would like staff to explore.

At the Mayor's request, RBPD Chief Hoffman addressed the enforcement process when receiving complaints about smoke shops; reported there are a lot of them in the City and they present a drain on resources.

Mayor Light spoke about the proliferation of real estate offices in Manhattan Beach and asked about grandfathering the existing shops.

City Manager Witzansky stated Council could ask staff to explore that.

Councilmember Nehrenheim agreed there needs to be a cap set, as soon as possible; suggested implementing a moratorium, keeping it simple and setting a maximum per district, considering adjoining districts, ensuring they are not in sensitive areas and using the same criteria as the Cannabis Ordinance. Additionally, he mentioned the need for high volume retail such as restaurants rather than notaries; spoke about the possibility of existing businesses expanding with second stories and the need for vertical mixed uses, parking and local jobs.

Councilmember Obagi agreed there are too many smoke shops; suggested capping the number at 10 so that as some go out of business, they are phased out or capping the number in each district at the number currently in that district; suggested revisiting the matter in the future and reducing the cap.

City Manager Witzansky spoke about investigating whether the City can set a cap that is below the current number and grandfathering the existing shops in for the duration of their ownership or function.

Councilmember Kaluderovic reported she will defer to Councilmember Nehrenheim relative to notaries; preferred one retail smoke shop in each district with a CUP required for each; talked about exploring whether signage can be regulated as well as visibility through windows and regulate entrance to underage patrons; agreed with reducing the number through attrition upon changes in ownership.

Councilmember Loewenstein mentioned low set-up costs; expressed concerns with the sale of K2 and Spice (synthetic marijuana); hoped the Cannabis Ordinance will give the City teeth in order to shut it down; agreed to capping the number at one per district.

Councilmember Obagi referenced Slide 2.b, showing two locations of new smoke

shops along Artesia Boulevard, both of which have prohibited banner signs and noted the need to stop them.

Councilmember Kaluderovic spoke about finding out whether laws are being broken with sales to underage customers or of illegal products and if their licenses can be revoked.

Assistant City Attorney Park reported Council may set conditions to revoke a license or CUP if illegal activities are taking place.

Community Development Director Wiener stated that in his experience, the CUP would be an easier process to allow for revocation of a business license.

City Manager Witzansky felt that everything Council cited is helpful and staff will research the matter and make it as simple as possible when it returns to Council for consideration.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and approved by voice vote, to direct staff to come back with draft land use regulations and business permitting standards pertaining to smoke shops and notary services based on comments by Council.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Robin Eisenberg talked about the smell emitted from smoke shops and as someone representing retailers, stated that none of her clients would want to go next to a smoke shop, as the smell permeates other areas; favored limiting their numbers.

Mayor Light asked about placing “No loitering or smoking” outside the shop and Assistant City Attorney Park responded affirmatively.

Eugene Solomon talked about the City of Fresno receiving a \$1.6 million grant to fight smoke shops; reported they recategorize themselves as grocery stores because they also sold snacks and agreed the CUP would be a better way to regulate it; talked about the primary business and its purpose and urged Council to seek direction relative to enforcement.

Joan Irvine, District 1, thanked Council for considering this matter; talked about the City currently having no control over what they sell and spoke favorably about it.

Laura MacMorran spoke about this being a public health matter and suggested looking at the topic through that lens, which will make it defensible, rather than setting an arbitrary number.

Nancy Skiba (via Zoom), District 4, mentioned seeing a giant sign advertising a dispensary; hoped these will not be allowed in Redondo Beach and talked about the



need for proper testing of the products.

City Clerk Manzano reported receiving one eComment in support of the item.

There were no other public comments.

City Manager Witzansky reported the item will likely return to Council in March.

The motion carried, 5-0.

Councilmember Behrendt left the chambers.

### **N.3. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE DIRECTION REGARDING MODIFICATIONS TO THE CITY'S TREE ORDINANCE**

**CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR**

Public Works Director Winje presented details of the Administrative Report; noted staff is looking for direction regarding language for a future ordinance for the preservation of trees on private property; reported that Public Works is responsible for City-owned trees while Community Development would manage trees on private property.

Councilmember Behrendt returned to the chambers.

City Manager Witzansky spoke about the concept of potential incentives that could be used as opposed to a regulatory framework or through code activity to encourage the protection of Heritage Trees, in public spaces and on private property.

In reply to Mayor Light's inquiry, Public Works Director Winje reported that all public trees are protected under the ordinance; stated the Heritage tree applies to private property, trees that would be considered of value as opposed to smaller diameter trees and noted it is not contained in the current ordinance.

Mayor Light asked to have IT look into problems with dais screens.

Councilmember Nehrenheim spoke about a case where a developer wanted to remove an 80-year-old tree that was part of the neighborhood; talked about making sure that if a tree dies within two years of construction the homeowner or permittee is held liable and that a permit requirement states that a tree should remain alive after two years of construction on a site; commented on the importance of maintaining a tree canopy and on increased home values where trees are valued. Additionally, he asked for a definition of a Heritage Tree to apply across the board.

Councilmember Loewenstein commented on the fine for removal of a Heritage Tree; talked about fines for poisoning a tree; mentioned the fine should include the cost of

services related to the replacement of the tree; shared the story of a tree on Emerald that he fought hard to keep; suggested the resident should be penalized and that the City should not be out any money. Additionally, he mentioned private property rights and agreed with finding a way to incentivize planting/keeping trees on private property.

Councilmember Obagi agreed with protecting trees and the City's tree canopy; wondered what the best way to provide incentives for people to plant new trees; suggested that the City offer to plant new trees on their property at no cost to them. He requested a BRR on the all-inclusive costs associated with planting a tree and how many trees staff could plant in one year or a given month.

Councilmember Loewenstein commented on visiting the City of Memphis and was amazed at how well they protect old trees even in the face of new construction; felt there are ways of building around old trees so they do not need to be removed.

Community Development Director Wiener commented on the City of Carmel and how they value their trees; described that city's regulations and practices.

Mayor Light suggested exploring the regulations from the City of Carmel to see if they can be applied in Redondo Beach; commented on a past case where the public opposed removal of a tree and the plans had to be changed.

Discussion followed regarding the possibility of allowing a density bonus for keeping a tree, the need to consider limitations with setbacks and challenges in maintaining the City of Carmel standards.

Mayor Light noted the City is losing canopy with every major development.

Councilmember Behrendt stated he likes the idea of exploring the cost of incentivizing the City to plant trees on private property and requested a BRR on the number of trees that can be planted.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Laura MacMorran spoke favorably about the Tree Ordinance; agreed with the Community Development Director that in other jurisdictions trees are required on private property; talked about ideas about accelerating replanting in the parkways; mentioned addressing a property owner's responsibility to the public ROW; addressed practices in the City of El Monte, where she currently works and urged Council to look at ordinances in other municipalities.

Discussion followed regarding different jurisdictions to look at in various cities.

Wayne Craig, Planning Commissioner, reported the Commission was looking at the tree canopy; commented positively on the City of Pasadena and suggested Council

may want to consider it's Tree Ordinance.

Jim Mueller, District 5, noted his neighborhood is afraid of losing trees; stated that to preserve trees one needs to go back deep into the architectural design; shared a case where the design was changed to preserve a tree and noted that the trees were located in the front setbacks; asked Council to work on saving trees on private properties.

Rolf Strutzenberg spoke about the importance of a tree canopy for cooling temperatures long term; gave examples of streets with great tree canopies; mentioned insurance policies are being cancelled when trees cover parts of a residential roof due to the hazard it may cause if it breaks and wanted Council to be aware of that issue when considering planning; commented on the need to encourage planting more trees and stop the decimation that is happening.

Discussion followed regarding green roof professionals.

Councilmember Obagi left the chambers.

Andy Porkchop spoke about Freddy the Ficus tree that was removed due to lack of visibility for drivers to turn; urged Council not to limit anything anyone can do on their private property relative to trees.

Ryder Mendez, student at Redondo Union High School, felt this is a matter that needs to be taken seriously and spoke about this affecting future generations; mentioned he lives on Flagger and Rockefeller Lane and his grandmother told him the field used to be filled with trees and now there are only one or two and felt it is important for the City to preserve the trees.

Nancy Skiba, via Zoom, talked about the importance of trees for cooling and health, peace and relaxation.

Mara Lang, via Zoom, spoke favorably about the proposed Tree Ordinance; urged Council to focus on enforcement and accountability instead; suggested that one area that can be immediately improved is enforcement; noted the Municipal Code already mandates tree planting and maintenance for new construction, but without penalties for removal, these rules lack impact; noted that she seen homeowners plant a tree for the occupancy requirement and remove it after receiving it; suggested the City should require the tree and enforce protection for it; wondered why the City caters to developers; believed the proposed amendment to the ordinance will benefit the entire community for decades to come. She recommended revisiting the ordinance annually to ensure it is achieving the goal of canopy maintenance and canopy growth; agreed with looking towards other cities to evaluate their Tree Ordinances.

There were no other public comments.

Councilmember Obagi directed a comment towards City Manager Witzansky, stating that under the state law the City is not able to anything that reduces residential intensity to which a property can be built such as increasing setbacks or reducing heights, etc.; liked the speaker's comments regarding requiring planting two trees when one is removed with an exemption if it can be proven why planting a tree would be detrimental to the design.

City Manager Witzansky stated staff will look at all options available; spoke in support of tree canopies and reported the City has been maintaining its urban forest; noted there are new State restrictions and the ability to regulate has been hindered by State action; stated staff will look at other cities that have had success and will return to Council with a full report.

In response to Councilmember Behrendt's questions as to whether the City can continue planting trees in public areas with the present budget, City Manager Witzansky reported adding structural maintenance funding for the ongoing planting of trees.

Public Works Director Winje reported the City is planting new trees at a general rate of 100 per year.

In terms of people who are poisoning or intentionally removing trees, Councilmember Behrendt asked staff to look at the replacement costs when considering penalties and fees and agreed with Council colleagues' comments.

Councilmember Nehrenheim stated that for him, it is about planting in commercial and residential property set back zones; commented on attaching values to old trees.

City Manager Witzansky reported the City's urban forest (public trees) is captured in a software program and their value is regularly updated.

Councilmember Nehrenheim spoke about the City having the ability to require that an existing parkway tree remain at least two years after completion of any construction.

Discussion followed regarding ensuring a tree is still alive on private commercial properties two years after completion of construction on the property, examples of available options and having an ordinance that applies to both residential and commercial properties.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and approved by voice vote, to direct staff to investigate the items discussed; return to Council with an update and a report for discussion and possible action of a two-year health term for trees after a permit is deemed completed or finalized (Certificate of Occupancy issued) for any type of rebuild in the public ROW work, and to investigate what a Heritage Tree or Tree Ordinance would look like to have it on the

setback zones of the private property use, look at the Tree Ordinances for the Cities of El Monte, Carmel and others as chosen by staff, requiring a replacement of a 2 for 1 ratio to be reviewed by the Planning Commission or Public Works and Sustainability Commission or an in-lieu fee, the viability of having the ordinance apply to commercial properties and include the total cost of removal and replacement if said trees suddenly die or disappear in addition to the penalty.

Councilmember Behrendt spoke about taking a more graduated approach including the tracing and tracking of trees and administrative costs, looking at commercial properties, addressing the 2 for 1 replacement ratio but felt that for this first go around looking at other cities and in-lieu fees may be a little too heavy.

Substitute motion by Councilmember Behrendt, to start a little slower at first to get data on trees, include the total cost of replacement, including penalties, direct staff to return with a BRR on costs to the City for planting trees on private property at the request of homeowners, if homeowners want that, information on additional public spaces that can be filled with trees, close to the asphalt and streets.

City Manager Witzansky summarized Councilmember Nehrenheim's motion and Councilmember Behrendt's substitute motion.

Discussion followed regarding this item not being a rush item.

The substitute motion died for lack of a second.

Councilmember Obagi offered a friendly amendment to the motion to add the request for a BRR and Councilmembers Nehrenheim and Loewenstein accepted the amendment.

Amended motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and approved by voice vote, to direct staff to investigate the items discussed; return to Council with an update and a report for discussion and possible action of a two-year health term for trees after a permit is deemed completed or finalized (Certificate of Occupancy issued) for any type of rebuild in the public ROW work as well as to investigate what a Heritage Tree or Tree Ordinance would look like to have it on the setback zones of the private property, use and look at the Tree Ordinances for the Cities of El Monte, Carmel and others as chosen by staff and requiring a replacement of a 2 for 1 ratio to be reviewed by the Planning Commission or Public Works and Sustainability Commission or an in-lieu fee and the viability of having the ordinance apply to commercial properties and include the total cost of removal and replacement if said trees suddenly die or disappear, in addition to the penalty and return to Council with a BRR on total costs to the City for planting trees on private property.

The amended motion carried 4-1. Councilmember Behrendt was opposed.

**O. CITY MANAGER ITEMS**

City Manager Witzansky thanked Council for hosting upcoming meetings with Police and Fire Professionals and hoped RBF Fire crews will be able to return after fighting the recent California fires; spoke about RBPD supporting regional deployments and commended the team and community for its support.

Discussion followed regarding existing contingency plans to activate emergency shelters, if necessary.

**P. MAYOR AND COUNCIL ITEMS - None**

**Q. MAYOR AND COUNCIL REFERRALS TO STAFF**

Councilmember Loewenstein asked about the costs for a geologist to deal with the ROW for Metro.

City Manager Witzansky reported there will be a contract for Council's review for an expert in that area forthcoming.

In response to Councilmember Obagi's inquiry regarding the City Treasurer's comments regarding ideas for raising revenue particularly as it relates to Airbnb, City Manager Witzansky reported that typically those things are discussed as part of the budget; reported he will need to review the original motion and check on the matter.

Councilmember Obagi requested a BRR regarding costs to add crossing guards at Artesia and the North Redondo Beach Bike Path and Inglewood Boulevard and Grant Avenue and including the latest status of efforts to attain School District contributions for crossing guards.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and approved by voice vote, for a discussion regarding direction to direct the City's lobbyist to oppose SB 11, aimed at exempting light rail projects along a ROW from CEQA analysis.

The motion carried 4-0. Councilmember Behrendt abstained.

Mayor Light requested a discussion on the City's Coyote Management Plan as the start of coyote season has arrived.

Discussion followed regarding the Harbor Sailing Program.

**R. RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION - None**

The Closed Session meeting was cancelled.

**S. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION - None**

The Closed Session meeting was cancelled.

**O. ADJOURNMENT – 9:11 p.m.**

There being no further business to come before the City Council, motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, to adjourn the meeting at 9:11 p.m. to an Adjourned Regular meeting to be held at 6:00 p.m. (Closed Session), on Tuesday, February 4, 2025, in the Redondo Beach City Hall Council Chambers, 415 N. Pacific Coast Hwy., Redondo Beach, California.

Motion carried, 5-0.

All written comments submitted via eComment are included in the record and available for public review on the City website.

Respectfully submitted:

---

Eleanor Manzano, CMC  
City Clerk