



Minutes  
Redondo Beach City Council  
Tuesday, July 16, 2024  
Closed Session - Adjourned Regular Meeting 4:30 p.m.  
Open Session –Regular Meeting 6:00 p.m.

## **4:30 PM - CLOSED SESSION – ADJOURNED REGULAR MEETING**

### **A. CALL MEETING TO ORDER**

An Adjourned Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 4:30 p.m. by Mayor Light in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

### **B. ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi (arrived at 4:31 p.m.), Mayor Light

Officials Present: Mike Witzansky, City Manager  
Melissa Villa, Analyst

### **C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION - NONE**

### **D. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS**

Analyst Villa announced there were no Blue Folder Items for Closed Session.

### **E. PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS ON CLOSED SESSION ITEMS AND NON-AGENDA ITEMS**

There were no public communications on Closed Session items and non-agenda items.

### **F. RECESS TO CLOSED – 4:33 p.m.**

Analyst Villa read title to the items to be considered in Closed Session.

City Manager Witzansky announced that the following would be participating in Closed Session: City Manager Mike Witzansky, City Attorney Mike Webb, Assistant City Attorney Cheryl Park, Outside Legal Counsel Jon Welner and Abby O'Brien.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and approved by voice vote to recess to Closed Session at 4:33 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

- F.1. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**Yes in My Back Yard, a California nonprofit corporation; SONJA TRAUSS, an individual v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; City of Redondo Beach Department of Community Development, and DOES 1 through 25 inclusive**

**Case Number: 23TRCP00325**

- F.2. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**City of Redondo Beach, et al. v. California State Water Resources Control Board**

**Case Number: 20STCP03193**

- F.3. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**New Commune DTLA, LLC and Leonid Pustilnikov v. City of Redondo Beach and City Council of the City of Redondo Beach**

**Case Number: 22TRCP00203**

- F.4. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**New Commune DTLA, LLC v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; City of Redondo Beach Department of Community Development, et al.**

**Case Number: 23STCP00426**

- F.5. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**New Commune DTLA LLC v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive**

**Case Number: 23STCV10146**

- F.6. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**9300 Wilshire, LLC v. City of Redondo Beach; City Council of the City of Redondo Beach; City of Redondo Beach Department of Community Development; and DOES 1 through 100, inclusive**

**Case Number: 23STCP02189**

- F.7. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION - The Closed Session is authorized by the attorney-client privilege, Government Code Section 54956.9(d)(1).**

**Name of case:**

**In re 9300 Wilshire LLC**

**Bankruptcy C.D. Cal. Case Number: 2:23-bk-10918-ER**

- G. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION – 6:00 p.m.**

Mayor Light reconvened to Open Session at 6:00 p.m.

**H. ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk  
Mike Witzansky, City Manager  
Lucie Colombo, Chief Deputy City Clerk

**I. ANNOUNCEMENT OF CLOSED SESSION ACTIONS**

City Manager Witzansky announced there were no reportable actions taken during Closed Session.

**J. ADJOURN TO REGULAR MEETING**

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and approved by voice vote, to adjourn to the regular meeting at 6:00 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

## **6:00 PM - OPEN SESSION - REGULAR MEETING**

### **A. CALL TO ORDER**

A Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order at 6:00 p.m. by Mayor Light in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

### **B. ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light

Officials Present: Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk  
Mike Witzansky, City Manager  
Mike Webb, City Attorney via Zoom  
Melissa Villa, Analyst

### **C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION**

Mayor Light invited Veterans and Active Military to stand and be recognized for their service.

Isaiah, Sixth Grader, Adams Middle School, led in the salute to the flag.

Mayor Light called for a moment of silence.

### **D. PRESENTATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/ANNOUNCEMENTS**

#### **D.1. MAYOR'S PROCLAMATION OF JULY 2024 AS PARKS AND RECREATION MONTH**

Mayor Light presented a proclamation declaring July 2024 as Parks and Recreation Month to Interim Community Development Director Hause.

#### **D.2. MAYOR'S COMMENDATION TO REDONDO BEACH PUBLIC SAFETY 2024 MEDAL OF VALOR AWARDEES**

Mayor Light invited RBPD Chief Hoffman and Rbfd Interim Fire Chief Butler to the podium and presented commendations to Redondo Beach Public Safety 2024 Medal of Valor Awardees.

Councilmember Nehrenheim mentioned he was out of town over the weekend but heard the Greek Festival was a big success; announced the District 1 Community Meeting will

be held at Alta Vista on Saturday, July 20th at 9:30 a.m. and the online District 1 Community Meeting on Monday, July 22nd at 6:30 p.m.; reported attending a summer seminar hosted by the Independent Cities Association (ICA); thanked Councilmember Obagi for joining him at the seminar; from the seminar, learned new ways of increasing revenue for the City without raising taxes and fees; thanked residents, the City, and fellow Councilmembers for allowing the City to be part of the ICA.

Councilmember Loewenstein thanked the Port Royal Marina, the King Harbor Yacht Club, and residents of Spencer for inviting him to their recent events; announced there will be no District 2 meeting in July.

Councilmember Kaluderovic commented on the recent District 3 Community Meeting; mentioned the two successful performances of Shakespeare by the Sea; thanked the Public Works team, especially Mike Klein, for their work in making the event at Dominguez Park a success.

Councilmember Obagi thanked Councilmember Nehrenheim for representing the City at ICA; mentioned collegiality between Councilmembers at the event; talked about great things happening in the City.

Mayor Light spoke about having the honor of opening the Greek Festival; thanked Councilmember Kaluderovic on Shakespeare by the Sea at Veterans Park; spoke about the Southland Parkland Conservancy Blue Butterfly walks and encouraged people to attend.

## **E. APPROVE ORDER OF AGENDA**

City Manager Witzansky pulled Agenda Item H.11 from the agenda and reported it will be presented to City Council at a later date.

Motion by Councilmember Behrendt, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, the order of the agenda, as amended to hear Item No. N.2 prior to N.1 pending the presenter's arrival.

City Manager Witzansky reported he should be arriving by the time Council considers the Consent Calendar.

Motion carried, 5-0.

## **F. AGENCY RECESS – None**

## **G. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS**

### **G.1 For Blue Folder Documents Approved at the City Council Meeting**

Chief Deputy City Clerk Colombo announced Blue Folder Items for Items No. H.12, J.1, and N.1.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and approved by voice vote, to receive and file Blue Folder Items.

Motion carried, 5-0.

## **H. CONSENT CALENDAR**

### **H.1. APPROVE AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING FOR THE CITY COUNCIL ADJOURNED AND REGULAR MEETING OF JULY 16, 2024**

**CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK**

### **H.2. APPROVE MOTION TO READ BY TITLE ONLY AND WAIVE FURTHER READING OF ALL ORDINANCES AND RESOLUTIONS LISTED ON THE AGENDA**

**CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK**

### **H.3. APPROVE THE FOLLOWING CITY COUNCIL MINUTES: NONE**

**CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK**

### **H.4. PAYROLL DEMANDS**

**CHECKS 29826-29847 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$16,738.73, PD. 7/5/24  
DIRECT DEPOSIT 280842-281454 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$2,235,804.28, PD. 7/5/24**

**EFT/ACH \$9,246.68, PD. 6/7/24 (PP2412)**

**EFT/ACH \$447,429.86, PD. 7/1/24 (PP2412)**

**ACCOUNTS PAYABLE DEMANDS**

**CHECKS 114966-115156 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$1,643,045.62**

**CONTACT: WENDY COLLAZO, FINANCE DIRECTOR**

### **H.5. APPROVE CONTRACTS UNDER \$35,000:**

**1. APPROVE THE FOURTH AMENDMENT TO THE ENCROACHMENT AGREEMENT WITH NORTHROP GRUMMAN SYSTEMS CORPORATION FOR USE OF PUBLIC RIGHT-OF-WAY NEAR MARINE AVE FOR BUSINESS FIBER OPTIC CABLE PURPOSES INCREASING THE ANNUAL RENTAL PAYMENTS TO \$2,177, PLUS ACTUAL ADMINISTRATIVE FEES NOT TO EXCEED \$2,500, TO BE PAID BY NORTHROP GRUMMAN AND TO EXTEND THE TERM TO AUGUST 3, 2029**

**2. APPROVE THE SECOND AMENDMENT TO THE AGREEMENT WITH KOA CORPORATION FOR CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT AND INSPECTION**

**SERVICES FOR THE TORRANCE BOULEVARD FROM TORRANCE CIRCLE TO PROSPECT AVENUE STREET REHABILITATION PROJECT, JOB NO. 41230, AND THE TORRANCE BLVD. & FRANCISCA AVENUE TRAFFIC SIGNAL MODIFICATION PROJECT, JOB NO. 41070, FOR AN ADDITIONAL AMOUNT OF \$19,360 AND TO EXTEND THE TERM TO DECEMBER 31, 2024**

**CONTACT: WENDY COLLAZO, FINANCE DIRECTOR**

**H.6. This Item was pulled by Councilmember Nehrenheim for separate discussion.**

**H.7. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH MC ELECTRIC TO INSTALL 16 REPLACEMENT LIGHT POLES ALONG THE BEACH BLUFF WALKWAY BETWEEN VETERANS PARK AND KNOB HILL AVENUE FOR A TOTAL COST NOT TO EXCEED \$276,480**

**ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2407-057, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, DECLARING REPLACEMENT OF 16 LIGHT POLES LOCATED ALONG THE BEACHFRONT WALKWAY BETWEEN VETERANS PARK AND KNOB HILL AVENUE AS “REPAIR” AND EXEMPTING IT FROM BIDDING REQUIREMENTS PURSUANT TO SECTIONS 19 AND 19.1(A) OF THE CITY CHARTER OF REDONDO BEACH**

**CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR**

**H.8. APPROVE A TRAFFIC CIRCULATION MODIFICATION TO PULLMAN LANE TO MAKE IT ONE-WAY, WESTBOUND, BETWEEN RIPLEY AVENUE AND MACKAY LANE**

**CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR**

**H.9. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH CHEN RYAN ASSOCIATES, INC., A CALIFORNIA CORPORATION DBA CR ASSOCIATES, FOR PROFESSIONAL ENGINEERING AND DESIGN SERVICES FOR THE NORTH REDONDO BEACH BIKEWAY EXTENSION ALONG INGLEWOOD AVE PROJECT AND THE TERRACED NATIVE PLANTING BEAUTIFICATION PROJECT ON GRANT AVE FOR AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$285,710 AND THE TERM ENDING JUNE 30, 2027**

**CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR**

**H.10. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH FEHR & PEERS, INC., A CALIFORNIA CORPORATION, FOR PROFESSIONAL PLANNING AND ENGINEERING SERVICES FOR THE PEDESTRIAN ENHANCEMENTS ON AVIATION BLVD PROJECT FOR AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$85,285 AND A TERM**

**ENDING JUNE 30, 2027**

**CONTACT: ANDREW WINJE, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR**

**H.11. This Item was pulled by Councilmember Nehrenheim for separate discussion.**

**H.12. ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY ORDINANCE NO. 3272-24, AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, REPEALING SECTIONS 2-9.201 THROUGH 2-9.303, AND SECTIONS 2-9.1101 THROUGH 2-9.1203 OF THE REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE REGARDING THE HISTORICAL, PRESERVATION, LIBRARY, AND RECREATION AND PARKS COMMISSIONS, AND ADDING SECTIONS 2-9.1501 THROUGH 2-9.1503 REGARDING THE CONSOLIDATED PUBLIC AMENITIES COMMISSION. FOR SECOND READING AND ADOPTION**

**CONTACT: LUKE SMUDE, ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER**

Councilmember Nehrenheim pulled Items No. H.6 and H.11 from the Consent Calendar for separate discussion. In response to his inquiry regarding the Blue Folder Item for Item No. N.1, Chief Deputy City Clerk Colombo confirmed it was sent as a link as the file was too big.

Councilmember Obagi referenced Item No. H.9; reported it is a \$285,000 contract for engineering and design services to expand the North Redondo bike path to Inglewood Avenue and design a terrace native garden. In terms of Item H.10, the appropriation is for pedestrian bike enhancements and neighborhood electric vehicle enhancements to get vehicles across Aviation Boulevard between Artesia and Manhattan Beach and thanked Public Works for their efforts.

There were no public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, the Consent Calendar as amended, pulling Items No. H.6 and H.11 for separate discussion.

Motion carried, 5-0.

Chief Deputy City Clerk Colombo read titles to Resolution No. CC-2407-057 and Ordinance No. 3272-24.

## **I. EXCLUDED CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS**

**H.6. APPROVE AN AGREEMENT WITH GRANICUS, LLC, TO PROCURE A NEW AGENDA MANAGEMENT SYSTEM (ONEMEETING) AND SWAGIT VIDEO STREAMING SERVICES AND CONTINUE CURRENT SERVICES DURING**

**IMPLEMENTATION FOR A THREE-YEAR CONTRACT IN AN AMOUNT OF \$279,937.20 AND A ONE-TIME FEE \$31,443.17 FOR THE TERM OF JULY 1, 2024 THROUGH JUNE 30, 2027 WITH ADDITIONAL OPTIONS TO EXTEND UP TO 2 ADDITIONAL ONE-YEAR TERMS**

**CONTACT:** ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK  
MIKE COOK, INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY DIRECTOR  
LUKE SMUDE, ASSISTANT TO THE CITY MANAGER

Councilmember Nehrenheim commented on past challenges with A/V elements in relation to agenda management and video management; discussed the contract amount and scope of work; asked IT Director Cook and City Clerk Manzano for a brief report on the changes, timeline, and implementation.

City Clerk Manzano spoke about the distribution of RFP information and expressed disappointment that only three bids were submitted; addressed the bid evaluation process and the team that reviewed the bids; stated they reached out to other cities that use both systems for recommendations; spoke favorably about the Granicus OneMeeting training and highlighted features of the programs.

IT Director Cook discussed details of the video streaming service; noted this is a “top-to-bottom” replacement; spoke about the ease-of-use and public access as well as searchable transcriptions of meetings.

City Clerk Manzano added that the last five years of videos will be migrated onto the new video service and reported launch should be between nine and twelve months; in response to Councilmember Nehrenheim question regarding backup of meetings, City Clerk Manzano stated the meetings are backed up on CD's.

City Manager Witzansky noted this has been “a long time coming”; thanked Council for its leadership on this matter; looked forward to the new tools this system will bring; noted that anything that can be done to streamline the process is essential as this is the most fundamental tool the City has as it pertains to governance of the City.

Councilmember Loewenstein spoke about the importance of this working so that people can participate from home; stressed the importance of the community being able to watch the meetings and hoped that Staff will continue to press the importance of getting this system implemented.

There were no public comments on this item.

Motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and approved by voice vote, Item No. H.6, as presented.

Motion carried, 5-0.

**H.11. INTRODUCE BY TITLE ONLY ORDINANCE NO. 3273-24 AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, AMENDING TITLE 3, CHAPTER 6, SECTION 3-6.03 OF THE REDONDO BEACH MUNICIPAL CODE PERTAINING TO PARKING METER HOURLY RATES, FOR INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING**

**CONTACT:** JOE HOFFMAN, CHIEF OF POLICE

Councilmember Nehrenheim reported feedback received on parking meter fee increases; stated that he met with the Riviera Village BID and several other areas, where he was asked what areas would be affected by the increases and he responded with the Redondo Beach Coastal zone only; it was suggested to him that other revenue generating areas should be impacted with the increases as well; he reported he was against this at first but was convinced by others that the City needs to move forward with this and stated he will approve this agenda item, pending action by Council, to look for other areas for parking meters.

Councilmember Kaluderovic mentioned she would like to see a need to install parking meters along Artesia Boulevard and hoped Council will create more business along Artesia Boulevard that would warrant parking meters.

Councilmember Obagi agreed with Councilmember Kaluderovic's comments; talked about Council having looked at parking meters along Herondo at one point but realized the cost of placing parking meters there would outweigh the benefits; mentioned having a BRR done on Artesia Boulevard to see what revenue would be generated there.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, to approve Item No. H.11, as presented.

Substitute motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to approve Item No. H.11 and to direct Staff to return with a report for parking machines for ticketing systems along Artesia Boulevard from Aviation to Inglewood and to provide a report within the next six months with costs and potential revenues associated with installing parking meters along Artesia Boulevard.

Councilmember Obagi stated this is not on the agenda and violates the Brown Act. Councilmember Nehrenheim argued that it relates to parking meters so it is not in violation.

There were no public comments on this item.

City Attorney Webb, via Zoom, recommended it would be more appropriate if Council provided the direction under referrals to Staff as this item is introducing an ordinance that has nothing to do with Artesia Boulevard; he opined that the current motion is inappropriate.

Amended motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to amend the ordinance to include parking meters on Artesia Boulevard and include the amount of revenue the City could derive from that.

City Attorney Webb, via Zoom, explained the amount of revenue is not part of it and is inappropriate; advised, if further discussion is desired, that would be appropriate in referrals to Staff.

Councilmember Nehrenheim restated the amended motion, per City Attorney Webb's recommendation.

Amended motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to include parking meters in a paid parking system on Artesia Boulevard.

More discussion regarding the amended motion ensued.

The amended motion failed, 2-3- by voice. Councilmembers Behrendt, Kaluderovic and Obagi voted, "No".

The original motion original carried, 3-2 by voice vote. Councilmembers Loewenstein and Nehrenheim voted, "No".

Chief Deputy City Clerk Colombo read title to Ordinance No. 3273-24.

## **J. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS**

### **J.1 For eComments and Emails Received from the Public**

Ron Maroko spoke favorably about the Shakespeare by the Sea event at Dominguez Park; spoke about the consolidation of the various Commissions and distributed copies of "A Moment in Redondo Beach History".

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Nehrenheim, and approved by voice vote, to receive and file Ron Maroko's "A Moment in Redondo Beach History".

Motion carried, 5-0.

Ron Maroko continued to speak about its meaning and the Historical Commission; commented on past moments in history and proceeded with the report.

Motion by Councilmember Kaluderovic, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, and approved by voice vote, to extend the time for Ron Maroko to comment.

Motion carried, 5-0.

Chief Deputy City Clerk Colombo reported receiving one eComment related to this item.

There were no other public comments.

**K. EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS - None**

**L. PUBLIC HEARINGS - None**

**M. ITEMS CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS AGENDAS – None**

**N. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION PRIOR TO ACTION**

Mayor Light moved to Item No. N.2 per Approval of the Agenda.

**N.1. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING PICKLEBALL PLAY AND COURT MANAGEMENT IN THE CITY**

**DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE INSTALLATION OF PICKLEBALL COURT LINES ON ONE OR TWO OF THE TENNIS COURTS LOCATED AT ALTA VISTA PARK**

**CONTACT:** ELIZABETH HAUSE, INTERIM COMMUNITY SERVICES DIRECTOR

Mayor Light advised the assembly to not clap, but instead quietly wave their hands or sign a thumbs down.

Interim Community Services Director Hause introduced the item and Deputy Community Services Director Orta. They presented a PowerPoint on the subject of pickleball with details regarding pickleball play, court management in the City, and the possible installation of pickleball court lines to one or two of the tennis courts at Alta Vista Park for dual play. She addressed City Council motions from March 5, 2024 regarding Aviation, Franklin, Alta Vista and Perry Parks and included direction for the City Attorney to consider preparing an ordinance and direction regarding signage and other matters; provided an update of current pickleball projects in the City and presented an example of signage commonly posted in parks.

Interim Community Services Director Hause continued with the presentation addressing Alta Vista Park and tennis users and included costs, proposed hourly fees, and projected court revenue.

Discussion followed regarding the City providing nets, hours of play, and net set-up and take-down.

Interim Community Services Director Hause discussed a noise measurement test at Alta Vista Park conducted with beginner players.

In response to Councilmember Obagi's question regarding why the particular court (the court closest to residences) was chosen, Deputy Community Services Director Orta reported that Staff wanted to use the location that would provide the largest impact for the noise test and stated Staff is not necessarily recommending that particular court to act on.

Councilmember Obagi asked about the fence surrounding the location and about the implementation of the material to help with the acoustics. Discussion ensued regarding the fence and sound proofing.

Mayor Light asked for clarification on the noise test with respect to Camino Real; opined that it will not yield results in terms of what residents would hear since it was taken from the sidewalk and not inside the homes; confirmed the players were amateurs but the equipment used for testing was professional grade and the operator was a trained police officer performing the tests.

Interim Director of Community Services Hause continued her presentation and discussed possible action items for Council to consider; stated Staff is available to answer any questions regarding this item.

Mayor Light explained that sound attenuation is better if it is closer to the courts.

Councilmember Obagi thanked Staff for their efforts to get pickleball courts out to residents; commented on pickleball at Perry Park; reported receiving information about an instructor setting up at Franklin Park on Sunday mornings at 6:00 a.m. and hogging the court all day and wondered what the City's rules are regarding commercial activity on free, shared pickleball courts.

Councilmember Kaluderovic commented on the need for enforcement.

Deputy Community Services Director Orta reported that Code Enforcement or the Police Department would handle enforcement; reported the Municipal Code prohibits the commercialization of activities without a permit, which would be allowed through the City's contract class program; noted that activity at Franklin Park is not permitted and offered to follow up. She added that Staff has developed draft signage listing the rules with a specific bullet prohibiting commercialization of activities without a permit and hopes to have that approved for posting soon.

Councilmember Obagi asked the public for feedback regarding having one tennis court converted to four pickleball courts, exclusively for pickleball, or two tennis courts converted to eight but with shared use and shared times.

Councilmember Obagi directed another question regarding round robin play or

tournament play to Deputy Community Services Director Orta or Interim Community Development Director Hause; Deputy Community Services Director Orta responded and addressed tournament play. Councilmember Obagi reported doing extensive due diligence on pickleball at Alta Vista Park; discussed the Windy App and the fact that the wind in Redondo Beach generally runs from west to east; noted that the sound carries with the wind and carries away from residences towards the rest of the park; shared results of an informal test he conducted; stated he has no concern regarding noise generated from pickleball play; commented if he is wrong they can restripe and take away the nets and problem solved.

Councilmember Nehrenheim reported attending pickleball events; appreciated the studies; stated after his own observations he understands why so many communities go through impact assessments and noise mitigation; mentioned he and Councilmember Loewenstein allocated \$320,000 for the sport; listed several locations in the area and neighboring cities that offer indoor courts and multi-use options year-round; posed the question of having shared courts as opposed to dedicated pickleball only courts; addressed the conflicts that shared courts create; advocated for dedicated-use courts with sufficient capacity for tournaments, such as at Aviation Park. Additionally, he talked about the consideration needed to nearby neighbors; noted the South Bay Tennis Center was well thought out and was a collaboration with the City; mentioned shared use devalues and ruins the competition aspect of the tennis courts; asked the public for their opinions.

Mayor Light mentioned other pickleball courts in the City that are near residential homes and asked if the City has received complaints from neighbors.

Interim Community Development Director Hause was unsure.

Councilmember Obagi commented on complaints from basketball players but not due to noise; the younger residents commented that they are too intimidated to ask adults to relinquish the courts.

Discussion followed regarding emails received on noise complaints.

RBPD Chief Hoffman was asked to come to the podium to comment on the subject; stated if complaints have been received, he has not been made aware of them. He added that complaints regarding pickleball are not usually in regard to noise but rather complaints that a court was set up illegally, such as at a parkette.

Mayor Light confirmed with Staff that signage can be installed at parkettes indicating that pickleball is prohibited.

Mayor Light invited public comments.

Ken Bernstein, District 5, voiced his disappointment with the outcomes of the tests conducted; referenced a petition and other items under Blue Folder Items including a

petition of 500 residents opposed to pickleball courts; mentioned the test at 150 feet and a video where they were warming up rather than playing; disagreed that there is not noise impact from pickleball; talked about density issues, noise studies, and practices in other cities; urged City Council to pay for a noise study and let the facts decide.

Mayor Light expressed his appreciation for the materials and video submitted by Mr. Bernsten and commented on flat versus sloped ground.

Bob Brown spoke in opposition to pickleball at Alta Vista Park; felt that the tests conducted by the Staff were to achieve results they wanted; stated that he witnessed and videotaped the test conducted by Staff and it was not a valid test; expressed concerns with noise and decreased property values; asked for a professional report be conducted; reported he plays pickleball every weekend, but it is not at a court that negatively impacts the neighboring community.

Jeanette Peter, Marine League Team Coordinator at Alta Vista, spoke about the League's membership, teams, her experience playing tennis at Alta Vista, new league teams and players this season, junior programs and other USTA programs; addressed tennis court usage; questioned the March 2024 court usage study data presented by a pickleball representative; reported that she plays pickleball; wondered about the validity of the study conducted by staff and requested that the City conduct a professional noise study to determine the real impacts of pickleball play at Alta Vista Park.

Chris Robbins, District 3, noted her preference for one tennis court to be made into four pickleball dedicated courts at Alta Vista Park; suggested that could be a solution until the courts at Aviation Park are built; appreciated Councilmembers' visits and views of the courts but did not feel it is a proper assessment of a typical pickleball court; noted it is not always a social event, pickleball players are dedicated and competitive, is also a family sport and feels like a community. Additionally, she mentioned doing a sound study but did not feel the results will differ greatly if the play is a little harder than just dinking; reported often stopping at Alta Vista Park to observe tennis courts and there is always at least one tennis court open.

Hai Tran, District 4, talked about his experience playing tennis and pickleball in the City; reported his wife and child are now playing pickleball too and they enjoy playing as a family; explained issues related to not being able to resource a court for play and the high costs of many clubs; stated he does not have a preference in terms of shared courts or dedicated courts as long as there is an ability to make reservations.

Sandy Nervig, Captain of the Marine Tennis League Team, noted that USTA data shows that tennis is also a growing sport with more expected in the next few years; urged City Council to preserve existing tennis courts; believed that Alta Vista is the only park in the City that provides competitive tennis courts; noted that once a tennis court is striped for pickleball it cannot be used for competition; urged Council to consider the League's history in the City.

Rita Schildt, District 3, on behalf of Desiree Galassi, District 4, Founder and Administrator, Redondo Beach Pickleball Platform, read a letter urging Council to evaluate the effectiveness of the WebTrac reservation system; referenced an analysis she presented in March that demonstrated how the City can make reasonable, cost-effective, swift decisions regarding the City's limited resources and effectively optimize Alta Vista to accommodate pickleball; offered her commitment to work with the City to develop a reasonable schedule for open play time and reservation play. She mentioned working together to find solutions to any challenges that may arise. Rita Schildt stated she would prefer one tennis court to be made into four dedicated pickleball courts at Alta Vista Park until a better solution is offered.

Sue Gallagher, District 1, felt the tennis people do not want to share; reported playing in surrounding cities and the South Bay Tennis Club; stated she is not in favor of amplified music while playing; noted it would be nice to be able to play in Alta Vista because currently she drives everywhere just to play.

In reply to Councilmember Obagi's question regarding amplified music, Interim Community Services Director Hause suggested addressing amplified music administratively.

Peter Zito, District 4, talked about playing tennis at Alta Vista Park for many years; agreed there are courts open, but indicated it is usually between the hours of 12:00 p.m. and 3:00 p.m.; noted challenges in terms of instructors/classes using the courts and reserving courts; expressed concerns with diminishing the number of resources available for tennis players; noted they are only trying to maintain what they already have; stated that once a tennis court is striped for pickleball it cannot be used for competition; opined dedicated pickleball courts at Aviation Park would be ideal and mentioned there are other pickleball courts in the City that are not being used.

In reply to Councilmember Obagi's question whether setting a set time for use by instructors and classes would benefit players such as his group, Peter Zito stated it is more of a threshold issue and not just windows of time; felt it is more of a lack of courts available in the area.

Councilmember Kaluderovic asked whether Peter Zito plays at Anderson Park, and he reported he does not because they do not play round robin which is what he likes to play.

Julie Wise, District 3, reported she plays pickleball at Franklin Park; noted it is difficult to get a court in a public park; stated her preference would be to convert one tennis court to four dedicated pickleball courts at Alta Vista; noted most of the people speaking against pickleball at Alta Vista are not residents; spoke about playing in Manhattan Beach and paying there; reported she would rather give her money to Redondo Beach to play in the Redondo Beach.

Doug Richardson reported he lives across the street from Alta Vista Park; urged City Council to conduct a proper noise study; spoke negatively about the informational study

conducted by Staff.

Discussion followed regarding the noise generated by pickleball, tennis, and baseball.

Wayne Craig, District 1, reported that tennis courts are usually packed when he has visited Alta Vista Park; gave a recommendation on how to possibly add pickleball courts more quickly; mentioned the possibility of pickleball courts at the former AES Powerplant site and talked about the School Board adding pickleball courts.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Mayor Light mentioned that when little leagues play on the fields on weekends, the parking lot does get full; noted he maintains the nearby community garden and that on weekdays there is plenty of parking; talked about fairness and noted no noise complaints have been received from residents living in the District; discussed prohibiting music and considering a starting time of 10:00 a.m. as that is when the winds start shifting to the west.

Councilmember Kaluderovic summarized comments made by the public; noted the issues have already been in neighborhoods that have pickleball courts; commented on challenges with parking at Franklin Park; asserted she has not received a single complaint; believed that South Redondo Beach residents should also have a place to play pickleball; discussed impacts to basketball; stressed that this is a community and staff is trying to respond to all of the needs of the entire community. Additionally, she believed there is an opportunity to share the courts until the dedicated pickleball courts at Aviation Park can be built; mentioned the petition that was submitted had the signatures of many non-residents.

Councilmember Obagi displayed a video of pickleball play along with ambient noise; reported that Council allocated over \$20,000 for sound attenuation measures; noted it costs very little to paint lines on tennis courts for dual pickleball play; urged residents to report problems at [qualityoflife@redondo.org](mailto:qualityoflife@redondo.org); talked about an opportunity to recognize one of the fastest-growing sports in the country; felt that implementing pickleball at Alta Vista Park would diversify the recreational opportunities in the City; talked about ensuring that the City continues to be an inclusive and accessible community when it comes to recreational opportunities.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, to direct staff to restripe the south-eastern tennis court at Alta Vista Park with four pickleball courts for exclusive use as a pickleball court; ensure installation of acoustic dampening, as appropriate; procure the nets and process a mitigated negative declaration for environmental issues.

Interim Community Services Director Hause reported getting the green light from the City Manager to start installing signs at parkettes and that the prohibition of music can be done administratively as well.

City Attorney Webb, via Zoom, suggested indicating that the Administrative Rules would be sufficient as opposed to an ordinance.

Councilmember Obagi added to the motion to reference that if the Administrative Rules regarding noise and other prohibitions do not solve the issues, the item will be referred for an ordinance.

Councilmember Kaluderovic seconded the motion.

Councilmember Loewenstein spoke about dealing with competing interests and noise and the lack of open space in Redondo Beach; noted he is sensitive to noise; talked about a Northrop lot as a solution to adding pickleball courts in the City and hoped the City can look into it.

Councilmember Nehrenheim talked about inclusivity and the importance of listening to residents; discussed the various “noise studies”, density and traffic; read from an article indicating that pickleball is not equal, acoustically, to tennis, volleyball or other activities at outdoor recreational activities; agreed that a proper study needs to be done to mitigate noise impacts and believed that the impact from the conversion of the courts will impact the community at large.

Substitute motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to direct staff to take the \$320,000 and look for concessionary agreements with the Northrop lot identified by Councilmember Loewenstein, empty areas around the gym that were identified, start that process and move the process forward to create a pickleball center.

Councilmember Behrendt spoke about pickleball courts at Anderson and Dale Page Parks; reported the City is moving forward to bring a dedicated pickleball facility with multiple courts at the Aviation Park open field; spoke about giving deference to preferences of a Councilmember and residents of a district before installing something like this project in that district; felt there is not much support from residents in District 1 who live near Alta Vista Park or the District 1 Councilmember and, therefore, stated he does not feel comfortable moving ahead with the full scope of this item. In addition, he suggested a compromise of converting one tennis court to a dual use court to be shared, including full sound mitigation, prohibition of amplified music, and a test period of six months as a compromise and return it to a tennis court once the Aviation Park courts are built.

In reply to Councilmember Behrendt’s question as to whether Councilmember Nehrenheim would accept that compromise, Councilmember Nehrenheim stated it goes back to the admission that there is a noise impact and offered to second the suggested motion if a noise impact study is included in the direction to Staff.

Councilmember Nehrenheim rejected the compromise offered by Councilmember Behrendt.

Substitute to the substitute motion by Councilmember Behrendt, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to direct Staff to restripe one tennis court at Alta Vista Park with four pickleball courts, converting one tennis court to a dual use court to be shared including full sound mitigation, prohibition of amplified music and a test period of six months, process a mitigated negative declaration for environmental issues and remove the pickleball striping entirely once the Aviation Park facility is completed.

The Substitute to the substitute motion failed 2-3, by roll call vote as follows:

AYES: Kaluderovic, Obagi  
NOES: Behrendt, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim  
ABSENT: None  
ABSTAIN: None

City Attorney Webb wanted to clarify whether they had one motion, wanted a friendly amendment to the motion, or were they willing to combine the two motions; Councilmember Obagi and Councilmember Nehrenheim did not want to combine their motions.

The Substitute motion failed 2-3, by roll call vote as follows:

AYES: Loewenstein, Nehrenheim  
NOES: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Obagi  
ABSENT: None  
ABSTAIN: None

The Original motion carried 3-2, by roll call vote as follows:

AYES: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Obagi  
NOES: Loewenstein, Nehrenheim  
ABSENT: None  
ABSTAIN: None

Mayor Light moved to Item No. O.

**N.2. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION RELATED TO THE ISSUANCE OF BONDS TO FINANCE THE RENOVATION OR REPLACEMENT OF CRITICAL PUBLIC INFRASTRUCTURE AND THE ACQUISITION OF PUBLIC OPEN SPACE**

**RECEIVE AND FILE A PRESENTATION FROM FAIRBANK, MASLIN, MAULLIN, METZ & ASSOCIATES, INC. (FM3) ON PUBLIC OPINION POLLING RELATED TO THE POTENTIAL BOND ISSUANCE**

**CONTACT: LUKE SMUDE, ASSISTANT TO THE CITY**

Assistant to the City Manager Smude narrated a PowerPoint presentation with details from Council's direction given on June 11, 2024; items included survey on General Obligation Bonds, consolidating Police facilities, and options to reconfigure Fire resources.

Discussion followed regarding the updated cost analysis in the Griffin study and an additional 10% contingency based on market conditions and availability of resources.

Adam Sonenshein, FM3, narrated a PowerPoint presentation; explained how they conducted the survey and what methodology they used; reviewed results of the public opinion polling related to the potential bond issuance.

Councilmember Obagi asked if costs for two separate new police structures have been considered; City Manager Witzansky reported they were included in the initial Griffin study and have not changed and were added into a single document. Additionally, Griffin estimates included some contingencies for construction, unforeseen conditions, and adjustments for inflation based on expected execution of the project. City Manager Witzansky suggested adding a programmatic contingency as a cushion (10%) in the event the City pursues the bond and runs into other unforeseeable issues during that time.

Councilmember Nehrenheim noted one of his take-aways from the presentation is that there is room for public engagement and education; noted the public is aware of the Fire Stations but is not aware of the dilapidated condition of the Public Works yard; asked Adam Sonenshein if his company would be open to educating the community; in response to his inquiry, Adam Sonenshein, FM3, stressed the importance of education in building support for the measure; noted there is opportunity to have a dialogue with the community about City needs, particularly in infrastructure; added that he understood that measures on the same ballot would only have to reach 55%.

Councilmember Nehrenheim talked about the need for certainty and for residents to become educated and get the right information, especially as it relates to the other City facilities besides Police and Fire Stations; reported residents have seen how the City is moving forward in the community but would want more information if the City goes down the path of a larger ask for the Public Works yard.

Adam Sonenshein, FM3, confirmed that if the City goes after a measure beyond Police and Fire Stations, there will be a great need for community education on other facilities that need funding.

Councilmember Loewenstein commented that the City is very far off from City Hall and the Public Works according to the survey; felt people have strong prejudices against increasing funding; asked about how Prop 5 is polling; in response, Adam Sonenshein stated that will depend on how the Attorney General describes it and that won't come out for a couple of days; Councilmember Loewenstein stated trade unions and a lot of

the unions will put a lot of money into that since it will benefit them which is positive for the City; asked whether a renovation at the current police stations would be large enough and could handle the design since the building was built 70 years ago.

City Manager Witzansky reported that, between the two sites, it is large enough to house all functions; agreed it is not ideal to be in two buildings, but the space added by the Annex has been a great asset; confirmed the City could renovate the two existing sites and continue to operate and function well but acknowledged a new, consolidated facility would be the preferred outcome.

In reply to Councilmember Kaluderovic's request, Adam Sonenshein, FM3, talked about challenges in passing similar measures on off elections versus a presidential election; noted people who vote in presidential elections tend to vote in favor of similar measures; noted during municipal elections the voter base is more conservative; discussed younger voters are less supportive but noted higher-turnout voters tend to offset those votes and are in favor of the bond measures; spoke about the tendencies of voters.

Councilmember Obagi asked whether people's perceptions of new versus old structures were measured; in response, Adam Sonenshein, FM3, reported the concepts of replacing versus repairing/updating were tested and did not produce different results, but admitted they did not explain the cost of renovating versus replacing.

Councilmember Loewenstein talked about the possibility of adding solar when the facilities are under construction.

City Manager Witzansky confirmed that it is possible and that staff can build on that consideration and will ask Griffin to provide costs estimates.

Dustin Alamo (via Zoom), Griffin, mentioned cost would depend on the level of coverage and structural considerations on the facilities.

Councilmember Obagi hoped to fund at least a refurbishment of the Public Works yard, if not a totally new construction of it; stated he is more "dovish" on the bond financing than he was when this was first discussed; spoke about the uncertainty of the November election and the need to be more conservative and mentioned a win of any number would be a big win when it comes to Public Safety infrastructure; reported that the Police Officers Association and Fire Fighters Association have stated they will advocate for this bond if the City makes it a Public Safety bond; talked about the public not being able to understand the connection between Public Safety and Public Works due to lack of education given; reviewed details of two spreadsheets presented as slide 2B; noted he would accept both of the scenarios in the spreadsheet. Relative to Public Works, City Hall and the Police Shooting Range, Councilmember Obagi stated this is not the extent of the City's financing capabilities; felt the City could engage in lease revenue bonds later on to continue to fulfill the City's infrastructure renewal obligations and investments in the City. He spoke about a conversation he had with a resident regarding the Police Shooting Range and stated she was against funding for it; he talked about changing the

Police Shooting Range to a Police Training Facility and believed comingling with Police and Fire Station projects is not a good idea.

Councilmember Kaluderovic spoke about the Police Shooting Range and stated she is very confident the City will get the funding for it.

In response to Councilmember Nehrenheim's inquiry on the next steps following the passing of the measure by voters, City Manager Witzansky reported that assuming it is on the ballot, approved by voters in November, and the election is certified, the City would have the ability to pull a bond issuance team; stated they already have a Bond Council and financing group but need to procure firms to support the issuance of a bond; listed details of next steps and noted Council would have options to consider but it begins with voter approval of the bond measure.

City Manager Witzansky talked about issuing the bonds in a timely manner, when Staff knows when the funds can be spent; mentioned the City could hire, through the RFP process, a firm to do pre-engineering analysis or a large design/build firm that could help coordinate the various projects allowing the City to potentially move more quickly with each of the four different locations, or bring on a firm to just handle design and then move to construction management; suggested it might make sense to build one fire station at a time and one police facility at a time; reported that all of the projects would require some type of temporary facility to support functionality during construction, which is expected to be a multi-year process. He noted that typically, the City would be able to invest the proceeds, with limitations; reported that the goal is to acquire the money when the project is at "shovel-ready" as possible; stated that there will be pre-engineering and design costs that will require an immediate infusion of funds and reported the City will need to commit to what is described in the measure itself.

Councilmember Nehrenheim mentioned the City does not have to do an entire rebuild for the Public Works yard; commented on being able to move money between projects. In response, City Manager Witzansky reported that the narrative will set the broad parameters on how to use the funds and the amount of the funds is a hard cap. He added that the bond itself does not necessarily tie specific amounts to each of the projects that are mentioned in there. However, there is the electorate reality where they are voting on this based on the City's commitment to build certain things and depending on how much outreach, education, and communication there is on the specificity of the use of those funds, the City would be bound by whatever that narrative is, if not legally, certainly from a public policy standpoint.

In further responding to Councilmember Nehrenheim's comments, City Manager Witzansky reported that the City will not do arguments "for" and opined it needs to be done by someone outside of the City. Mayor Light stated a Councilmember can do it as an individual.

Councilmember Nehrenheim stated the more specificity included in the description of the bond, and the higher the overall amount of public relations and education, the higher

the likelihood of the measure passing.

City Manager Witzansky referenced the initial draft of the measure statement provided in the FM3 PowerPoint; reported it has been reviewed by the bond counsel as an eligible statement; Council will vote on it (or a version of it) on July 30, 2024; initially for introduction and for adoption on August 6, 2024. Ultimately, it is what would govern the amount and use of the funds. Regarding the \$18.00 average number, City Manager Witzansky reported that the City used their municipal adviser, who was hired in June to do this work; they ran a series of scenarios for the City, and this was the average estimate, assuming a 5% interest rate at the time of the issuance. He mentioned they wanted to error on the conservative side; felt the City could be more aggressive and assume a lower number but in fairness to the community they wanted to test it on the higher side with the public; noted there is always possibility of changes in the market in the future.

Councilmember Nehrenheim talked about the various State, County and Local bond measures in the November ballot the City needs to worry about; asked how these measures may impact the City's bond measure.

City Manager Witzansky reported that the opposition statements that were tested included wording regarding the local bonds that could be on the ballot and stated that was part of the reaction from the community.

Adam Sonenshein, FM3, added that they tried to reflect that in the survey; mentioned uncertainties in terms of what was going to be on the ballot at the time they conducted the survey; reported when the opposition was reflected back to the voters, there was a dip in support and opined it does create challenges in getting their stories through in terms of communication and outreach when they are also hearing about local, state and regional causes at the same time.

In response to a question from Councilmember Loewenstein, Adam Sonenshein, FM3, reported that people are likely to favor local measures over state measures.

Councilmember Nehrenheim mentioned the City's March election will have three Council seats, the Mayor seat, and the City Attorney position; noted it will also include the Charter amendments and will be a heavy ballot; mentioned Redondo Beach will have a big voter turnout, especially when there is a heavy agenda; voiced his worry over the November election; stated he is cautious about the November ballot and discussed the need to get the word out and educate voters; noted the FM3 survey showed a 10% increase in support after educating voters.

Adam Sonenshein, FM3, believed it is clear there would need to be education and outreach; discussed the benefit of time to do that outreach; stated that in a lower turnout universe less resources would be needed but, as noted by Councilmember Nehrenheim, Redondo Beach has a higher voter turnout; stressed the benefits for people to be targeted and noted tradeoffs.

Councilmember Nehrenheim felt that voter apathy to local elections is being taken for granted; talked about having a higher voter turnout during the Special Election in October, 2022 than the General Election in November 2022; opined that is indicative that residents in Redondo Beach pay attention to their local government.

In reply to Mayor Light's question, City Manager Witzansky reported that Staff is looking for three things tonight; direction on whether or not to begin preparing the ballot measure statement for the City to move forward with an ordinance, effective July 30, 2024, decision on which facilities and in what amounts; stated that once Council gives that direction, if the council decides to move forward, staff will have a draft ballot measure statement and an ordinance for introduction on July 30th.

Councilmember Nehrenheim talked about a past Riviera Village Parking Structure Study; reported the City used to have a Parking District and asked about the likelihood of going for separate bond measures on the same ballot.

City Manager Witzansky reported that it could potentially be issued as a Lease Revenue Bond because the City would potentially be generating new revenue that can be used to help pay for the debt service associated with construction costs. He added that would not necessarily be a property assessment on residents; explained Council has different options on how to present it to the residents, including going to voters to determine support for a new parking structure in the Village.

Mayor Light noted this is not on the agenda.

Councilmember Nehrenheim explained he is trying to determine if some of these projects can be broken into smaller pieces.

City Manager Witzansky stated it could be considered as public infrastructure; noted it has not been uncovered but in that scenario, revenue would be generated that could be assigned to the debt service cost, which is different than what is being pursued here, which is non-revenue producing.

Councilmember Loewenstein stated he is in favor of moving forward with this; felt the City will risk passing the four facilities (Firehouse 1, Firehouse 2, the Police Annex and Headquarters) forward if Council starts adding other things; asserted Council needs to take action on a decision.

Discussion followed regarding deciding the total amount and the 20% contingency and whether soft costs are built in.

Dustin Alamo, Griffin, reported the snapshot includes all project costs for this level of estimate; noted construction costs include design contingencies between 10% and 15%; explained inclusion of an escalation to the midpoint of construction for the projects and included a 10% course of construction contingency. He added there are likely to be

more unknowns if they do renovations; reported a 10% contingency has been added across the project plus another 5% contingency for soft costs. He added that renovations always require a higher level of contingency and felt adding another 10% to 20% on top of the current contingencies would be prudent.

City Manager Witzansky confirmed Griffin suggests adding another 10% on new construction as a programmatic extra and 20% if the City chooses to renovate.

Councilmember Obagi worked on updates to Slide 2B.

Councilmember Behrendt noted this is going to be a narrow election; pointed out that 2/3 of voters will need to support it to pass and depends on Prop 5 passing; asserted the need to be cautious and conservative; opined that new construction is essential for Fire Stations 1 and 2; commented on the importance of renovating the Police Headquarters and Annex and agreed with the need for a 10% contingency on new construction and possibly an additional 20% for the Police Headquarters and Annex remodel.

Councilmember Obagi reviewed the new amounts reflected in updated Slide 2B.

City Manager Witzansky agreed with the 10% contingency for remodels; talked about Council being specific regarding the four facilities and communicating that to residents; agreed the added contingencies would total 30% for remodels and 20% for new construction.

Public Works Director Winje reported that FM3's contingencies were for various elements; explained 10% was just for the construction piece, not the whole package; felt with all things considered it will reach low-to-mid 20%; explained this seems a reasonable approach and agreed there is still many unknowns.

Councilmember Loewenstein agreed with being conservative; suggested considering a new Police Headquarters and a modernization of the Annex, which would allow room for Administration and other things that happen within Police Headquarters.

In reply to Mayor Light's question about expanding capacity at the current Police Station, City Manager Witzansky reported space is tight; stated there is some capacity for growth but not much; noted how the City ultimately spends the money between the two sides is yet to be determined; talked about reconstructing two stations and renovating the other two and reported the City will get to choose how to allocate the resources so there will be flexibility.

Councilmember Obagi commented that Councilmember Loewenstein has an interesting idea; reported that adding 20% to the Police Annex refurbishment results in \$93,348,000 and asked to hear thoughts from RBPD Chief Hoffman.

RBPD Chief Hoffman noted that the Annex does not have essential functions and it only houses Department staff; reported the Police Headquarters has the Type 1 Jail, a full communication center with massive amounts of infrastructure, records facility, property and evidence storage with giant safes that keep evidence for trials; indicated it was built in 1954 as a full-service facility at the time and they have outgrown its capacity. He added that the units and divisions housed in the Annex could be placed in any commercial facility because it does not have those essential components of what it takes to operate the Police Department.

Councilmember Kaluderovic wanted Adam Sonenshein's, FM3, opinion, based on his experience, on what the polling swing would be in situations where city projects have options that differ in costs such as theirs being \$76 million for one option and \$93 million for the other option. Adam Sonenshein, FM3, reported that the bond authorization amount would matter less to voters than the tax rate; noted the lower bond authorization amount would have a lower tax rate. He added that a couple of dollars might mean a point or two, but probably not 10, and any points the City could pick up would be helpful.

City Manager Witzansky reported that with the \$76,000,000 figure, the result is just over \$14.00 for \$100,000 of assessed value.

Assistant to the City Manager Smude added that \$100,000,000 would be \$18.70.

Mayor Light invited public comment.

Officer Robert Carlborg, President of the Redondo Beach Police Officers Association (RBPOA), spoke in support of a bond measure for Public Safety facilities; recognized infrastructure problems in the current state of public buildings; referenced a 15-year-old study to build a new station where the Annex now stands; noted increased costs with the passage of time and mentioned that as stewards of the City, Council must do what is best for the City with an eye towards tomorrow. He spoke in support of a consolidated Police Department under one roof; urged City Council to move this forward, commit to working with the community by educating them, and advocate on behalf of this measure.

Georgette Gantner, District 2, talked about the importance of infrastructure; wondered about the number of people polled; hoped that the final measure will be specific so that voters will understand it; asked if there is any way to commit to an estimate once it is given instead of spiraling it around; voiced her frustration in the amount of time this is taking and commented how desperate the City needs this; asked whether the bond will be for facility exteriors as well.

City Manager Witzansky reported that renovations include exterior enhancements.

Councilmember Loewenstein reported the key to this is getting it done quickly, because of inflation; stressed that it is up to Council and Staff to drive this and mentioned that time is money.

Andy Porkchop, Torrance, spoke about his father's advice that if he did not have money, wait until he did have the money to spend it; talked about bonds and paying extra money on his property taxes because of the bond measure; opined the bonds are loans that the people must pay back and mentioned that everything does not need to be done at once.

There were no other public comments on this item.

Councilmember Obagi called RBPB Chief Hoffman to the podium and in response to his question regarding the priority of the renovation of the Annex, RBPB Chief Hoffman reported it is an old building and there are issues with the HVAC as well as electrical problems; reiterated that it is basically office space housing the Special Operations Bureau of the Police Department.

Councilmember Nehrenheim asked RBPB Chief Hoffman his opinion on combining the Police Department under one roof; RBPB Chief Hoffman reiterated that would be ideal from an organizational efficiency standpoint; understood the challenges and limitations and asserted that would be the ideal option. He spoke about the previous study to rebuild the Police Station under one roof at the Annex site; noted the department has grown since then and as the department continues to expand based on community needs the City would run into similar issues in terms of lack of capacity.

Councilmember Nehrenheim invited Public Works Director Winje to the podium.

Councilmember Nehrenheim spoke about taking a tour of the Public Works Facility; commented on its condition; reported he personally would classify it under a critical need (full replacement) and in response to his question, Public Works Director Winje acknowledged the lack of space; commented on the condition of the building and offices; mentioned most of the team spends their days in the field but when they return at the end of the day, it can get crowded; reported the Building Maintenance group is across the street in a warehouse that is not secure and is not air conditioned or heated and noted they work under less than ideal conditions.

More discussion followed regarding other offices Public Works occupy and Director Winje stated many are unreliable so no one enters those areas.

Councilmember Behrendt expressed his concerns about the City having competition on the ballot, assuming the need for 67% of the vote, felt that \$98,000,000 may be too much to bear and could cost a couple of percentage points; he opined in order to go for a win, he proposes \$28,000,000 for the renovation of the Police Department, almost \$50,000,000 for the two Fire Station rebuilds and favored a \$76,000,000 ballot measure; this way the City can get it passed with the voters rather than nothing.

Councilmember Obagi reported respecting that perspective; understood that residents see public safety infrastructure as needing replacement; understood the need to keep the number low in order to hit the 67% mark; liked Councilmember Loewenstein's idea of refurbishing the Annex and replacing the Police Headquarters; agreed with Officer

Carlborg's comments about not delaying the project further and about the need for new structures; asserted that making everything new is too rich for the City at present and puts further strain on residents. Additionally, he expressed support for the \$93,348,834.10 ballot measure figure.

Councilmember Loewenstein voiced his support; noted he has been through this before; mentioned mistakes made in a former School Bond Measure in terms of not building a new Science and Technology building; reported warning them not to make a mistake of not future-proofing leverage and felt the best thing is to future-proof the Police Headquarters and renovate the Annex; spoke about being able to direct current discretionary funds to the Public Works Facility.

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to proceed with a Bond Measure to construct new Fire Stations 1 and 2, a new Police Headquarters, with 10% contingency and refurbishment of the Police Annex with an added 20% contingency in an amount not to exceed \$93,348,834.10.

Councilmember Kaluderovic agreed regarding the need and importance of upgrading City facilities; noted they have exceeded their usable life; discussed the Police Shooting Range also upgrades the Public Works yard at that location; felt that if the City is successful in obtaining a grant both facilities can be upgraded. In addition, she commented on the importance of how the bond measure is worded in terms of public safety facilities in general.

City Manager Witzansky reported staff will work on a draft measure to present to Council.

Councilmember Nehrenheim spoke about the need to stay on the path of criticality and to blend and braid the City's ability to get quality of life issues in the measure; mentioned he would settle for refurbishment of the Public Works yard for \$6,100,000 and with that, it will get the City to \$90,000,000 with a 10% (\$9,000,000) contingency to pass \$100,000,000 across the board, which would round out the needs of Public Works.

Substitute motion by Councilmember Nehrenheim, to proceed with a bond measure for refurbishment of the Police Annex, rebuild of the Police Headquarters, refurbishment of the Public Works yard and complete refurbishment for Fire Stations 1 and 2, and any money left over could be used for the Harbor Patrol and all Fire Stations in the Harbor as well.

Councilmember Obagi reported that would total \$100,738,264.90 and explained a 20% contingency is included for refurbishments.

Councilmember Behrendt summarized the discussions and asked for Adam Sonenshein, FM3, thoughts on the motion before they vote.

Adam Sonenshein, FM3, reported it is important to remember that the \$93,348,834 is similar to what was tested in the survey which resulted in an initial response of 61% and

noted that the more conservative option still requires the City to build support and work to ensure the measure's success.

Dustin Alamo (via phone), Griffin, noted Council has considered the challenges and solutions well; spoke about the good feedback and input provided; felt that renovations of this magnitude could add 25 to 30 years of life to the facilities and new construction would be in the 50-year lifespan.

In response to Councilmember Behrendt's question regarding the proposed new construction of the two Fire Stations and refurbishment of the two Police Facilities, City Manager Witzansky reported that the basis for that was the pragmatic reaction to the polling; noted the public surveyed felt strongly about the two Fire Stations and less positive about the Police Facilities; asserted that the option was presented to show what the polling data most demonstrated in terms of the City's best chance to get a positive outcome. He added that all of the facilities have a critical need and at some point, it will be a "need to have" rather than a "nice to have"; noted any victory will be a victory for the City and the City has the ability to redirect resources that are discretionary today to the facilities that are on the list.

City Manager Witzansky felt the proposed changes are well-reasoned; spoke favorably regarding the contingencies and reiterated that any victory will be huge for the City.

Substitute motion by Councilmember Behrendt, to proceed with a bond measure for new construction of Fire Stations 1 and 2, the remodel of the Police Headquarters and the Annex, with a 10% addition contingency on the new construction and 20% on remodels for a total amount of \$76,233,442.50.

Councilmember Nehrenheim offered to second the Substitute motion if it amended to include a refurbishment of the Public Works yard.

Councilmember Behrendt stated he favors compromise but noted he is sensitive that there was no support for it in the survey; he does not want to jeopardize the success of the measure; added that he would be willing to address that in the future but did not accept the amendment at this time.

Councilmember Loewenstein pointed out that if the lifespan of a refurbishment is 20 to 30 years, after which a new one will be needed, and the City will not be able to do it for the \$17,000,000 difference.

Councilmember Behrendt explained he is in favor of combining Police Facilities and having a state-of-the-art world class Police Department that matches the quality of the City's Officers, but, as a pragmatist, he does not want to end up with nothing at the end of the day.

Councilmember Kaluderovic offered a friendly amendment to make the total \$80,000,000, remove the Annex at this time and commit to the Police Headquarters, and

giving Council the flexibility to use the funds where it sees fit.

City Manager Witzansky spoke about the importance of being unified in Council's support for the measure; addressed the importance of reaching a compromise; discussed describing it in the bond measure as Police Facilities as referenced in the prior description to allow the flexibility to use those funds based on construction estimates at the time.

Councilmember Behrendt accepted Councilmember Kaluderovic's friendly amendment.

Amended substitute motion by Councilmember Behrendt, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, to proceed with a Public Safety Bond Measure for new construction of Fire Stations 1 and 2 and of the Police Headquarters and postpone consideration of the Annex for a total amount of \$80,000,000.

Councilmember Obagi agreed that the Public Works yard needs to be replaced; noted this is not just an exercise in criticality, it is an exercise as to what is popular; expressed concerns that \$10,700,000 will not be enough to refurbish the Police Annex down the road, when things are more expensive, and would rather have a bond for Public Safety now that includes the Annex rather than later to avoid voter burn-out; stated he will not support the amended substitution motion.

In response to Councilmember Behrendt's question about shifting the funds between the two facilities, City Manager Witzansky stated it can be done depending on how the ballot measure is described; noted it is a matter of how Council presents it to the community and what Council feels the community is receptive to and supportive of.

Councilmember Loewenstein reported the difference between a \$80,000,000 bond and a \$98,000,000 bond is about \$2 per \$100,000; noted the average assessment is \$900,000; found it hard to believe \$18 will skew the election and felt it will not make much of a difference.

Mayor Light declared this is a tough decision and appreciated Council's deliberation and the public's input and hoped that Council will align and move forward.

The Amended substitute motion failed 2-3, as follows:

AYES: Behrendt, Kaluderovic  
NOES: Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi  
ABSENT: None  
ABSTAIN: None

Councilmember Obagi recapped the items as listed in the motion and restated it.

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to proceed with a Bond Measure to construct new Fire Stations 1 and 2, a new Police

Headquarters with 10% contingency and refurbishment of the Police Annex with an added 20% contingency in an amount not to exceed \$93,348,834.

Councilmember Nehrenheim offered to vote “Yes” if the motion includes a refurbishment of the Public Works yard.

Councilmember Obagi did not accept the offer.

The Motion carried 4-1, as follows:

AYES: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Obagi  
NOES: Nehrenheim  
ABSENT: None  
ABSTAIN: None

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and approved by voice vote, to receive and file a presentation from Fairbank, Maslin, Maullin, Metz & Associates, Inc. (FM3) on public opinion polling related to the potential bond issuance.

Motion carried, 5-0.

## **RECESS/RECONVENE**

Motion by Councilmember Behrendt, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, and approved by voice vote, to recess at 9:07 p.m.

Motion carried, 5-0.

Mayor Light reconvened the meeting at 9:17 p.m.

## **ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present: Behrendt, Kaluderovic, Loewenstein, Nehrenheim, Obagi, Mayor Light

Mayor Light returned to Item No. N.1.

## **O. CITY MANAGER ITEMS**

City Manager Witzansky spoke about a successful subcommittee meeting with the School District; reported they are open to having additional conversations and want a side-by-side comparison of various services they provide for the community; mentioned they would plan an upcoming follow up meeting with the School District in August to continue discussions.

**P. MAYOR AND COUNCIL ITEMS**

**Q. MAYOR AND COUNCIL REFERRALS TO STAFF**

In reply to Councilmember Nehrenheim's question, City Manager Witzansky reported that Staff is working on dates for Strategic Planning meetings and stated it will likely be scheduled in August.

Councilmember Nehrenheim asked whether a report on cannabis will be ready to be presented in August.

City Attorney Webb, via Zoom, noted that Council keeps adding things that take a higher priority and addressed the Measure DD language.

City Manager Witzansky provided a status update on the Farmers Market, business licenses and the tree ordinance.

Mayor Light mentioned that Public Works and Sustainability Commission were working on recommendations to Council on native plants and asked about the status.

City Manager Witzansky stated that he will find out about the status and return to Council with a response.

**R. RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION – None**

The Closed Session meeting was cancelled.

**S. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION – None**

The Closed Session meeting was cancelled.

**T. ADJOURNMENT – 10:57 p.m.**

There being no further business to come before the City Council, motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Kaluderovic, and was approved by voice vote, to adjourn the meeting at 10:57 p.m., to an Adjourned Regular meeting to be held at 4:30 p.m. (Closed Session) and a Regular meeting to be held at 6:00 p.m. (Open Session) on Tuesday, July 23, 2024 in the Redondo Beach City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

Motion carried, 5-0.

All written comments submitted via eComment are included in the record and available for public review on the City website.

Respectfully submitted:

DocuSigned by:

*Eleanor Manzano*

72F2AC716C214CF...

---

Eleanor Manzano, CMC  
City Clerk