

I. OPENING SESSION

1. CALL MEETING TO ORDER

A Regular Meeting of the Planning Commission was called to order by Chair Elder at 7:00 p.m. in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

2. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Hinsley, Rodriguez (via teleconference), Strutzenberg (via teleconference), Toporow (via teleconference), Ung, Vice Chair Glad (via teleconference), Chair Elder

Commissioners Absent: None

Officials Present: Brandy Forbes, Community Development Director
Sean Scully, Planning Manager
Stacey Kinsella, Associate Planner
Maria Shafer, Recording Secretary

3. SALUTE TO THE FLAG

Commissioner Hinsley led the assembly in the Salute to the Flag.

Chair Elder asked for a moment of silence in honor of those affected by the COVID-19 pandemic.

II. APPROVAL OF ORDER OF AGENDA

Motion by Commissioner Hinsley, seconded by Commissioner Ung, to approve the Order of Agenda as presented. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote.

III. CONSENT CALENDAR

4. APPROVAL OF AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING FOR THE PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING OF March 19, 2020

5. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM THE REGULAR MEETINGS OF January 16, 2020 and February 20, 2020

6. RECEIVE AND FILE THE STRATEGIC PLAN UPDATE OF: February 18, 2020

7. RECEIVE AND FILE WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS

Commissioner Hinsley pulled Item 5 from the Consent Calendar for separate discussion and consideration.

Motion by Commissioner Ung, seconded by Commissioner Hinsley, to approve the Consent Calendar with the exception of Item No. 5, as presented. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote.

IV. AUDIENCE OATH

Chair Elder administered the Audience Oath for members of the public sitting in the audience.

V. EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

Commissioner Hinsley reported speaking with the applicant and Councilmember Nehrenheim regarding Item No. 9.

Commissioner Rodriguez reported speaking with a neighbor regarding a couple of the items.

VI. EXCLUDED CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS

5. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM THE REGULAR MEETINGS OF January 16, 2020 and February 20, 2020

Commissioner Hinsley referenced Blue Folder Items relative to edits he suggested to the January 16, 2020 minutes and edits recommended by resident Holly Osbourne.

Motion by Commissioner Hinsley, seconded by Commissioner Ung, to approve the minutes from the regular meeting of January 16, 2020, as amended. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote.

Commissioner Hinsley submitted suggested edits to the meeting minutes of February 20, 2020 which will be incorporated into the final minutes and returned to the Commission for approval at the next regular meeting.

Motion by Commissioner Hinsley, seconded by Commissioner Ung, to continue approval of the regular meeting minutes of February 20, 2020 to the next regular meeting of the Planning Commission. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote.

VII. PUBLIC HEARINGS

8. Public Hearing to consider an Exemption Declaration and Planning Commission Design Review to allow the installation of a monument sign for a church on property located within a Low-Density Multiple-Family Residential (R-3) zone.

PROPERTY OWNER: Journey South Bay Church
APPLICANT: Same as owner
LOCATION: 2761 190th Street
CASE NO.: PCDR-2020-02

RECOMMENDATION: Adopt a resolution approving the Exemption Declaration and Planning Commission Design Review subject to the findings and conditions contained therein.

Motion by Commissioner Ung, seconded by Commissioner Hinsley, to open the Public Hearing. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote.

Planning Manager Sean Scully presented the staff report addressing location, existing conditions, previous and proposed monument signs, the need to conform to current regulations, proposed location, design and architecture and recommendations.

In reply to Commissioner Strutzenberg's question regarding whether temporary signage was permissible, Planning Manager Scully stated the application tonight would remove the need for those signs and that while the applicant worked with staff on the proposed sign, the City did not conduct enforcement.

It was noted there is a condition requiring removal of temporary banners and signs.

Commissioner Ung asked about the height and width requirements and discussed lifting the sign for increased visibility.

In response to Commissioner Hinsley's question regarding zoning, Planning Manager Scully reported churches are permitted in the R-3 zone with a Conditional Use Permit and would need to meet the setback requirements of the specific zone.

Discussion followed regarding allowances for temporary banners through the permit process.

Chair Elder invited the applicant to the podium.

Scott Demerjian, Superior Electrical Advertising, addressed setbacks; reported the sign ties into the design of the building and has been paired down significantly from the original design and noted there will be no need for temporary signs or banners in the future.

There were no other speakers.

Motion by Commissioner Hinsley, seconded by Commissioner Ung, to close the Public Hearing. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote.

Discussion followed regarding adding the PowerPoint presentation to the minutes and

consistency of the findings with the General Plan.

Motion by Commissioner Rodriguez, seconded by Commissioner Toporow, to adopt a resolution approving the Exemption Declaration and Planning Commission Design Review subject to the findings and conditions contained therein. Motion carried, by roll call vote, with Commissioner Strutzenberg, opposed.

9. Public Hearing to consider an Appeal of the administrative denial by the Community Development Director for a street-facing garage along the front elevation for a new two-story single-family residence on property located within a Single-Family Residential (R-1) zone, within the neighborhood referred to as "The Avenues".

PROPERTY OWNER:	Christopher Quezambra
APPLICANT:	Same as owner
LOCATION:	748 Avenue A
CASE NO.:	APL-2020-01

RECOMMENDATION: Adopt resolution denying the appeal subject to the findings contained therein.

Motion by Commissioner Ung, seconded by Commissioner Hinsley, to open the Public Hearing. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote.

Associate Planner Stacey Kinsella presented the staff report addressing location, existing conditions, surrounding uses, residential design guidelines, neighborhood characteristics, details of the proposed project, building height, the appeal and responses from staff and recommendations.

In response to Commissioner Rodriguez's question, Associate Planner Kinsella reported the alley is 12 feet in width and the backup distance is 25 feet. Commissioner Rodriguez reported it is difficult to maneuver through the alley and noted it is overgrown with weeds.

Commissioner Strutzenberg referenced Architectural Design Guidelines relative to "the architecture and intensity of new residential developments should respect the character and scale of older residences with the neighborhood"; addressed increases in the FAR and felt that the project does not respect the design guidelines.

Community Development Director Brandy Forbes reported the applicant wanted to have a determination on the driveway prior to moving forward with the full application.

Associate Planner Kinsella addressed staff's acknowledgement of the increased FAR and noted a more comprehensive design review will take place when the project is revised and ready for submittal.

Vice Chair Glad addressed the street view; expressed concern regarding the design

providing a usable front yard and felt it is out of character with the rest of the neighborhood.

In response to Commissioner Hinsley's question, Community Development Director Brandy Forbes confirmed the actions required tonight and reported the applicant will be able to appeal the decision of the Planning Commission to the City Council.

Chair Elder felt the design is not consistent with the neighborhood.

Commissioner Hinsley pointed out a nearby residence with a front-facing garage and stated he would like to address it.

Chair Elder invited the applicant to the podium.

Christopher Quezambra spoke about the importance of the project to his family; opined a rear-facing garage will limit the size of the back yard; noted safety concerns; opined a driveway next to the house would take up too much landscaping and reported designing the garage door to look like a folding-door patio system.

Motion by Commissioner Hinsley, seconded by Commissioner Ung, to extend the speaker's time. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote.

Mr. Quezambra listed reasons for not having a rear-facing garage in the alley including the lack of space, that the alley is not well-maintained and noted he will most-likely sell the house if he is unable to move forward with the project.

Commissioner Strutzenberg referenced the approval of the near-by residence with a front-facing garage and concerns by that planner regarding the front-facing garage.

Mr. Quezambra responded to questions from Commissioner Hinsley regarding purchase of the house and noted when he bought the house, the house nearby, with a front-facing garage, was under construction. Commissioner Hinsley expressed concerns regarding the size of the house.

In reply to Commissioner Ung's question, Mr. Quezambra reported he was not aware that The Avenues had residential guidelines when he bought the property.

Discussion followed regarding the size of the back yard with a rear-facing garage and the size of the front yard with a front-facing garage.

In response to an inquiry from Chair Elder regarding complaints from neighbors regarding the proposed design, Mr. Quezambra reported the neighbors were noticed.

Associate Planner Kinsella reported receiving one email from a real estate agent noting she advises potential buyers in The Avenues of the existing design guidelines.

Commissioner Ung asked about the poorly-maintained alley and who is responsible for

doing so.

Community Development Director Forbes stated it would be the responsibility of the owner of the encroaching property landscape; reported Code Enforcement is on a complaint-based system and noted the problem can now be addressed as staff is aware of the issue.

There were no other speakers.

Motion by Commissioner Rodriguez, seconded by Vice Chair Glad, to close the Public Hearing. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote.

Commissioner Rodriguez noted the project exceeds the FAR and in reply to his question regarding FAR bonuses, Associate Planner Kinsella reported the applicant could request additional design features (i.e., an additional second-floor side setback in two different sections); addressed the minimum width of a single-family driveway and the setbacks from the property line for the different garage options.

In response to Commissioner Strutzenberg's question regarding FAR bonuses including a second-story side setback, Associate Planner Kinsella reported there is a minimum 8 foot, second-story side setback for a cumulative length of 15 feet or more. Commissioner Strutzenberg commended staff for upholding the design guidelines

Commissioner Hinsley asked about the possibility of a semi-subterranean front garage and Community Development Director Forbes stated it would not be compatible with the neighborhood. She confirmed a side driveway would need to meet the minimum width of 9 feet and explained the process for changing design guidelines.

Motion by Commissioner Ung, seconded by Commissioner Toporow, to adopt resolution denying the appeal subject to the findings contained therein. Motion carried by roll call vote, with Commissioners Hinsley and Strutzenberg, opposed.

10. Public Hearing to consider an Exemption Declaration and Amendment to a Conditional Use Permit for the interior reconfiguration of an existing music school within a commercial building on property located in a Mixed-Use (MU-1) zone.

PROPERTY OWNER:	1806-12 Artesia LLC
APPLICANT:	4/100 Music WLA VII Corp.
LOCATION:	1806 Artesia Boulevard
CASE NO.:	PAA-2020-01

RECOMMENDATION: Adopt resolution approving the Exemption Declaration and Amendment to a Conditional Use Permit subject to the findings and conditions contained therein.

Motion by Commissioner Hinsley, seconded by Commissioner Toporow, to open the Public Hearing. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote.

Associate Planner Stacey Kinsella presented the staff report addressing location, zoning, parking, existing conditions, site map, grade changes between Mixed-Use and Residential properties, original approval, floorplans, the proposed amendment, acoustical analyses, proposed Conditions of Approval, and recommendations. She added there will be no changes to the operation of the business.

Commissioner Strutzenberg referenced the Planning Commission meeting minutes of July 19, 2012 relative to submission of additional decibel readings and Associate Planner Kinsella reported she did not find additional readings in the original CUP file. Commissioner Strutzenberg noted what was built was not what was approved, and Associate Planner Kinsella confirmed existing conditions are not in compliance with the original use permit.

Commissioner Hinsley referenced a Blue Folder Item submitted by the applicant addressing the discrepancy.

Commissioner Toporow noted the Blue Folder Item explained the discrepancy well and was well-written.

Commissioner Hinsley asked about monitoring decibel readings by the applicant and Associate Planner Kinsella explained staff is requesting one set of decibel readings when rehearsal rooms are in use to verify the acoustical analysis was correct, prior to issuance of a certificate of occupancy.

In response to Commissioner Ung's inquiry regarding construction phasing, Associate Planner Kinsella suggested asking the applicant.

Chair Elder invited the applicant to the podium.

Jesse Bornstein, applicant, referenced the Blue Folder Item he submitted; thanked the Planning Commission for its consideration; discussed construction phasing and reported they will do sound testing during construction and submit the results to Planning.

At Commissioner Hinsley's request, Mr. Bornstein agreed with the requirement to decrease volumes if complaints are received, until such as time as further upgrades to the wall and/or ceiling assemblies are installed. Associate Planner Kinsella agreed to add the following language to Condition of Approval No. 6: "The business operator shall agree to lower the music volume to a level considered reasonable, as determined by the City or until they can provide further upgrades to the wall and/or ceiling assemblies to further reduce the decibel level outside the building and at the back of the property line and retest until the noise level is within allowable noise levels."

Commissioner Ung felt the statement relative to "results in complaints" is ambiguous and suggested adding language that "exceeds 60 dB or results in complaints".

Commissioner Toporow noted they have different locations without complaints and reported

they have expertise and a good track record.

Associate Planner Kinsella added there have been no Code Enforcement or Police issues related to the Redondo Beach site.

Commissioner Strutzenberg referenced Item No. 5 in the current resolution and noted it would be helpful to identify what is happening at the time of the acoustic readings and archive them properly for future reference. He suggested adding language that certified records of acoustic readings will be kept as part of the use permit.

Chair Elder invited the applicant to the podium.

Stephen Roberts spoke in support of the project noting there is a need for kids to learn their craft; suggested decreasing the volume when complaints are received and urged the business owner and residents to work together.

There were no other speakers.

Motion by Commissioner Ung, seconded by Commissioner Hinsley, to close the Public Hearing. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote.

Motion by Commissioner Toporow to adopt resolution approving the Exemption Declaration and Amendment to a Conditional Use Permit subject to the findings and conditions contained therein.

Commissioner Hinsley offered a friendly amendment to add the following modifications to Condition No. 5: When the new rehearsal rooms are in operation the applicant shall provide, prior to final approval, daytime decibel level readings taken by a licensed professional at the rear of the building and at the south property line and kept with the original use permit and kept with the operations conditions.

Commissioner Strutzenberg suggested omitting "prior to final approval" and noted the changes are to protect the applicant more than anything.

Commissioner Toporow suggested including the language, "within the first two months of operation" rather than "prior to final approval".

Associate Planner Kinsella suggested it could still be "before final approval" of the whole site, as the building official could grant a temporary certificate of occupancy for the rehearsal rooms to be utilized for the readings.

Community Development Director Forbes suggested, "before issuance of the final certificate of occupancy".

Commissioner Ung noted that if the CUP indicates it they do not submit the required readings, it is void.

Discussion followed regarding proposed changes to Condition No. 6.

Motion by Commissioner Toporow, seconded by Commissioner Ung, to adopt resolution approving the Exemption Declaration and Amendment to a Conditional Use Permit subject to the findings and conditions contained therein, as amended. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote.

11. Public Hearing to consider an Exemption Declaration and Amendment to an existing Conditional Use Permit, Coastal Development Permit and Planning Commission Design Review to allow the expansion of an existing restaurant into an adjacent tenant space. The following land use entitlements were previously granted: Conditional Use Permit for a restaurant that exceeded 2,000 square feet in size, Coastal Development Permit for an improvement that increased the intensity of use of the structure, and Planning Commission Design Review for overlap parking for the restaurant within a multiple tenant shopping center on property located in a Commercial (C-2A) zone, in the Coastal Zone.

PROPERTY OWNER:	Hoshizaki Investment Company
APPLICANT:	Charlinc, Inc. dba Charlie's.
LOCATION:	601 – 607 N. Pacific Coast Highway
CASE NO.:	PAA-2020-02

RECOMMENDATION: Adopt resolution approving the Exemption Declaration and Amendment to a Conditional Use Permit, Coastal Development Permit, and Planning Commission Design Review subject to the findings and conditions contained therein.

Motion by Commissioner Ung, seconded by Commissioner Strutzenberg, to open the public hearing. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote.

Community Development Director Forbes presented the staff report addressing entitlements, location, surrounding uses, tenant spaces, parking, prior expansions into adjacent tenant spaces, proposed changes to the exterior, floorplan, code required parking and recommendations.

Commissioner Strutzenberg confirmed the total number of parking spaces and asked about existing overlap parking spaces allocated for the complex. Planning Manager Scully reported all of the parking is shared parking for the center.

Discussion followed regarding evaluation of parking every time a new tenant moves into the complex.

Chair Elder invited the applicant to the podium.

Stephen Roberts addressed parking; commented on their years in operation serving the

community and thanked the Planning Commission for its consideration.

Commissioner Rodriguez reported visiting the complex various times and noted he never had issues with parking.

There were no other speakers.

Motion by Commissioner Ung, seconded by Vice Chair Glad, to close the public hearing. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote.

Motion by Commissioner Ung, seconded by Vice Chair Glad, to adopt resolution approving the Exemption Declaration and Amendment to a Conditional Use Permit, Coastal Development Permit, and Planning Commission Design Review subject to the findings and conditions contained therein. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote.

12. Public Hearing to consider an Exemption Declaration and Amendment to an existing Conditional Use Permit to allow the expansion of an existing restaurant into an adjacent tenant space within a multi-tenant commercial shopping center on property located in a Commercial (C-2) zone.

PROPERTY OWNER:	Kabushikikaisha Chokoudo
APPLICANT:	BiZee LLC dba Avenue A Bar and Grill
LOCATION:	800 S. Pacific Coast Highway
CASE NO.:	PAA-2020-03

RECOMMENDATION: Adopt resolution approving the Exemption Declaration and Amendment to a Conditional Use Permit subject to the findings and conditions contained therein.

Motion by Commissioner Ung, seconded by Commissioner Hinsley, to open the public hearing. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote.

Planning Manager Scully presented the staff report addressing location, surrounding uses, existing conditions, details of the project, Conditional Use Permit, Environmental Review, use of the expanded area, and recommendations.

Commissioner Hinsley confirmed the present Conditional Use Permit is supplemental to previous Conditional Use Permits.

Commissioner Ung discussed the calculation of parking spaces noting the change in use of the extension for games requires no additional parking.

Community Development Director Forbes reported the extension will be used as an accessory to the restaurant.

Chair Elder invited the applicant to the podium.

Gary Zinger, applicant, reported there will be no eating or drinking in the gaming area.

Discussion followed regarding the purpose of tables on the side of the gaming area, adequacy of parking, parking limitations relative to snack shops, counting bar stools as seating, prohibiting or limiting additional seating in the gaming area, being clear that no additional food service will be allowed in the gaming area, support of the project by the community and prohibiting BBQing or smoked foods.

Commissioner Strutzenberg suggested amending language to Item No. 4 in the resolution to state, "The 900 square foot tenant space shall not incorporate more than 200 square feet of additional dining area".

There were no other speakers.

Motion by Commissioner Ung, seconded by Commissioner Toporow, to close the public hearing. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote.

Motion by Commissioner Rodriguez, seconded by Commissioner Strutzenberg, to adopt resolution approving the Exemption Declaration and Amendment to a Conditional Use Permit subject to the findings and conditions contained therein, as amended. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote.

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

13. Commission input related to development of goals and objectives for the City's Strategic Plan

RECOMMENDATION: Receive report and finalize and approve recommendations to City Council.

Community Development Director Forbes presented the report addressing background, previous consideration, and recommendations by the Planning Commission.

Chair Elder spoke about the jobs imbalance issue and questioned whether it should be included considering the uncertainty of the current pandemic and its economic impacts.

Commissioner Hinsley suggested prioritizing some of the suggested goals and he and Commissioners Strutzenberg and Ung made edits to the letter.

Motion by Commissioner Toporow, seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez, to receive the report, finalize the letter and approve recommendations to City Council as amended. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote.

IX. NEW BUSINESS - None

X. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS - None

XI. COMMISSION ITEMS AND REFERRALS TO STAFF

Commissioner Rodriguez wished Chair Elder a Happy Birthday.

Commissioner Strutzenberg referenced the Governor's new directive regarding the COVID-19 pandemic and asked if there are items that the Planning Commission could discuss without a public hearing.

Community Development Director Forbes reported for public meetings, the public must be allowed the opportunity to comment on agenda and non-agenda items. The City is looking at different technologies that may allow teleconferencing with the opportunity for the public to comment via telephone or email.

XII. ITEMS FROM STAFF – None

XIII. COUNCIL ACTION ON PLANNING COMMISSION MATTERS - None

XIV. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to come before the Commission, Commissioner Hinsley motioned, seconded by Commissioner Ung, to adjourn at 10:45 p.m. to a Regular meeting to be held at 7:00 p.m. on Thursday, April 16, 2020, in the Redondo Beach City Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California. Motion carried unanimously.

Respectfully submitted,

Brandy Forbes
Community Development Director