



**A. CALL TO ORDER**

Via Teleconference, a Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach City Council was called to order by Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim at 6:06 p.m. in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California.

**B. ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present:	Loewenstein, Horvath, Obagi, Emdee, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim
Councilmembers Absent:	Mayor Brand
Officials Present:	Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk Michael Webb, City Attorney Joe Hoefgen, City Manager Vickie Kroneberger, Chief Deputy City Clerk

**C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG AND INVOCATION**

At the request of Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim, the audience and Councilmembers rose to salute the flag followed by a moment of silence

**D. PRESENTATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Community Development Director Brandy Forbes gave a report and highlighted the opening of parts of City Hall and the library.

Councilmember Loewenstein announced opening day of Port Royal Yacht Club and his Community Meeting taking place on Thursday, May 13 from 6 to 7:30 p.m. on Zoom with special guest City Attorney Mike Webb discussing homelessness.

Councilmember Horvath noted SBCCOG and legislators are continuing to fight against the housing package, announced a Town Hall meeting taking place on Wednesday, May 19 with two local physicians discussing vaccine hesitancy, and his Community Meeting taking place on the 20<sup>th</sup> discussing the upcoming budget.

Councilmember Obagi announced his Community Meeting last Thursday with a good attendance, and thanked Public Works Ted Semaan for his responsiveness and help in the City.

Councilmember Emdee thanked the CCOG and Councilmember Horvath for the visits regarding legislative housing, and wished everyone a happy Star Wars Day and happy Cinco de Mayo Day.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim announced his Community Meeting this Saturday at Alta Vista back parking lot outside from 9:30 to 11:30 a.m. and an online meeting on May 17. He also noted a report from the LA County Sanitization District regarding covid and testing, and announced the testing alert system on the beach.

**E. APPROVAL OF ORDER OF AGENDA**

Motion by Councilmember Emdee, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to move Item N.5 to immediately after N.1 and Referrals to Staff to immediately after Public Comments on Non-Agenda Items. Motion carried unanimously, with the following roll call vote:

AYES: Loewenstein, Horvath, Obagi, Emdee, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim  
NOES: None  
ABSENT: None

**F. AGENCY RECESS: 6:20 p.m.**

**F.1. REGULAR MEETING OF THE COMMUNITY FINANCING AUTHORITY**  
**CONTACT: MARNI RUHLAND, FINANCE DIRECTOR**

**RECONVENE: 6:25 p.m.**

**ROLL CALL**

Councilmembers Present:	Loewenstein, Horvath, Obagi, Emdee, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim
Councilmembers Absent:	Mayor Brand
Officials Present:	Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk
	Michael Webb, City Attorney
	Joe Hoefgen, City Manager
	Vickie Kroneberger, Chief Deputy City Clerk

**G. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS**

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to receive and file additional materials for Items H.3, J.1, N.4, and N.5. Motion carried unanimously, with the following roll call vote:

AYES: Loewenstein, Horvath, Obagi, Emdee, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim  
NOES: None  
ABSENT: None

**H. CONSENT CALENDAR**

**H.1. APPROVE AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING FOR THE CITY COUNCIL REGULAR MEETING OF MAY 4, 2021**

**CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK**

**H.2. APPROVE MOTION TO READ BY TITLE ONLY AND WAIVE FURTHER READING OF ALL ORDINANCES AND RESOLUTIONS LISTED ON THE AGENDA.**

**CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK**

**H.3. APPROVE THE FOLLOWING CITY COUNCIL MINUTES:**

- A. JANUARY 5, 2021 REGULAR MEETING**
- B. JANUARY 12, 2021 ADJOURNED AND REGULAR MEETING**
- C. JANUARY 19, 2021 REGULAR MEETING**

**CONTACT: ELEANOR MANZANO, CITY CLERK**

**H.4. PAYROLL DEMANDS**

**CHECKS 27296-27323 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$37,823.41, PD. 04/16/2021**

**DIRECT DEPOSIT 233936-234410 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$1,796,281.59, PD.04/16/2021**

**ACCOUNTS PAYABLE DEMANDS**

**CHECKS 98711-98895 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$1,582,198.35**

**DIRECT DEPOSIT 100004737-100004842 IN THE AMOUNT OF \$99,011.30, PD. 05/01/2021**

**REPLACEMENT DEMAND 98710**

**CONTACT: MARNI RUHLAND, FINANCE DIRECTOR**

**H.5. APPROVE CONTRACTS UNDER \$35,000:**

- 1. APPROVE AGREEMENT WITH THE AMERICAN NATIONAL RED CROSS FOR LICENSED TRAINING PROVIDER SERVICES WITH THE REDONDO BEACH FIRE DEPARTMENT AT NO COST TO THE CITY FOR THE TERM MAY 4, 2021 TO MAY 3, 2024.**
- 2. APPROVE FIRST AMENDMENT TO THE FUEL PURCHASING AGREEMENT WITH ARAKELIAN ENTERPRISES, INC. DBA ATHENS SERVICES ADJUSTING THE NET COST OF FUEL, INCLUDING APPLICABLE TAXES AND ADMINISTRATIVE FEES TO SEVENTY-FIVE CENTS PER GALLON FOR COMPRESSED NATURAL GAS AND THIRTY-FOUR CENTS PER GALLON FOR UNLEADED AND DIESEL FUEL FOR THE EXISTING TERM TO JUNE 30, 2023.**

**CONTACT: MARNI RUHLAND, FINANCE DIRECTOR**

**H.6. APPROVE THE CITY ENGINEER'S REPORT FOR THE 2021-2022 FISCAL YEAR STREET LANDSCAPING AND LIGHTING ASSESSMENT DISTRICT**

**ADOPT BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2105-039, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, DECLARING ITS INTENTION TO ORDER THE MAINTENANCE AND IMPROVEMENTS OF CERTAIN STREET LIGHTING FIXTURES, APPURTENANCES, AND LANDSCAPED AREAS FOR THE FISCAL YEAR COMMENCING JULY 1, 2021 AND ENDING JUNE 30, 2022, AND SETTING A TIME AND PLACE FOR THE PUBLIC PROTEST HEARING**

**SET JUNE 1, 2021 AS THE DATE TO CONDUCT A PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER THE PROPOSED 2021-2022 FISCAL YEAR STREET LANDSCAPING AND LIGHTING DISTRICT ASSESSMENT**

**CONTACT: TED SEMAAN, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR**

**H.7. APPROVE THE FOURTH AMENDMENT TO THE AGREEMENT WITH GILLIS & PANICHAPAN ARCHITECTS, INC. (GPA) FOR CITY COUNCIL CHAMBER IMPROVEMENTS CONSULTING SERVICES TO PROVIDE ADDITIONAL SERVICES FOR AN ADDITIONAL AMOUNT OF \$3,000 FOR A TOTAL NOT TO EXCEED AMOUNT OF \$113,940 FOR THE EXISTING TERM**

**CONTACT: TED SEMAAN, PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR**

**H.8. PULLED BY COUNCILMEMBER OBAGI FOR FURTHER DISCUSSION.**

**H.9. ADOPT BY 4/5 VOTE AND BY TITLE ONLY RESOLUTION NO. CC-2105-040, A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH, CALIFORNIA, AUTHORIZING A 2020-2021 FISCAL YEAR BUDGET MODIFICATION APPROPRIATING \$2,790 IN 2018 STATE HOMELAND SECURITY PROGRAM (SHSP) GRANT FUNDS**

**CONTACT: KEITH KAUFFMAN, POLICE CHIEF**

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim called for public comment via Zoom and eComment. There being no comments, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim closed the public comment period.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to approve Consent Calendar items H.1 through H.9, with the exclusion of item H.8. Motion carried unanimously, with the following roll call vote:

**AYES:** Loewenstein, Horvath, Obagi, Emdee, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim

NOES: None  
ABSENT: None

City Clerk Eleanor Manzano read all Ordinances and Resolutions by title only which were included on the Consent Calendar.

## **I. EXCLUDED CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS**

**H.8. APPROVE THE FIFTH AMENDMENT TO THE AGREEMENT WITH LESLIE SCOTT CONSULTING FOR TRANSIT CONSULTING PROFESSIONAL SERVICES FOR AN ADDITIONAL AMOUNT OF \$100,000 FOR THE TERM JULY 1, 2021 - JUNE 30, 2022**  
**CONTACT: LAURIE KOIKE, INTERIM COMMUNITY SERVICES DIRECTOR**

Councilmember Obagi questioned a reoccurring pattern of not going to RFP.

Transit Manager Joyce Rooney gave a report and explained that the City did not go out to BID, noting this is a professional service with specific experience and expertise handling a wide variety of transit.

City Manager Hoefgen noted the final stages of the Transit Center, security services and a number of items that Leslie Scott is involved with and announced a new director coming on board in a month.

Councilmember Obagi supported public competition for these opportunities.

Councilmember Horvath pointed out that the funding for this position comes from transit funds and not the General Fund.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim supported spending tax dollars wisely and getting the best contracting services as possible.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim called for public comment via Zoom and eComment. There being no comments, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim closed the public comment period.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Horvath, to approve the Fifth Amendment to the Agreement with Leslie Scott Consulting for transit consulting professional services for an additional amount of \$100,000 for the term July 1, 2021 – June 30, 2022. Motion carried unanimously, with the following roll call vote:

AYES: Loewenstein, Horvath, Obagi, Emdee, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim  
NOES: None  
ABSENT: None

## **J. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS**

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim called for public comment via Zoom and eComment.

Wayne Craig spoke on transparency and the local government and expressed concern with using a non-City email address to communicate with the public.

Ron Maroko, Chair Historical Commission, shared items being done by the Historical Commission to include \$8,000 funded by Council for the Historical Museum renovation, stated the report is included in the Commission's agenda packet from February 17, previewed name a park from the Historical Commission at Ripley and Flagler, rebooting the Path of History project and two signs in process, an oral history project, and a project to bring the museum outdoors.

Dr. Andrew Lesser spoke on vaccine hesitancy and encouraged everyone to get their vaccinations, thanked those involved in Code Enforcement regarding clothing collection boxes in the parking lot, and announced Coffee with a Cop at the Civic Center tomorrow at 1 to 3 p.m.

Chief Deputy City Clerk Vickie Kroneberger read eComment submitted by Michelle Cohens.

There being no further comments, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim closed the public comment period.

**Q. MAYOR AND COUNCIL REFERRALS TO STAFF**

Councilmember Obagi requested that the City Attorney's Office look at the agreements with Spectrum and Frontier, noting the utility lines are very blighted. City Attorney Webb suggested making a complaint to Code Enforcement offline.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim, to have Spectrum and Frontier provide a presentation in July/August regarding concerns with the aesthetic impacts on the community. Motion carried unanimously with no objections.

Councilmember Obagi requested staff to investigate areas regarding dog runs in the park areas.

Councilmember Loewenstein suggested a BRR regarding the dog park in terms of improvement.

City Manager Hoefgen requested a report on possible locations for dog runs.

Motion by Councilmember Emdee, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to bring back to Closed Session possible litigation regarding housing by next Tuesday. Motion carried unanimously, with no objections.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim requested agendaizing a conversation to staff regarding the Reed driveway apron and other potential items. City Manager Hoefgen suggested also including the minutes.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim requested an update on the design contract regarding skateboarders. City Attorney Webb noted a current issue regarding a conflict of interest and bidding on the contract which is being addressed.

**K. EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim disclosed communications with Councilmember Loewenstein.

Councilmember Loewenstein disclosed communications with Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim and the public.

**L. PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**L.1 PUBLIC HEARING TO CONSIDER PUBLIC SERVICE GRANT RECOMMENDATIONS AND ADOPT COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT DRAFT 2021-2022 ANNUAL ACTION PLAN**

**PROCEDURES:**

- 1. OPEN PUBLIC Hearing and take testimony;**
  - 2. Consider public service grant recommendations; and**
  - 3. Adopt 2021-2022 Action Plan**
- CONTACT:** LAURIE KOIKE, INTERIM COMMUNITY SERVICES DIRECTOR

Motion by Councilmember Horvath, seconded by Councilmember Emdee, to open the public hearing. Motion carried unanimously, with no objections.

Interim Community Services Director Laurie Koike gave a PowerPoint presentation and discussed the following:

- CDBG Program
- Annual Action Plan
- City of Redondo Beach CDBG Funding FY 2001-02 – FY 2021-22
- Proposed CDBG FY 2021-22 Budget
- Public Service Agencies and Proposed Funding
- Proposed CDBG Project Activities FY 2021-22
- Annual Action Plan Schedule
- Procedures
- Damien Delany, Michael Baker International, CDBG Consultant

In response to Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim, Councilmember Loewenstein believed that First United Methodist on Broadway received funding, and Public Works Director Semaan gave a report on the curb ramps.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim called for public comment via Zoom and eComment.

Yuki Sugisaki, Exodus Recovery, reviewed their various services.

Juliano Santos spoke on the Salvation Army in Redondo Beach and reviewed their services.

Michele Nadeau, Outreach Coordinator for 1736 Family Crisis Center, gave a report and reviewed their services.

Faye Norman spoke on the dental clinic, reviewed their status and thanked Council for their support.

Tory Blazek, Project Needs, St. Paul's United Methodist Church, gave a report and reviewed their services.

There being no further comments, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim closed the public comment period.

Councilmember Emdee thanked the organizations and noted support.

Motion by Councilmember Emdee, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to close the public hearing. Motion carried unanimously, with the following roll call vote:

AYES: Loewenstein, Horvath, Obagi, Emdee, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim  
NOES: None  
ABSENT: None

Motion by Councilmember Emdee, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to adopt the 2021-2022 Action Plan. Motion carried unanimously, with the following roll call vote:

AYES: Loewenstein, Horvath, Obagi, Emdee, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim  
NOES: None  
ABSENT: None

#### **M. ITEMS CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS AGENDAS – NONE**

#### **N. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION PRIOR TO ACTION**

**N.1. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING APPROVAL OF STIFEL, NICOLAUS & COMPANY, INCORPORATED (STIFEL) AND RAMIREZ & CO., INC. (RAMIREZ) TO PERFORM UNDERWRITING SERVICES AS JOINT SENIOR MANAGERS FOR THE PROPOSED CALPERS UNFUNDED ACCRUED LIABILITY (UAL) REFINANCING**  
**CONTACT: MARNI RUHLAND, FINANCE DIRECTOR**

Finance Director Marni Ruhland gave a report and stated staff is recommending Stifel, Nicolaus & Company, Inc and Ramirez & Co., Inc. She said this is a unanimous recommendation per staff and Commissions.

Dan Massiello, Sr. VP & Chief Compliance Officer, Kosmont Transactions Services, gave a report and discussed the following:

- Summary of Underwriter Qualifications and Proposed UAL Refinancing
- Executive Summary
- Board Distribution of Requests for Qualifications
- Detailed Screening Process
- Six Firms Selected for Interviews
- Conclusions from SOQ Review, Interviews and Budget/Finance Commission Review
- Next Steps
- Questions/Appendix

In response to Councilmember Emdee, Mr. Massiello stated both specific recommendations and options will be considered at the next presentation.

Assistant City Manager Witzansky stated it is also important to consider the recommendations and advice provided by the underwriter. He also said this item will flow into the budget considerations as well.

Councilmember Emdee also acknowledged the Budget and Finance Commission.

Councilmember Loewenstein thanked Commissioner Wood and noted a 5-minute video that can be used to sell the bonds to various investors.

Sarah Brown, Stifel, Nicolaus & Company, Inc., reviewed the purpose of the video.

Councilmember Loewenstein asked if the video is geared towards institutional portfolio managers or individuals. Ms. Brown believed both and is available to everybody and noted more interest from fund managers, insurance companies and other municipalities across the country.

Councilmember Loewenstein asked if the bonds are going to be tax free municipal bonds or taxable. Ms. Brown stated they would be taxable just by virtue of the nature of the use of proceeds. Mr. Massiello believed that California is tax exempt.

Councilmember Obagi asked about infrastructure bonds such as for bike lanes. Mr. Massiello stated their staff is analyzing impacts of using certain City assets in terms of optimal mix of bond issue. He also said they are working on a structure in asset valuation model with a lease structure.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim called for public comment via Zoom and eComment. There being no comments, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim closed the public comment period.

Motion by Councilmember Emdee, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to approve Stifel, Nicolaus & Company, Inc. (Stifel) and Ramirez & Co, Inc. (Ramirez) to perform underwriting services as joint senior managers for the proposed CALPERS unfunded accrued liability (UAL) refinancing. Motion carried unanimously, with the following roll call vote:

AYES: Loewenstein, Horvath, Obagi, Emdee, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim  
NOES: None  
ABSENT: None

**N.5. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON THE GENERAL PLAN ADVISORY COMMITTEE (GPAC) RECOMMENDED LAND USE PLAN**

**CONTACT:** BRANDY FORBES, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

Community Development Director Brandy Forbes and Wendy Nowak of Placeworks gave a report to date and reviewed the agenda discussion for tonight.

Planning Manager Scully also reviewed the density comparison tables and the existing district by district.

Councilmember Obagi observed that District 4 is the most dense as far as residents and District 5 is the least dense per total acreage which includes the industrial and commercial areas plus Manhattan Beach Boulevard.

Councilmember Horvath asked about the total acreage in District 5, primarily the residential component. Planning Manager Scully stated they looked at the commercial, industrial from all of the districts as well as from zip codes.

Councilmember Obagi asked if the spreadsheet is excluding or including the commercial zones. Planning Manager Scully stated it is still including all the acreage including the Galleria site. He also said the last row breaks down only the total in all residentially zoned properties and provides a dwelling unit per all residential acre.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim asked how many buildings in the City are more than three stories in size and with extremely high density such as on The Esplanade along the coastline. He also asked about the maxed density that HCD allows for residential buildings, and the maximum density on mixed use and maximum on concrete in terms of density.

Veronica Tam clarified that at least 30 units to acre count towards low income RHNA but in terms of maximum, it is up to the local jurisdiction.

Ms. Nowak reviewed a project in Downtown LA at 8<sup>th</sup> and Grand with Whole Foods on the lower ground and residential above.

In response to Councilmember Obagi, Ms. Nowak believed the City is up to 45 acres in the overlay area and with the exception of the Kingsdale area which is up to 60, and some parcels are being consolidated.

Councilmember Obagi asked about the density on Torrance Boulevard and the small lots. Ms. Novak suggested looking at the lot width first to see if the actual product would fit on the site.

Councilmember Obagi opposed putting in density in South Redondo causing residents to drive to the freeway. He also referred to the area zone public institutional and asked how did this land use designation include an elderly care facility. Community Development Director Forbes explained there was rezoning of that type of zone and has been a use allowed and is required to get a CUP. She also said the language could be clarified in the definition.

Councilmember Obagi asked about residential on 190<sup>th</sup> Street. Ms. Nowak said the existing uses are residential.



Councilmember Obagi asked about incentivizing open space versus dense developments. Ms. Nowak stated this has to do with the implementation of each project (reviewed). She also said parklands are permitted in the SPE easement negotiated over time.

Councilmember Loewenstein asked about the zoning change at the Kensington project, asking for the allowance of a zoning change as part of the CUP and having to go before the Planning Commission. He also asked if schools were exempt from residential areas in terms of density, and asked about the Crystal Cove Apartments and the acreage and density.

Councilmember Horvath asked about District 4 being the most dense and smallest acreage and suggested examining why the Artesia corridor was not chosen as an area for disbursement of RHNA numbers, missing an opportunity to spread out density issues and correcting deficiencies in current zoning. He also noted the benefit of horizontal mixed use and noted dense units along Vanderbilt and Matthews. He said his goal is to create enough flexibility for a generative project that can consolidate some density and create more amenities and quality of life improvement for residents and commercial entities, such as in specific areas.

Councilmember Emdee referred to a chart from HCD which is a data mapping resource guide and all blue areas are the closest proximity to jobs and are all within the 40 to 60 range and noted the traffic concerns will be solved in the entitlement process. She said the issue is getting 30 units/acre and noted that El Segundo has 0 housing units in their HQT, industrial land is valuable being close to freeway and LAX, and expressed concern with exacerbating the job housing imbalance. She also pointed out that the job proximity level is the same throughout all of Redondo Beach. She also said the proximities to jobs will go in different directions.

Councilmember Loewenstein said it is important to consider where to add housing and reviewed the commuting issues.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim called for public comment via Zoom and eComment.

Jean Mayhew supported quality and suggested seeing all the data before making a decision. She pointed out that Northrop has a plating shop in the building and could not get licenses by pushing all of the people in that corridor. She also referred to the 105 issues and expressed concern with the data presented by Planning Manager Scully. She also said she would like to see the relevant data at the third meeting that is actually useful.

James DeCicco also supported imaging and data after the fact and see how the traffic patterns would be affected. He also suggested breaking down the numbers to user technology.

Sheila Lamb referred to the Land Use Definitions and PCF and the addition of residential care facilities for the elderly. She said land use is guided by the Municipal Code which she reviewed and spoke on RCFE's which shouldn't be allowed in the P or PCF zones and belong in the R3, MU and commercial zones and must require a CUP as stated by the RBMC.

Wayne Craig commended Councilmember Obagi to represent the process and requested clarification by Councilmember Loewenstein regarding traffic patterns, and noted how long it takes to get out of the City. He supported fighting as a City and working together.

Minh Nguyen, District 5, noted a bad accident at Manhattan Beach Boulevard and Inglewood Avenue, and also reminded east and west traffic impacts as well. He encouraged Council to listen to the residents and not just the data. He also did not support rezoning the tech area, noting many people work there.

Alisa Beeli, District 5, expressed concern with a comment from Councilmember Obagi regarding the Dow Johnston neighborhood, and clarified that the new housing needs to be equitably zoned throughout the City.

She pointed out that she lived on three on a lot but moved to Dow Johnston for the lot sizes and eventually remodeled.

Holly Osborne, District 5, spoke on RHNA and the algorithm with part being based on population and expected growth and also based on proximity to frequency bus stops and transportation corridors. She also referred to the cemetery in North Redondo and the City was assigned RHNA based on that cemetery. She asked if this could be subtracted from the City's RHNA. She also asked that the data be corrected before re-running it.

Colleen Otash stated she has been involved with the Galleria and Metro projects and the Pallets. She said they have tried to get a multiuse at the Galleria and have agreed to 6,000 housing in District 4 which should be an equitable distribution based on the density of the land use for each of the four districts. She also said she works in Long Beach and takes the 110 and take the south route.

Amy Josefek expressed concern with impacts from the elected officials in Sacramento and suggested people call Senator Ben Allen, Senator Bradford and Al Muratsuchi regarding SB9 and SB10 which do not address affordable housing and would be a destructive bill, enriching builders.

Valerie Fernandes did not support 1,000 units in any one area and impacts many issues in the area and asked about the revenue to the City compared to property taxes. She also asked about the traffic, noise and pollution and quality of life.

Candace Nafissi, District 3, stated a PCF zone to include an accepted use was never presented or approved by the GPAC. She also expressed concern with adding a disproportionate number of housing to an already dense area. She suggested to distribute the number based on the number of housing that already exists. She also suggested calling Senator Ben Allen regarding voting against SB9 and SB10.

Lara Duke, District 3, expressed concern with public zoning in the DEIR for BCHD Health Living Campus that actually says the property is on public institutional but there has been no change. This proposal should only be on commercial or high residential density zone.

Eugene Solomon asked that consultant Veronica Tam discuss with Council the 20% buffer which does not appear in the legislation, and supported relying on the data as guidelines.

There being no further comments, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim closed the public comment period.

Councilmember Emdee referred to the density comparison table and the complete built out would be 42,000 in portions of 90278 and 25,000 in portions of 90277, nearly 19 people per acre versus 14 people per acre. She stated this is about zoning and the zoning of the lot would be known when purchasing a home. She said it is vital to determine the densities and where they will go once completely built out. She also pointed out that this has already been appealed and denied.

In response to Councilmember Emdee, City Attorney Webb gave a report on various cities regarding affordable housing and said there could be consequences if the City did not comply. He also provided a report regarding affordable housing and lawsuits.

Councilmember Obagi believed the expertise is lacking and asked if a traffic consultant could attend the next meeting.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Emdee, to ask staff to come back next week with responses on traffic and revenue on existing sites, receive and file comments on Granicus, and remind everyone to call Senator Ben Allen.

AYES: Loewenstein, Horvath, Obagi, Emdee, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim  
NOES: None  
ABSENT: None

**N.2. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING AN UPDATED SEASIDE LAGOON OPERATIONAL PLAN TO ACCOMMODATE THE 2021 BEACHLIFE FESTIVAL**  
**CONTACT: LAURIE KOIKE, INTERIM COMMUNITY SERVICES DIRECTOR**

Interim Community Services Director Laurie Koike gave a report and discussed the proposals and discussions at the last meeting, opening June 15 through August 22 as the 20-21 season.

In response to Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim regarding September 10-12, City Manager Hoefgen stated staff spoke with Allen at that time and it was unclear when it would open, and a date was finalized. He noted this is a Council decision.

Allen Sanford provided a brief background and said the physical site won't support immediate usage.

Assistant City Manager Witzansky noted a moving target for Mr. Sanford and his team due to covid but it's Council's call at the end of the day but staff believes it is a good compromise.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim asked what the City needs to do from August 23 to 27. Assistant City Manager Witzansky stated Mr. Sanford needs a window of time for the sand to dry and then to build. He also said nothing happening this year will set a precedent going forward.

Councilmember Obagi suggested pushing the event back. Mr. Sanford said no.

Mr. Sanford said this is a difficult site and the decision was based on safety precautions and the wet sand.

Councilmember Emdee noted a short season and suggested not opening it this year and to have Beach Live only.

Assistant City Manager Witzansky suggested a more flexible calendar and to open the Lagoon as soon as possible safely and close it no earlier than August 22 and allow for expansion if allowed.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim called for public comment via Zoom and eComment.

Chief Deputy City Clerk Vickie Kroneberger read comments submitted via eComment by:

Grace Peng, Michael Sachs

There being no further comments, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim closed the public comment period.

Motion by Councilmember Obagi, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to direct staff to exercise full efforts to open up the Seaside Lagoon on June 11 to August 22. Motion carried, with the following roll call vote:

AYES: Loewenstein, Obagi, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim  
NOES: Horvath, Emdee  
ABSENT: None

**N.3. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE CITY'S 4TH OF JULY DISPLAY AND ADDITIONAL PROPOSED SPECIAL EVENTS IN REDONDO BEACH ON JULY 4, 2021**

**CONTACT: LAURIE KOIKE, INTERIM COMMUNITY SERVICES DIRECTOR**

Interim Community Services Director Laurie Koike gave a followup report regarding the discussions on April 13 as follows:

- Improvements and ongoing expansion
- Options
- Council decided to go with a land-based event – not requiring an expensive rental of a barge at approximately \$25K
- Jeff Ginsburg suggested an RVA sponsored offshore fireworks event off of Avenue I
- Since April 13, the RVA has submitted a special events application to include a festival on Avenue I between Catalina Avenue and The Esplanade
- Fireworks paid for by RVA and looking for a waiver of the police and fire fees
- Requirement for RVA to provide barricades and traffic control
- Mike Ward looking to hold his annual 5K run in the Village and would pay for fees
- Staff met with Public Works, Fire Department and Police Department to discuss impacts
- Received a second quote for the City sponsored fireworks show - \$29,500 and \$30,000 – both companies also provided quotes to RVA for potential events
- Staff reached out to Kings Harbor Association, Pier Association and the Redondo Beach Travel and Tourism Group – no interest in assisting in the City event or participating financially

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim pointed out that 60 to 70 percent of municipalities will be putting on a show again. He supported the RVA putting on the show this year as well as Mike Ward covering the costs for the Run.

Councilmember Emdee asked about costs for police and fire and security. Public Works Director Semaan explained that Public Works has the experience regarding traffic control but suggested Mr. Ward contract the Run service out completely to avoid staff working very long hours. He also suggested that the RVA fireworks show be funded and supported a traffic control company. He also said they could support the 5K Run if it took place on Saturday.

Councilmember Emdee stated her concern would be having three different events on the same day and taxing staff.

In response to Councilmember Obagi, Interim Community Services Director Koike said the fireworks event would cost approximately \$8400. Councilmember Obagi asked about having restroom facilities. Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim stated the area on Avenue I would have all restroom facilities and stated that the beach restrooms are open at that time as well.

Councilmember Loewenstein suggested two fireworks displays would spread out the crowds and suggested having the display in the harbor but not on the barge. He also supported RVA stepping up but it is not a City event and should not pick up the costs. He also supported the Fun Run taking place on Saturday. Councilmember Horvath agreed.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim explained having the fireworks show on land in the proposed location will be smaller and more difficult to see and a larger clearance area will be needed.

Councilmember Obagi supported having the RVA paying for the costs, and the City would only need to cover police and fire at \$8,000, and is a public show.

Jeff Ginsburg stated people in the harbor will have an incredible show on Avenue I and is safer being away from the harbor.

Councilmember Emdee also supported having two fireworks show.

City Manager Hoefgen noted concerns with having two fireworks shows, a special event in the RV and the Fun Run.

Chief Kauffman stated safety is the most important consideration, stated the hours would be impactful to staff, and the Torrance staff will not be available this year regarding people leaving. He also noted fireworks enforcement may be an issue and a police presence will be needed. He further expressed concern with lack of volunteers this year.

In response to Councilmember Obagi, Chief Kauffman said just for the City-sponsored event, the cost would be approximately \$25K for police under normal operations, cost of the Fun Run would be estimated at \$9500, and the cost of the RV event at \$7400, along with traffic control on the south end to mitigate the dismissal after the Riviera event. He supported working with private security and mitigating costs as long as they are vetted through the Police Department, but it doesn't replace having police presence in a very tight area.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim noted \$63,765 for public safety at \$90,000 in costs with no income.

Councilmember Obagi also said the event will take place on a Sunday night where Monday is a national holiday and more people will be attending and drinking, and suggested assistance from neighboring cities.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim called for public comment via Zoom and eComment.

Wayne Craig supported the RV bid option, supported fireworks in the harbor but opposed it being on land which will push people further away.

Mark Hansen stated the hotels expressed concern with losing business during the 4<sup>th</sup> of July and suggested keeping the show in the harbor which will provide a better view, stated the boaters love the fireworks in the harbor, and said the RVA would have more impacts on the beaches. He also suggested the show could go on land if needed.

Chief Deputy City Clerk Vickie Kroneberger read eComment submitted by Lee Coller.

There being no further comments, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim closed the public comment period.

Councilmember Horvath pointed out that fireworks did not take place last year due to covid and the area was still very busy on the 4<sup>th</sup> of July with fireworks everywhere.

Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Councilmember Horvath, to choose the \$29,000 option for Exposhow Inc. on land. Motion carried with the following roll call:

AYES: Loewenstein, Horvath, Obagi, Emdee  
NOES: None  
RECUSED: Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim

Motion by Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim, seconded by Councilmember Loewenstein, to approve the RVA special events and fireworks display, have the Fun Run on Saturday morning, and that the RVA pay for the police and public safety portion of their event. Motion carried unanimously, with the following roll call vote:

AYES: Loewenstein, Horvath, Obagi, Emdee, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim  
NOES: None  
ABSENT: None

#### **N.4. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION REGARDING THE ADOPTION OF A MOBILE PARKING PAYMENT SYSTEM IN THE CITY OF REDONDO BEACH**

**APPROVE AGREEMENT WITH PARKMOBILE, LLC FOR MOBILE PARKING PAYMENT SERVICES AT NO COST TO THE CITY FOR THE TERM MAY 4, 2021 TO MAY 3 2023 WITH AN OPTION TO EXTEND FOR THREE ADDITIONAL YEARS**

**CONTACT: KEITH KAUFFMAN, CHIEF OF POLICE**

Acting Assistant Chief Joe Hoffman and Administrative Analyst Andrea Delap presented the following presentation:

- Background
- Request for Proposals (RFP) – Input
- Objectives Addressed in RFP
- Selection Committee
- Selection Committee Review Process
- Recommendation and Next Steps
- Options
  - Status Quo
  - Approve ParkMobile agreement and direct staff to implement program before summer 2021
  - Provide alternative direction to staff

Kristen Locke and Jeff Perkins of ParkMobile provided the following:

- Mission Statement
- ParkMobile Resources
- Customer Choice with ParkMobile
- Recent User and Transaction Growth in Redondo Beach
- More than 1.7 Million people used ParkMobile in California, combining for 20 Million transactions
- The ParkMobile Application
- Mobile Web
- Guest Checkout
- More Ways to Pay
- Pay by Google Pay
- Meeting the Needs of Consumers and Clients

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim stated this would affect District 1, the harbor and the parking garage and stated he has used all of the systems in the past and has been happy with paybyphone. He also asked about the security breach with ParkMobile and how it has affected their business.

Mr. Perkins explained the security breach and noted a vulnerability in the system not identified in penetration testing allowing input into their system. He said this was closed and another layer of cyber security software was added into their system. He said an audit took place of the system and customers were notified. He said the data accessed was general account information but sensitive data is not included in their system. He also said they have not seen any impacts to their user base, and encouraged all users change their password. Ms. Locke explained the notification process.

In response to Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim, Administrative Analyst Andrea Delap stated staff recommendation is that the City will receive the revenue directly and does not collect the parking citation.

In response to Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim, Administrative Analyst Andrea Delap stated this is a ParkMobile contract but does not preclude from in the future engaging with another vendor.

In response to Councilmember Obagi, Mr. Perkins explained the process for creating an account which includes an email and/or phone number, license plate number and a nickname for the vehicle. He also said they offer a wallet product as well.

In response to Councilmember Loewenstein, Administrative Analyst Andrea Delap the City can also work with someone else as part of the RFP.

Ms. Locke explained multiple options for parking payments and customer choice and reviewed their options.

Administrative Analyst Andrea Delap explained that the Selection Committee at this time recommended just one vendor, being ParkMobile.

In response to Councilmember Loewenstein regarding the data breach, Mr. Perkins stated they use a third party software which was the vulnerability and the breach could only extract data.

In response to Councilmember Emdee regarding the fee structure, Administrative Analyst Andrea Delap stated the user would only pay a one-time fee of 25 cents if parking is being extended unless it expires.

Mr. Perkins also said the users can pay on the app, mobile web as well as the Google Pay app, noting the users have a lot of choices and there is also a guest checkout option.

Councilmember Emdee asked what distinguishes ParkMobile from paybyphone. Administrative Analyst Andrea Delap reviewed the choice for ParkMobile and vendor recommendations and stated the two vendors were very tight.

In response to Councilmember Emdee, Waterfront and Economic Development Director Stephen Proud stated the City's relationship with ParkMobile goes back to 2012 and utilized sparingly by users, but the peak of the usage has taken place over the last 12 to 18 months. He also said there haven't been many complaints, despite the spotty self-service in the waterfront about the ability to use the extension.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim stated he would like to see the paperwork from other providers before approving ParkMobile tonight.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim called for public comment via Zoom and eComment.

Whitney Taylor spoke on paybyphone and suggested being provided responses from the other vendors, reviewed her Blue Folder Items and noted lines of people still waiting at pay stations. She also reviewed the ParkMobile numbers averaging at best 12 per day in 1300 spaces, and said paybyphone knows how to do the marketing. She asked that paybyphone also be considered.

Colleen Otash supported just using her credit card without providing all of the other information needed with the app, and preferred low tech with respect to paying for parking. She recommended status quo for now and consider other options later.

Jeff Ginsburg, RVA, stated they investigated vendors that use smart parking and supported paybyphone. He also said the King Harbor Marina evaluated both of the vendors and also determined that the paybyphone app was outstanding.

Eugene Solomon observed that a data breach in the State of California requires notification of all consumers and to provide monitoring depending upon the situation. He also asked about resale of data collected by the app that the provider performs.

Chief Deputy City Clerk Vickie Kroneberger read eComments submitted by:

Mara Perscheid, Claire Surrows, Matt Tibbetts, Jailyn Matthews, Brent Gonzalez, Andy Schuler, Katy Corrington, Sam Wineburgh

There being no further comments, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim closed the public comment period.

Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim did not support ParkMobile and suggested paybyphone.

In response to Councilmember Emdee, Waterfront and Economic Development Director Stephen Proud suggested not using the pier experience and amount of usage as the indicator for success. He said the app has not been aggressively pursued as an alternate payment program, with the usage for only about a year with signage.

Administrative Analyst Andrea Delap stated paybyphone responses are included in the Blue Folder item and the selection criteria are listed in the staff report. She also said the paybyphone is per transaction to include every time the user paid or extended.

In response to Councilmember Emdee regarding marketing, Mr. Perkins stated they have an extensive marketing plan covering local PR, signage, social media and followers, digital ads, local influencers, being twice as much as the competitors. He also said marketing is their specialty with strong engagements and biggest network of users.

In response to Councilmember Obagi regarding having two vendors, Administrative Analyst Andrea Delap believed the City is capable and the adoption implementation touches a great variety of departments.

Waterfront and Economic Development Director Stephen Proud supported continuity of the pier and parking areas across the City before approving the app. He supported a single operator to start with to get the adoption of the app which can be expanded later.

In response to Councilmember Obagi regarding citations and having more than one vendor, Administrative Analyst Andrea Delap stated this interface is the reason for recommending one vendor at this time.

In response to Councilmember Obagi, Ms. Locke said the required integration would be at no charge to the City.

Councilmember Loewenstein supported giving people choice and as quickly as possible. Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim agreed.

Motion by Councilmember Horvath, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to approve the agreement with ParkMobile, LLC for mobile parking services at no cost to the City for the term May 4, 2021 to May 3, 2023 with an option to extend for three additional years, and after a year to reevaluate having a multi-vendor scenario and how it would affect user/usage and/or parking enforcement issues.

Substitute Motion by Councilmember Loewenstein, seconded by Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim, to approve the agreement with ParkMobile and direct staff to immediately engage to return with a contract as soon as possible with paybyphone to be implemented within four months.

Friendly Amendment by Councilmember Horvath to ask staff to negotiate similar financial terms with paybyphone as with ParkMobile where the end user is not incurring additional fees. Councilmember Loewenstein accepted the amendment.

AYES: Loewenstein, Horvath, Obagi, Emdee, Mayor Pro Tem Nehrenheim  
NOES: None



ABSENT: None

**O. CITY MANAGER ITEMS**

City Manager Hoefgen stated staff is working on the budget and BRR's which are the priority at this point.

**P. MAYOR AND COUNCIL ITEMS – NONE**

**Q. MAYOR AND COUNCIL REFERRALS TO STAFF – NONE**

**R. CLOSED SESSION – NONE**

**S. RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION – NONE**

**T. ADJOURNMENT 12:34 A.M.**

There being no further business to come before the City Council, Motion by Councilmember Emdee, seconded by Councilmember Obagi, to adjourn the meeting at 12:38 a.m., May 5, 2021 to an Adjourned Regular meeting to be held at 4:30 p.m. (Closed Session) and a Regular meeting to be held at 6:00 p.m. (Open Session) on Tuesday, May 11, 2021, in the City Hall Council Chambers, 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California, via teleconference. Motion carried unanimously, with no objection.

All written comments submitted via eComment are included in the record and available for public review on the City website.

Respectfully submitted,

---

Eleanor Manzano, City Clerk