#### CITY OF REDONDO BEACH LIBRARY COMMISSION AGENDA Monday, June 7, 2021

THIS VIRTUAL MEETING IS HELD PURSUANT TO EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 ISSUED BY GOVERNOR NEWSOM ON MARCH 17, 2020.

#### **REGULAR MEETING OF THE LIBRARY COMMISSION - 7 PM**

#### ALL COMMISSION MEMBERS ARE PARTICIPATING BY VIRTUAL MEETING. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC MAY ONLY PARTICIPATE BY ZOOM, EMAIL OR eCOMMENT.

Library Commission meetings are broadcast live through Spectrum Cable, Channel 8, and Frontier Communications, Channel 41. Live streams and indexed archives of meetings are available via internet. Visit the City's office website at www.Redondo.org/rbtv.

TO WATCH MEETING LIVE ON CITY'S WEBSITE: https://redondo.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx \*Click "In Progress" hyperlink under Video section of meeting

TO WATCH MEETING LIVE ON YOUTUBE: https://www.youtube.com/c/CityofRedondoBeachIT

TO JOIN ZOOM MEETING (FOR PUBLIC COMMENT ONLY): Register in advance for this meeting: https://us02web.zoom.us/webinar/register/WN\_b6V4P0TzSDK86T35Gzyymg

After registering, you will receive a confirmation email containing information about joining the meeting.

If you are participating by phone, be sure to provide your phone # when registering. You will be provided a Toll Free number and a Meeting ID to access the meeting. Note; press # to bypass Participant ID. Attendees will be muted until the public participation period is opened. When you are called on to speak, press \*6 to unmute your line. Note, comments from the public are limited to 3 minutes per speaker.

eCOMMENT: COMMENTS MAY BE ENTERED DIRECTLY ON WEBSITE AGENDA PAGE:

1) Public comments can be entered before and during the meeting.

2) Select a SPECIFIC AGENDA ITEM to enter your comment;

3) Public will be prompted to Sign-Up to create a free personal account (one-time) and then comments may be added to each Agenda item of interest.

4) Public comments entered into eComment (up to 2200 characters; equal to approximately 3 minutes of oral comments) will become part of the official meeting record. Comments may be read out loud during the meeting.

EMAIL: TO PARTICIPATE BY WRITTEN COMMUNICATION WITH ATTACHED DOCUMENTS BEFORE 3PM DAY OF MEETING:

Written materials that include attachments pertaining to matters listed on the posted agenda

received after the agenda has been published will be added as supplemental materials under the relevant agenda item. RBPLWEB@REDONDO.ORG

#### **REGULAR MEETING OF THE LIBRARY COMMISSION - 7 PM**

- A. CALL MEETING TO ORDER
- B. ROLL CALL
- C. SALUTE TO THE FLAG
- D. APPROVE ORDER OF AGENDA

#### E. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS - ADDITIONAL BACK UP MATERIALS

Blue folder items are additional back up material to administrative reports and/or public comments received after the printing and distribution of the agenda packet for receive and file.

#### F. CONSENT CALENDAR

Business items, except those formally noticed for public hearing, or discussion are assigned to the Consent Calendar. The Commission Members may request that any Consent Calendar item(s) be removed, discussed, and acted upon separately. Items removed from the Consent Calendar will be taken up under the "Excluded Consent Calendar" section below. Those items remaining on the Consent Calendar will be approved in one motion following Oral Communications.

- F.1. <u>APPROVAL OF THE AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING FOR THE LIBRARY COMMISSION</u> <u>MEETING OF JUNE 7, 2021</u>
- F.2. APPROVAL OF THE FOLLOWING MINUTES: APRIL 5, 2021

#### G. EXCLUDED CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS

#### H. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

This section is intended to provide members of the public with the opportunity to comment on any subject that does not appear on this agenda for action. This section is limited to 30 minutes. Each speaker will be afforded three minutes to address the Commission. Each speaker will be permitted to speak only once. Written requests, if any, will be considered first under this section.

#### I. ITEMS CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS AGENDAS

- I.1. DISCUSSION OF STRATEGIC PLANNING
- I.2. DISCUSSION OF LIBRARY REOPENING PLANS
- J. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION PRIOR TO ACTION
- J.1. DISCUSSION OF 2021 SUMMER READING PROGRAM
- J.2. DISCUSSION OF KLUGE CENTER REPORT ON DISINFORMATION
- J.3. DISCUSSION OF THE FY 2021-2022 BUDGET PROCESS
- J.4. DIRECTOR'S REPORT
- K. MEMBER ITEMS AND REFERRALS TO STAFF

#### L. ADJOURNMENT

The next meeting of the Redondo Beach Library Commission will be a regular meeting to be held at 7 p.m. on August 2, 2021, in the Redondo Beach Council Chambers, at 415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, California via teleconference.

It is the intention of the City of Redondo Beach to comply with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) in all respects. If, as an attendee or a participant at this meeting you will need special assistance beyond what is normally provided, the City will attempt to accommodate you in every reasonable manner. Please contact the City Clerk's Office at (310) 318-0656 at least forty-eight (48) hours prior to the meeting to inform us of your particular needs and to determine if accommodation is feasible. Please advise us at that time if you will need accommodations to attend or participate in meetings on a regular basis.

An agenda packet is available 24 hours at www.redondo.org under the City Clerk.



F.1., File # LC21-2583

Meeting Date: 6/7/2021

#### <u>TITLE</u>

APPROVAL OF THE AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING FOR THE LIBRARY COMMISSION MEETING OF JUNE 7, 2021

#### STATE OF CALIFORNIA ) COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES SS ) CITY OF REDONDO BEACH )

#### **AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING**

In compliance with the Brown Act, the following materials have been posted at the locations indicated below.

Legislative Body	Library Commission
Posting Type	Regular Meeting Agenda
Posting Locations	<ul> <li>415 Diamond Street, Redondo Beach, CA 90277</li> <li>✓ City Hall Kiosk</li> </ul>

Meeting Date & Time June 7, 2021 7:00 p.m.

As Administrative Coordinator of the City of Redondo Beach, I declare, under penalty of perjury, the document noted above was posted at the date displayed below.

Karen Nakamura, Administrative Coordinator

Date: June 2, 2021



F.2., File # LC21-2587

Meeting Date: 6/7/2021

#### <u>TITLE</u>

APPROVAL OF THE FOLLOWING MINUTES: APRIL 5, 2021

#### A. CALL MEETING TO ORDER

A Virtual Regular Meeting of the Redondo Beach Library Commission was called to order by Chair Beauchamp at 7:00 p.m.

#### B. ROLL CALL

Members Present:	Hall, Walls, Wirsing, Chair Beauchamp
Members Absent:	Hannon, Coopman, Nafissi

Officials Present: Susan Anderson, Library Director

#### C. SALUTE TO FLAG

Commissioner Walls led in the salute to the flag.

#### D. APPROVAL OF ORDER OF AGENDA

Motion by Commissioner Walls, seconded by Commissioner Hall, to approve the Order of Agenda, as presented. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote, with Commissioners Hannon, Coopman and Nafissi, absent.

There were no eComments or public comments on this item.

#### E. BLUE FOLDER ITEMS – ADDITIONAL BACKUP MATERIAL – NONE

#### F. CONSENT CALENDAR

**F.1.** APPROVE AFFIDAVIT OF POSTING FOR THE REDONDO BEACH LIBRARY COMMISSION MEETING OF APRIL 5, 2021

#### F.2. APPROVAL OF THE FOLLOWING MINUTES: FEBRUARY 1, 2021

Motion by Commissioner Wirsing, seconded by Commissioner Walls, to approve the Consent Calendar, as presented. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote, with Commissioners Hannon, Coopman and Nafissi, absent.

#### G. EXCLUDED CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS - NONE

#### H. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

Library Director Susan Anderson announced there were no eComments or public comments regarding this item.

#### I. ITEMS CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS AGENDAS

I.1. DISCUSSION OF STRATEGIC PLANNING

Library Director Anderson provided an update on e Strategic Plan; discussed a new Councilmember and advised she will let Commission Members know when City Council considers the item.

#### I.2. DISCUSSION OF MIDYEAR BUDGET

Library Director Anderson reported asking for \$50,000 of savings from the part-time budget; noted they were allowed to move it into the collection budget and addressed items and programs for which the funds will be used including investing in the Library's digital resources.

Discussion followed regarding the process for deciding where to allocate the money, the popularity of digital resources and the shared SORA app between the Redondo Beach School District and the City Library.

#### J. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION PRIOR TO ACTION

#### J.1. DISCUSSION OF DAY IN THE DISTRICT

Library Director Anderson provided an update on the recent Day in the District event; discussed talking points and addressed funding for PPE for library reopening and restoring the cut to the CLSA funds.

Discussion followed regarding the event offering opportunities for learning what other libraries in the area are doing.

Commissioner Wirsing reported she was interested in attending but stated she participates in Leadership Redondo and their meeting was on the same day as Day in the District.

#### J.2 DISCUSSION OF PUBLIC LIBRARY ASSOCIATION BENCHMARK BRIEFINGS

Library Director Anderson reported the briefings that allowed comparison of the Redondo Beach Library to suburban library systems that are under a city, on the west coast, around the same size; stated she developed a spreadsheet of the data; discussed how the Redondo Beach Library ranked, compared to similar systems, and noted increases in adult programming.

Commissioner Walls requested a copy of the spreadsheet and suggested the data would be helpful in proposing additional headcount going forward.

In response to Commissioner Wirsing's inquiry, Library Director Anderson stated she was surprised that the Redondo Beach Library ranked low on programs and ranked high on WiFi usage; discussed staffing in the past and changes; listed programs developed and suggested areas in which to add programming.

Commissioner Hall asked about other areas that could be contributing to low programming and Library Director Anderson discussed the importance of appropriate staffing.

#### J.3. DISCUSSION OF FY2021-2022 BUDGET LETTER

Chair Beauchamp commented positively on the FY2021-2022 Budget Letter; suggested including a chart to better illustrate the data relative to Digital Circulation (Figure 1); reviewed the recommended chart and in reference to hoopla, questioned whether it would be beneficial

to be a member of a larger library in terms of digital assets. Library Director Anderson felt there is little benefit in that regard.

Library Director Anderson thanked Commissioners Hall, Wirsing, and Walls for their help in developing the letter and commented positively about the letter.

Motion by Commissioner Hall, seconded by Commissioner Walls, to approve the FY2021-2022 Budget Letter, as amended to include the proposed chart illustrating data on Digital Circulation (Figure 1), have Chair Beauchamp sign the letter and direct staff to forward it to City Council. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote, with Commissioners Hannon, Coopman and Nafissi, absent.

#### J.4. DISCUSSION OF LIBRARY REOPENING PLANS

Library Director Anderson reported the tentative plan is for the Redondo Beach Library to reopen April 19, 2021 at 75% capacity, with browsing only, limited computer time and limited reference; stated she will present the plan at the next City Council meeting; noted patrons who do not feel comfortable going into the library will be accommodated with curbside pickup and addressed hours of operation, availability of PPEs and self-service checkout.

#### J.5. DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Library Director Anderson discussed a Zoom meeting with OCLC about the Capira App; reported it is available through Google and Apple; addressed National Library Week; announced the Friends of the Library are holding a Bag o' Books sale on Thursday from 10:00 a.m. to 1:00 p.m. and talked about upcoming Opera Talks programming.

Discussion followed regarding the Bag o' Books sale, details of the Frosty Windows, Frosty Mirrors meeting and related programming possibilities.

#### K. MEMBER ITEMS AND REFERRALS TO STAFF - None

#### L. ADJOURNMENT

Motion by Commissioner Walls, seconded by Commissioner Wirsing, to adjourn the meeting. Motion carried unanimously, by roll call vote, with Commissioners Hannon, Coopman and Nafissi, absent.

The Library Commission meeting was adjourned at 7:46 p.m. to the next meeting of the Redondo Beach Library Commission at 7:00 p.m. on June 7, 2021.

Respectfully submitted,

Susan Anderson, Library Director



#### I.1., File # LC21-2475

Meeting Date: 6/7/2021

TO: LIBRARY COMMISSION

FROM: SUSAN ANDERSON, LIBRARY DIRECTOR

#### <u>TITLE</u>

DISCUSSION OF STRATEGIC PLANNING

#### BACKGROUND

The date for the City's next strategic planning session has not been set.



#### I.2., File # LC21-2426

Meeting Date: 6/7/2021

TO: LIBRARY COMMISSION

FROM: SUSAN ANDERSON, LIBRARY DIRECTOR

#### <u>TITLE</u>

DISCUSSION OF LIBRARY REOPENING PLANS

#### BACKGROUND

The Main Library and the North Branch re-opened for browsing on April 19, 2021 under County of Los Angeles Department of Public Health "orange tier" guidelines. Services will be modified to match future guidelines.



#### J.1., File # LC21-2434

Meeting Date: 6/7/2021

TO: LIBRARY COMMISSION

FROM: SUSAN ANDERSON, LIBRARY DIRECTOR

#### <u>TITLE</u>

DISCUSSION OF 2021 SUMMER READING PROGRAM

#### BACKGROUND

The 2021 Summer Reading Program theme is "Reading Colors Your World" and participation will be online through Beanstack.

#### **ATTACHMENTS**

2021 Summer Reading Presentation

# 2021 Summer Reading



\*Redondo Beach Public Library 2021 Summer Reading Program\*



Celebrate the awesomeness of summer at your Library! Due to COVID-19, our program will be an on-line program again this year. Join us for our Reading Colors Your World Summer Reading program from June 5<sup>th</sup> through August 14<sup>th</sup>. Look for us on Facebook for virtual programs and activities!

#### How It Works:

- Register online at <u>https://Redondo.Beanstack.org</u> for either the Children, Teen or Adult Summer Reading Program.
- Complete the Summer Challenge by logging your minutes or books.
- · Participate in programs from some awesome performers.
- · Earn digital badges by completing activities and reading books.
- Pick up your prizes at either Library.
- · Catch us on Facebook for updates.

Check in with us on Facebook @ https://www.facebook.com/RedondoBeachPubLib/



#### 

#### **REDONDO BEACH PUBLIC LIBRARY**

Download our RBPL mobile app from your app store or visit us online at www.redondo.org to check out books.

#### JUNE 5TH-AUGUST 14TH

Come and celebrate the awesomeness of summertime at your library!

Join us for exciting entertainers, special programs, and storytimes!

This year's theme is

loct (Br

Mcdonald's

#### READING COLORS YOUR WORLD!

#### Main Library

303. N. Pacific Coast Hwy. Redondo Beach, CA 90277 310-318-0675
Monday : 3:00 p.m. — 7:00 p.m.
Tuesday-Thursday: 11:00 a.m. — 7:00 p.m.
Friday: 2:00 p.m. — 6:00 p.m.
Saturday: 9:00 a.m. - 5:00 p.m.

Read or listen to books all summer! Everyone who reads or listens for 5, 10, 15, 20, & 25 hours earns fun prizes!

Prize Drawing— Earn an opportunity drawing badge for every virtual book review completed! (Limit 20) Last day to pick up hourly prizes is August 21st.

Opportunity Drawing- Earn a badge for each secret code entered— keep an eye out for them during each virtual children's event! The last day to earn tickets is August 14th.

Opportunity winners will be phoned or emailed by August 28th and will have until September 11th to claim prize.

#### North Branch Library

2000 Artesia Blvd. Redondo Beach, CA 90278 310-318-0677 **Monday - Thursday:** 

1:00 p.m.—7:00 p.m. Friday: Closed Saturday:

9:00 a.m. – 5:00 p.m.

Parents! Make sure to check out our Teen and Adult Summer Reading Program!

THANK YOU TO OUR SPONSORS

EVENTS AND SUPPLIES MADE POSSIBLE BY THE









#### J.2., File # LC21-2435

Meeting Date: 6/7/2021

TO: LIBRARY COMMISSION

FROM: SUSAN ANDERSON, LIBRARY DIRECTOR

#### TITLE

DISCUSSION OF KLUGE CENTER REPORT ON DISINFORMATION

#### BACKGROUND

In February and March 2021, Library Director Susan Anderson, working with a team of librarians from across the country through the platform Wikiwisdom, created and then presented a report to the American Library Association and the Library of Congress' Kluge Center on the library's role in combatting mis/disinformation and helping the greater community find common ground in shared facts.

#### **ATTACHMENTS**

Standing Up for Truth: The Role of Libraries in the Mis/Disinformation Age



# Standing Up for Truth

The Role of Libraries in the Mis/Disinformation Age

"Misinformation rides the greased algorithmic rails of powerful social media platforms and travels at velocities and in volumes that make it nearly impossible to stop. That alone makes information warfare an unfair fight for the average internet user."

–Charlie Warzel, <u>New York Times</u>, Feb. 18, 2021

#### **Table of Contents**

Recommendations	5
Role of a Public Librarian	23
Role of a School Librarian	25
Role of an Academic Librarian	28
Role of a Special Librarian	30
<u>Thought Leaders</u>	32
Resources	38
About WikiWisdom	50

#### Introduction

We should all agree that a well-informed, information-literate population is essential for democracy. We believe librarians are uniquely positioned to make that happen.

Across the political spectrum, people hold librarians in high regard (Geiger, 2017; Horrigan, 2016). Librarians have always been skilled curators of information resources. But in a world of mis/disinformation, their role has grown into helping the community find common ground in shared facts and teaching the skills needed to successfully navigate a complex information landscape. Indeed, librarians may be the best defense against mis/disinformation.

#### **FROM THE WIKI**

It's NEVER been easy for citizens to identify credible information, engage in legitimate debate, or counter disinformation, and now I think it's more exhausting. Information (true or false) spreads fast, and the speed exacerbates what has always been a challenge into a phenomenon we're calling fake news. I think it's a librarian's job to help people feel a little less exhausted, overwhelmed or alone when it comes to finding quality information, and to empower people to be better information seekers. It's never been easier to get SO. MUCH. Information.

–Samantha M.

*Merriam-Webster* defines misinformation as "incorrect or misleading information." Disinformation is more sinister. It is defined as "false information deliberately and often covertly spread (as by the planting of rumors) in order to influence public opinion or obscure the truth." One can turn into the other when an unsuspecting person, believing it to be true, unwittingly passes along the more sinister disinformation, turning it into misinformation. Both create problems for "sense-making," or developing a plausible understanding of a shifting world. For that reason, this report uses the combined term, mis/ disinformation, throughout.

With many local newspapers folding, trust in the mainstream media falling, and big tech algorithms feeding bias that can mislead users, people struggle to discern evidence-based facts (Abernathy, 2018; Brenan, 2020; Takenaga, 2019). Or, more troubling, they may choose not to engage in that struggle, preferring to believe the mis/disinformation no matter how outlandish it might appear, while writing off generally reliable sources as "fake news."

Recognizing the crisis of a lack of shared understanding of evidence-based facts, librarians are refining their role as Information Literacy experts. Increasingly, it falls to librarians to teach library users to examine their beliefs in order to make thoughtful, informed decisions.

2

New Voice Strategies sponsored the Librarian WikiWisdom Forum. More than 300 librarians and library workers from across the country joined a unique online conversation in celebration of Danielle Allen, the 2020 Kluge Prize Winner.

During this unique, vibrant online conversation, participating librarians and library workers posted 136 ideas and 432 comments engaging with these questions:

- In a world of disinformation, social media, and "alternative facts," how do you identify and vet credible information sources?
- How do you share those credible sources with students and public library users?
- What is a librarian's role in helping the greater community find common ground in shared facts?

The 15 most engaged members of this peer collaboration were invited to join Phase 2 of our project as Librarian Thought Leaders. Building on the online conversation, they developed the 4 Recommendations and 23 Proposed Solutions included in this report. On March 11th this report was presented to Danielle Allen.

#### FROM THE WIKI

It is dangerous to democracy when folks of varying political stripes live in information ecosystems that do not share the same grounding in basic facts. We must engage citizens in the skills necessary to assess information so that we can begin from a base point of factual information. —Marybeth G.

Because different types of librarians have different goals and face different obstacles, we included in this report separate sections addressing challenges to each. Public librarians need training in highlevel communication skills and administrative support to effectively tackle these issues in their local communities. School librarians face budget challenges that require them to divide their time and efforts among multiple tasks, even multiple campuses. Academic librarians must be seen as critical collaborators with classroom instructors to design and provide Information Literacy instruction alongside established curricula. Special librarians need to be empowered to encourage their users to seek balanced opinions. Each type of library and librarian plays a critical role in fighting mis/disinformation. The public library is a community anchor that can be leveraged to bring together people with diverse viewpoints for civil discourse. School librarians should be regarded as education professionals who can teach K-12 students to question the information they encounter and how to locate evidence-based facts. Academic librarians need administrative alignment and institutional commitment of resources and faculty allies across disciplines to effectively build meaningful programs that span a student's college career. Special librarians must leverage their trusted positions within institutions to promote diverse information sources, providing balanced views in research materials while employing communication skills with their patrons to promote ethical information use.

This report lays out the support needed to help librarians do their part to create an informed and engaged citizenry, as characterized by a commitment to:

- information sharing as opposed to defending specific opinions;
- the continuous examination of beliefs;
- approaching subjects with a spirit of inquiry:
- civil discourse;
- curiosity and inclusion in information seeking;
- evidence-based facts;
- the protection of democracy; and
- systemic equity and social justice for all.

We acknowledge that mis/disinformation is endemic to the Information Age. Developing and refining strategies to mitigate the effects of mis/disinformation is a critical mission for libraries and must be ongoing. In great challenges lie great opportunities. There is no time to waste.

"Misinformation is most dangerous when it is able to exploit the fears and needs of communities. If librarians are able to bring their community together to solve problems before they become the target of a disinformation campaign, then this is a valuable contribution even if the library never directly addresses the topic of misinformation itself." Journal of Librarianship and Information Science (Young et al., 2020)

#### Recommendations

#### Recommendation 1 Improve Outreach to Patrons and Community

- 1. Advertise Librarians' Expertise Throughout the Library
- 2. Educate the Community on the Topic of Mis/Disinformation
- 3. Approach Library Users in a Spirit of Collaborative Information Seeking
- 4. Engage Patrons with Creative Programming around Emotional Subjects
- 5. Use Current Digital Methods of Communication
- 6. Partner with Community Organizations
- 7. Foster Collaborations with Local Media Outlets

#### **Recommendation 2**

### Enlist the Aid of Foundations, State Libraries, and Professional Associations in Combating Mis/Disinformation

- 8. Lobby Foundations to Make Combating Mis/Disinformation a Priority
- 9. Create New Grant Opportunities for Fighting Mis/Disinformation
- 10. Launch a National Public Education Campaign Promoting Libraries as the Go-To Source for Evidence-Based Facts
- 11. <u>Develop Online Tools Local Libraries Can Use to Determine Community Needs Regarding</u> <u>Mis/Disinformation</u>

### Recommendation 3 Arm Librarians with New Skills

- 12. Develop a Collaborative Approach to Fighting Mis/Disinformation
- 13. Teach Librarians to Facilitate Community Conversations
- 14. Offer Professional Development that Elevates the Reference Interview
- 15. Help Librarians Stay Abreast of Primary Sources for Facts and Statistics
- 16. Ensure Efficacy of Materials Selection Policies
- 17. Provide Continuing Education Opportunities on the Mechanics of Mis/Disinformation

5

#### Recommendation 4 Adapt LIS Education to Critical New Issues

- 18. Update the LIS Curricula
- 19. Teach Community-Based Information Literacy
- 20. Teach Higher-Order Communication Skills
- 21. Add Media Literacy to the List of Mandatory Courses
- 22. Offer Elective Courses in Mis/Disinformation
- 23. Teach Social Media Skills

**Recommendation 1** 

#### Improve Outreach to Patrons and Community

#### STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

While libraries remain providers of books and internet access and appealing places for groups to gather, 21st century libraries are so much more. They are community anchors and vibrant centers for democracy, Information Literacy, and civic engagement, both in person and online. And they play an increasingly important role in addressing the dangers of mis/disinformation.

For years, libraries have served as repositories of knowledge, staffed by engaged experts in research, resource evaluation, the provision of diverse viewpoints, and the teaching of Information Literacy skills. It is imperative that librarians now launch a vigorous campaign for public awareness about the dangers of mis/disinformation, advocate for methods of counteracting mis/disinformation, and help library users navigate a complex information ecosystem that contains escalating amounts of misinformation and disinformation.

#### **FROM THE WIKI**

The librarians' role is huge in helping the community find common ground in shared facts. Most people still trust libraries in a way that they don't trust the media. Librarians have worked hard to maintain their reputation as curators of information resources, so they should play a key role. —Elena B.

#### **PROPOSED SOLUTIONS**

#### 1. Advertise Librarians' Expertise Throughout the Library

This can take many forms, including:

- Displaying posters and memes that demonstrate "How to Fact Check in Less Than 90 Seconds."
- Adding signs in the nonfiction section telling users: "Have doubts about this book? Ask a Librarian!"
- An ongoing education campaign via the library newsletter, website, and social media accounts reminding people to confirm the accuracy of a social media post before sharing it as a method of deterring the spread of misinformation.

7

- Infographics to raise awareness of misinformation and disinformation (advertise NewsGuard and other tools).
- A data dashboard to gather in one place major fact checking sites on current hot topics with continuous updates.

#### 2. Educate the Community on the Topic of Mis/Disinformation

Consider hosting a series of community town halls to discuss mis/disinformation in nonfiction books. The goal is to help library users understand that librarians select materials for many different reasons — because they are best sellers, because they have received good reviews in established journals, or because there is community interest. But having a book in the nonfiction section does not guarantee it is "true." For example, a book of essays is subject to interpretation, and one patron's spiritual "truth" may be different from another's. Furthermore, the "truth" can change, e.g., dietary recommendations that morph over time. There are also many meaningful truths to discover in the fiction section.

In addition, these town halls can engage the public in strategies to identify fake news and conspiracy theories in books and other media.

#### FROM THE WIKI

Even if the individual or organization possesses professional or personal credentials, this does not necessarily mean their facts or opinions are the best. After all, sometimes people seek second opinions for a medical diagnosis, so why not seek other opinions on information or facts. —Martina K.

#### 3. Approach Library Users in a Spirit of Collaborative Information Seeking

Librarians must tread lightly when attempting to counter mis/disinformation by showing respect for the user's beliefs, engaging in a reference interview, steering the user to research tools and verified resources, and avoiding arguments as to "facts" by instead teaching Information Literacy skills when there is an opportunity to do so.

#### **FROM THE WIKI**

Using non-political and non-controversial examples that don't appeal to emotions is a really great way to help people spot bad arguments. That helps to avoid getting focused on the wrong thing and lets the examples get through.

–Jessie S.

#### 4. Engage Patrons with Creative Programming around Emotional Subjects

Encourage participation and build trust in the library as a space to discuss difficult topics by taking creative approaches to programming. The idea is to offer programming that is less politically charged but encourages the development of communication skills around emotion-laden subjects. Some ideas:

- A "conspiracy theory book club" that discusses books on the topic of conspiracy theories as well as fiction and/or nonfiction books containing conspiracy theories in order to examine whether these theories are credible according to a shared evaluation toolkit.
- Discussions around effective communication skills and more specifically how to have a productive conversation in person or online with someone whose viewpoints differ.
- A program centered on a difficult but common personal experience (such as death).

#### FROM THE WIKI

Could libraries provide a safe, civilized, and calm way to meet and greet people from both sides of the political aisles to have a conversation? We could provide a space and opportunity to let people get to know each other as real people and not the "radical right" or "liberal extremists." We might be surprised to know that our neighbors do not hold the same beliefs that we do but are still good people with families, hopes, and dreams. We could provide coffee, snacks, and a chance for the community to find common ground. —Jessie S.

#### 5. Use Current Digital Methods of Communication

Wage the war on mis/disinformation on social media platforms from Facebook to Tik Tok as well as in digital newsletters and other forms of online marketing to effectively reach audiences where they get their news and information.

#### 6. Partner with Community Organizations

Position the library as the backbone infrastructure for developing an informed and engaged citizenry by sending staff to community meetings to discuss the subject of mis/disinformation, hosting events at the library that bring together disparate groups for community-building exercises, and asking aligned community groups to promote library events focused on mis/disinformation.

#### 7. Foster Collaborations with Local Media Outlets

Build trust in the journalistic process and professional journalists by inviting local reporters to speak at the library to discuss how they approach professional tasks such as conducting interviews; planning, editing, and writing stories to be broadcast or published; and verifying information provided by subjects and other authorities.

#### FROM THE WIKI

I have a hard time balancing awareness of news sources across the political spectrum with not validating conspiracy theories and really harmful beliefs and takes. How can librarians not validate such ideas, but also not condemn them so much that their believers turn away from us? —Hannah R.

#### WHY WE BELIEVE THIS WILL WORK

Outreach is the key to spreading the word about mis/disinformation. Improved communications in the library, such as signs that encourage users to ask a librarian when they have questions about a book or information source, gives librarians the opportunity to teach patrons to use critical thinking skills as they read. Taking a librarian's expertise into the community is critical if we are to spread the word that evidence-based facts matter.

#### **MEASURES OF SUCCESS**

- Increased reach of publicity in terms of diverse participants, especially new participants from underserved population groups, and constructive engagement.
- Increased attendance at programs and events and patron satisfaction with these programs.
- A growing number of community organizations partner with the library and host programs to encourage civil discourse and to help their members understand mis/disinformation and how to determine whether a fact is evidence-based.
- Statistics on the number of patrons who follow prompts from library signage (Ask a Librarian!) and ask staff questions about them.

### Enlist the Aid of Foundations, State Libraries, and Professional Associations in Combating Mis/Disinformation

#### STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

Mis/disinformation is a problem of national import; its proliferation threatens our democracy. Local libraries are on the front line of the battle, but they cannot be expected to fight this war alone. It requires funding, resources, and training to ensure library efforts are coordinated, consistent, and effective.

#### FROM THE WIKI

I wonder if librarians' role is to help our communities de-stigmatize the contexts surrounding news sources. Maybe it's to engage people with information from across an appropriate information spectrum. —Lauren Elizabeth P.

#### **PROPOSED SOLUTIONS**

#### 8. Lobby Foundations to Make Combating Mis/Disinformation a Priority

Like library users, foundations need to see libraries in a new light, as the front line of defense against mis/disinformation. Funding this fight should become a principal program for any foundation whose mission is to promote civil discourse, to advocate for truth and facts, or to participate in any other effort to preserve our democracy. These lobbying efforts should be across the board and can be spearheaded by local library boards, friends groups, state library boards, national professional associations or anyone else who has an interest in supporting libraries' role in preserving our democracy.

#### 9. Create New Grant Opportunities for Fighting Mis/Disinformation

State libraries in all 50 states should create specific funding opportunities for local library outreach programs aimed at combating mis/disinformation in a community-sensitive manner. Local libraries can apply for the grants while the State Libraries oversee administrative tasks involved.

#### FROM THE WIKI

Last year our public library, the Daniel Boone Regional Library (DBRL) in Columbia Missouri, applied for and received a literacy grant from our state library and the IMLS. We argued in the grant application that news and media literacy is not just tangential to literacy in general; in this day and age it should be part of a broader literacy curriculum.

The program has been a real success! After a slow start due to Covid, we moved everything to the online seminar format and are now reaching out to organizations and civic groups throughout our service region. We have teamed up with the University of Missouri School of Journalism and an organization called IREX (International Research and Exchange Board) as project partners. They have helped us greatly with our curriculum for the seminars.

We have 8 seminars lined up this winter and spring with I'm sure more to come! These groups are diverse: from local Rotary clubs, to college courses in research methodology, to a small, rural book-club. We feel like we are in a special place to help people navigate the very tricky world of digital news and disinformation. We are concentrating on developing a toolbox for media consumers. This toolbox includes empowering users and patrons to:

- 1. Distinguish between news and reported facts and misinformation (incorrect information) and disinformation.
- 2. Have emotional resilience, to recognize when a headline or story is meant to be emotionally manipulative, and feel confident in your skills to evaluate online articles and stories before you share them with others.
- 3. Use tools and practices that make you better and more confident media consumers.
- 4. Although this grant and initiative is specifically geared toward adults, we feel like it could easily be repurposed for middle and high schoolers. We at DBRL feel like we are doing our little part in helping people navigate through this tumultuous and confusing time in human history.

–Seth S.

### 10. Launch a National Public Education Campaign Promoting Libraries as the Go-To Source for Evidence-Based Facts

Library-supporting entities, such as philanthropies, should support efforts to develop a powerful public education campaign that promotes professional librarians as the go-to source for reliable information.

In addition to PR outreach to major media outlets, this campaign should include support for state and local libraries to do their own outreach to local media. This includes but is not limited to:

- Press release and social media templates that can be easily adapted with local information.
- Interactive posts such as "true or false" polls that can be posted on local libraries' social channels.
- Graphics regarding mis/disinformation that individual libraries can display.

### **11.** Develop Online Tools Local Libraries Can Use to Determine Community Needs Regarding Mis/Disinformation

Support local library efforts to combat mis/disinformation by giving them the tools needed to gather information from their community regarding what services and education would be helpful in managing the onslaught of information. These tools could be developed by State Libraries and professional library associations and must include funding and professional development around how to implement the tools, how to interpret the results, and how to develop programs to meet community needs.

#### WHY WE BELIEVE THIS WILL WORK

Local librarians know their community best, but many are cash-strapped and spread thin. They may lack the expertise to run an effective social media campaign or the training to engage library patrons around emotionally weighty issues such as mis/disinformation. Giving them the financial and programmatic support to do these things and promoting all librarians as the go-to experts on Information Literacy will significantly increase the likelihood of success.

#### **MEASURES OF SUCCESS**

- Increase in funding for mis/disinformation efforts.
- Increase in media mentions of library activities in combating mis/disinformation.
- Increase in the number of professional librarians quoted as expert sources in combating mis/ disinformation.
- Increase in number of partners and community collaboration activities.
- Growth in libraries' online and social media presence.
- Surveys conducted in person in the library, on the website, or over social media show there is interest in learning more about a particular aspect of mis/disinformation.

#### STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

We ask a lot from librarians. Yes, they manage the collection and point people toward the resources they need. But that is just the beginning of their duties. They are part teacher, part social worker, part IT support, part therapist and part enforcer of the rules. And now we ask that they guide users to factual information in what can be intensely uncomfortable conversations. Librarians are experts at helping library users find the resources they need, but they may feel less equipped at building trust and fighting disinformation in an ethically sound, emotionally sophisticated, and politically sensitive manner.

#### FROM THE WIKI

During a "discussion," I try not to put a barrier between the other person and myself – no desk, etc. I think it is an equalizer. —Linda C.

#### **PROPOSED SOLUTIONS**

#### 12. Develop a Collaborative Approach to Fighting Mis/Disinformation

The traditional helping mindset assumes a "provider versus receiver" power structure in which the provider (librarian) is the helper and the receiver (library user) is the helpless. That must change. Whether they are library users or not, many community members have strengths and resources that can help librarians fight mis/disinformation. It is important that librarians take time to discover the strengths of community members, develop meaningful relationships with diverse population groups, and engage them as allies in the fight against mis/disinformation. Trust develops when people are given opportunities to contribute what they do best. This may require professional development for professional librarians and modifications to librarian education (addressed in the last section of this report).

#### **FROM THE WIKI**

I am sometimes amazed at what a patron might tell me or trust me with. It's all about relationship building. Collection development that expresses our diversity can make the library a place of critical dialog that may create some opportunities for a change of perspective. —Linda C.

#### 13. Teach Librarians to Facilitate Community Conversations

Librarians need to learn communication skills to facilitate community conversations on many topics, including sensitive political ones. To do so, they must be able to listen without personal bias and without giving solutions in order to find common interests among the diverse perspectives. These are skills that can be taught in professional development programs developed by State Libraries and state-level library associations that take into account community sensibilities. The skills also should be taught in professional development programs, continuing education, and MLIS graduate programs.

#### **FROM THE WIKI**

The soft skills (familiar to those who have been facilitators, coaches, etc.) of establishing or building trust, being mindfully present to the person and their emotions as well as your own, seeing each interaction with patrons as relational rather than transactional, and working to understand where the person is coming from rather than trying to change their mind are as important in librarians' work to counter misinformation and help patrons find credible sources as the information skills we have. Undertaking this work as relationship and trust building also builds community.

-Deb. B.

#### 14. Offer Professional Development that Elevates the Reference Interview

The reference interview can – and should! – be the first step in combating mis/disinformation. But broaching sensitive topics (have you considered other sides to that story?) can require a delicate approach. Librarians are more likely to take that step if they have training that makes them feel more comfortable having that conversation.

#### **FROM THE WIKI**

Librarians need to incorporate information education into our reference interviews and transactions as much as possible. We need to describe the search process to our patrons, and illustrate that we are using multiple sources to answer a question (as much as possible).

-Rachel M.

## 15. Help Librarians Stay Abreast of Primary Sources for Facts and Statistics

Librarians need continual training regarding primary sources for facts and statistics in order to help patrons research claims made in the larger information ecosystem. This is an ongoing education role for national professional organizations.

#### **FROM THE WIKI**

I try to explain to people how certain platforms work. If someone indicates they get their news from Facebook, I try to explain that Facebook is a platform that is better for advertising than news because it groups users into targetable segments that advertisers can send messages directly to. I like to use anti Vax examples from Facebook to highlight how they can target specific groups like Jewish neighborhoods or people who have autistic children. I think it can be eye opening to some people how social media like Facebook really work. —Jessie S.

## 16. Ensure Efficacy of Materials Selection Policies

Librarians need training in revising, explaining, and upholding a Materials Selection Policy in order to ensure effectiveness. This can take many forms, but should include a strongly worded policy in favor of evidence-based facts. Most importantly, it should be backed at an institutional level, such as by a Library Board, and by local political and community leaders.

#### FROM THE WIKI

Librarians, libraries, and library boards need to go into this with their eyes wide open. After some experience with a small, rural public library answering to a city and county with a century of one-party rule, you are opening your institution to blowback including threats of resource cutbacks if not outright being dismissed if the truth about facts does not fit with the conformity the community demands. I am not saying that this is not a fight we should engage in. We should. But for some libraries, there will be a price to be paid and all who care about their library should understand that.

-Randall S.

# 17. Provide Continuing Education Opportunities on the Mechanics of Mis/Disinformation

Librarians need training in how mis/disinformation operates from both a technical and a psychological standpoint in order to educate their communities on how to spot it and guard against it. These are also skills that can be taught in professional development programs developed by State Libraries that take into account community sensibilities. The skills also should be taught in librarian education programs.

#### FROM THE WIKI

I think librarianship in many ways is stuck in a situation set up for us by Melvil Dewey when he claimed that librarians don't need to be experts, but rather should rely on other specialists to determine what is appropriate for our collections. I think librarianship should stretch ourselves as a profession and help come up with an ability to determine what is disinformation at least. Our code of ethics calls for us to resist labeling, but if we serve the public I think we need to at least be ready to label blatant misinformation. —Andrew W.

#### WHY WE BELIEVE THIS WILL WORK

Librarians are on the front line of fighting mis/disinformation. Like the infantry on the front lines of a war, they need to be fully armed, trained, and supported to be most successful. Librarians who want to take on this fight need updated skills to stay ahead of the mis/disinformation tsunami. Due to the inherent sensitivities of this topic in the current moment, it is important for librarians to have the unequivocal and public support of their administrators, institutional leaders, and other community leadership.

#### **MEASURES OF SUCCESS**

This is most easily measured through surveys and polls.

- Ask librarians and library workers if they have the training and skills they need.
- After professional development, ask librarians and library workers if the training was useful and whether they feel more comfortable teaching users about mis/disinformation and directing them to evidence-based sources.
- Survey library users and community members about their opinion of library efforts to combat mis/disinformation.

#### STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

Today's librarians, regardless of the type of library, are faced with the immense challenge of countering mis/disinformation. New librarians enrolled in LIS graduate programs need educational opportunities that will fully prepare them to confront this challenge and take on leadership roles to address it. To do that effectively requires higher-level interpersonal and communication skills as well as strong community outreach. Education for Information Literacy should be integrated into the core curriculum of all LIS programs, including knowledge and skills in information organization and retrieval, evaluation of information sources and services, and communication of credible information to users. In addition, LIS programs should develop pedagogies in Information Literacy as a requirement for addressing mis/ disinformation.

Credibility of information is integrally connected to the trust perceived in human connections associated with that information. To meet that challenge, LIS students must learn higher-order communication and community-building skills. As professionals, they will be called upon to use those skills to help members of their community build human relationships and expand the sources they trust as part of librarians' work in promoting Information Literacy.

#### FROM THE WIKI

Our communities need to be able to rely on libraries and librarians to be "credibility anchors" and "thought leaders" with regard to credible information sources and shared facts.

But how can we accomplish this?

Libraries and library professionals should model and deploy disinformation-busting strategies like:

- Engagement with and countering of "post truth" ideas by publicly and transparently fact checking harmful narratives using credible information sources.
- Design of multimodal guides and messaging (on sites like library websites, newspapers, Twitter, Reddit, Facebook, LinkedIn, YouTube, etc.), authored by dedicated library & information science thought leaders, for deployment to our libraries and librarians who don't have time to develop resources themselves.
- Work together as professionals to raise awareness of common challenges, test strategies, and reimagine solutions.
- -Kristen R.

## **PROPOSED SOLUTIONS**

## 18. Update the LIS Curricula

Educational components of Information Literacy should be further infused throughout the core LIS curricula, including:

- knowledge and skills of information organization and retrieval;
- evaluation of information sources and services;
- methods of communicating credible information to users and institutions; and
- development of pedagogical and curriculum design skills for Information Literacy.

#### FROM THE WIKI

There is no single course that can cover all student learning objectives in Information Literacy. The principle of curriculum design is to develop multiple courses to achieve a wide range of student learning objectives, providing a cohesive core curriculum for a holistic library education program.

School libraries are competing with Google. To be useful, digital library collections need to consist of sources that are credible and support schools' curriculums. It is also important for school librarians to share digital library collections in a way that makes it easy to search and browse for credible sources. —Amy B.

## 19. Teach Community-Based Information Literacy

In addition to inviting people into libraries to attend activities, librarians have to feel comfortable taking their Information Literacy message into the community. Practicing community-based Information Literacy requires breaking down silos and being inclusive of all in the community by considering information from diverse sources and intentionally showcasing new human stories. It also requires demonstrating genuine interest in what people are doing and saying, so that they feel heard and not judged when they have an information question.

In curricular design for community-based Information Literacy, we propose this instruction be covered in multiple courses so that, upon the completion of professional education, students are able to:

- 1. Apply the concepts of information organization and retrieval in library programming and service design.
- 2. Evaluate credibility of information to meet user and community needs.

- 3. Identify diverse information sources to broaden user perspectives.
- 4. Facilitate community outreach to non-users in partnership with other community entities.
- 5. Conduct community conversations to achieve constructive and equitable information exchange among different perspectives.
- 6. Integrate library programming and resources in existing and new community initiatives to sustain the efforts for long term community building.
- 7. Assess the outcomes of programs and services for continuous improvement.

#### **FROM THE WIKI**

How do we reach the people who have created a false reality bubble and who may never enter a library because "everything is on Google?" How can we educate people about the harmful effects of misinformation if they think, "this could never happen to me?"

–Jessie S.

## 20. Teach Higher-Order Communication Skills

Librarians of all types need to know how to build alliances with groups in their respective communities, and they need to learn and practice higher-order communication and interpersonal skills that allow them to have constructive conversations with skeptical users.

Public librarians must take it a step further. They need to know how to build alliances with community groups. They need to learn high-level interpersonal skills that allow them to approach skeptical users as peers. And they need facilitation skills they can use to conduct difficult community conversations among disparate groups.

#### **FROM THE WIKI**

It's relatively simple to teach people skills like lateral reading, tracing back to an original source, etc.—but people who are determined to believe only what they want to believe have no motivation to use these skills. Unfortunately, there's no shortcut to teaching others (and ourselves!) how to interrogate their/our own ideologies. We need to embed critical literacy practices across everything we do. —Maggie B.

# 21. Add Media Literacy to the List of Mandatory Courses

A course focused on developing LIS students' media literacy competencies should be a foundational LIS course. By ensuring that professional librarians have a shared and deep understanding of the concepts of media literacy, graduates will be in a stronger position to both stay abreast of the constantly changing media landscape and teach media literacy concepts and skills to their patrons and students.

#### FROM THE WIKI

Judging by behaviors over the last decade, people aren't going to stop and fact check every article they scroll by, even when sources like Snopes and Politifact are widely known. My conclusion is that change hinges on treating the sharing of misinformation as dangerous; not "I'll share this in case it's true" but "I can't share this in case it isn't."

-Katy M.

# 22. Offer Elective Courses in Mis/Disinformation

Given the seriousness of the problem of mis/disinformation, it benefits our society to have more professional librarians with deep knowledge of these issues. Stand-alone, elective LIS courses on mis/ disinformation can help more librarians develop their expertise and understanding of many different aspects of mis/disinformation such as how it is created, disseminated, and spread; why it is created; the psychology of mis/disinformation; and media messages, social media, conspiracy theories, propaganda, and the like.

## 23. Teach Social Media Skills

An understanding of how social media platforms work, how information is created and shared, and how libraries of all types can use these platforms for effective community outreach and communication with patrons are all now essential competencies for librarians.

#### WHY WE BELIEVE THIS WILL WORK

Mis/disinformation is now firmly part of the information ecosystem and will continue to evolve over time. Librarians must have the support, training, and skills to adequately respond to these threats and stay up-to-date on how they change. Intentional efforts to incorporate this education into LIS programs will ensure that librarians are appropriately equipped and can maintain these vital skills. The perception of the credibility of information is often about trust. With trust as an important factor in human information-seeking behaviors, LIS students must become skilled at the larger context of community-building as part of Information Literacy services. Librarians are in a prime position to help community members build relationships and expand their range of trusted information sources as part of our work in Information Literacy.

#### **MEASURES OF SUCCESS**

- LIS students are better able to identify local resources and build relationships with their community to facilitate collaborative initiatives in combating mis/disinformation.
- LIS programs produce more graduates with thorough knowledge of mis/disinformation and constantly changing media landscapes, equipped with skills to better face and keep current with this complex issue.

A number of factors have contributed to our current crisis in sense-making. The World Wide Web, while creating a rich environment for public engagement and beneficial opportunities for participation in the public sphere, unleashed an information tsunami, further amplified by social media, that has led to "information overload" as well as misinformation. Digital algorithms simultaneously encourage confirmation bias. The web has also had deleterious effects on traditional media, with local newspapers folding, trust in the mainstream media falling, and budgets for in-depth reporting diminishing. Some surviving media outlets have experienced greater consolidation and pressure from corporate owners to deploy ever more sensational and partisan tactics in the competition for "eyeballs." Attempts by big tech to label or censor misinformation risks pushing people further into information silos. The public can easily feel that they have no solid source to rely on while facing a flood of misinformation that has left our democratic society adrift in a sea of "alternative facts" and seemingly irreconcilable narratives.

In this atmosphere marked by political tension and distrust of institutions that has been described by some as "post-truth," public libraries are uniquely situated to act as a bulwark against the deluge of false and misleading information that exacerbates the divisions in our society. By building and upholding trust within the communities they serve, public libraries can leverage that trust to restore faith in public institutions, heal divisions, and provide their communities with the tools they need to navigate information overload and a complex media and information landscape.

This is not an easy charge, and many public librarians lack the time, training, and administrative support to effectively tackle these issues. But librarians are information experts, and when we don't have what we need, we certainly know how to find it. Recent research has shone a light on some of the methods and strategies public libraries can utilize to combat misinformation as well as the partnerships that are needed. Below, we have listed some of the actions public libraries can take along with the support that is required for implementation.

## HOW PUBLIC LIBRARIANS COMBAT MIS/DISINFORMATION

- Provide tools for analyzing the accuracy of information and guide users to those resources.
- Bolster democratic values by facilitating healthy civic discourse, promoting materials that represent diverse viewpoints, and teaching effective communication skills.
- Provide education on information literacy and misinformation through programming and displays.
- Collect materials representing a diversity of viewpoints.
- Use the reference interview as an opportunity for instruction, to help users analyze information sources and narratives through a spirit of collaboration.
- Maintain and cultivate partnerships with community organizations, especially those positioned to authoritatively and proactively counter disinformation.

• Actively counter misinformation through the promotion of information that is based on available evidence.

#### SUPPORTS NEEDED

In order to perform the job of combating mis/disinformation, a public librarian needs the following supports:

- Graduate level or in-house training on facilitation, pedagogy, psychology of communication, social media, and identifying community needs.
- Backing from library boards and support groups, community leadership, and elected officials regarding professional ethics in library services and programming.
- Assistance from academic partners and professional organizations in designing effective programming and tools for librarians tackling misinformation.

# The Role of a School Librarian in Combating Mis/Disinformation

School librarians are especially well positioned in the battle against mis/disinformation. If instruction begins in elementary school, the focus can be on learning good habits rather than unlearning bad ones. A generation raised with an expertly designed K-12 Information Literacy curriculum offers hope for a future populated by citizens who are not only resistant to being manipulated by cleverly crafted falsehoods, but who are empathetic, open-minded, and culturally aware.

However, there are multiple barriers to overcome if school librarians are to take up this lofty charge. Many states do not require schools to employ a librarian, and those that do often do not enforce such mandates. This means that when there is a budget shortfall (which is a widespread occurrence due to decreased government spending on education and inequitable school funding policies), school librarians' positions are among the first to be cut. Additionally, some states have weak certification requirements, resulting in the hiring of "school librarians" who do not have library degrees or may have no training in librarianship or Information Literacy instruction whatsoever.

Of the highly qualified school librarians who exist, most are required to spread themselves thin. School librarians wear an astonishing number of hats, and the focus and scope of their work varies drastically from district to district. Some school librarians spend the majority of their time as educational technology consultants. Others are assigned administrative responsibilities. Still others may be the sole librarian in an enormous district, serving multiple schools and an overwhelming number of students. Many have no paraprofessional or aide to perform the time consuming, necessary, day-to-day operations of a library, such as checking materials in and out, keeping records, and shelving.

A related issue is the confusion regarding the school librarian's role in a digital age. Despite advocacy efforts from the American Library Association and nonprofits such as EveryLibrary, antiquated stereotypes of school librarians as the shushing guardians of musty tomes have been remarkably persistent, even among K-12 administrators. Efforts to increase understanding, respect, and, ultimately, funding, for the vital work school librarians do has led to a proliferation of creative alternate job titles, from Teacher Librarian to Digital Learning Instructor to Technology Integrator to—yes, this one's real—Library Interventionist. School libraries, too, are often renamed as media centers, learning commons, resource rooms, and more. These inconsistent identifiers for school librarians and libraries have complicated efforts to collect accurate data about Information Literacy instruction and initiatives in the K-12 arena.

Additionally, although collaboration between and among librarians, teachers, and administrators is vital to the success of any Information Literacy curriculum, school librarians are often isolated. Most are the sole librarian in their school, and library departments often have a tenuous position in district hierarchies, like a lone planet revolving around a different sun in the same universe. This results in their (often unintentionally) being left out of planning, discussions, and decision-making around areas in which they are the district experts—including Information Literacy.

School librarians struggle with many of the same issues as other educators, especially those working in content areas whose objectives are not well represented in the Common Core and/or on mandated state tests. It is a truism that while we should assess what we value, what frequently happens instead is that we value what we assess. Too often, Information Literacy instruction in K-12 schools is spotty,

inconsistent, and catch-as-catch can. Until effective and widespread measures of K-12 Information Literacy are established and utilized, Information Literacy is likely to continue to be perceived as a frill in a system forced to operate on a no-frills basis.

Finally, a well-designed Information Literacy curriculum must, by necessity, address "hot" topics such as bias, stereotypes, racism, and identity that some stakeholders view as controversial and better left for families to address. Ultimately, however, the ability to interrogate why we believe certain things to be true is a core competency for Information Literacy. The objective of Information Literacy instruction is not to teach students what to believe, but rather to empower students to make thoughtful, informed decisions about what they believe and how they've come to that belief.

#### HOW SCHOOL LIBRARIANS COMBAT MIS/DISINFORMATION

- Develop goals and objectives for students related to Information Literacy. These may include, but are not limited to:
  - accessing diverse sources of information;
  - using evidence-based practices to evaluate information;
  - creating and sharing information effectively and ethically;
  - understanding the psychological, emotional, social, cultural, and cognitive forces that impact the perception of facts, reality, and truth.
- Design, deliver, and assess the effectiveness of cross-curricular Information Literacy- instruction from K-12 in collaboration with other teachers.
- Employ authentic and connected teaching methods such as inquiry and student-directed learning, so that students value Information Literacy and apply its precepts in their everyday lives.
- Provide reference assistance to students and staff, especially concerning source selection and information evaluation.
- Provide ongoing Information Literacy professional development to staff.
- Provide extra-curricular programming and community outreach related to Information Literacy topics.
- Partner with outside specialists and institutions, such as journalists and public libraries.
- Collect, curate, maintain, and ensure equitable access to diverse, relevant, and high-quality resources.
- Model and advocate for high standards of Information Literacy.

## SUPPORTS NEEDED

- A mandate (ideally, at the federal level; alternatively, in every state) requiring adequate staffing of public schools with highly qualified certified librarians. Such mandate(s) should be enforced, and accompanied by adequate and equitable funding provisions.
- MLS and/or school library certification training that includes coursework not only in Information Literacy, but in communication, marketing/advocacy, pedagogy, and child/adolescent development.
- Accurate means for collecting and accessing data regarding school librarians and the impact and efficacy of Information Literacy instruction.
- Clear, reasonable, and practicable job descriptions for school librarians, with Information Literacy instruction identified as a priority.
- Paraprofessional support, with boundaries established between the duties of the library aide and the certified school librarian. Paraprofessionals should never be employed in lieu of a certified school librarian (just as a paraprofessional would never be employed in lieu of any other certified teacher).
- Strong support and follow-through from building and district administrators, school boards, and state and national education departments for well designed K-12 cross-curricular Information Literacy programs.
- Opportunities and ample time for collaboration with teachers and administrators.
- Access to and funding for professional development and conferences relating to Information Literacy.

# The Role of the Academic Librarian in Combating Mis/Disinformation

Academic librarians have been on the front lines of combating misinformation and disinformation online since at least the 1990s. Once the Internet and social media became ubiquitous on college and university campuses, librarians began partnering with faculty to combat the misinformation and plagiarism that proliferated in student work. The work of academic librarians and their collaborations with faculty have been built on Information Literacy instruction, a set of abilities that have seen a renewed focus in the college and university classroom and in re-accreditation standards.

Academic librarians brought Information Literacy into the higher education conversation in 2000 with the publication of "Information Literacy Competency Standards for Higher Education" by the Association of College & Research Libraries (ACRL). This document was revised in 2016 and became "Framework for Information Literacy for Higher Education." An additional document of note by ACRL is "Characteristics of Programs of Information Literacy that Illustrate Best Practices: A Guideline," published in 2019, which highlights curriculum planning and pedagogy as hallmarks of effective Information Literacy programs.

While many colleges and universities have skilled librarians ready to teach Information Literacy concepts, those same institutions lack programmatic and curricular structures necessary to fulfill those missions. Information Literacy in practice is often reduced to a few in-person class sessions; the idealized vision of an Information Literate student can never be accomplished in one class session presented on an ad-hoc basis. This is too often the case on college campuses, where individual faculty interest, course content, and time allotment all compete to determine if a student receives Information Literacy instruction at all during their college career. An information literate community will not happen without intervention and design.

Higher administrators, faculty, library leadership, and librarians all hope that our students leave college as critically-minded, thoughtful, and empathetic individuals with strong Information Literacy skills. To achieve this, students deserve a college program that teaches, challenges, and evolves right alongside the world around them.

## HOW ACADEMIC LIBRARIANS COMBAT MIS/DISINFORMATION

As the "Age of Mis/Disinformation" dawned on campuses, the role for librarians became more critical, but it has not created more resources in order for librarians to meet these new expectations. We urge academic library leadership to advocate for strong programs and the proper labor to achieve this goal. These efforts of intervention require concentrated and unimpeded staff time, and it requires that librarians on staff are connecting directly with faculty to build buy-in across campus. It is therefore the responsibility of library leadership to create these avenues for librarians to reach faculty and for information literacy efforts to reach higher administration. Questions academic librarians face now include how to integrate Information Literacy concepts into a curriculum to reach the widest audience possible, and how to evaluate effectiveness to improve instruction in order to be accountable to the academic community.

Recommendations for recognizing, reinforcing and elevating academic librarians' role in combating mis/ disinformation:

- Academic librarians become the front-line instructor of Information Literacy and evaluation concepts.
- Academic librarians partner with campus stakeholders to embed Information Literacy and evaluation across the curriculum in strategic ways, designed in collaboration with teaching faculty.
- Academic libraries teach the ethical use of information as an outgrowth of their responsibility to help faculty create a culture of academic honesty.

After three decades of work, the role of academic librarians still is in dispute. For us to be the most effective in teaching Information Literacy to college and university students and combating mis/ disinformation, the following is critical:

- 1. Recognize academic librarians as scholars who possess the necessary pedagogical skills to teach Information Literacy to higher education students.
- 2. Embed instruction by academic librarians into existing classes while sequencing Information Literacy sessions to build on each other into a cohesive program.
- 3. Partner with faculty on campus committees to integrate into the curriculum so that students recognize Information Literacy as a necessary skill set across disciplines.
- 4. Ensure librarian students receive adequate pedagogical and curriculum development training in graduate school.
- 5. Teach students how to recognize authority, recency, and the inherent bias in most information as well as the importance of seeking out and listening to multiple voices for understanding.
- 6. Assess the effectiveness of the Information Literacy program. Has there been growth in students' abilities and how is it demonstrated?

## SUPPORTS NEEDED

- Better pedagogical and curriculum training for librarians in graduate school.
- Institutional buy-in on the importance of Information Literacy training and evaluation to improve student success and to graduate better citizens.
- Faculty buy-in on librarians as teaching partners in the classroom.
- Mandatory Information Literacy education across all disciplines.
- Better evaluation tools to demonstrate program effectiveness.
- Dedicated librarian instructors to handle class load.
- Periodical professional development training pertaining to disinformation.

# The Role of a Special Librarian in Combating Mis/Disinformation

Like other library types, special libraries are responsible for accommodating the information needs of their community. The primary distinctions between special libraries and school/public/academic libraries are accessibility to the public and purpose. Due to their narrow focus on supporting organizational objectives and the professionals working for them, special libraries do not encounter disinformation or misinformation in the same magnitude as other libraries. Conspiracy theories and politics are rarely discussed in these spaces unless there is an organizational/professional need to study them.

However, there are situations where patrons ask for research assistance to find information that confirms their own biases on a subject as opposed to considering multiple viewpoints. These types of questions can be problematic to data and information-driven organizations because fulfilling one's own agenda can steer them in the wrong direction when it comes to decision making. It's also problematic for professional libraries because the research services they provide could be used to build on knowledge in that profession. That knowledge could be in the form of a narrowly-scoped research paper that cites nothing but sources to strengthen a biased argument.

#### HOW SPECIAL LIBRARIANS COMBAT MIS/DISINFORMATION

- Deeming social media posts by themselves as unreliable information sources There's been a
  lot of discussion on how misinformation is distributed via social media platforms. Many special
  libraries are fortunate in this regard because they do not entertain social media posts as valid
  sources of information, nor do their patrons expect them to do so. Special libraries typically refer
  users to items in their collections, eJournal databases, reputable think tanks, policy centers, etc.
  It's always possible that a patron asks a librarian for help finding information about a topic based
  on something they might have seen on social media. Therefore, a special librarian's role will be to
  see if there is any scholarly information addressing that social media post, so long as the post was
  relevant to their research as a professional.
- Advocating for the licensing and use of credible information resources e.g., Database collections, peer-reviewed material, research-based journal articles, and government publications. In summaries or abstracts of information prepared for "customers" or patrons, special librarians provide context and typically cite the sources they've found while preparing such summaries.

• Taking a bold/tough stance as information professionals when addressing mis/disinformation and bias - Because special librarians are able to work more closely with their patrons, a sense of trust and respect for the profession becomes fostered. This empowers special librarians to respectfully question or call out the biases that the research question presents.

#### SUPPORTS NEEDED

- Competency in digital literacy, through MLIS programs or professional development training.
- Competency in data literacy, through MLIS programs or professional development training. (e.g. Ted Talk 3 Ways to Spot a Bad Statistic)
- Similar to recommending school library training, special librarians would also benefit from training in pedagogy, communication, marketing, and advocacy. Though special librarians may find it easier to foster conversations with patrons than other types, constant development of these three practices strengthen the impact of services.

## **Thought Leaders**



**Samantha Alfrey** (she/her/hers) is an academic librarian in Los Angeles. She has ten years of experience in libraries, focusing her efforts in information literacy, with focus on news media and visual information. She has her MS in Library and Information Science from University of Illinois Urbana-Champaign, MA in Art History from University of Illinois at Chicago, and a BA in International Political Economy and Art History from Fordham University. She currently works at Occidental College in the Center for Digital Liberal Arts, serves as a directorat-large on CARL (California Academic Research Libraries), and is a steering committee member on ILiADS (Institute for Liberal Arts Digital Scholarship).



**Susan Anderson** (she/her/hers) is currently the Director of the Redondo Beach Public Library. She graduated with a degree in Sociology from The Colorado College in 1992 and received her Master of Library and Information Science degree from the University of Texas at Austin. She has worked in public libraries for over twenty years, gaining experience in everything from children's services to technical services. She also served in the United States Peace Corps as a librarian in the country of Botswana in Southern Africa. After serving as the Managing Librarian for Centralized Selection at Austin Public Library, she became the manager of the West Hollywood Library, part of the County of Los Angeles Public Library system, and opened the new West Hollywood Library building in 2011. She has been the Director of Redondo Beach Public Library since 2014. She has recently paid a lot more attention to the state of the media and the problem of misinformation.



Maggie Bokelman (she/her/hers) is a school librarian and digital literacy instructor at Eagle View Middle School in the Cumberland Valley School District, Mechanicsburg, Pennsylvania. She holds an M.A. in English from Temple University, an M.A. in Library and Information Studies from the University of Wisconsin, and an M.A. in Children's Literature from Hollins University. A frequent presenter at local and national library, education, and children's literature conferences, Maggie enjoys researching and writing about children's literature, technology, and information literacy. Maggie has served as an adjunct instructor at Penn State Harrisburg and Millersville University and provides professional development for teachers. She has a special interest in poetry for children, and chaired the Lee Bennett Hopkins Poetry Award committee. Maggie is dedicated to increasing equity in public schools, and serves on various committees related to social justice initiatives in her district, in the Cumberland Valley Education Association, and in the Pennsylvania School Library Association.



Collis Crews (he/him/his) received his Bachelors in History at North Carolina A&T State University in 2012 and a Masters in Library & Information Science at Wayne State University in 2020. He brings five years of experience serving in government libraries, starting as a contractor at the Library of Congress assisting with map digitization to increase accessibility for federal partners. After a year, Collis went on to serve in other federal agencies, where he managed interlibrary loan services and discovered his passion for reference and research. This led to a role that assisted national security professionals in developing strategies for navigating commercial and internal databases to satisfy their information needs. He is currently serving as a member of the Department of State's team of research librarians tasked with conducting searches of the Department's official records to respond to Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) requests from the public. Outside of his day job, Collis is a member of the American Libraries Association (ALA), Reference & User Services Association (RUSA), and the Black Caucus of the American Libraries Association (BCALA). As a resident of Silver Spring, MD, he also serves as secretary of the Library Advisory Committee for the Marilyn Praisner Library Branch; part of the Montgomery County Public Library System (MCPLS).



Jim Duncan (he/him/his) is Executive Director of the Colorado Library Consortium (CLiC), a small but mighty non-profit organization with a statewide reach, serving ALL types and sizes of libraries. He often advocates for, and speaks about, how Colorado libraries bring incredible value to their communities. In 2011 he was named a "Mover & Shaker" by Library Journal in the Community Builder category, and in 2019 was presented with ALA's John Phillip Immroth Memorial Award for his work defending intellectual freedom. You can find more detail about Jim's 26-year career on LinkedIn. https://www.linkedin.com/in/ jamesmduncan/



**Natalie Caula Hauff** (she/her/hers) is the Deputy Director of Charleston County Public Library overseeing Innovation. She has spent the last five years working in governmental and library public relations and the last two years in library administration overseeing the operations of community engagement, programming, outreach, data management and communications for the Charleston County Public Library. Natalie is a former journalist who spent nearly eight years covering news in Charleston, SC. She worked at the Post and Courier Newspaper and WCIV-TV as a reporter and was awarded the Pulitzer Prize in 2015 for her work on a series about domestic violence. Previously, she was also a reporter for Mid-Florida Public Radio. She currently serves on the board of directors of My Sister's House, a non-profit organization aimed at breaking the cycle of domestic violence in the tri-county area of Charleston, as well as the Black Ink Charleston Book Festival Committee.



**Dr. Ling Hwey Jeng** (she/her/hers) is professor and director of Texas Woman's University School of Library and Information Studies. She is a recipient of four federal research and training grants throughout her career, totaling more than two million in funding including the current project Transforming Libraries into Community Anchors in Rural Texas, funded by Institute of Museum and Library Services. Her research and teaching focus on Asset-Based Community Development and Collective Impact. She has served on elective and appointed positions at American Library Association and Texas Library Association, and is the president of Texas Library Association for 2017-2018 when her presidential theme is community engagement. Dr. Jeng is actively engaged in local community, most recently co-chairing the United Way of Denton County (UWDC) Community Needs Assessment Project and serving as a member of the Denton County Workforce Success Leadership Team.



**Paris Kelvakis** (he/him/his) is the Children's Librarian at the Wai'anae branch of the Hawaii State Public Library System. Paris is originally from Minneapolis, Minnesota. He graduated with a degree in English from Hamline University in St. Paul in 2012 and received his MLIS from St. Catherine University in 2015. Paris previously worked as a Youth Librarian for Hennepin County Libraries before moving to Oahu in January 2020. He has a background in theater and performance poetry, chaired the 2017 Kerlan Award Committee for the CLRC at the University of Minnesota, and was a member of the 2020 ALSC Institute Task Force. He enjoys games, sour candies, and dismantling traditional constructions of masculinity, especially in regards to youth literacy.



Alexandra Loewen (she/her/hers) enjoyed a career in business in positions such as a brand manager, sponsorship marketer, and events producer, before pursuing her second career in librarianship. She recently graduated with a Master of Library and Information Science (MLIS) degree from Indiana University—Purdue University Indianapolis. An active member of professional library associations including the American Library Association and the Special Libraries Association, she currently serves as a volunteer on two committees within these associations. She volunteers in a branch of the Indianapolis Public Library, and as an advisor/ coach to a high school DECA chapter. She serves on the Advisory Board of the Library and Information Science Department of Indiana University—Purdue University Indianapolis. Her passions for media literacy and information literacy were initially sparked by her experience working in consumer marketing and advertising, and she now hopes to contribute to these areas within librarianship.



**Ross Mays** (he/him/his) is a Reference Librarian at Denver Public Library in Colorado. Previously he was the Reference Services Supervisor at Terrebonne Parish Library in Houma, Louisiana. Ross holds an MA in Psychology as well as an MLIS, and his professional interests as a public library reference librarian include promoting information literacy, media literacy, and science literacy to library patrons and the general public. In 2016 Ross helped create a public program at DPL called How To Spot Fake News, which has also been presented for many local organizations around Denver. In 2020 he helped develop and present a 2-part class with PEN America called Media Literacy in the Disinformation Age.



**Fabio Montella** (he/him/his) is an Assistant Professor of Library Services and an Adjunct Professor of History at Suffolk County Community College. He is an Open SUNY Online Teaching Ambassador for Excellence and a Grant recipient of the 2015 NEH/ALA Latino Americans: 500 Years of History. Fabio holds an MLIS from Long Island University, an MA in History from Stony Brook University and an MA in Learning and Emerging Technology from SUNY Empire State College. He is also a graduate of the Quality Matters Teaching Online Certificate Program. Currently, Fabio teaches an Introduction to College Research Course and several history courses, all of which are taught in both online and face-to-face modalities.

Fabio is a proponent of the community of inquiry (COI) framework and values its social constructivist model of learning. Fabio utilizes the COI framework in conjunction with the ACRL Framework for Information Literacy to effectively address the issues of disinformation in an information-saturated age. Fabio's current projects include the study of Virtual Reality as a means to both inform and disinform, the design of embedded and collaborative information literacy practices, and the history of baseball on Long Island and its connections to the era of segregated professional baseball.



Marlon Moore (he/him/his) holds a Bachelor's Degree in Music from The Florida State University and is currently pursuing a Master of Science in Information Degree at Florida State University. He has helped develop system-wide library initiatives such as adult computer classes, robotics programs, Hackathons at the Library, drone education classes, immersive spatial computing technology throughout Miami-Dade County Libraries, and college and career opportunities for teens. His work has supported the Miami-Dade Public Library System in receiving five National Association of Counties (NACo) Awards in 2013, 2017, 2018 and 2019 for YOUmedia Miami, YOUmake Miami, the Technobus and the Coworking Center, as well as the Climate of Art Program, and the 2019 FLA Library Innovation Award for the MDPLS Technobus. In 2020, Mr. Moore's work supported the Miami-Dade Public Library in receiving the 2020 Urban Library Council National Innovation Award for Community Engagement, with the Climate of Art Program.



**Olanike Oladunni Olaniyi** (she/her/hers) is a Diversity Fellow at Indianapolis Public Library (IndyPL). She has served in the position as Children Librarian, Digital Project Librarian and currently as Assistant Collection Librarian. In the current position she is working on the diversity audit of the IndyPL collection which includes book-by-book review/assessment of library resources starting from branch level. She currently serves on the Indiana Library Federation Adhoc Committee on Racial Justice and Inclusion. She is a member of BCALA and IRRT of American Library Association. She volunteers as a Natural Helper with Immigrant Welcome Center of Indianapolis and also member of education committee of Impact 100 Greater Indianapolis.



**Randall Schroeder** (he/him/his) has been a professional librarian for 33 years. A graduate of the University of Iowa library and information science program, he started as a reference/instructional librarian at Augustana College in Illinois and later became the Coordinator of Information Literacy Across the Curriculum program at Wartburg College in Iowa, where he earlier received his Bachelor of Arts in history and journalism. He has published and presented widely in the area of information literacy instruction and assessment for colleges, particularly first-year students. His latest publication explored partnerships of student affairs and diversity offices with the library for student success. Lately, he experienced community librarianship as director of a rural public library. Schroeder started as a newspaper journalist and high school history teacher in Iowa and Wisconsin. He is a part-owner of the Green Bay Packers and a citizen archivist volunteer with the National Archives.



Jessie Stoner (she/her/hers) has been working in libraries for nine years. She has worked in academic, public, and special libraries and is currently working in a technical library for science and engineering, providing reference and research services. She holds a BA in Interdisciplinary Studies from the University of Central Florida and is completing her MLIS at San Jose State University. She is an ALA member and member of her local Women in Science and Engineering (WiSE) group. Jessie is passionate about the subject of misinformation and has been using interdisciplinary research to investigate this challenging issue and to consider innovative and creative solutions that libraries can employ to help mitigate its negative effects through education and service to the community.

## **References Cited in the Introduction**

- Abernathy, P.M. (2018). The loss of local news: What it means for communities. The Expanding News Desert. Center for Innovation and Sustainability in Local Media, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. <u>https://www.usnewsdeserts.com/reports/expanding-news-desert/loss-of-local-news/</u>
- Brenan, M. (2020). Americans remain distrustful of mass media. Gallup. <u>https://news.gallup.com/poll/321116/americans-remain-distrustful-mass-media.aspx</u>
- Geiger, A.W. (2017). Most Americans especially Millennials say libraries can help them find reliable, trustworthy information. Pew Research Center. <u>https://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2017/08/30/most-americans-especially-millennials-say-libraries-can-help-them-find-reliable-trustworthy-information/</u>
- Horrigan, J.B. (2016). Americans' attitudes toward public libraries. Pew Research Center. <u>https://www.pewresearch.org/internet/2016/09/09/americans-attitudes-toward-public-libraries/</u>
- Merriam-Webster. (n.d.). Disinformation. *Merriam-Webster.com dictionary*. <u>https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/disinformation</u>
- Merriam-Webster. (n.d.). Misinformation. *Merriam-Webster.com dictionary*. <u>https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/misinformation</u>
- Takenaga, L. (2019, December 21). More than 1 in 5 U.S. papers has closed. This is the result. *The New York Times*. <u>https://www.nytimes.com/2019/12/21/reader-center/local-news-deserts.html</u>
- Warzel, C. (2021, February 18). Don't go down the rabbit hole. *The New York Times*. https://www.nytimes.com/2021/02/18/opinion/fake-news-media-attention.html
- Young, J.C., Boyd, B., Yefimova, K., Wedlake, S., Coward, C., & Hapel, R. (2020). The role of libraries in misinformation programming: A research agenda. *Journal of Librarianship and Information Science*. doi.org/10.1177/0961000620966650

Cover photo credit: "People Sitting Inside Well Lit Room," Pixabay, licensed under CCO.

#### Resources

#### INTRODUCTION

Librarians have a growing list of tools and resources to assist the public with navigating misinformation. This resource list provides practical tools to help people evaluate information as well as articles providing a deeper understanding of the current information ecosystem.

Resources are grouped into sections including fact-checking and media bias resources, Information Literacy skills, and educational resources. This list also includes several ideas for programming and engagement as well as resources that facilitate the identification of common ground. We also offer a list of organizations that libraries can partner with for support and assistance in combating disinformation. Finally, the selected articles and books provide a solid foundational understanding of disinformation, which is essential in order to effectively counter it.

As librarians, we believe that the teaching of information literacy skills is crucial for all ages and will help individuals recognize and resist mis/disinformation. It is our hope that these resources will lead to a more informed, more discerning and more knowledgeable citizenry.

#### **RESOURCES FOR PATRONS AND LIBRARY STAFF**

This chart contains many valuable tools and websites devoted to fact checking, examining media bias, and reverse image searching, in addition to organizations that provide support, education, and additional tools for media literacy. Also included are courses and curricula—for all ages—designed to improve individuals' abilities to identify and think critically about misinformation. Because no single source can thoroughly cover today's information landscape, we recommend that library staff and the public become familiar with multiple resources.

Fact-Checking Sites	Media Bias Rating Sites	Information/Media Literacy Organizations				
Associated Press Fact Check <u>https://apnews.com/hub/ap-</u> <u>fact-check</u>	Ad Fontes Media <u>https://www.adfontesmedia.</u> <u>com/</u>	Center for an Informed Public. University of Washington <u>https://www.cip.uw.edu/</u>				
The Dispatch Fact Check <u>https://factcheck.thedispatch.</u> <u>com/</u>	AllSides <u>https://www.allsides.com/</u> <u>unbiased-balanced-news</u>	National Association for Media Literacy Education <u>https://namle.net</u>				
FactCheck https://www.factcheck.org/	Media Bias Fact Check <u>https://mediabiasfactcheck.com/</u>	News Literacy Project <u>https://newslit.org/</u>				
Lead Stories <u>https://leadstories.com/</u>	Ground.news <u>https://ground.news/</u>	MediaWise <u>https://www.poynter.org/</u> <u>mediawise/</u>				
Politifact https://www.politifact.com/	Reverse Image Search Engines and other Fact-checking Tools	PEN America. Knowing the News <u>https://pen.org/knowing-the-</u> <u>news-media-literacy-project/</u>				
Reuters Fact Check <u>https://www.reuters.com/fact-</u> <u>check</u>	First Draft Fact-Checking Toolkit <u>https://start.me/p/vjv80b/first-</u> <u>draft-basic-toolkit</u>	Media Literacy Now https://medialiteracynow.org/				
Snopes https://www.snopes.com/	Google Images (Searchable in Chrome by right-clicking on images)	Courses and Curricula				
Truth or Fiction https://www.truthorfiction.com/	TinEye <u>https://tineye.com/</u>	Checkology https://get.checkology.org				
USA Today Fact <u>https://www.usatoday.com/</u> <u>news/factcheck/</u>	Media Literacy Tools <u>https://padlet.com/</u> <u>mvergult2020/</u> jklol46hyzucpuhb	Civic Online Reasoning https://cor.stanford.edu/				
Washington Post Factchecker <u>https://www.washingtonpost.</u> <u>com/news/fact-checker/</u>	Tools That Fight Disinformation <u>https://www.rand.org/research/</u> <u>projects/truth-decay/fighting-</u> <u>disinformation/search.html</u>	Crash Course Media Literacy Series <u>https://www.youtube.com/play-</u> list?list=PL8dPuuaLjXtM6jSpzb- 5gMNsx9kdmqBfmY				

## GENERAL RESOURCES FOR INFORMATION LITERACY

The following resources provide general information about information and media literacy. Educational resources, handbooks, guides, and infographics are included in this list, in addition to library associations' statements and resolutions on the mis/disinformation issue.

• American Library Association (2005) Resolution on Disinformation, Media Manipulation and the Destruction of Public Information (2004-2005 ALA CD #64):

"Whereas inaccurate information, distortions of truth, deliberate deceptions, excessive limitations on access and the removal or destruction of information in the public domain are anathema to the ethics of librarianship and to the functioning of a healthy democracy..." ALA, The American Library Association's "Core Values of Librarianship."

- American Library Association. (2017, January 24). *Resolution on access to accurate information*. <u>http://www.ala.org/advocacy/intfreedom/statementspols/ifresolutions/accurateinformation</u>.
- American Library Association. (2019, March 18). *Evaluating information*. <u>https://libguides.ala.org/</u> InformationEvaluation/Overview\_
- Association of College & Research Libraries. (2000). *Information literacy competency standards for higher education*. American Library Association Institutional Repository. <u>https://alair.ala.org/handle/11213/7668</u>
- Association of College & Research Libraries. (2016, January 11). *Framework for information literacy for higher education*. <u>http://www.ala.org/acrl/standards/ilframework</u>
- Caulfield, M. (2018, September 14). A short history of CRAAP. Hapgood. https://hapgood.us/2018/09/14/a-short-history-of-craap/
- Caulfield, M. (2019, June 19). *SIFT (The four moves)*. Hapgood. <u>https://hapgood.us/2019/06/19/</u> <u>sift-the-four-moves/</u>
- Chalabi, M. (2017, February). 3 ways to spot a bad statistic [Video]. TED. <u>https://www.ted.com/talks/mona\_chalabi\_3\_ways\_to\_spot\_a\_bad\_statistic</u>
- Coleman, K. (2021, January 25). Introducing Birdwatch, a community-based approach to misinformation. Twitter. <u>https://blog.twitter.com/en\_us/topics/product/2021/introducing-birdwatch-a-community-based-approach-to-misinformation.html</u>
- Cooke, N. [Programming Librarian]. (2017, August 23). Post truth: Fake news and a new era of information literacy [Video]. YouTube. <u>https://youtu.be/7Wp4eZr0d7g</u>
- Elk Grove Unified School District. (2018). *The ART of reading laterally* [Infographic]. <u>https://drive.google.com/file/d/1SMh6xuKdo9ESxSryDvTfWILuMh8zcMhr/view</u>
- First Draft. <u>https://firstdraftnews.org/research/</u>

- International Federation of Library Associations and Institutions. (2005, November 9). Beacons
  of the information society: The Alexandria Proclamation on information literacy and lifelong learning.
  <a href="https://www.ifla.org/publications/beacons-of-the-information-society-the-alexandria-proclamation-on-information-literacy">https://www.ifla.org/publications/beacons-of-the-information-society-the-alexandria-proclamation-society-the-alexandria-proclamation-on-information-literacy</a>
- International Federation of Library Associations and Institutions. (n.d.). How to spot fake news [Infographic]. <u>https://www.ifla.org/files/assets/hq/topics/info-society/images/how\_to\_spot\_fake\_news.pdf</u>
- Lewandowsky, S., Cook, J., Ecker, U. K. H., Albarracín, D., Amazeen, M. A., Kendeou, P., Lombardi, D., Newman, E. J., Pennycook, G., Porter, E., Rand, D. G., Rapp, D. N., Reifler, J., Roozenbeek, J., Schmid, P., Seifert, C. M., Sinatra, G. M., Swire-Thompson, B., van der Linden, S., Vraga, E. K., Wood, T. J., & Zaragoza, M. S. (2020). *The debunking handbook 2020*. Center for Climate Change Communication. DOI:10.17910/b7.1182 https://www.climatechangecommunication.org/debunking-handbook-2020/
- Library of Congress. (2018, May 9). *Disinformation & the threat to democracy* [Video]. Library of Congress. <u>https://www.loc.gov/item/webcast-8541/</u>
- Library of Congress Law. (2019, April). *Initiatives to Counter Fake News*. <u>https://www.loc.gov/law/help/fake-news/index.php</u>
- Media Education Lab, University of Rhode Island. <u>https://mediaeducationlab.com/</u>
- Meriam Library, California State University, Chico. (2010). *Evaluating information—Applying the CRAAP test*. <u>https://library.csuchico.edu/help/source-or-information-good</u>
- Nijhuis, M. (2014, April 29). The pocket guide to bullshit prevention. *The Last Word on Nothing*. <u>https://www.lastwordonnothing.com/2014/04/29/the-pocket-guide-to-bullshit-prevention/</u>
- Pacific Library Partnership. (n.d.). *News literacy toolkit*. <u>https://www.plpinfo.org/news-literacy-toolkit/</u>
- Programming Librarian. (2020). <u>https://programminglibrarian.org/learn</u>
- The Propwatch Project. <u>https://www.propwatch.org</u>
- Radom, R. (2017, February 16). *Evaluating information sources using the 5 Ws*. Howard Community College. <u>https://howardcc.instructure.com/courses/928697/modules/items/10762904</u>
- Tanner, K. & McPhee, K. (2015). A new approach to evaluating information: A reflection on RADAR. Western Libraries Presentations. <u>https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1050&context=wlpres</u>
- Three Rivers College. (2021). *Critical Information & Media Literacy*. <u>https://library.trcc.edu/crit-info-lit</u>
- The White House. (2009, October 1). *Presidential proclamation national information literacy awareness month*. Obama White House Archives. <u>https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/the-press-office/presidential-proclamation-national-information-literacy-awareness-month</u>

## K-12 SCHOOL LIBRARY RESOURCES

Specific to K-12 school libraries, these resources include research, lesson plans, handouts, videos, blogs, tips, and training for all grade levels.

- ADL. (2021). Outsmarting Propaganda : Combating the Lure of Extremist Recruitment Strategies. Accessed on February 20, 2021 <u>https://www.adl.org/education/educator-resources/</u><u>lesson-plans/outsmarting-propaganda-combatting-the-lure-of-extremist</u>
- Baker, F. (2019). Real Media Literacy: Spotting a Fake News Story. MiddleWeb. <u>https://www.middleweb.com/40839/real-media-literacy-spotting-a-fake-story/?fbclid=IwAROw</u> <u>TzJ1kG59kHN8aJTcoSwfOZzZ8HaGGUGrOZM2pKgDWZ-dIJDL-9MWhSw</u>
- BBC Learning and Microsoft Education. My World Cultivating media literacy skills. <u>https://www.microsoft.com/en-us/education/myworld</u>
- Center for Media Literacy. <u>http://www.medialit.org/about-cml</u>
- Common Sense Media. Topic: News & Media Literacy. https://www.commonsense.org/education/digital-citizenship/curriculum
- Factitious. (2018). <u>http://factitious.augamestudio.com/#/</u>
- Honner, P. (2020). Dangerous Numbers? Teaching about Data and Statistics Using the Coronavirus Outbreak. The New York Times. <u>https://www.nytimes.com/2020/02/27/learning/</u> <u>dangerous-numbers-teaching-about-data-and-statistics-using-the-coronavirus-outbreak.</u> <u>html?action=click&module=RelatedLinks&pgtype=Article</u>
- KQED. Youth Media. <u>https://www.kqed.org/education/youth-media</u>
- Lance, K. C. (2020). School Library Studies. https://keithcurrylance.com/school-library-impact-studies/
- Learning for Justice. (2020). Digital Literacy. https://www.learningforjustice.org/frameworks/digital-literacy
- News Literacy Project. (2021). The Sift. <u>https://newslit.org/subscribe/</u>
- PBS. News and Media Literacy Collection. https://witf.pbslearningmedia.org/collection/newsandmedialiteracy/
- Project Look Sharp. <u>https://www.projectlooksharp.org/</u>
- Thomas, N.P., et al. (2020). Information Literacy and Information Skills Instruction: New Directions for School Libraries. 4th ed. Libraries Unlimited.
- University of Michigan Center for Research on Learning and Teaching. (2020). Guidelines for Discussing Difficult or High-Stakes Topics. <u>https://crlt.umich.edu/publinks/generalguidelines</u>

• Valenza, J. (2016). Truth, Truthiness, Triangulation: A New Literacy Toolkit for a "Post-Truth" World. School Library Journal. <u>http://blogs.slj.com/neverendingsearch/2016/11/26/truth-truthiness-triangulation-and-the-librarian-way-a-news-literacy-toolkit-for-a-post-truth-world/</u>

#### AMERICAN LIBRARY ASSOCIATION RESOURCES

The following are selected information and media literacy resources from the American Library Association, including books, e-courses, posters, and guides. Please note: Some resources are available to the general public; others may be available only to ALA members.

#### **Free Resources**

- Community Relationships. <u>http://www.ala.org/tools/librariestransform/community</u>
- Media Literacy @ Your Library.
   <u>http://www.ala.org/tools/programming/media-literacy-your-library</u>
- Media Literacy Education in Libraries for Adult Audiences. <u>http://www.ala.org/tools/programming/MediaLiteracy</u>
- Media Literacy in the Library: A Guide for Library Practitioners. <u>http://www.ala.org/tools/sites/ala.org.tools/files/content/%21%20Media-Lit\_Prac-Guide\_FINALWEB\_112020\_0.pdf</u>

#### **Paid Resources**

- Information Literacy Poster. <u>https://www.alastore.ala.org/content/information-literacy-poster</u>
- Engaging your Community Through Active Strategic Marketing by Terry Kendrick. <u>https://www.alastore.ala.org/content/engaging-your-community-through-active-strategic-marketing</u>
- Fighting Fake News With Information Literacy eCourse by Melissa Mallon & Megan Mallon. https://www.alastore.ala.org/content/fighting-fake-news-information-literacy-ecourse
- Framing Information Literacy: Teaching Grounded in Theory, Pedagogy, and Practice by Mary Oberlies & Janna Mattson. <u>https://www.alastore.ala.org/content/framing-information-literacy-pil73-teaching-grounded-theory-pedagogy-and-practice-6-volume</u>
- Metaliteracy in a Connected World: Developing Learners as Producers by Thomas Mackey & Trudi Jacobson. <u>https://www.alastore.ala.org/mlitproducers</u>
- The Critical Thinking about Sources Cookbook by Sarah Morris. <u>https://www.alastore.ala.org/</u> <u>content/critical-thinking-about-sources-cookbook%E2%80%94eeditions-pdf-e-book</u>

## **PROGRAMMING & ENGAGEMENT OPPORTUNITIES**

The following articles describe programs, events, and opportunities for engagement that libraries could adapt for their own communities. These possible program ideas include finding common ground among diverse beliefs, educational programs, the use of games in education, possible funding opportunities, and social media engagement.

- Giangreco, L. (2020). Across the country, liberals and conservatives are coming together at moderated dinners to understand each other better. The Washington Post Magazine. <u>https://www.washingtonpost.com/lifestyle/magazine/across-the-country-liberals-andconservatives-are-coming-together-at-moderated-dinners-to-understand-each-other-better/20 20/02/20/7b393b4a-4143-11ea-aa6a-083d01b3ed18\_story.html
  </u>
  - The article provides examples of an event where people with differing political viewpoints come together at a dinner and talk about things people from the opposing side would be surprised to know about them. Participants bring an item to share that tells their story. The event is steered by unbiased moderators and is meant to help bring back civil discourse.
- Holt, K. (2021). Google commits \$3 million to fight COVID-19 misinformation. <u>https://www.engadget.com/google-covid-19-vaccine-misinformation-funding-google-news-initiative-185810729.html</u>
  - Google Money: If part of your response to the "How do you..." question in this forum is that your library requires more funding to combat misinformation, you might find this initiative very interesting. What is the librarian's role in securing and utilizing funds to find common ground in shared facts?
- Mackintosh, E. (2019). Finland is winning the war on fake news. What it's learned may be crucial to Western democracy. CNN. <u>https://edition.cnn.com/interactive/2019/05/europe/finland-fake-news-intl/</u>
  - This CNN Special Report details the initiatives taken by Finland to educate citizens on the threat of disinformation and how to effectively counter it. Libraries could employ many of these initiatives.
- Minkovsky, N. (2018). For the love of libraries: How libraries use content to tell new stories. Content Marketing Institute. <u>https://contentmarketinginstitute.com/2018/02/libraries-content-stories/</u>
  - This article is not about misinformation but it is about engagement through social media campaigns and how important they are in library strategies. These social media campaigns could be used to target misinformation.
    - A great example of a great social media campaign is what the Steak-Umm Twitter account has been up to this past year. Every time I see the account tweet a thoughtful analysis I think, "Maybe we should be the ones doing this..." <u>https://twitter.com/steak\_umm/status/1336348473713680385</u>

- Roozenbeek, J., van der Linden, S., & Nygren, T. (2020). Prebunking interventions based on "inoculation" theory can reduce susceptibility to misinformation across cultures. Harvard Kennedy School Misinformation Review, 1(2). <u>https://misinforeview.hks.harvard.edu/article/global-vaccination-badnews/</u>
  - This study shows that teaching people how to create and disseminate mis/disinformation in a game scenario helped them recognize those same tactics in the real world, suggesting that the use of this game and teaching general propaganda techniques early would be helpful.
- Smith, Maribeth D. (2017). Arming students against bad information. Phi Delta Kappan, 99(3), 56-58. <u>https://kappanonline.org/smith-arming-students-against-bad-information/</u>
  - This article suggests that school teachers for all subjects should partner with librarians to create plans for Information Literacy evaluation skills that allow students to practice these important skills.
- Woodworth, A. (2018). My body is ready: Best practices for using memes on library social media. Reference & User Services Quarterly, 58(2). <u>https://journals.ala.org/index.php/rusq/article/view/6928/9355</u>
  - Best practices for using memes on social media for engagement as part of your library's social media strategy.

## RESOURCES FOR DEVELOPING AND STRENGTHENING PARTNERSHIPS

Partnerships can provide crucial support and additional resources for libraries in the fight against disinformation. Your library may consider exploring a partnership with these organizations.

- Africa Library & Information Association & Institutions <u>https://web.aflia.net/about-aflia/</u>
- Braver Angels <u>https://braverangels.org/</u>
- Civic Health Project <u>https://www.civichealthproject.org/</u>
- Living Room Conversations <u>https://livingroomconversations.org/</u>
- The National Digital Inclusion Alliance <u>https://www.digitalinclusion.org/</u>
- News Guard <u>https://www.newsguardtech.com/news-literacy/</u>
- OpenMind <u>https://openmindplatform.org/</u>
- Poynter Institute <u>https://www.poynter.org/</u>

#### **RESOURCES FOR FINDING COMMON GROUND**

The first step for finding a shared truth within a community is to establish common ground. These resources provide a framework that can facilitate healthy civic discourse between polarized groups.

- Benson, B. (2019). Why are we yelling? The art of productive disagreement. Portfolio.
- Block, P. (2018). Community: The structure of belonging. (2nd ed.). Berrett-Koehler Publishers.
- Fournier, M.D. & Ostman, S. (2021). Ask, listen, empower: Grounding your library work in community engagement. ALA Public Programs Office.
- Greater Good Science Center. (2020). Bridging differences playbook. <u>https://greatergood.berkeley.edu/images/uploads/Bridging\_Differences\_Playbook-Final.pdf?</u> <u>ga=2.33030392.776663338.1604415157-255958577.1604060842</u>
- Headlee, C. (2017). We need to talk. Harper Wave.
- Heterodox Academy. (2020). <u>https://heterodoxacademy.org/tools-and-resources/</u>
- The Hidden Tribes of America. (2018). <u>https://hiddentribes.us/?fbclid=lwAR0T1mTlbCAKzzEcpj</u> <u>eFuinAIWgY9vCOr-JwygbACWIfLBF0XSJIs8wyn4A</u>
- The Narratives Project. (2020). <u>https://www.narrativesproject.com/</u>
- Schulman, S. (2016). Conflict is not abuse: Overstating harm, community responsibility, and the duty of repair. Arsenal Pulp Press.
- Tosi, J. & Warmke, B. (2020). *Grandstanding: The use and abuse of moral talk*. Oxford Scholarship Online.
- Turk, V. (2020). Kill reply all: A modern guide to online etiquette, from social media to work to love. Plume.

#### **CONSPIRACY THEORIES**

Conspiracy theories are becoming more popular and mainstream as social media helps them step out from the shadows and dark corners of the Internet. These resources help librarians to better understand conspiratorial thinking and respectfully address disinformation with patrons who hold unsubstantiated beliefs.

• Butter, M. (2020). There's a conspiracy theory that the CIA invented the term "conspiracy theory"—here's why. The Conversation. <u>https://theconversation.com/theres-a-conspiracy-theory-that-the-cia-invented-the-term-conspiracy-theory-heres-why-132117</u>

- Coady, D. (2018). In defense of conspiracy theories (and why the term is a misnomer). The Conversation. <u>https://theconversation.com/in-defence-of-conspiracy-theories-and-why-the-term-is-a-misnomer-101678</u>
- Lewandowsky, S., & Cook, J. (2020). The Conspiracy Theory Handbook. <u>https://www.climatechangecommunication.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/</u> <u>ConspiracyTheoryHandbook.pdf</u>
- Roose, K. (2020). Rabbit hole. New York Times Podcasts. <u>https://www.nytimes.com/column/rabbit-hole</u>
- Shermer, M., & Linse, P. (n.d.). Conspiracy theories: Who believes them and why, and how to determine if a conspiracy theory is true or false. Skeptic. <u>https://www.skeptic.com/downloads/conspiracy-theories-who-why-and-how.pdf</u>
- West, M. (2018). Escaping the rabbit hole: How to debunk conspiracy theories using facts, logic, and respect. Skyhorse.

## ADDITIONAL REFERENCES FOR FURTHER READING

The articles and books below address a range of disinformation topics allowing for a more comprehensive understanding of the issue.

## Articles

- Batchelor, O. (2017). Getting out the truth: the role of libraries in fighting fake news. *Reference Services Review*, 45(2), 143-148. Emerald Publishing Ltd. DOI 10.1108/RSR-03- 2017-0006
- Boyd, D. (2017, January 5). Did media literacy backfire? *Points Data & Society*. <u>https://points.datasociety.net/did-media-literacy-backfire-7418c084d88d</u>
- Breakstone, J., Smith, M., Wineburg, S., Rapaport, A., Carle, J., Garland, M., & Saavedra, A. (2019). Students' civic online reasoning: A national portrait. Stanford History Education Group & Gibson Consulting. <u>https://purl.stanford.edu/gf151tb4868</u>
- Brunvand, A. (2020). Re-localizing the library: Considerations for the Anthropocene. *Journal of Critical Library and Information Studies*, 3(1). <u>https://journals.litwinbooks.com/index.php/jclis/article/view/94</u>
- Brunvand, A. (2020). Researching Bears Ears: Reference Practice for Civic Engagement. *Reference Services Review*, 48(1), 49-61.
- Buschman, J. (2017). November 8, 2016: Core values, bad faith, and democracy. *The Library Quarterly*, 87(3), 277–286. <u>https://doi.org/10.1086/692305</u>
- Cooke, N., (2017). Post-truth, truthiness, and alternative facts: Information behavior and critical information consumption for a new age. *Library Quarterly: Information, Community, Policy*, 87(3), 211–221.

- Fallis, D. (2015). What is disinformation? *Library Trends*, 63(3), 401-426. http://www.u.arizona.edu/~fallis/LIB%2063.3%2005.%20fallis%20401\_426.pdf
- Fister, B. (2021). The lizard people in the library. Project Information Literacy Provocation Series. https://projectinfolit.org/pubs/provocation-series/essays/lizard-people-in-the-library.html
- Knight Foundation. (2018). American views: Trust, media, and democracy. https://knightfoundation.org/reports/american-views-trust-media-and-democracy/
- LaPierre, S. (2020). New research explores how public libraries can best combat misinformation. *Public Libraries Online*. <u>http://publiclibrariesonline.org/2020/11/new-research-explores-how-public-libraries-can-best-combat-misinformation/</u>
- Lazer, D. M. J., Baum, M. A., Benkler, Y., Berinsky, A. J., Greenhill, K. M., Menczer, F., Metzger, M. J., Nyhan, B., Pennycook, G., Rothschild, D., Schudson, M., Sloman, S. A., Sunstein, C. R., Thorson, E. A., Watts, D. J., & Zittrain, J. L. (2018). The science of fake news: Addressing fake news requires a multidisciplinary effort. *Science*, 359(6380), 1094–1096. DOI: 10.1126/science.aao2998
- Lenker, M. (2016). Motivated reasoning, political information, and Information Literacy education. *Libraries and the Academy*, 16(3), 511–528.
- Morris, S. (2019). Academic integrity in an age of misinformation. International Center for Academic Integrity. <u>https://www.academicintegrity.org/responsibility/academic-integrity-in-an-age-of-misinformation/</u>
- Revez, J. & Corujo, L. (2021). Librarians against fake news: A systematic literature review of library practices (Jan. 2018–Sept. 2020). *The Journal of Academic Librarianship*, 47(2), 102304. doi:10.1016/j.acalib.2020.102304.
- Willard, J. (2018). What Europe can teach America about Russian disinformation. *The Atlantic*. <u>https://www.theatlantic.com/international/archive/2018/06/what-europe-can-teach-america-about-russian-disinformation/562121/</u>
- Wineburg, S., McGrew, S., Breakstone, J., & Ortega, T. (2016). Evaluating information: The cornerstone of civic online reasoning. Stanford Digital Repository. <u>http://purl.stanford.edu/fv751yt5934</u>

## Books

- Agosto, D.E. (Ed.). (2018). Information literacy and libraries in the age of fake news. Libraries Unlimited.
- Andrews, G. (2020). Keep calm and log on: Your handbook for surviving the digital revolution. The MIT Press.
- Barclay, D. (2018). Fake news, propaganda, and plain old lies: How to find trustworthy information in the digital age. Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.

- Cooke, N. (2018). Fake news and alternative facts: Information literacy in a post-truth era. ALA Editions.
- Greenwood, V.E. (2020). Navigating media literacy: A pedagogical tour of Disneyland. Myers Education Press.
- Hobbs, R. (2021). Media literacy in action. Rowman & Littlefield.
- Hobbs, R. (2020). Mind over media: Propaganda education for a digital age. W. W. Norton.
- Lagarde, J., & Hudgins, D. (2018). Fact vs. Fiction: Teaching critical thinking skills in the age of fake news. International Society for Technology in Education.
- Levitan, D. (2017). Weaponized lies: How to think critically in the post-truth era. Dutton.
- Otis, C. (2020). True or false: A CIA analyst's guide to spotting fake news. Feiwel & Friends.

## About WikiWisdom

How do leaders or decision makers easily capture the valuable insights, ideas, observationsm and wisdom from the hands-on experience of frontline peer groups that reside at the bottom of the power pyramid?

How do they learn from the frontline about issues that are plaguing the system? How can you make it comfortable for them to come forward and share what they know in a way that could be used to inform policy making and priority setting?

#### WIKIWISDOM IS THE ANSWER.

A WikiWisdom Forum harnesses the power of technology, peer collaboration and networks to unearth frontline wisdom and connect it to the people with the power to make changes.

WikiWisdom uses the internet to offer people a chance to do more than gripe about their situation. It gives them the opportunity to use their knowledge to tell the powers that be how to do things better.

It's a rare gift to people at both ends of the power structure.



The power of technology, peer collaboration and networks.

wikiwisdom.net



# Administrative Report

#### J.3., File # LC21-2537

Meeting Date: 6/7/2021

TO: LIBRARY COMMISSION

FROM: SUSAN ANDERSON, LIBRARY DIRECTOR

## <u>TITLE</u>

DISCUSSION OF THE FY 2021-2022 BUDGET PROCESS

#### BACKGROUND

The public hearing on the proposed FY 2021-2022 budget was held on June 1<sup>st</sup>, 2021. City Council budget adoption is scheduled for June 15<sup>th</sup>, 2021.



# Administrative Report

#### J.4., File # LC21-2571

Meeting Date: 6/7/2021

TO: LIBRARY COMMISSION

FROM: SUSAN ANDERSON, LIBRARY DIRECTOR

TITLE DIRECTOR'S REPORT



# Administrative Report

# Commission Meeting Date: June 7, 2021

To: LIBRARY COMMISSION

From: SUSAN ANDERSON, LIBRARY DIRECTOR

Subject: DIRECTOR'S REPORT – June 2021

There was no Commission meeting in May so this report is inclusive of March and April 2021 information and activities.

#### **March Activities**

- March 1 Library Director Susan Anderson watched the webinar "Preparing for the Next Wave of Pandemic-Fatigued Customers."
- March 3 Library Director Susan Anderson watched the PEN America/ EveryLibrary webinar "Navigating the First Amendment and Misinformation."
- March 5 Staff began passing out "pot o' gold" craft kits for children and paper quilling kits for teens.
- March 9 Senior Librarian Erin Schoonover held a book discussion group via Zoom.
- March 10 Library Director Susan Anderson, Senior Librarian Erin Schoonover, and Youth Services Librarian Donia Sichler participated in a practice "Day in the District" session with Torrance Public Library, El Segundo Public Library, and Palos Verdes Library District staff and library supporters.
- March 11 Library Director Susan Anderson and a team of librarians presented the report they created on the role of libraries in the mis/disinformation age to the American Library Association and the Library of Congress Kluge Center.
- March 12 Library Director Susan Anderson, Senior Librarian Erin Schoonover, Youth Services Librarian Donia Sichler, Library Commissioner Jennifer Hall, and Friends of the Library treasurer Mary Simun participated in a Zoom "Day in the District" meeting with Assemblymember Al Muratsuchi.
- March 16 Library Director Susan Anderson, Senior Librarian Erin Schoonover, Youth Services Librarian Donia Sichler, Library Commissioners Andrew Beauchamp and Nona Janssen Walls, and Friends of the Library treasurer Mary Simun participated in a Zoom "Day in the District" meeting with Senator Ben Allen.
- March 18 Library Director Susan Anderson watched the SBCCOG General Assembly.
- March 25 Library Director Susan Anderson participated in a Southern California Library Cooperative meeting.

#### **April Activities**

• April 5 Staff began distributing Take and Make "Save the Monarch" milkweed packets for Citizen Science month.

- April 6 Doggo Studybreak and Booktalk for teens posted to Facebook.
- April 6 Staff celebrated National Library Workers' Day with an ice cream party.
- April 6 Youth Services Librarian Donia Sichler watched the webinar "Preparing for the Next Wave of Pandemic Fatigued Customers."
- April 7 Library Director Susan Anderson and Youth Services Librarian Donia Sichler participated in a California State Library Zoom webinar on "Libraries and Community Engagement: A Listening Session."
- April 8 Redondo Ballet Outreach Team storytime posted to Facebook.
- April 8 The Friends of the Library held a "Bag o' Books" sale for the public at the Main Library.
- April 8 Library Director Susan Anderson participated in the California State Library Director's Forum.
- April 12 Library Director Susan Anderson, Senior Librarian Erin Schoonover, Library Technician Scott Vilhauer, and part-time librarians Tim Parker and James Devlin met to discuss the collection budget.
- April 13 Senior Librarian Erin Schoonover held a Zoom book discussion group.
- April 15 Library Director Susan Anderson participated in the California Library Directors' Forum.
- April 21 Library Director Susan Anderson attended a budget meeting with the City Manager.
- April 21 Youth Services Librarian Donia Sichler watched the webinar "Let's Get Together! Book Clubs for Neurodivergent Adults."
- April 22 Redondo Ballet Outreach Team storytime posted to Facebook.
- April 22 Library Director Susan Anderson participated in a meeting for the Southern California Library Cooperative Audit and Finance Committee.
- April 22 Library Director Susan Anderson participated in the California Library Directors' Forum.
- April 23 Youth Services Librarian Donia Sichler watched the InfoPeople webinar "Music for Autism Concerts at Your Library."
- April 26 Youth Services Librarian Donia Sichler watched the webinar "Building News Literacy for Tweens & Teens."
- April 26 Library Director Susan Anderson, Senior Librarian Erin Schoonover, Youth Services Librarian Donia Sichler, Library Technician Scott Vilhauer, and part-time librarians Tim Parker and James Devlin participated in a conference call with a Baker and Taylor representative regarding "Automatically Yours" and bestseller lists.
- April 27 LA Opera held a Zoom talk on "Akhnaten."
- April 28 Library Director Susan Anderson participated in a focus group regarding a needs assessment for State Library staff training.
- April 29 Senior Librarian Erin Schoonover, Youth Services Librarian Donia Sichler, and the full-time clerks watched a Ryan Dowd training on "Handling Patrons Without Masks."
- April 29 Library Director Susan Anderson attended the Redondo Beach Chamber of Commerce State of the City Address.

 April 29 Library Director Susan Anderson attended the California Library Directors' Forum.

#### **FACILITIES**

- March 21 Carpets were cleaned at the North Branch.
- March 28 Carpets were cleaned at the Main Library.

#### <u>June Calendar</u>

- June 5 Summer Reading Program launches
- June 7, 14, 21, 28 Youth Zoom programs
- June 8, 15, 22, 29 Friends of the Library "Bag o' Books" sales at the Main Library
- June 8 Adult book discussion group on "Hidden Valley Road" via Zoom
- June 22
   LA Opera Talks will provide a Zoom program on "Joseph Bologne"

Attachments: FY 20/21 Statistical Report FY 20/21 Digital Circulation Report

#### CC: City Manager, Library Staff

REDONDO BEACH PUBLIC LIBRARY

LIBRARY COMMISSION

STATISTICS 2020-21

	GATE COUNT	JUL	AUG	SEP	OCT	NOV	DEC	JAN	FEB	MAR A	APR
2020-21	MAIN LIBRARY	C	) 0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2,329
	NORTH BRANCH	C	) 0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	631
	TOTAL	C	) 0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2,960
2019-20	MAIN LIBRARY	20,124	21,933	19,842	20,405	16,823	13,536	19,302	17808	9,310	0
	NORTH BRANCH	7,617	6,467	6,631	6,306	4,373	4,444	5,493	5243	2,955	0
	TOTAL	27,741	28,400	26,573	26,711	21,196	17,980	24,795	23,051	12,265	0
	REGISTRATION										
2020-21	MAIN LIBRARY	49	) 109	287	125	57	51	59	55	68	69
2020-21	NORTH BRANCH	43			123	0		0	1	1	09 14
	TOTAL	49			125	57		59	56	69	83
	TOTAL	43	, 110	509	125	57	51	59	50	09	00
2019-20	MAIN LIBRARY	249	) 229	166	168	122	78	192	229	119	55
	NORTH BRANCH	150	) 105	107	74	75	52	80	91	73	0
	TOTAL	399	) 334	273	242	197	130	272	320	192	55
2020.24		0.10/		C 0.45	C 007	F 0F0	4 420	7 445	( 200	7 0 6 7	0.556
2020-21		9,184			6,087	5,858		7,415	6,398	7,067	8,556
	NORTH BRANCH	4,154	-	-	4,578	3,936	-	4,145	4,186	5,175	5,044
	TOTAL	13,338	3 11,733	10,478	10,665	9,794	7,939	11,560	10,584	12,242	13,600
2019-20	MAIN LIBRARY	28,011	26,447	23,285	30,279	29,578	25,133	29,028	23,435	17,910	116
	NORTH BRANCH	11,604	9,399	8,629	11,737	11,468	9,684	11,289	7,133	7,216	48
	TOTAL	39,615		-	42,016	41,046	34,817	40,317	30,568	25,126	164
		•	•	-	•		•			•	

#### Digital Circulation 2020-2021 and 2019-2020

2020-21	July	August	September	October	November	December	January	February	March	April	May	June	Total
CloudLibrary	2,828	2,645	2,392	2,607	2,531	2,645	2,628	2,201	2,282	2,311			25,070
Hoopla	2,217	2,252	2,174	2,094	2,287	2,103	2,211	2,198	2,138	2,021			21,695
Kanopy	733	735	717	638	737	656	649	688	669	582			6804
Overdrive				42	47	70	52	155	53	109			528
Magazines RBDigital:									188	266			454
Magazines	788	867	1,031	1,078	1,052	928	1,017	982	1,047	,			8790
Video	61	296	374	282	50	14	. 77	70	181	. 106			1511
AudioBooks	303	227											530
Total													65,382
2019-20													
CloudLibrary	1,116	1,115	997	1,085	1,015	1,058	1,130	1,104	1,472	1,679			11,771
Hoopla	2,000	1,878	1,944	2,052	1,955	2,047	2,094	1,980	2,342	2,520			20,812
Kanopy	6	357	422	441	. 368	394	463	473	684	646			4254
RBDigital:													
Magazines	650	687	633	691	. 748	601	542	687	709	814			6762
Video	21	29	21	. 10	12	5	1	13	196	59			367
AudioBooks	308	320	324	378	281	. 318	397	347	358	357			3388
Total													47,354